THE PROTAGORAS OF PLATO.

Cambridge:
PRINTED BY C. J. CLAY, M.A.
AT THE UNIVERSITY PRESS.

PR

PLATONIS PROTAGORAS.

THE

PROTAGORAS OF PLATO.

THE GREEK TEXT REVISED,

WITH

AN ANALYSIS AND ENGLISH NOTES,

BY

WILLIAM WAYTE, M.A.
LATE FELLOW OF KING'S COLLEGE, CAMBRIDGE,
ASSISTANT MASTER AT ETON.

SECOND EDITION.

CAMBRIDGE:
DEIGHTON, BELL, AND CO.
LONDON: BELL AND DALDY.
1871.

PREFACE TO THE SECOND EDITION.

THIS book is still in the main what it was in the first edition, a grammatical commentary, intended in some measure as an introduction to the study of Platonic Greek, but with no pretension to an exhaustive treatment of Plato's philosophy. In the interval which has elapsed, the Editor has not had the leisure to undertake a course of study which would have qualified him to deal independently with those difficult problems; and he has seldom thought it necessary merely to record the opinions of others. It may be added that the Protagoras, from its discursiveness and the want of a definite plan, suffers less than most other dialogues by the absence of philosophic treatment. As a brilliant example of the Socratic method it ranks with the Phædrus, the Gorgias, and the Republic, among the great masterpieces of Plato's genius; inferior to none of these in dramatic power and dialectic subtlety, unrivalled (except by the Hippias Major, a dialogue of much slighter texture) in the comic element which renders it especially attractive to younger readers. But its argument is less systematic than is usual with Plato.

The leading idea, it is true, may be defined to be the unity of virtue. But this is obscured by digressions, each no doubt separately of the greatest interest, by mythology, literary criticism, and personal satire; until at last the disputants change places, and Socrates points out the contradiction in which both he and Protagoras have been involved (p. 361 A).

At the time when the first edition was published, in 1854, no portion of Plato, so far as I am aware, had yet appeared with English notes, except the four short dialogues edited by Dr W. Smith in 1840. Nothing had been done in the way of popularising the labours of Heindorf, Ast, and Stallbaum for the use of beginners, and so of illustrating the peculiarities of Platonic, as distinguished from Attic, idiom. This edition of the Protagoras was designed as a contribution towards the supply of that want. What was here attempted on a humble scale has since been carried out, on a more systematic plan, and with far ampler resources, in Mr Riddell's *Digest of Idioms*, appended to his posthumous edition of the Apology. In revising the book for a second edition, I have availed myself of Mr Riddell's work, of Dr Thompson's notes on the Phædrus and Gorgias, of Moritz Sauppe's edition of the Protagoras with German notes, and of the re-issue of Stallbaum, with an improved text, by Kroschel. Some use has also been made of Dr Wagner's English editions of the Apology, Crito, and Phædo. I have likewise carefully weighed, to the best of my judgment, Hirschig's conjectural emendations, amounting to nearly ninety on this dialogue alone. I find myself able to agree with

him, I regret to say, only in a very small number of instances. Hirschig appears to me to deal with Plato's text too much in the style of a tutor correcting a pupil's exercise. The field of conjectural criticism has no doubt been enlarged of late years by such scholars as Cobet and Badham: and Hirschig has proved himself a worthy disciple of the school of Cobet. But he is too often not satisfied to leave well alone.

Some traces of the revision which the book has undergone will be found on almost every page. The grammatical references, which are little altered, are to Jelf's Greek Grammar, and Madvig's Syntax, translated by Browne.

In the former edition I had to express my obligations to my friend Mr Shilleto, for permission to make use of notes taken at his College lectures, and for several valuable hints. I have now to acknowledge a similar debt to the present Master of Trinity, who has favoured me with his critical remarks on some corrupt or obscure passages.

Those who have least agreement with the views of Mr Grote and Mr Mill on the nature and merits of Plato's philosophy will nevertheless, it is believed, read with pleasure the following extracts from Mr Mill's Review of Grote's Plato (*Dissertations and Discussions*, III. 308 foll.). They refer to the subject discussed in the note on 311 E. The entire Essay, it is needless to observe, should be in the hands of every student:

"It neither needs nor can be denied, not only

that Plato had an unfavourable opinion of the Sophists generally, but that his writings contain much evidence of their being looked upon, in Athenian society, with a widespread sentiment of aversion. Their unpopularity may be accounted for, without supposing it to have been, in a moral point of view, deserved. In the first place, the disapprobation was far from being unanimous. Though the name Sophist was already a term of reproach, it was also one of praise: Plato himself (Soph. 231 B) speaks of 'the genuine Sophistic art' (ἡ γένει γενναία σοφιστική) as a thing which he cannot completely distinguish from something laudable, and asks, 'Have we not, in seeking for the Sophist, unexpectedly found the Philosopher?' (ibid. 253 C). In another place, when speaking of the skilful adaptation of Creative Power, he says that the gods are admirable Sophists. The term, when applied to any one, was an insult or a compliment according to the person who used it; like metaphysician, or political economist, or Malthusian, in our own day. And this double tradition was prolonged into the latest period of Grecian culture. It lasted even after the word Philosopher had come into use as the designation which all kinds of speculative men took to themselves; when this name might have been expected to engross all the favourable associations, leaving only the unfavourable to the word Sophist." . . .

. . . "Plato's own dislike of the Sophists was probably quite as intense as that to which he testifies on the part of the Athenian public; but was

it of the same nature? Did he regard them as corruptors of youth? Not if the Sokrates of the Republic expresses Plato's opinions. In one of the most weighty passages of that majestic dialogue, Sokrates is made to say: 'People fancy that it is Sophists and such people that are corruptors of youth; but this is a mistake. The real corruptor of the young is society itself; their families, their associates, all whom they see and converse with, the applauses and hootings of the public assembly, the sentences of the court of justice. These are what pervert young men, by holding up to them a false standard of good and evil, and giving an entirely wrong direction to their desires. As for the Sophists, they merely repeat the people's own opinions.'" . . .

. . . "The enemy against whom Plato really fought, and the warfare against whom was the incessant occupation of the greater part of his life and writings, was not Sophistry, either in the ancient or the modern sense of the term, but Common-place. It was the acceptance of traditional opinions and current sentiments as an ultimate fact; and bandying of the abstract terms which express approbation and disapprobation, desire and aversion, admiration and disgust, as if they had a meaning thoroughly understood and universally assented to. The men of his day (like those of ours) thought that they knew what Good and Evil, Just and Unjust, Honourable and Shameful, were, because they could use the words glibly, and affirm them of this and of that, in agreement with existing custom. But

what the property was, which these several instances possessed in common, justifying the application of the term, nobody had considered; neither the Sophists, nor the rhetoricians, nor the statesmen, nor any of those who set themselves up or were set up by others as wise. Yet whoever could not answer this question was wandering in darkness; had no standard by which his judgments were regulated, and which kept them consistent with one another; no rule which he knew, and could stand by, for the guidance of his life. Not knowing what Justice and Virtue are, it was impossible to be just and virtuous; not knowing what Good is, we not only fail to reach it, but are certain to embrace Evil instead. Such a condition, to any one capable of thought, made life not worth having. The grand business of human intellect ought to consist in subjecting these general terms to the most rigorous scrutiny, and bringing to light the ideas that lie at the bottom of them. Even if this cannot be done, and real knowledge be attained, it is already no small benefit to expel the false opinion of knowledge; to make men conscious of their ignorance of the things most needful to be known, fill them with shame and uneasiness at their own state, and rouse a pungent internal stimulus, summoning up all their mental energies to attack these greatest of all problems, and never rest until, as far as possible, the true solutions are reached. This is Plato's notion of the condition of the human mind in his time, and of what philosophy could do to help it; and any one who does not think the description applicable, with

slight modifications, to the majority even of educated minds in our own and in all times known to us, certainly has not brought either the teachers or the practical men of any time to the Platonic test."

Eton College,
July, 1871.

ERRATA.

P. 127. The note on *πάνυ μὲν οὐκ*, **338** E, should have been corrected in harmony with that on **321** B.

P. 129, l. 19 from foot, *for ξυμφέρεσθον read ξυμφερέσθων.*

ΠΛΑΤΩΝΟΣ

ΠΡΩΤΑΓΟΡΑΣ.

ΤΑ ΤΟΥ ΔΙΑΛΟΓΟΥ ΠΡΟΣΩΠΑ.

ΕΤΑΙΡΟΣ, ΣΩΚΡΑΤΗΣ, ΙΠΠΟΚΡΑΤΗΣ, ΠΡΩΤΑΓΟΡΑΣ, ΑΛΚΙΒΙΑΔΗΣ, ΚΑΛΛΙΑΣ, ΚΡΙΤΙΑΣ, ΠΡΟΔΙΚΟΣ, ΙΠΠΙΑΣ.

309 I. ΕΤ. Πόθεν, ὦ Σώκρατες, φαίνει; ἢ δῆλα δὴ
ὅτι ἀπὸ κυνηγεσίου τοῦ περὶ τὴν Ἀλκιβιάδου ὥραν;
καὶ μήν μοι καὶ πρώην ἰδόντι καλὸς μὲν ἐφαίνετο
ἀνὴρ ἔτι, ἀνὴρ μέντοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὥς γ' ἐν αὐτοῖς
ἡμῖν εἰρῆσθαι, καὶ πώγωνος ἤδη ὑποπιμπλάμενος.
B ΣΩ. Εἶτα τί τοῦτο; οὐ σὺ μέντοι Ὁμήρου ἐπαινέ-
της εἶ, ὃς ἔφη χαριεστάτην ἥβην εἶναι τοῦ ὑπηνήτου,
ἣν νῦν Ἀλκιβιάδης ἔχει; ΕΤ. Τί οὖν τὰ νῦν; ἢ
παρ' ἐκείνου φαίνει; καὶ πῶς πρός σε ὁ νεανίας διά-
κειται; ΣΩ. Εὖ ἔμοιγε ἔδοξεν, οὐχ ἥκιστα δὲ καὶ
τῇ νῦν ἡμέρᾳ· καὶ γὰρ πολλὰ ὑπὲρ ἐμοῦ εἶπε βοη-
θῶν ἐμοί, καὶ οὖν καὶ ἄρτι ἀπ' ἐκείνου ἔρχομαι. ἄτο-
πον μέντοι τί σοι ἐθέλω εἰπεῖν· παρόντος γὰρ ἐκείνου,
οὔτε προσεῖχον τὸν νοῦν, ἐπελανθανόμην τε αὐτοῦ
θαμά. ΕΤ. Καὶ τί ἂν γεγονὸς εἴη περὶ σὲ κἀκεῖνον
C τοσοῦτον πρᾶγμα; οὐ γὰρ δήπου τινὶ καλλίονι ἐνέ-
τυχες ἄλλῳ ἔν γε τῇδε τῇ πόλει. ΣΩ. Καὶ πολύ γε.
ΕΤ. Τί φῄς; ἀστῷ, ἢ ξένῳ; ΣΩ. Ξένῳ. ΕΤ. Πο-
δαπῷ; ΣΩ. Ἀβδηρίτῃ. ΕΤ. Καὶ οὕτω καλός τις
ὁ ξένος ἔδοξέ σοι εἶναι, ὥστε τοῦ Κλεινίου υἱέος καλ-
λίων σοι φανῆναι; ΣΩ. Πῶς δ' οὐ μέλλει, ὦ μακά-

ριε, τὸ σοφώτατον κάλλιον φαίνεσθαι; ΕΤ. Ἀλλ' ἦ
σοφῷ τινι ἡμῖν, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐντυχὼν πάρει; ΣΩ.
Σοφωτάτῳ μὲν οὖν δήπου τῶν γε νῦν, εἴ σοι δοκεῖ D
σοφώτατος εἶναι Πρωταγόρας. ΕΤ. Ὦ τί λέγεις;
Πρωταγόρας ἐπιδεδήμηκε; ΣΩ. Τρίτην γε ἤδη ἡμέ-
ραν. ΕΤ. Καὶ ἄρτι ἄρα ἐκείνῳ συγγεγονὼς ἥκεις;
ΣΩ. Πάνυ γε πολλὰ καὶ εἰπὼν καὶ ἀκούσας. ΕΤ. 310
Τί οὖν οὐ διηγήσω ἡμῖν τὴν ξυνουσίαν, εἰ μή σέ τι
κωλύει, καθιζόμενος ἐνταυθί, ἐξαναστήσας τὸν παῖδα
τουτονί; ΣΩ. Πάνυ μὲν οὖν· καὶ χάριν γε εἴσομαι,
ἐὰν ἀκούητε. ΕΤ. Καὶ μὴν καὶ ἡμεῖς σοί, ἐὰν λέγῃς.
ΣΩ. Διπλῆ ἂν εἴη ἡ χάρις. ἀλλ' οὖν ἀκούετε.

II. Τῆς παρελθούσης νυκτὸς ταυτησί, ἔτι βαθέος
ὄρθρου, Ἱπποκράτης, ὁ Ἀπολλοδώρου υἱός, Φάσωνος
δὲ ἀδελφός, τὴν θύραν τῇ βακτηρίᾳ πάνυ σφόδρα
ἔκρουε, καὶ ἐπειδὴ αὐτῷ ἀνέῳξέ τις, εὐθὺς εἴσω ᾔει B
ἐπειγόμενος, καὶ τῇ φωνῇ μέγα λέγων, Ὦ Σώκρατες,
ἔφη, ἐγρήγορας ἢ καθεύδεις; Καὶ ἐγὼ τὴν φωνὴν
γνοὺς αὐτοῦ, Ἱπποκράτης, ἔφην, οὗτος· μή τι νεώτερον
ἀγγέλλεις; Οὐδέν γ', ἢ δ' ὅς, εἰ μὴ ἀγαθά γε. Εὖ
ἂν λέγοις, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. ἔστι δὲ τί, καὶ τοῦ ἕνεκα τη-
νικάδε ἀφίκου; Πρωταγόρας, ἔφη, ἥκει, στὰς παρ'
ἐμοί. Πρῴην, ἔφην ἐγώ· σὺ δὲ ἄρτι πέπυσαι; Νὴ
τοὺς θεούς, ἔφη, ἑσπέρας γε. Καὶ ἅμα ἐπιψηλαφή- C
σας τοῦ σκίμποδος ἐκαθέζετο παρὰ τοὺς πόδας μου,
καὶ εἶπεν· Ἑσπέρας δῆτα, μάλα γε ὀψὲ ἀφικόμενος
ἐξ Οἰνόης. ὁ γάρ τοι παῖς με ὁ Σάτυρος ἀπέδρα· καὶ
δῆτα μέλλων σοι φράζειν, ὅτι διωξοίμην αὐτόν, ὑπό
τινος ἄλλου ἐπελαθόμην. ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἦλθον καὶ δε-
δειπνηκότες ἦμεν καὶ ἐμέλλομεν ἀναπαύεσθαι, τότε
μοι ὁ ἀδελφὸς λέγει, ὅτι ἥκει Πρωταγόρας. καὶ ἔτι
μὲν ἐνεχείρησα εὐθὺς παρὰ σὲ ἰέναι, ἔπειτά μοι λίαν

D πόρρω ἔδοξε τῶν νυκτῶν εἶναι. ἐπειδὴ δὲ τάχιστά με ἐκ τοῦ κόπου ὁ ὕπνος ἀνῆκεν, εὐθὺς ἀναστὰς οὕτω δεῦρο ἐπορευόμην. Καὶ ἐγὼ γιγνώσκων αὐτοῦ τὴν ἀνδρείαν καὶ τὴν πτοίησιν, Τί οὖν σοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦτο; μῶν τί σε ἀδικεῖ Πρωταγόρας; Καὶ ὃς γελάσας, Νὴ τοὺς θεούς, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὅτι γε μόνος ἐστὶ σοφός, ἐμὲ δὲ οὐ ποιεῖ. Ἀλλὰ ναὶ μὰ Δία, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἂν αὐτῷ διδῷς ἀργύριον καὶ πείθῃς ἐκεῖνον, ποιήσει καὶ
E σὲ σοφόν. Εἰ γάρ, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὦ Ζεῦ καὶ θεοί, ἐν τούτῳ εἴη· ὡς οὔτ' ἂν τῶν ἐμῶν ἐπιλίποιμι οὐδὲν οὔτε τῶν φίλων. ἀλλ' αὐτὰ ταῦτα καὶ νῦν ἥκω παρὰ σέ, ἵνα ὑπὲρ ἐμοῦ διαλεχθῇς αὐτῷ. ἐγὼ γὰρ ἅμα μὲν καὶ νεώτερός εἰμι, ἅμα δὲ οὐδὲ ἑόρακα Πρωταγόραν πώποτε οὐδ' ἀκήκοα οὐδέν· ἔτι γὰρ παῖς ἦ, ὅτε τὸ πρότερον ἐπεδήμησεν. ἀλλὰ γάρ, ὦ Σώκρατες, πάντες τὸν ἄνδρα ἐπαινοῦσι καί φασι σοφώτατον εἶναι λέγειν. ἀλλὰ τί οὐ βαδίζομεν παρ' αὐτόν, ἵνα ἔνδον καταλάβωμεν; καταλύει δ', ὡς ἐγὼ ἤκουσα, παρὰ
311 Καλλίᾳ τῷ Ἱππονίκου. ἀλλ' ἴωμεν. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· Μήπω γ' ὦ 'γαθέ, [ἐκεῖσε ἴωμεν,] πρῴ γάρ ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ δεῦρο ἐξαναστῶμεν εἰς τὴν αὐλὴν καὶ περιιόντες αὐτοῦ διατρίψωμεν, ἕως ἂν φῶς γένηται· εἶτα ἴωμεν. καὶ γὰρ τὰ πολλὰ Πρωταγόρας ἔνδον διατρίβει· ὥστε θάρρει, καταληψόμεθα αὐτόν, ὡς τὸ εἰκός, ἔνδον.

III. Μετὰ ταῦτα ἀναστάντες εἰς τὴν αὐλὴν περι-
B ῇμεν. Καὶ ἐγὼ ἀποπειρώμενος τοῦ Ἱπποκρατους τῆς ῥώμης διεσκόπουν αὐτὸν καὶ ἠρώτων, Εἰπέ μοι, ἔφην ἐγώ, ὦ Ἱππόκρατες, παρὰ Πρωταγόραν νῦν ἐπιχειρεῖς ἰέναι ἀργύριον τελῶν ἐκείνῳ μισθὸν ὑπὲρ σεαυτοῦ, ὡς παρὰ τίνα ἀφιξόμενος καὶ τίς γενησόμενος; ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἐπενόεις παρὰ τὸν σαυτοῦ ὁμώνυμον ἐλθὼν Ἱπποκράτη τὸν Κῷον, τὸν τῶν Ἀσκλη-

πιαδῶν, ἀργύριον τελεῖν ὑπὲρ σαυτοῦ μισθὸν ἐκείνῳ, εἴ τις σε ἤρετο· Εἰπέ μοι, μέλλεις τελεῖν, ὦ Ἱππό- C κρατες, Ἱπποκράτει μισθὸν ὡς τίνι ὄντι; τί ἂν ἀπεκρίνω; Εἶπον ἄν, ἔφη, ὅτι ὡς ἰατρῷ. Ὡς τίς γενησόμενος; Ὡς ἰατρός, ἔφη. Εἰ δὲ παρὰ Πολύκλειτον τὸν Ἀργεῖον ἢ Φειδίαν τὸν Ἀθηναῖον ἐπενόεις ἀφικόμενος μισθὸν ὑπὲρ σαυτοῦ τελεῖν ἐκείνοις, εἴ τίς σε ἤρετο· Τελεῖν τοῦτο τὸ ἀργύριον ὡς τίνι ὄντι ἐν νῷ ἔχεις Πολυκλείτῳ τε καὶ Φειδίᾳ; τί ἂν ἀπεκρίνω; Εἶπον ἂν ὡς ἀγαλματοποιοῖς. Ὡς τίς δὲ γενησόμε- D νος αὐτός; Δῆλον ὅτι ἀγαλματοποιός. Εἶεν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. παρὰ δὲ δὴ Πρωταγόραν νῦν ἀφικόμενοι ἐγώ τε καὶ σὺ ἀργύριον ἐκείνῳ μισθὸν ἕτοιμοι ἐσόμεθα τελεῖν ὑπὲρ σοῦ, ἂν μὲν ἐξικνῆται τὰ ἡμέτερα χρήματα καὶ τούτοις πείθωμεν αὐτόν,—εἰ δὲ μή, καὶ τὰ τῶν φίλων προσαναλίσκοντες. εἰ οὖν τις ἡμᾶς περὶ ταῦτα οὕτω σφόδρα σπουδάζοντας ἔροιτο· Εἰπέ μοι, ὦ Σώκρατές τε καὶ Ἱππόκρατες, ὡς τίνι ὄντι τῷ Πρωταγόρᾳ ἐν νῷ ἔχετε χρήματα τελεῖν; τί ἂν αὐτῷ ἀποκριναίμεθα; τί ὄνομα ἄλλο γε λεγόμενον περὶ E Πρωταγόρου ἀκούομεν, ὥσπερ περὶ Φειδίου ἀγαλματοποιὸν καὶ περὶ Ὁμήρου ποιητήν; τί τοιοῦτον περὶ Πρωταγόρου ἀκούομεν; Σοφιστὴν δή τοι ὀνομάζουσί γε, ὦ Σώκρατες, τὸν ἄνδρα εἶναι, ἔφη. Ὡς σοφιστῇ ἄρα ἐρχόμεθα τελοῦντες τὰ χρήματα; Μάλιστα. Εἰ οὖν καὶ τοῦτό τίς σε προσέροιτο. Αὐτὸς δὲ δὴ ὡς τίς 312 γενησόμενος ἔρχει παρὰ τὸν Πρωταγόραν; Καὶ ὃς εἶπεν ἐρυθριάσας—ἤδη γὰρ ὑπέφαινέ τι ἡμέρας, ὥστε καταφανῆ αὐτὸν γενέσθαι—Εἰ μέν τι τοῖ ἔμπροσθεν ἔοικε, δῆλον, ὅτι σοφιστὴς γενησόμενος. Σὺ δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, πρὸς θεῶν, οὐκ ἂν αἰσχύνοιο εἰς τοὺς Ἕλληνας σαυτὸν σοφιστὴν παρέχων; Νὴ τὸν Δία, ὦ Σώκρα-

τες, εἴπερ γε ἃ διανοοῦμαι χρὴ λέγειν. Ἀλλ' ἄρα,
ὦ Ἱππόκρατες, μὴ οὐ τοιαύτην ὑπολαμβάνεις σου
B τὴν παρὰ Πρωταγόρου μάθησιν ἔσεσθαι, ἀλλ' οἵαπερ
ἡ παρὰ τοῦ γραμματιστοῦ ἐγένετο καὶ κιθαριστοῦ καὶ
παιδοτρίβου; τούτων γὰρ σὺ ἑκάστην οὐκ ἐπὶ τέχνῃ
ἔμαθες, ὡς δημιουργὸς ἐσόμενος, ἀλλ' ἐπὶ παιδείᾳ, ὡς
τὸν ἰδιώτην καὶ τὸν ἐλεύθερον πρέπει. Πάνυ μὲν
οὖν μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη, τοιαύτη μᾶλλον εἶναι ἡ παρὰ
Πρωταγόρου μάθησις.

IV. Οἶσθα οὖν ὃ μέλλεις νῦν πράττειν, ἤ σε
λανθάνει; ἦν δ' ἐγώ. Τοῦ πέρι; Ὅτι μέλλεις τὴν
C ψυχὴν τὴν σαυτοῦ παρασχεῖν θεραπεῦσαι ἀνδρί, ὡς
φῄς, σοφιστῇ· ὅ τι δέ ποτε ὁ σοφιστής ἐστι, θαυ-
μάζοιμ' ἂν εἰ οἶσθα. καίτοι εἰ τοῦτ' ἀγνοεῖς, οὐδὲ
ὅτῳ παραδίδως τὴν ψυχὴν οἶσθα, οὔτ' εἰ ἀγαθῷ οὔτ'
εἰ κακῷ πράγματι. Οἶμαί γ', ἔφη, εἰδέναι. Λέγε δή,
τί ἡγεῖ εἶναι τὸν σοφιστήν; Ἐγὼ μέν, ἦ δ' ὅς, ὥσπερ
τοὔνομα λέγει, τοῦτον εἶναι τὸν τῶν σοφῶν ἐπιστή-
μονα. Οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τοῦτο μὲν ἔξεστι λέγειν
καὶ περὶ ζωγράφων καὶ περὶ τεκτόνων, ὅτι οὗτοι εἰσιν
D οἱ τῶν σοφῶν ἐπιστήμονες· ἀλλ' εἴ τις ἔροιτο ἡμᾶς,
τῶν τί σοφῶν εἰσιν οἱ ζωγράφοι ἐπιστήμονες, εἴποιμεν
ἄν που αὐτῷ, ὅτι τῶν πρὸς τὴν ἀπεργασίαν τὴν τῶν
εἰκόνων, καὶ τἆλλα οὕτως. εἰ δέ τις ἐκεῖνο ἔροιτο·
Ὁ δὲ σοφιστὴς τῶν τί σοφῶν ἐστι; τί ἂν ἀποκριναί-
μεθα αὐτῷ; ποίας ἐργασίας ἐπιστάτης; Τί ἂν εἴποι-
μεν αὐτὸν εἶναι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἢ ἐπιστάτην τοῦ ποιῆσαι
δεινὸν λέγειν; Ἴσως ἄν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἀληθῆ λέγοιμεν,
E οὐ μέντοι ἱκανῶς γε· ἐρωτήσεως γὰρ ἔτι ἡ ἀπόκρισις
ἡμῖν δεῖται, περὶ ὅτου ὁ σοφιστὴς δεινὸν δήπου ποιεῖ
λέγειν περὶ οὗπερ καὶ ἐπιστήμονα, περὶ κιθαρίσεως.
ἦ γάρ; Ναί. Εἶεν· ὁ δὲ δὴ σοφιστὴς περὶ τίνος

δεινὸν ποιεῖ λέγειν; ἢ δῆλον ὅτι περὶ οὗπερ καὶ ἐπίσταται; Εἰκός *γε.* Τί *δή ἐστι τοῦτο, περὶ οὗ αὐτός τε ἐπιστήμων ἐστὶν ὁ σοφιστὴς καὶ τὸν μαθητὴν ποιεῖ;* Μὰ Δί', *ἔφη, οὐκέτι ἔχω σοι λέγειν.*

V. Καὶ *ἐγὼ εἶπον μετὰ τοῦτο·* Τί *οὖν; οἶσθα* 313 *εἰς οἷόν τινα κίνδυνον ἔρχει ὑποθήσων τὴν ψυχήν; ἢ εἰ μὲν τὸ σῶμα ἐπιτρέπειν σε ἔδει τῳ διακινδυνεύοντα ἢ χρηστὸν αὐτὸ γενέσθαι ἢ πονηρόν, πολλὰ ἂν περιεσκέψω, εἴτ' ἐπιτρεπτέον εἴτε οὔ. καὶ εἰς συμβουλὴν τούς τε φίλους ἂν παρεκάλεις καὶ τοὺς οἰκείους σκοπούμενος ἡμέρας συχνάς· ὃ δὲ περὶ πλείονος τοῦ σώματος ἡγεῖ, τὴν ψυχήν, καὶ ἐν ᾧ πάντ' ἐστὶ τὰ σὰ ἢ εὖ ἢ κακῶς πράττειν, χρηστοῦ ἢ πονηροῦ αὐτοῦ γενομένου, περὶ δὲ τούτου οὔτε τῷ πατρὶ οὔτε τῷ* B *ἀδελφῷ ἐπεκοινώσω οὔτε ἡμῶν τῶν ἑταίρων οὐδενί, εἴτ' ἐπιτρεπτέον εἴτε καὶ οὐ τῷ ἀφικομένῳ τούτῳ ξένῳ τὴν σὴν ψυχήν, ἀλλ' ἑσπέρας ἀκούσας, ὡς φῄς, ὄρθριος ἥκων περὶ μὲν τούτου οὐδένα λόγον οὐδὲ συμβουλὴν ποιεῖ, εἴτε χρὴ ἐπιτρέπειν σαυτὸν αὐτῷ εἴτε μή, ἕτοιμος δ' εἶ ἀναλίσκειν τά τε σαυτοῦ καὶ τὰ τῶν φίλων χρήματα, ὡς ἤδη διεγνωκώς, ὅτι πάντως συνεστέον* Πρωταγόρᾳ, *ὃν οὔτε γιγνώσκεις, ὡς φῄς, οὔτε διείλεξαι οὐδεπώποτε, σοφιστὴν δ' ὀνομάζεις, τὸν δὲ σοφιστήν, ὅ τι ποτέ ἐστι, φαίνει ἀγνοῶν, ᾧ μέλλεις* C *σαυτὸν ἐπιτρέπειν;* Καὶ *ὃς ἀκούσας,* Ἔοικεν, *ἔφη, ὦ* Σώκρατες, *ἐξ ὧν σὺ λέγεις.* Ἆρ' *οὖν, ὦ* Ἱππόκρατες, *ὁ σοφιστὴς τυγχάνει ὢν ἔμπορός τις ἢ κάπηλος τῶν ἀγωγίμων, ἀφ' ὧν ψυχὴ τρέφεται;* Φαίνεται *γὰρ ἔμοιγε τοιοῦτός τις.* Τρέφεται *δέ, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ψυχὴ τίνι;* Μαθήμασι *δήπου, ὦ* Σώκρατες. Καὶ *ὅπως γε μή, ὦ ἑταῖρε, ὁ σοφιστὴς ἐπαινῶν ἃ πωλεῖ ἐξαπατήσῃ ἡμᾶς, ὥσπερ οἱ περὶ τὴν τοῦ σώματος τροφήν, ὁ*

D ἔμπορός τε καὶ κάπηλος. καὶ γὰρ οὗτοί που ὧν
ἄγουσιν ἀγωγίμων οὔτε αὐτοὶ ἴσασιν ὅ τι χρηστὸν ἢ
πονηρὸν περὶ τὸ σῶμα, ἐπαινοῦσι δὲ πάντα πωλοῦν-
τες, οὔτε οἱ ὠνούμενοι παρ' αὐτῶν, ἐὰν μή τις τύχῃ
γυμναστικὸς ἢ ἰατρὸς ὤν. οὕτω δὲ καὶ οἱ τὰ μαθή-
ματα περιάγοντες κατὰ τὰς πόλεις καὶ πωλοῦντες καὶ
καπηλεύοντες τῷ ἀεὶ ἐπιθυμοῦντι ἐπαινοῦσι μὲν πάντα
ἃ πωλοῦσι, τάχα δ' ἄν τινες, ὦ ἄριστε, καὶ τούτων
ἀγνοοῖεν ὧν πωλοῦσιν ὅ τι χρηστὸν ἢ πονηρὸν πρὸς
E τὴν ψυχήν· ὡς δ' αὔτως καὶ οἱ ὠνούμενοι παρ' αὐτῶν,
ἐὰν μή τις τύχῃ περὶ τὴν ψυχὴν αὖ ἰατρικὸς ὤν. εἰ
μὲν οὖν σὺ τυγχάνεις ἐπιστήμων τούτων τί χρηστὸν
καὶ πονηρόν, ἀσφαλές σοι ὠνεῖσθαι μαθήματα καὶ
παρὰ Πρωταγόρου καὶ παρ' ἄλλου ὁτουοῦν· εἰ δὲ μή,
ὅρα, ὦ μακάριε, μὴ περὶ τοῖς φιλτάτοις κυβεύῃς τε
314 καὶ κινδυνεύῃς. καὶ γὰρ δὴ καὶ πολὺ μείζων κίνδυνος
ἐν τῇ τῶν μαθημάτων ὠνῇ ἢ ἐν τῇ τῶν σιτίων. σιτία
μὲν γὰρ καὶ ποτὰ πριάμενον παρὰ τοῦ καπήλου καὶ
ἐμπόρου ἔξεστιν ἐν ἄλλοις ἀγγείοις ἀποφέρειν, καὶ
πρὶν δέξασθαι αὐτὰ εἰς τὸ σῶμα πιόντα ἢ φαγόντα,
καταθέμενον οἴκαδε ἔξεστι συμβουλεύσασθαι, παρα-
καλέσαντα τὸν ἐπαΐοντα, ὅ τι τε ἐδεστέον ἢ ποτέον
καὶ ὅ τι μή, καὶ ὁπόσον καὶ ὁπότε· ὥστε ἐν τῇ ὠνῇ
B οὐ μέγας ὁ κίνδυνος. μαθήματα δὲ οὐκ ἔστιν ἐν ἄλλῳ
ἀγγείῳ ἀπενεγκεῖν, ἀλλ' ἀνάγκη καταθέντα τὴν τιμὴν
τὸ μάθημα ἐν αὐτῇ τῇ ψυχῇ λαβόντα καὶ μαθόντα
ἀπιέναι ἢ βεβλαμμένον ἢ ὠφελημένον. ταῦτα οὖν
σκοπώμεθα καὶ μετὰ τῶν πρεσβυτέρων ἡμῶν· ἡμεῖς
γὰρ ἔτι νέοι, ὥστε τοσοῦτο πρᾶγμα διελέσθαι. νῦν
μέντοι, ὥσπερ ὡρμήσαμεν, ἴωμεν καὶ ἀκούσωμεν τοῦ
ἀνδρός, ἔπειτα ἀκούσαντες καὶ ἄλλοις ἀνακοινωσώ-
C μεθα· καὶ γὰρ οὐ μόνος Πρωταγόρας αὐτόθι ἐστίν,

ἀλλὰ καὶ Ἱππίας ὁ Ἠλεῖος—οἶμαι δὲ καὶ Πρόδικον τὸν Κεῖον—καὶ ἄλλοι πολλοὶ καὶ σοφοί.

VI. Δόξαν ἡμῖν ταῦτα, ἐπορευόμεθα. Ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἐν τῷ προθύρῳ ἐγενόμεθα, ἐπιστάντες περί τινος λόγου διελεγόμεθα, ὃς ἡμῖν κατὰ τὴν ὁδὸν ἐνέπεσεν· ἵν' οὖν μὴ ἀτελὴς γένοιτο, ἀλλὰ διαπερανάμενοι οὕτως εἰσίοιμεν, στάντες ἐν τῷ προθύρῳ διελεγόμεθα, ἕως συνωμολογήσαμεν ἀλλήλοις. δοκεῖ οὖν μοι, ὁ θυρωρός, εὐνοῦχός τις, κατήκουεν ἡμῶν, κινδυνεύει δὲ διὰ D τὸ πλῆθος τῶν σοφιστῶν ἄχθεσθαι τοῖς φοιτῶσιν εἰς τὴν οἰκίαν. ἐπειδὴ γοῦν ἐκρούσαμεν τὴν θύραν, ἀνοίξας καὶ ἰδὼν ἡμᾶς, Ἔα, ἔφη, σοφισταί τινες· οὐ σχολὴ αὐτῷ. Καὶ ἅμα ἀμφοῖν τοῖν χεροῖν τὴν θύραν πάνυ προθύμως ὡς οἷός τ' ἦν ἐπήραξε. καὶ ἡμεῖς πάλιν ἐκρούομεν, καὶ ὃς ἐγκεκλῃμένης τῆς θύρας ἀποκρινόμενος εἶπεν, Ὦ ἄνθρωποι, ἔφη, οὐκ ἀκηκόατε, ὅτι οὐ σχολὴ αὐτῷ; Ἀλλ' ὦ 'γαθέ, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὔτε παρὰ Καλλίαν ἥκομεν οὔτε σοφισταί ἐσμεν, ἀλλὰ θάρρει· Πρωταγόραν γάρ τοι δεόμενοι ἰδεῖν ἤλθομεν. εἰσάγγειλον E οὖν. Μόγις οὖν ποτε ἡμῖν ἄνθρωπος ἀνέῳξε τὴν θύραν.

VII. Ἐπειδὴ δὲ εἰσήλθομεν, κατελάβομεν Πρωταγόραν ἐν τῷ προστῴῳ περιπατοῦντα, ἑξῆς δ' αὐτῷ συμπεριεπάτουν ἐκ μὲν τοῦ ἐπὶ θάτερα Καλλίας ὁ Ἱππονίκου καὶ ὁ ἀδελφὸς αὐτοῦ ὁ ὁμομήτριος, Πάραλος ὁ Περικλέους, καὶ Χαρμίδης ὁ Γλαύκωνος, ἐκ δὲ 315 τοῦ ἐπὶ θάτερα ὁ ἕτερος τῶν Περικλέους Ξάνθιππος καὶ Φιλιππίδης ὁ Φιλομήλου καὶ Ἀντίμοιρος ὁ Μενδαῖος, ὅσπερ εὐδοκιμεῖ μάλιστα τῶν Πρωταγόρου μαθητῶν καὶ ἐπὶ τέχνῃ μανθάνει, ὡς σοφιστὴς ἐσόμενος. τούτων δ' οἳ ὄπισθεν ἠκολούθουν ἐπακούοντες τῶν λεγομένων τὸ μὲν πολὺ ξένοι ἐφαίνοντο, οὓς ἄγει ἐξ

ἑκάστων τῶν πόλεων ὁ Πρωταγόρας, δι' ὧν διεξέρχε-
ται, κηλῶν τῇ φωνῇ ὥσπερ Ὀρφεύς, οἱ δὲ κατὰ τὴν
B φωνὴν ἕπονται κεκηλημένοι· ἦσαν δέ τινες καὶ τῶν
ἐπιχωρίων ἐν τῷ χορῷ. τοῦτον τὸν χορὸν μάλιστα
ἔγωγε ἰδὼν ἥσθην, ὡς καλῶς εὐλαβοῦντο μηδέποτε
ἐμποδὼν ἐν τῷ ἔμπροσθεν εἶναι Πρωταγόρου, ἀλλ'
ἐπειδὴ αὐτὸς ἀναστρέφοι καὶ οἱ μετ' ἐκείνου, εὖ πως
καὶ ἐν κόσμῳ περιεσχίζοντο οὗτοι οἱ ἐπήκοοι ἔνθεν
καὶ ἔνθεν, καὶ ἐν κύκλῳ περιιόντες ἀεὶ εἰς τὸ ὄπισθεν
καθίσταντο κάλλιστα.

Τὸν δὲ μετ' εἰσενόησα, ἔφη Ὅμηρος, Ἱππίαν
C τὸν Ἠλεῖον, καθήμενον ἐν τῷ κατ' ἀντικρὺ προστῴῳ
ἐν θρόνῳ· περὶ αὐτὸν δ' ἐκάθηντο ἐπὶ βάθρων Ἐρυξί-
μαχός τε ὁ Ἀκουμενοῦ καὶ Φαῖδρος ὁ Μυρρινούσιος
καὶ Ἄνδρων ὁ Ἀνδροτίωνος καὶ τῶν ξένων πολῖταί
τε αὐτοῦ καὶ ἄλλοι τινές. ἐφαίνοντο δὲ περὶ φύσεώς
τε καὶ τῶν μετεώρων ἀστρονομικὰ ἄττα διερωτᾶν τὸν
Ἱππίαν, ὁ δ' ἐν θρόνῳ καθήμενος ἑκάστοις αὐτῶν διέ-
κρινε καὶ διεξῄει τὰ ἐρωτώμενα.

Καὶ μὲν δὴ καὶ Τάνταλόν γε εἰσεῖδον. ἐπε-
D δήμει γὰρ ἄρα καὶ Πρόδικος ὁ Κεῖος, ἦν δὲ ἐν οἰκή-
ματί τινι, ᾧ πρὸ τοῦ μὲν ὡς ταμιείῳ ἐχρῆτο Ἱππό-
νικος, νῦν δὲ ὑπὸ τοῦ πλήθους τῶν καταλυόντων ὁ
Καλλίας καὶ τοῦτο ἐκκενώσας ξένοις κατάλυσιν πε-
ποίηκεν. ὁ μὲν οὖν Πρόδικος ἔτι κατέκειτο, ἐγκεκα-
λυμμένος ἐν κῳδίοις τισὶ καὶ στρώμασι καὶ μάλα
πολλοῖς, ὡς ἐφαίνετο· παρεκάθηντο δὲ αὐτῷ ἐπὶ ταῖς
πλησίον κλίναις Παυσανίας τε ὁ ἐκ Κεραμέων καὶ
μετὰ Παυσανίου νέον τι ἔτι μειράκιον, ὡς μὲν ἐγῷ-
μαι, καλόν τε κἀγαθὸν τὴν φύσιν, τὴν δ' οὖν ἰδέαν
E πάνυ καλός. ἔδοξα ἀκοῦσαι ὄνομα αὐτῷ εἶναι Ἀγά-
θωνα, καὶ οὐκ ἂν θαυμάζοιμι, εἰ παιδικὰ Παυσανίου

τυγχάνει ὤν. καὶ τὼ Ἀδειμάντω ἀμφοτέρω, ὅ τε
Κήπιδος καὶ ὁ Λευκολοφίδου, καὶ ἄλλοι τινὲς ἐφαί-
νοντο. περὶ δὲ ὧν διελέγοντο οὐκ ἐδυνάμην ἔγωγε
μαθεῖν ἔξωθεν, καίπερ λιπαρῶς ἔχων ἀκούειν τοῦ
Προδίκου—πάσσοφος γάρ μοι δοκεῖ ἀνὴρ εἶναι καὶ
θεῖος,—ἀλλὰ διὰ τὴν βαρύτητα τῆς φωνῆς βόμβος 316
τις ἐν τῷ οἰκήματι γιγνόμενος ἀσαφῆ ἐποίει τὰ λε-
γόμενα.

Καὶ ἡμεῖς μὲν ἄρτι εἰσεληλύθειμεν, κατόπιν δὲ
ἡμῶν ἐπεισῆλθον Ἀλκιβιάδης τε ὁ καλός, ὡς φῂς σὺ
καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι, καὶ Κριτίας ὁ Καλλαίσχρου.

VIII. Ἡμεῖς οὖν ὡς εἰσήλθομεν, ἔτι σμίκρ' ἄττα
διατρίψαντες καὶ ταῦτα διαθεασάμενοι προσῇμεν πρὸς B
τὸν Πρωταγόραν, καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον· Ὦ Πρωταγόρα, πρὸς
σέ τοι ἤλθομεν ἐγώ τε καὶ Ἱπποκράτης οὗτος. Πό-
τερον, ἔφη, μόνῳ βουλόμενοι διαλεχθῆναι ἢ καὶ μετὰ
τῶν ἄλλων; Ἡμῖν μέν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οὐδὲν διαφέρει·
ἀκούσας δὲ οὗ ἕνεκα ἤλθομεν, αὐτὸς σκέψαι. Τί οὖν
δή ἐστιν, ἔφη, οὗ ἕνεκα ἥκετε; Ἱπποκράτης ὅδε ἐστὶ
μὲν τῶν ἐπιχωρίων, Ἀπολλοδώρου υἱός, οἰκίας μεγά-
λης τε καὶ εὐδαίμονος· αὐτὸς δὲ τὴν φύσιν δοκεῖ ἐνά-
μιλλος εἶναι τοῖς ἡλικιώταις. ἐπιθυμεῖν δέ μοι δοκεῖ C
ἐλλόγιμος γενέσθαι ἐν τῇ πόλει. τοῦτο δὲ οἴεταί οἱ
μάλιστα γενέσθαι, εἰ σοὶ συγγένοιτο. ταῦτ' οὖν ἤδη
σὺ σκόπει, πότερον περὶ αὐτῶν μόνος οἴει δεῖν διαλέ-
γεσθαι πρὸς μόνους, ἢ μετ' ἄλλων. Ὀρθῶς, ἔφη, προ-
μηθεῖ, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὑπὲρ ἐμοῦ. ξένον γὰρ ἄνδρα καὶ
ἰόντα εἰς πόλεις μεγάλας, καὶ ἐν ταύταις πείθοντα
τῶν νέων τοὺς βελτίστους ἀπολείποντας τὰς τῶν ἄλ-
λων συνουσίας, καὶ οἰκείων καὶ ὀθνείων, καὶ πρεσβυ-
τέρων καὶ νεωτέρων, ἑαυτῷ συνεῖναι ὡς βελτίους ἐσο- D
μένους διὰ τὴν ἑαυτοῦ συνουσίαν, χρὴ εὐλαβεῖσθαι τὸν

ταῦτα πράττοντα· οὐ γὰρ σμικροὶ περὶ αὐτὰ φθόνοι
τε γίγνονται καὶ ἄλλαι δυσμένειαί τε καὶ ἐπιβουλαί.
ἐγὼ δὲ τὴν σοφιστικὴν τέχνην φημὶ μὲν εἶναι πα-
λαιάν, τοὺς δὲ μεταχειριζομένους αὐτὴν τῶν παλαιῶν
ἀνδρῶν φοβουμένους τὸ ἐπαχθὲς αὐτῆς πρόσχημα ποι-
εῖσθαι καὶ προκαλύπτεσθαι τοὺς μὲν ποίησιν, οἷον
Ὅμηρόν τε καὶ Ἡσίοδον καὶ Σιμωνίδην, τοὺς δὲ αὖ
τελετάς τε καὶ χρησμῳδίας, τοὺς ἀμφί τε Ὀρφέα καὶ
Μουσαῖον, ἐνίους δέ τινας ᾔσθημαι καὶ γυμναστικήν,
οἷον Ἴκκος τε ὁ Ταραντῖνος καὶ ὁ νῦν ἔτι ὢν οὐδενὸς
E ἥττων σοφιστὴς Ἡρόδικος ὁ Σηλυμβριανός, τὸ δὲ ἀρ-
χαῖον Μεγαρεύς· μουσικὴν δὲ Ἀγαθοκλῆς τε ὁ ὑμέ-
τερος πρόσχημα ἐποιήσατο, μέγας ὢν σοφιστής, καὶ
Πυθοκλείδης ὁ Κεῖος καὶ ἄλλοι πολλοί. οὗτοι πάν-
τες, ὥσπερ λέγω, φοβηθέντες τὸν φθόνον ταῖς τέχναις
317 ταύταις παραπετάσμασιν ἐχρήσαντο. ἐγὼ δὲ τούτοις
ἅπασι κατὰ τοῦτο εἶναι οὐ ξυμφέρομαι. ἡγοῦμαι γὰρ
αὐτοὺς οὔ τι διαπράξασθαι ὃ ἐβουλήθησαν· οὐ γὰρ
λαθεῖν τῶν ἀνθρώπων τοὺς δυναμένους ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι
πράττειν, ὧνπερ ἕνεκα ταῦτ᾽ ἐστὶ τὰ προσχήματα,
ἐπεὶ οἵ γε πολλοί, ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν, οὐδὲν αἰσθάνονται,
ἀλλ᾽ ἅττ᾽ ἂν οὗτοι διαγγέλλωσι, ταῦτα ὑμνοῦσι. τὸ
οὖν ἀποδιδράσκοντα μὴ δύνασθαι ἀποδρᾶναι, ἀλλὰ
καταφανῆ εἶναι, πολλὴ μωρία καὶ τοῦ ἐπιχειρήματος,
B καὶ πολὺ δυσμενεστέρους παρέχεσθαι ἀνάγκη τοὺς ἀν-
θρώπους· ἡγοῦνται γὰρ τὸν τοιοῦτον πρὸς τοῖς ἄλλοις
καὶ πανοῦργον εἶναι. ἐγὼ οὖν τούτων τὴν ἐναντίαν
ἅπασαν ὁδὸν ἐλήλυθα, καὶ ὁμολογῶ τε σοφιστὴς εἶναι
καὶ παιδεύειν ἀνθρώπους, καὶ εὐλάβειαν ταύτην οἶμαι
βελτίω ἐκείνης εἶναι, τὸ ὁμολογεῖν μᾶλλον ἢ ἔξαρνον
εἶναι· καὶ ἄλλας πρὸς ταύτῃ ἔσκεμμαι, ὥστε, σὺν θεῷ
C εἰπεῖν, μηδὲν δεινὸν πάσχειν διὰ τὸ ὁμολογεῖν σοφι-

στὴς εἶναι. καίτοι πολλά γε ἔτη ἤδη εἰμὶ ἐν τῇ τέχνῃ. καὶ γὰρ καὶ τὰ ξύμπαντα πολλά μοί ἐστιν· οὐδενὸς ὅτου οὐ πάντων ἂν ὑμῶν καθ' ἡλικίαν πατὴρ εἴην. ὥστε πολύ μοι ἥδιστόν ἐστιν, εἴ τι βούλεσθε, περὶ τούτων ἁπάντων ἐναντίον τῶν ἔνδον ὄντων τὸν λόγον ποιεῖσθαι. Καὶ ἐγώ—ὑπώπτευσα γὰρ βούλεσθαι αὐτὸν τῷ τε Προδίκῳ καὶ τῷ Ἱππίᾳ ἐνδείξασθαι καὶ καλλωπίσασθαι, ὅτι ἐρασταὶ αὐτοῦ ἀφιγμένοι εἴημεν —Τί οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὐ καὶ Πρόδικον καὶ Ἱππίαν ἐκα- D
λέσαμεν καὶ τοὺς μετ' αὐτῶν, ἵνα ἐπακούσωσιν ἡμῶν; Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη ὁ Πρωταγόρας. Βούλεσθε οὖν, ὁ Καλλίας ἔφη, συνέδριον κατασκευάσωμεν, ἵνα καθιζόμενοι διαλέγησθε; Ἐδόκει χρῆναι. ἄσμενοι δὲ πάντες ἡμεῖς, ὡς ἀκουσόμενοι ἀνδρῶν σοφῶν, καὶ αὐτοὶ ἀντιλαβόμενοι τῶν βάθρων καὶ τῶν κλινῶν κατεσκευάζομεν παρὰ τῷ Ἱππίᾳ· ἐκεῖ γὰρ προϋπῆρχε τὰ βάθρα· ἐν δὲ τούτῳ Καλλίας τε καὶ Ἀλκιβιάδης ἡκέ- E
την ἄγοντε τὸν Πρόδικον, ἀναστήσαντες ἐκ τῆς κλίνης, καὶ τοὺς μετὰ τοῦ Προδίκου.

IX. Ἐπεὶ δὲ πάντες συνεκαθεζόμεθα, ὁ Πρωταγόρας, Νῦν δὴ ἄν, ἔφη, λέγοις, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐπειδὴ καὶ οἵδε πάρεισι, περὶ ὧν ὀλίγον πρότερον μνείαν ἐποιοῦ πρὸς ἐμὲ ὑπὲρ τοῦ νεανίσκου. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον, ὅτι Ἡ αὐτή μοι ἀρχή ἐστιν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ἥπερ ἄρτι, 318
περὶ ὧν ἀφικόμην. Ἱπποκράτης γὰρ ὅδε τυγχάνει ἐν ἐπιθυμίᾳ ὢν τῆς σῆς συνουσίας· ὅ τι οὖν αὐτῷ ἀποβήσεται, ἐάν σοι συνῇ, ἡδέως ἂν φησι πυθέσθαι. τοσοῦτος ὅ γε ἡμέτερος λόγος. Ὑπολαβὼν οὖν ὁ Πρωταγόρας εἶπεν· Ὦ νεανίσκε, ἔσται τοίνυν σοι, ἐὰν ἐμοὶ συνῇς, ᾗ ἂν ἡμέρᾳ ἐμοὶ συγγένῃ, ἀπιέναι οἴκαδε βελτίονι γεγονότι, καὶ ἐν τῇ ὑστεραίᾳ ταὐτὰ ταῦτα, καὶ ἑκάστης ἡμέρας ἀεὶ ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιον ἐπιδιδόναι. Καὶ

B ἐγὼ ἀκούσας εἶπον· Ὦ Πρωταγόρα, τοῦτο μὲν οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν λέγεις, ἀλλὰ εἰκός, ἐπεὶ κἂν σύ, καίπερ τηλικοῦτος ὢν καὶ οὕτω σοφός, εἴ τίς σε διδάξειεν ὃ μὴ τυγχάνεις ἐπιστάμενος, βελτίων ἂν γένοιο. ἀλλὰ μὴ οὕτως, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ αὐτίκα μάλα μεταβαλὼν τὴν ἐπιθυμίαν Ἱπποκράτης ὅδε ἐπιθυμήσειε τῆς συνουσίας τούτου τοῦ νεανίσκου τοῦ νῦν νεωστὶ ἐπιδημοῦντος, Ζευξίππου τοῦ Ἡρακλεώτου, καὶ ἀφικόμενος παρ' αὐτόν, ὥσπερ παρὰ σὲ νῦν, ἀκούσειεν αὐτοῦ ταὐτὰ ταῦτα, ἅπερ σοῦ, ὅτι ἑκάστης ἡμέρας ξυνὼν αὐτῷ C βελτίων ἔσται καὶ ἐπιδώσει, εἰ αὐτὸν ἐπανέροιτο· Τί δὴ φῂς βελτίω ἔσεσθαι καὶ εἰς τί ἐπιδώσειν; εἴποι ἂν αὐτῷ ὁ Ζεύξιππος, ὅτι πρὸς γραφικήν· κἂν εἰ Ὀρθαγόρᾳ τῷ Θηβαίῳ συγγενόμενος, ἀκούσας ἐκείνου ταὐτὰ ταῦτα, ἅπερ σοῦ, ἐπανέροιτο αὐτόν, εἰς ὅ τι βελτίων καθ' ἡμέραν ἔσται συγγιγνόμενος ἐκείνῳ, εἴποι ἄν, ὅτι εἰς αὔλησιν· οὕτω δὴ καὶ σὺ εἰπὲ τῷ D νεανίσκῳ καὶ ἐμοὶ ὑπὲρ τούτου ερωτῶντι, Ἱπποκράτης ὅδε Πρωταγόρᾳ συγγενόμενος, ᾗ ἂν αὐτῷ ἡμέρᾳ συγγένηται, βελτίων ἄπεισι γενόμενος καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἡμερῶν ἑκάστης οὕτως ἐπιδώσει εἰς τί, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, καὶ περὶ τοῦ; Καὶ ὁ Πρωταγόρας ἐμοῦ ταῦτα ἀκούσας, Σύ τε καλῶς ἐρωτᾷς, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἐγὼ τοῖς καλῶς ἐρωτῶσι χαίρω ἀποκρινόμενος. Ἱπποκράτης γὰρ παρ' ἐμὲ ἀφικόμενος οὐ πείσεται ἅπερ ἂν ἔπαθεν ἄλλῳ τῳ συγγενόμενος τῶν σοφιστῶν. οἱ μὲν γὰρ ἄλλοι E λωβῶνται τοὺς νέους· τὰς γὰρ τέχνας αὐτοὺς πεφευγότας ἄκοντας πάλιν αὖ ἄγοντες ἐμβάλλουσιν εἰς τέχνας, λογισμούς τε καὶ ἀστρονομίαν καὶ γεωμετρίαν καὶ μουσικὴν διδάσκοντες — καὶ ἅμα εἰς τὸν Ἱππίαν ἀπέβλεψε —. παρὰ δ' ἐμὲ ἀφικόμενος μαθήσεται οὐ περὶ ἄλλου του ἢ περὶ οὗ ἥκει. τὸ δὲ μάθημά ἐστιν

εὐβουλία περί τε τῶν οἰκείων, ὅπως ἂν ἄριστα τὴν
αὐτοῦ οἰκίαν διοικοῖ, καὶ περὶ τῶν τῆς πόλεως, ὅπως
τὰ τῆς πόλεως δυνατώτατος ἂν εἴη καὶ πράττειν καὶ
λέγειν. Ἆρ', ἔφην ἐγώ, ἕπομαί σου τῷ λόγῳ; δοκεῖς 319
γάρ μοι λέγειν τὴν πολιτικὴν τέχνην καὶ ὑπισχνεῖσθαι
ποιεῖν ἄνδρας ἀγαθοὺς πολίτας. Αὐτὸ μὲν οὖν τοῦτό
ἐστιν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, τὸ ἐπάγγελμα, ὃ ἐπαγγέλλομαι.
Χ. Ἦ καλόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τέχνημα ἄρα κέκτησαι,
εἴπερ κέκτησαι· οὐ γάρ τι ἄλλο πρός γε σὲ εἰρήσεται
ἢ ἅπερ νοῶ. ἐγὼ γὰρ τοῦτο, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, οὐκ
ᾤμην διδακτὸν εἶναι, σοὶ δὲ λέγοντι οὐκ ἔχω ὅπως
ἀπιστῶ. ὅθεν δὲ αὐτὸ ἡγοῦμαι οὐ διδακτὸν εἶναι μηδ' B
ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων παρασκευαστὸν ἀνθρώποις, δίκαιός εἰμι
εἰπεῖν. ἐγὼ γὰρ Ἀθηναίους, ὥσπερ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι Ἕλ-
ληνες, φημὶ σοφοὺς εἶναι. ὁρῶ οὖν, ὅταν συλλεγῶμεν
εἰς τὴν ἐκκλησίαν, ἐπειδὰν μὲν περὶ οἰκοδομίας τι δέῃ
πρᾶξαι τὴν πόλιν, τοὺς οἰκοδόμους μεταπεμπομένους
συμβούλους περὶ τῶν οἰκοδομημάτων, ὅταν δὲ περὶ
ναυπηγίας, τοὺς ναυπηγούς· καὶ τἆλλα πάντα οὕτως, C
ὅσα ἡγοῦνται μαθητά τε καὶ διδακτὰ εἶναι. ἐὰν δέ τις
ἄλλος ἐπιχειρῇ αὐτοῖς συμβουλεύειν, ὃν ἐκεῖνοι μὴ
οἴονται δημιουργὸν εἶναι, κἂν πάνυ καλὸς ᾖ καὶ πλού-
σιος καὶ τῶν γενναίων, οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον ἀποδέχονται,
ἀλλὰ καταγελῶσι καὶ θορυβοῦσιν, ἕως ἂν ἢ αὐτὸς
ἀποστῇ ὁ ἐπιχειρῶν λέγειν καταθορυβηθείς, ἢ οἱ το-
ξόται αὐτὸν ἀφελκύσωσιν ἢ ἐξαίρωνται κελευόντων
τῶν πρυτάνεων. περὶ μὲν οὖν ὧν οἴονται ἐν τέχνῃ
εἶναι, οὕτω διαπράττονται· ἐπειδὰν δέ τι περὶ τῆς D
πόλεως διοικήσεως δέῃ βουλεύσασθαι, συμβουλεύει
αὐτοῖς ἀνιστάμενος περὶ τούτων ὁμοίως μὲν τέκτων,
ὁμοίως δὲ χαλκεύς, σκυτοτόμος, ἔμπορος ναύκληρος,
πλούσιος πένης, γενναῖος ἀγεννής, καὶ τούτοις οὐδεὶς

τοῦτο ἐπιπλήττει ὥσπερ τοῖς πρότερον, ὅτι οὐδαμόθεν μαθών, οὐδὲ ὄντος διδασκάλου οὐδενὸς αὐτῷ, ἔπειτα συμβουλεύειν ἐπιχειρεῖ· δῆλον γάρ, ὅτι οὐχ ἡγοῦνται διδακτὸν εἶναι. μὴ τοίνυν ὅτι τὸ κοινὸν τῆς πόλεως
E οὕτως ἔχει, ἀλλ' ἰδίᾳ ἡμῖν οἱ σοφώτατοι καὶ ἄριστοι τῶν πολιτῶν ταύτην τὴν ἀρετὴν ἣν ἔχουσιν οὐχ οἷοί τε ἄλλοις παραδιδόναι· ἐπεὶ Περικλῆς, ὁ τουτωνὶ τῶν νεανίσκων πατήρ, τούτους ἃ μὲν διδασκάλων εἴχετο καλῶς καὶ εὖ ἐπαίδευσεν, ἃ δὲ αὐτὸς σοφός ἐστιν οὔτε
320 αὐτὸς παιδεύει οὔτε τῳ ἄλλῳ παραδίδωσιν, ἀλλ' αὐτοὶ περιιόντες νέμονται ὥσπερ ἄφετοι, ἐάν που αὐτόματοι περιτύχωσι τῇ ἀρετῇ. εἰ δὲ βούλει, Κλεινίαν, τὸν Ἀλκιβιάδου τουτουὶ νεώτερον ἀδελφόν, ἐπιτροπεύων ὁ αὐτὸς οὗτος ἀνὴρ Περικλῆς, δεδιὼς περὶ αὐτοῦ, μὴ διαφθαρῇ δὴ ὑπ' Ἀλκιβιάδου, ἀποσπάσας ἀπὸ τούτου, καταθέμενος ἐν Ἀρίφρονος ἐπαίδευε· καὶ πρὶν ἓξ μῆνας γεγονέναι, ἀπέδωκε τούτῳ οὐκ ἔχων ὅ τι χρή-
B σαιτο αὐτῷ. καὶ ἄλλους σοι παμπόλλους ἔχω λέγειν, οἳ αὐτοὶ ἀγαθοὶ ὄντες οὐδένα πώποτε βελτίω ἐποίησαν οὔτε τῶν οἰκείων οὔτε τῶν ἀλλοτρίων. ἐγὼ οὖν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, εἰς ταῦτα ἀποβλέπων οὐχ ἡγοῦμαι διδακτὸν εἶναι ἀρετήν· ἐπειδὴ δὲ σοῦ ἀκούω ταῦτα λέγοντος, κάμπτομαι καὶ οἶμαί τί σε λέγειν διὰ τὸ ἡγεῖσθαί σε πολλῶν μὲν ἔμπειρον γεγονέναι, πολλὰ δὲ μεμαθηκέναι, τὰ δὲ αὐτὸν ἐξευρηκέναι. εἰ οὖν ἔχεις ἐναργέστερον ἡμῖν ἐπιδεῖξαι, ὡς διδακτόν ἐστιν ἡ
C ἀρετή, μὴ φθονήσῃς, ἀλλ' ἐπίδειξον. Ἀλλ', ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, οὐ φθονήσω. ἀλλὰ πότερον ὑμῖν, ὡς πρεσβύτερος νεωτέροις, μῦθον λέγων ἐπιδείξω, ἢ λόγῳ διεξελθών; Πολλοὶ οὖν αὐτῷ ὑπέλαβον τῶν παρακαθημένων, ὁποτέρως βούλοιτο, οὕτω διεξιέναι. Δοκεῖ τοίνυν μοι, ἔφη, χαριέστερον εἶναι μῦθον ὑμῖν λέγειν.

XI. Ἦν γάρ ποτε χρόνος, ὅτε θεοὶ μὲν ἦσαν,
θνητὰ δὲ γένη οὐκ ἦν. ἐπειδὴ δὲ καὶ τούτοις χρόνος D
ἦλθεν εἱμαρμένος γενέσεως, τυποῦσιν αὐτὰ θεοὶ γῆς
ἔνδον ἐκ γῆς καὶ πυρὸς μίξαντες καὶ τῶν ὅσα πυρὶ
καὶ γῇ κεράννυται. ἐπειδὴ δ' ἄγειν αὐτὰ πρὸς φῶς
ἔμελλον, προσέταξαν Προμηθεῖ καὶ Ἐπιμηθεῖ κοσμῆ-
σαί τε καὶ νεῖμαι δυνάμεις ἑκάστοις ὡς πρέπει.
Προμηθέα δὲ παραιτεῖται Ἐπιμηθεὺς αὐτὸς νεῖμαι·
Νείμαντος δ' ἐμοῦ, ἔφη, ἐπίσκεψαι. καὶ οὕτω πείσας
νέμει. νέμων δὲ τοῖς μὲν ἰσχὺν ἄνευ τάχους προσῆπτε, E
τοὺς δ' ἀσθενεστέρους τάχει ἐκόσμει· τοὺς δὲ ὥπλι-
ζε, τοῖς δ' ἄοπλον διδοὺς φύσιν ἄλλην τιν' αὐτοῖς ἐμη-
χανᾶτο δύναμιν εἰς σωτηρίαν. ἃ μὲν γὰρ αὐτῶν σμι-
κρότητι ἤμπισχε, πτηνὸν φυγὴν ἢ κατάγειον οἴκησιν
ἔνεμεν· ἃ δὲ ηὖξε μεγέθει, τῷδε αὐτῷ αὐτὰ ἔσωζε· καὶ 321
τἆλλα οὕτως ἐπανισῶν ἔνεμε. ταῦτα δὲ ἐμηχανᾶτο
εὐλάβειαν ἔχων, μή τι γένος ἀϊστωθείη. ἐπειδὴ δὲ
αὐτοῖς ἀλληλοφθοριῶν διαφυγὰς ἐπήρκεσε, πρὸς τὰς
ἐκ Διὸς ὥρας εὐμάρειαν ἐμηχανᾶτο ἀμφιεννὺς αὐτὰ
πυκναῖς τε θριξὶ καὶ στερεοῖς δέρμασιν, ἱκανοῖς μὲν
ἀμῦναι χειμῶνα, δυνατοῖς δὲ καὶ καύματα, καὶ εἰς
εὐνὰς ἰοῦσιν ὅπως ὑπάρχοι τὰ αὐτὰ ταῦτα στρωμνὴ
οἰκεία τε καὶ αὐτοφυὴς ἑκάστῳ, καὶ ὑποδῶν τὰ μὲν B
ὁπλαῖς, τὰ δὲ ὄνυξι καὶ δέρμασι στερεοῖς καὶ ἀναίμοις.
τοὐντεῦθεν τροφὰς ἄλλοις ἄλλας ἐξεπόριζε, τοῖς μὲν
ἐκ γῆς βοτάνην, ἄλλοις δὲ δένδρων καρπούς, τοῖς δὲ
ῥίζας· ἔστι δ' οἷς ἔδωκεν εἶναι τροφὴν ζώων ἄλλων
βοράν. καὶ τοῖς μὲν ὀλιγογονίαν προσῆψε, τοῖς δ'
ἀναλισκομένοις ὑπὸ τούτων πολυγονίαν, σωτηρίαν τῷ
γένει πορίζων. ἅτε δὴ οὖν οὐ πάνυ τι σοφὸς ὢν ὁ C
Ἐπιμηθεὺς ἔλαθεν αὑτὸν καταναλώσας τὰς δυνάμεις.
λοιπὸν δ' ἀκόσμητον ἔτι αὐτῷ ἦν τὸ ἀνθρώπων γένος,

καὶ ἠπόρει ὅ τι χρήσαιτο. ἀποροῦντι δὲ αὐτῷ ἔρχεται
Προμηθεὺς ἐπισκεψόμενος τὴν νομήν, καὶ ὁρᾷ τὰ μὲν
ἄλλα ζῶα ἐμμελῶς πάντων ἔχοντα, τὸν δὲ ἄνθρωπον
γυμνόν τε καὶ ἀνυπόδητον καὶ ἄστρωτον καὶ ἄοπλον.
ἤδη δὲ καὶ ἡ εἱμαρμένη ἡμέρα παρῆν, ἐν ᾗ ἔδει καὶ
ἄνθρωπον ἐξιέναι ἐκ γῆς εἰς φῶς. ἀπορίᾳ οὖν ἐχό-
D μενος ὁ Προμηθεύς, ἥντινα σωτηρίαν τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ
εὕροι, κλέπτει Ἡφαίστου καὶ Ἀθηνᾶς τὴν ἔντεχνον
σοφίαν σὺν πυρί—ἀμήχανον γὰρ ἦν ἄνευ πυρὸς αὐ-
τὴν κτητήν τῳ ἢ χρησίμην γενέσθαι—, καὶ οὕτω δὴ
δωρεῖται ἀνθρώπῳ. τὴν μὲν οὖν περὶ τὸν βίον σοφίαν
ἄνθρωπος ταύτῃ ἔσχε, τὴν δὲ πολιτικὴν οὐκ εἶχεν·
ἦν γὰρ παρὰ τῷ Διί· τῷ δὲ Προμηθεῖ εἰς μὲν τὴν
ἀκρόπολιν τὴν τοῦ Διὸς οἴκησιν οὐκέτι ἐνεχώρει εἰσελ-
θεῖν· πρὸς δὲ καὶ αἱ Διὸς φυλακαὶ φοβεραὶ ἦσαν· εἰς
E δὲ τὸ τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς καὶ Ἡφαίστου οἴκημα τὸ κοινόν,
ἐν ᾧ ἐφιλοτεχνείτην, λαθὼν εἰσέρχεται, καὶ κλέψας
τήν τε ἔμπυρον τέχνην τὴν τοῦ Ἡφαίστου καὶ τὴν
ἄλλην τὴν τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς δίδωσιν ἀνθρώπῳ, καὶ ἐκ τού-
του εὐπορία μὲν ἀνθρώπῳ τοῦ βίου γίγνεται, Προμη-
θέα δὲ δι' Ἐπιμηθέα ὕστερον, ᾗπερ λέγεται, κλοπῆς
322 δίκη μετῆλθεν.

XII. Ἐπειδὴ δὲ ὁ ἄνθρωπος θείας μετέσχε μοί-
ρας, πρῶτον μὲν διὰ τὴν τοῦ θεοῦ συγγένειαν ζώων
μόνον θεοὺς ἐνόμισε, καὶ ἐπεχείρει βωμούς τε ἱδρύ-
εσθαι καὶ ἀγάλματα θεῶν· ἔπειτα φωνὴν καὶ ὀνόματα
ταχὺ διηρθρώσατο τῇ τέχνῃ, καὶ οἰκήσεις καὶ ἐσθῆ-
τας καὶ ὑποδέσεις καὶ στρωμνὰς καὶ τὰς ἐκ γῆς τρο-
φὰς εὕρετο. οὕτω δὴ παρεσκευασμένοι κατ' ἀρχὰς ἄν-
B θρωποι ᾤκουν σποράδην, πόλεις δὲ οὐκ ἦσαν. ἀπώλ-
λυντο οὖν ὑπὸ τῶν θηρίων διὰ τὸ πανταχῇ αὐτῶν

ἀσθενέστεροι εἶναι, καὶ ἡ δημιουργικὴ τέχνη αὐτοῖς πρὸς μὲν τροφὴν ἱκανὴ βοηθὸς ἦν, πρὸς δὲ τὸν τῶν θηρίων πόλεμον ἐνδεής· πολιτικὴν γὰρ τέχνην οὔπω εἶχον, ἧς μέρος πολεμική. ἐζήτουν δὴ ἀθροίζεσθαι καὶ σῴζεσθαι κτίζοντες πόλεις. ὅτ' οὖν ἀθροισθεῖεν, ἠδίκουν ἀλλήλους, ἅτε οὐκ ἔχοντες τὴν πολιτικὴν τέχνην, ὥστε πάλιν σκεδαννύμενοι διεφθείροντο. Ζεὺς οὖν C δείσας περὶ τῷ γένει ἡμῶν, μὴ ἀπόλοιτο πᾶν, Ἑρμῆν πέμπει ἄγοντα εἰς ἀνθρώπους αἰδῶ τε καὶ δίκην, ἵν' εἶεν πόλεων κόσμοι τε καὶ δεσμοὶ φιλίας συναγωγοί. ἐρωτᾷ οὖν Ἑρμῆς Δία, τίνα οὖν τρόπον δοίη δίκην καὶ αἰδῶ ἀνθρώποις. πότερον ὡς αἱ τέχναι νενέμηνται, οὕτω καὶ ταύτας νείμω; νενέμηνται δὲ ὧδε· εἷς ἔχων ἰατρικὴν πολλοῖς ἱκανὸς ἰδιώταις, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι δημιουργοί. καὶ δίκην δὴ καὶ αἰδῶ οὕτω θῶ ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις, ἢ ἐπὶ πάντας νείμω; Ἐπὶ πάντας, ἔφη D ὁ Ζεύς, καὶ πάντες μετεχόντων· οὐ γὰρ ἂν γένοιντο πόλεις, εἰ ὀλίγοι αὐτῶν μετέχοιεν ὥσπερ ἄλλων τεχνῶν. καὶ νόμον γε θὲς παρ' ἐμοῦ τὸν μὴ δυνάμενον αἰδοῦς καὶ δίκης μετέχειν κτείνειν ὡς νόσον πόλεως.

Οὕτω δή, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ διὰ ταῦτα οἵ τε ἄλλοι καὶ Ἀθηναῖοι, ὅταν μὲν περὶ ἀρετῆς τεκτονικῆς ᾖ λόγος ἢ ἄλλης τινὸς δημιουργικῆς, ὀλίγοις οἴονται μετεῖναι συμβουλῆς, καὶ ἐάν τις ἐκτὸς ὢν τῶν ὀλίγων E συμβουλεύῃ, οὐκ ἀνέχονται, ὡς σὺ φῄς· εἰκότως, ὡς ἐγώ φημι· ὅταν δὲ εἰς συμβουλὴν πολιτικῆς ἀρετῆς ἴωσιν, ἣν δεῖ διὰ δικαιοσύνης πᾶσαν ἰέναι καὶ σωφρο- 323 σύνης, εἰκότως ἅπαντος ἀνδρὸς ἀνέχονται, ὡς παντὶ προσῆκον ταύτης γε μετέχειν τῆς ἀρετῆς, ἢ μὴ εἶναι πόλεις. αὕτη, ὦ Σώκρατες, τούτου αἰτία.

Ἵνα δὲ μὴ οἴῃ ἀπατᾶσθαι, ὡς τῷ ὄντι ἡγοῦνται

πάντες ἄνθρωποι πάντα ἄνδρα μετέχειν δικαιοσύνης
τε καὶ τῆς ἄλλης πολιτικῆς ἀρετῆς, τόδε αὖ λαβὲ
τεκμήριον. Ἐν γὰρ ταῖς ἄλλαις ἀρεταῖς, ὥσπερ σὺ
λέγεις, ἐάν τις φῇ ἀγαθὸς αὐλητὴς εἶναι ἢ ἄλλην ἡν-
τινοῦν τέχνην, ἣν μή ἐστιν, ἢ καταγελῶσιν ἢ χαλε-
B παίνουσι, καὶ οἱ οἰκεῖοι προσιόντες νουθετοῦσιν ὡς
μαινόμενον· ἐν δὲ δικαιοσύνῃ καὶ ἐν τῇ ἄλλῃ πολιτικῇ
ἀρετῇ, ἐάν τινα καὶ εἰδῶσιν, ὅτι ἄδικός ἐστιν, ἐὰν οὗ-
τος αὐτὸς καθ' αὑτοῦ τἀληθῆ λέγῃ ἐναντίον πολλῶν,
ὃ ἐκεῖ σωφροσύνην ἡγοῦντο εἶναι, τἀληθῆ λέγειν, ἐν-
ταῦθα μανίαν, καί φασι πάντας δεῖν φάναι εἶναι δικαί-
ους, ἐάν τε ὦσιν ἐάν τε μή, ἢ μαίνεσθαι τὸν μὴ προσ-
C ποιούμενον δικαιοσύνην, ὡς ἀναγκαῖον οὐδένα ὅντιν'
οὐχὶ ἀμωσγέπως μετέχειν αὐτῆς, ἢ μὴ εἶναι ἐν ἀν-
θρώποις.

XIII. Ὅτι μὲν οὖν πάντ' ἄνδρα εἰκότως ἀποδέ-
χονται περὶ ταύτης τῆς ἀρετῆς σύμβουλον διὰ τὸ
ἡγεῖσθαι παντὶ μετεῖναι αὐτῆς, ταῦτα λέγω· ὅτι δὲ
αὐτὴν οὐ φύσει ἡγοῦνται εἶναι οὐδ' ἀπὸ τοῦ αὐτομά-
του, ἀλλὰ διδακτόν τε καὶ ἐξ ἐπιμελείας παραγίγνε-
σθαι ᾧ ἂν παραγίγνηται, τοῦτό σοι μετὰ τοῦτο πει-
ράσομαι ἀποδεῖξαι. Ὅσα γὰρ ἡγοῦνται ἀλλήλους
D κακὰ ἔχειν ἄνθρωποι φύσει ἢ τύχῃ, οὐδεὶς θυμοῦται,
οὐδὲ νουθετεῖ, οὐδὲ διδάσκει, οὐδὲ κολάζει τοὺς ταῦτα
ἔχοντας, ἵνα μὴ τοιοῦτοι ὦσιν, ἀλλ' ἐλεοῦσιν. οἷον
τοὺς αἰσχροὺς ἢ σμικροὺς ἢ ἀσθενεῖς τίς οὕτως ἀνόη-
τος, ὥστε τι τούτων ἐπιχειρεῖν ποιεῖν; ταῦτα μὲν
γάρ, οἶμαι, ἴσασιν ὅτι φύσει τε καὶ τύχῃ τοῖς ἀνθρώ-
ποις γίγνεται τὰ καλὰ καὶ τἀναντία τούτοις· ὅσα δὲ
E ἐξ ἐπιμελείας καὶ ἀσκήσεως καὶ διδαχῆς οἴονται γί-
γνεσθαι ἀγαθὰ ἀνθρώποις, ἐάν τις ταῦτα μὴ ἔχῃ,
ἀλλὰ τἀναντία τούτων κακά, ἐπὶ τούτοις πού οἵ τε

θυμοὶ γίγνονται καὶ αἱ κολάσεις καὶ αἱ νουθετήσεις.
ὧν ἐστιν ἓν καὶ ἡ ἀδικία καὶ ἡ ἀσέβεια καὶ συλλήβδην
πᾶν τὸ ἐναντίον τῆς πολιτικῆς ἀρετῆς. ἔνθα δὴ πᾶς 324
παντὶ θυμοῦται καὶ νουθετεῖ, δῆλον ὅτι ὡς ἐξ ἐπιμε-
λείας καὶ μαθήσεως κτητῆς οὔσης. εἰ γὰρ ἐθέλεις
ἐννοῆσαι τὸ κολάζειν, ὦ Σώκρατες, τοὺς ἀδικοῦντας τί
ποτε δύναται, αὐτό σε διδάξει, ὅτι οἵ γε ἄνθρωποι
ἡγοῦνται παρασκευαστὸν εἶναι ἀρετήν. οὐδεὶς γὰρ
κολάζει τοὺς ἀδικοῦντας πρὸς τούτῳ τὸν νοῦν ἔχων B
καὶ τούτου ἕνεκα, ὅτι ἠδίκησεν, ὅστις μὴ ὥσπερ θη-
ρίον ἀλογίστως τιμωρεῖται· ὁ δὲ μετὰ λόγου ἐπιχειρῶν
κολάζειν οὐ τοῦ παρεληλυθότος ἕνεκα ἀδικήματος τι-
μωρεῖται—οὐ γὰρ ἂν τό γε πραχθὲν ἀγένητον θείη—
ἀλλὰ τοῦ μέλλοντος χάριν, ἵνα μὴ αὖθις ἀδικήσῃ μήτε
αὐτὸς οὗτος μήτε ἄλλος ὁ τοῦτον ἰδὼν κολασθέντα.
καὶ τοιαύτην διάνοιαν ἔχων διανοεῖται παιδευτὴν εἶναι
ἀρετήν· ἀποτροπῆς γοῦν ἕνεκα κολάζει. ταύτην οὖν
τὴν δόξαν πάντες ἔχουσιν, ὅσοιπερ τιμωροῦνται καὶ C
ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ. τιμωροῦνται δὲ καὶ κολάζονται οἵ
τε ἄλλοι ἄνθρωποι οὓς ἂν οἴωνται ἀδικεῖν, καὶ οὐχ
ἥκιστα Ἀθηναῖοι, οἱ σοὶ πολῖται· ὥστε κατὰ τοῦτον
τὸν λόγον καὶ Ἀθηναῖοί εἰσι τῶν ἡγουμένων παρα-
σκευαστὸν εἶναι καὶ διδακτὸν ἀρετήν. Ὡς μὲν οὖν
εἰκότως ἀποδέχονται οἱ σοὶ πολῖται καὶ χαλκέως καὶ
σκυτοτόμου συμβουλεύοντος τὰ πολιτικά, καὶ ὅτι δι- D
δακτὸν καὶ παρασκευαστὸν ἡγοῦνται ἀρετήν, ἀποδέ-
δεικταί σοι, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἱκανῶς, ὥς γ' ἐμοὶ φαίνεται.

XIV. Ἔτι δὴ λοιπὴ ἡ ἀπορία ἐστίν, ἣν ἀπορεῖς
περὶ τῶν ἀνδρῶν τῶν ἀγαθῶν, τί δήποτε οἱ ἄνδρες οἱ
ἀγαθοὶ τὰ μὲν ἄλλα τοὺς αὑτῶν υἱεῖς διδάσκουσιν ἃ
διδασκάλων ἔχεται καὶ σοφοὺς ποιοῦσιν, ἣν δὲ αὐτοὶ
ἀρετὴν ἀγαθοί, οὐδενὸς βελτίους ποιοῦσι. τούτου δὴ

πέρι, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὐκέτι μῦθόν σοι ἐρῶ, ἀλλὰ λόγον. ὧδε γὰρ ἐννόησον. Πότερον ἔστι τι ἕν, ἢ οὐκ ἔστιν, οὗ ἀναγκαῖον πάντας τοὺς πολίτας μετέχειν, εἴπερ E μέλλει πόλις εἶναι; ἐν τούτῳ γὰρ αὕτη λύεται ἡ ἀπορία, ἣν σὺ ἀπορεῖς, ἢ ἄλλοθι οὐδαμοῦ, εἰ μὲν γὰρ ἔστι, καὶ τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ ἓν οὐ τεκτονική, οὐδὲ χαλκεία, οὐδὲ κεραμεία, ἀλλὰ δικαιοσύνη καὶ σωφροσύνη καὶ 325 τὸ ὅσιον εἶναι, καὶ συλλήβδην ἓν αὐτὸ προσαγορεύω εἶναι ἀνδρὸς ἀρετήν· εἰ τοῦτ' ἐστὶν οὗ δεῖ πάντας μετέχειν καὶ μετὰ τούτου πάντ' ἄνδρα, ἐάν τι καὶ ἄλλο βούληται μανθάνειν ἢ πράττειν, οὕτω πράττειν, ἄνευ δὲ τούτου μή, ἢ τὸν μὴ μετέχοντα καὶ διδάσκειν καὶ κολάζειν καὶ παῖδα καὶ ἄνδρα καὶ γυναῖκα, ἕωσπερ ἂν κολαζόμενος βελτίων γένηται, ὃς δ' ἂν μὴ ὑπακούῃ κολαζόμενος καὶ διδασκόμενος, ὡς B ἀνίατον ὄντα τοῦτον ἐκβάλλειν ἐκ τῶν πόλεων ἢ ἀποκτείνειν· εἰ οὕτω μὲν ἔχει, οὕτω δ' αὐτοῦ πεφυκότος οἱ ἀγαθοὶ ἄνδρες εἰ τὰ μὲν ἄλλα διδάσκονται τοὺς υἱεῖς, τοῦτο δὲ μή, σκέψαι, ὡς θαυμασίως γίγνονται οἱ ἀγαθοί. ὅτι μὲν γὰρ διδακτὸν αὐτὸ ἡγοῦνται καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ, ἀπεδείξαμεν· διδακτοῦ δὲ ὄντος καὶ θεραπευτοῦ, τὰ μὲν ἄλλα ἄρα τοὺς υἱεῖς διδάσκονται, ἐφ' οἷς οὐκ ἔστι θάνατος ἡ ζημία, ἐὰν μὴ ἐπιστῶνται, ἐφ' ᾧ δὲ ἥ τε ζημία θάνατος αὐτῶν C τοῖς παισὶ καὶ φυγαὶ μὴ μαθοῦσι μηδὲ θεραπευθεῖσιν εἰς ἀρετήν, καὶ πρὸς τῷ θανάτῳ χρημάτων τε δημεύσεις καὶ ὡς ἔπος εἰπεῖν ξυλλήβδην τῶν οἴκων ἀνατροπαί, ταῦτα δ' ἄρα οὐ διδάσκονται, οὐδ' ἐπιμελοῦνται πᾶσαν ἐπιμέλειαν; Οἴεσθαί γε χρή, ὦ Σώκρατες.

XV. Ἐκ παίδων σμικρῶν ἀρξάμενοι μέχρι οὗπερ ἂν ζῶσι καὶ διδάσκουσι καὶ νουθετοῦσιν. ἐπειδὰν

θᾶττον συνιῇ τις τὰ λεγόμενα, καὶ τροφὸς καὶ μήτηρ
καὶ παιδαγωγὸς καὶ αὐτὸς ὁ πατὴρ περὶ τούτου διαμά-
χονται, ὅπως ὡς βέλτιστος ἔσται ὁ παῖς, παρ' ἕκαστον D
καὶ ἔργον καὶ λόγον διδάσκοντες καὶ ἐνδεικνύμενοι, ὅτι
τὸ μὲν δίκαιον, τὸ δὲ ἄδικον, καὶ τόδε μὲν καλόν,
τόδε δὲ αἰσχρόν, καὶ τόδε μὲν ὅσιον, τόδε δὲ ἀνόσιον,
καὶ τὰ μὲν ποίει, τὰ δὲ μὴ ποίει. καὶ ἐὰν μὲν ἑκὼν
πείθηται· εἰ δὲ μή, ὥσπερ ξύλον διαστρεφόμενον καὶ
καμπτόμενον εὐθύνουσιν ἀπειλαῖς καὶ πληγαῖς. Μετὰ
δὲ ταῦτα εἰς διδασκάλων πέμποντες πολὺ μᾶλλον
ἐντέλλονται ἐπιμελεῖσθαι εὐκοσμίας τῶν παίδων ἢ
γραμμάτων τε καὶ κιθαρίσεως. οἱ δὲ διδάσκαλοι E
τούτων τε ἐπιμελοῦνται καὶ ἐπειδὰν αὖ γράμματα
μάθωσι καὶ μέλλωσι συνήσειν τὰ γεγραμμένα, ὥσπερ
τότε τὴν φωνήν, παρατιθέασιν αὐτοῖς ἐπὶ τῶν βά-
θρων ἀναγιγνώσκειν ποιητῶν ἀγαθῶν ποιήματα καὶ
ἐκμανθάνειν ἀναγκάζουσιν, ἐν οἷς πολλαὶ μὲν νουθε- 326
τήσεις ἔνεισι, πολλαὶ δὲ διέξοδοι καὶ ἔπαινοι καὶ
ἐγκώμια παλαιῶν ἀνδρῶν ἀγαθῶν, ἵνα ὁ παῖς ζηλῶν
μιμῆται καὶ ὀρέγηται τοιοῦτος γενέσθαι. οἵ τ' αὖ κιθα-
ρισταὶ ἕτερα τοιαῦτα σωφροσύνης τε ἐπιμελοῦνται
καὶ ὅπως ἂν οἱ νέοι μηδὲν κακουργῶσι. πρὸς δὲ
τούτοις, ἐπειδὰν κιθαρίζειν μάθωσιν, ἄλλων αὖ ποιη-
τῶν ἀγαθῶν ποιήματα διδάσκουσι, μελοποιῶν, εἰς τὰ B
κιθαρίσματα ἐντείνοντες, καὶ τοὺς ῥυθμούς τε καὶ τὰς
ἁρμονίας ἀναγκάζουσιν οἰκειοῦσθαι ταῖς ψυχαῖς τῶν
παίδων, ἵνα ἡμερώτεροί τε ὦσι, καὶ εὐρυθμότεροι καὶ
εὐαρμοστότεροι γιγνόμενοι χρήσιμοι ὦσιν εἰς τὸ λέ-
γειν τε καὶ πράττειν· πᾶς γὰρ ὁ βίος τοῦ ἀνθρώπου
εὐρυθμίας τε καὶ εὐαρμοστίας δεῖται. ἔτι τοίνυν πρὸς
τούτοις εἰς παιδοτρίβου πέμπουσιν, ἵνα τὰ σώματα
βελτίω ἔχοντες ὑπηρετῶσι τῇ διανοίᾳ χρηστῇ οὔσῃ,

C *καὶ μὴ ἀναγκάζωνται ἀποδειλιᾶν διὰ τὴν πονηρίαν τῶν σωμάτων καὶ ἐν τοῖς πολέμοις καὶ ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις πράξεσι. καὶ ταῦτα ποιοῦσιν οἱ μάλιστα δυνάμενοι· μάλιστα δὲ δύνανται οἱ πλουσιώτατοι, καὶ οἱ τούτων υἱεῖς πρωιαίτατα εἰς διδασκάλων τῆς ἡλικίας ἀρξάμενοι φοιτᾶν ὀψιαίτατα ἀπαλλάττονται. Ἐπειδὰν δὲ ἐκ διδασκάλων ἀπαλλαγῶσιν, ἡ* D *πόλις αὖ τούς τε νόμους ἀναγκάζει μανθάνειν καὶ κατὰ τούτους ζῆν κατὰ παράδειγμα, ἵνα μὴ αὐτοὶ ἐφ᾿ αὑτῶν εἰκῇ πράττωσιν, ἀλλ᾿ ἀτεχνῶς ὥσπερ οἱ γραμματισταὶ τοῖς μήπω δεινοῖς γράφειν τῶν παίδων ὑπογράψαντες γραμμὰς τῇ γραφίδι οὕτω τὸ γραμματεῖον διδόασι καὶ ἀναγκάζουσι γράφειν κατὰ τὴν ὑφήγησιν τῶν γραμμῶν, ὣς δὲ καὶ ἡ πόλις νόμους ὑπογράψασα, ἀγαθῶν καὶ παλαιῶν νομοθετῶν εὑρήματα, κατὰ τούτους ἀναγκάζει καὶ ἄρχειν καὶ ἄρχεσθαι, ὃς δ᾿ ἂν ἐκτὸς βαίνῃ τούτων, κολάζει· καὶ ὄνομα τῇ κολάσει ταύτῃ καὶ παρ᾿ ὑμῖν καὶ ἄλλοθι πολλαχοῦ,* E *ὡς εὐθυνούσης τῆς δίκης, εὐθῦναι.* Τοσαύτης οὖν τῆς *ἐπιμελείας οὔσης περὶ ἀρετῆς ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ, θαυμάζεις, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἀπορεῖς, εἰ διδακτὸν ἐστιν ἀρετή; Ἀλλ᾿ οὐ χρὴ θαυμάζειν, ἀλλὰ πολὺ μᾶλλον, εἰ μὴ διδακτόν.*

XVI. *Διὰ τί οὖν τῶν ἀγαθῶν πατέρων πολλοὶ υἱεῖς φαῦλοι γίγνονται; τοῦτο αὖ μάθε· οὐδὲν γὰρ θαυμαστόν, εἴπερ ἀληθῆ ἐγὼ ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν ἔλεγον,* 327 *ὅτι τούτου τοῦ πράγματος, τῆς ἀρετῆς, εἰ μέλλει πόλις εἶναι, οὐδένα δεῖ ἰδιωτεύειν.* Εἰ *γὰρ δὴ ὃ λέγω οὕτως ἔχει—ἔχει δὲ μάλιστα πάντων οὕτως—, ἐνθυμήθητι ἄλλο τῶν ἐπιτηδευμάτων ὁτιοῦν καὶ μαθημάτων προελόμενος. εἰ μὴ οἷόν τ᾿ ἦν πόλιν εἶναι, εἰ μὴ πάντες αὐληταὶ ἦμεν, ὁποῖός τις ἐδύνατο ἕκαστος, καὶ τοῦτο*

καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ πᾶς πάντα καὶ ἐδίδασκε καὶ ἐπέπληττε τὸν μὴ καλῶς αὐλοῦντα, καὶ μὴ ἐφθόνει τούτου, ὥσπερ νῦν τῶν δικαίων καὶ τῶν νομίμων οὐδεὶς φθονεῖ οὐδ' ἀποκρύπτεται ὥσπερ τῶν ἄλλων τεχνημάτων— B λυσιτελεῖ γάρ, οἶμαι, ἡμῖν ἡ ἀλλήλων δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἀρετή· διὰ ταῦτα πᾶς παντὶ προθύμως λέγει καὶ διδάσκει καὶ τὰ δίκαια καὶ τὰ νόμιμα—εἰ οὖν οὕτω καὶ ἐν αὐλήσει πᾶσαν προθυμίαν καὶ ἀφθονίαν εἴχομεν ἀλλήλους διδάσκειν, οἴει ἄν τι, ἔφη, μᾶλλον, ὦ Σώκρατες, τῶν ἀγαθῶν αὐλητῶν ἀγαθοὺς αὐλητὰς τοὺς υἱεῖς γίγνεσθαι ἢ τῶν φαύλων; οἶμαι μὲν οὔ, ἀλλὰ ὅτου ἔτυχεν ὁ υἱὸς εὐφυέστατος γενόμενος εἰς αὔλησιν, οὗτος ἂν ἐλλόγιμος ηὐξήθη, ὅτου δὲ ἀφυής, ἀκλεής· καὶ C πολλάκις μὲν ἀγαθοῦ αὐλητοῦ φαῦλος ἂν ἀπέβη, πολλάκις δ' ἂν φαύλου ἀγαθός. ἀλλ' οὖν αὐληταί γ' ἂν πάντες ἦσαν ἱκανοὶ ὡς πρὸς τοὺς ἰδιώτας καὶ μηδὲν αὐλήσεως ἐπαΐοντας. οὕτως οἴου καὶ νῦν, ὅστις σοι ἀδικώτατος φαίνεται ἄνθρωπος τῶν ἐν νόμοις καὶ ἀνθρώποις τεθραμμένων, δίκαιον αὐτὸν εἶναι καὶ δημιουργὸν τούτου τοῦ πράγματος, εἰ δέοι αὐτὸν κρίνεσθαι πρὸς ἀνθρώπους, οἷς μήτε παιδεία ἐστὶ μήτε δικα- D στήρια μήτε νόμοι, μηδὲ ἀνάγκη μηδεμία διὰ παντὸς ἀναγκάζουσα ἀρετῆς ἐπιμελεῖσθαι, ἀλλ' εἶεν ἄγριοί τινες, οἷοί περ οὓς πέρυσι Φερεκράτης ὁ ποιητὴς ἐδίδαξεν ἐπὶ Ληναίῳ. ἦ σφόδρα ἐν τοῖς τοιούτοις ἀνθρώποις γενόμενος, ὥσπερ οἱ ἐν ἐκείνῳ τῷ χορῷ μισάνθρωποι, ἀγαπήσαις ἄν, εἰ ἐντύχοις Εὐρυβάτῳ καὶ Φρυνώνδᾳ, καὶ ἀνολοφύραι' ἂν ποθῶν τὴν τῶν ἐνθάδε ἀνθρώπων πονηρίαν. νῦν δὲ τρυφᾷς, ὦ Σώκρατες, διότι E πάντες διδάσκαλοί εἰσιν ἀρετῆς, καθ' ὅσον δύνανται ἕκαστος, καὶ οὐδείς σοι φαίνεται. εἶθ' ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ζητοῖς, τίς διδάσκαλος τοῦ ἑλληνίζειν, οὐδ' ἂν εἷς φα-

328 νείη, οὐδέ γ' ἄν, οἶμαι, εἰ ζητοῖς, τίς ἂν ἡμῖν διδάξειε
τοὺς τῶν χειροτεχνῶν υἱεῖς αὐτὴν ταύτην τὴν τέχνην,
ἣν δὴ παρὰ τοῦ πατρὸς μεμαθήκασι, καθ' ὅσον οἷός
τ' ἦν ὁ πατὴρ καὶ οἱ τοῦ πατρὸς φίλοι ὄντες ὁμότεχνοι,
τούτους ἔτι τίς ἂν διδάξειεν, οὐ ῥᾴδιον οἶμαι εἶναι,
ὦ Σώκρατες, τούτων διδάσκαλον φανῆναι, τῶν δὲ ἀπεί-
ρων παντάπασι ῥᾴδιον, οὕτω δὲ ἀρετῆς καὶ τῶν ἄλλων
B πάντων. ἀλλὰ κἂν εἰ ὀλίγον ἔστι τις ὅστις διαφέρει
ἡμῶν προβιβάσαι εἰς ἀρετήν, ἀγαπητόν. Ὧν δὴ ἐγὼ
οἶμαι εἷς εἶναι, καὶ διαφερόντως ἂν τῶν ἄλλων ἀνθρώ-
πων ὀνῆσαί τινα πρὸς τὸ καλὸν καὶ ἀγαθὸν γενέσθαι,
καὶ ἀξίως τοῦ μισθοῦ ὃν πράττομαι, καὶ ἔτι πλείονος,
ὥστε καὶ αὐτῷ δοκεῖν τῷ μαθόντι. διὰ ταῦτα καὶ τὸν
τρόπον τῆς πράξεως τοῦ μισθοῦ τοιοῦτον πεποίημαι.
ἐπειδὰν γάρ τις παρ' ἐμοῦ μάθῃ, ἐὰν μὲν βούληται,
ἀπέδωκεν ὃ ἐγὼ πράττομαι ἀργύριον· ἐὰν δὲ μή, ἐλ-
C θὼν εἰς ἱερὸν ὀμόσας, ὅσου ἂν φῇ ἄξια εἶναι τὰ μαθή-
ματα, τοσοῦτον κατέθηκε.

Τοιοῦτόν σοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐγὼ καὶ μῦθον καὶ
λόγον εἴρηκα, ὡς διδακτὸν ἀρετή, καὶ Ἀθηναῖοι οὕτως
ἡγοῦνται, καὶ ὅτι οὐδὲν θαυμαστὸν τῶν ἀγαθῶν πατέ-
ρων φαύλους υἱεῖς γίγνεσθαι καὶ τῶν φαύλων ἀγαθούς,
ἐπεὶ καὶ οἱ Πολυκλείτου υἱεῖς, Παράλου καὶ Ξανθίπ-
που τοῦδε ἡλικιῶται, οὐδὲν πρὸς τὸν πατέρα εἰσί, καὶ
ἄλλοι ἄλλων δημιουργῶν. τῶνδε δὲ οὔπω ἄξιον τοῦτο
D κατηγορεῖν. ἔτι γὰρ ἐν αὐτοῖς εἰσιν ἐλπίδες· νέοι γάρ.

XVII. Πρωταγόρας μὲν τοσαῦτα καὶ τοιαῦτα ἐπι-
δειξάμενος ἀπεπαύσατο τοῦ λόγου. καὶ ἐγὼ ἐπὶ μὲν
πολὺν χρόνον κεκηλημένος ἔτι πρὸς αὐτὸν ἔβλεπον ὡς
ἐροῦντά τι, ἐπιθυμῶν ἀκούειν· ἐπεὶ δὲ δὴ ᾐσθόμην, ὅτι
τῷ ὄντι πεπαυμένος εἴη, μόγις πως ἐμαυτὸν ὡσπερεὶ
συναγείρας εἶπον, βλέψας πρὸς τὸν Ἱπποκράτη· Ὦ

παῖ Ἀπολλοδώρου, ὡς χάριν σοι ἔχω, ὅτι προὔτρεψάς με ὧδε ἀφικέσθαι· πολλοῦ γὰρ ποιοῦμαι ἀκηκοέναι ἃ ἀκήκοα Πρωταγόρου. ἐγὼ γὰρ ἐν μὲν τῷ ἔμπροσθεν E χρόνῳ ἡγούμην οὐκ εἶναι ἀνθρωπίνην ἐπιμέλειαν, ᾗ οἱ ἀγαθοὶ ἀγαθοὶ γίγνονται· νῦν δὲ πέπεισμαι. πλὴν σμικρόν τί μοι ἐμποδών, ὃ δῆλον ὅτι Πρωταγόρας ῥᾳδίως ἐπεκδιδάξει, ἐπειδὴ καὶ τὰ πολλὰ ταῦτα ἐξεδίδαξε. καὶ γὰρ εἰ μέν τις περὶ αὐτῶν τούτων συγγένοιτο ὁτῳοῦν τῶν δημηγόρων, τάχ' ἂν καὶ τοιούτους 329 λόγους ἀκούσειεν ἢ Περικλέους ἢ ἄλλου τινὸς τῶν ἱκανῶν εἰπεῖν· εἰ δὲ ἐπανέροιτό τινά τι, ὥσπερ βιβλία οὐδὲν ἔχουσιν οὔτε ἀποκρίνασθαι οὔτε αὐτοὶ ἐρέσθαι, ἀλλ' ἐάν τις καὶ σμικρὸν ἐπερωτήσῃ τι τῶν ῥηθέντων, ὥσπερ τὰ χαλκεῖα πληγέντα μακρὸν ἠχεῖ καὶ ἀποτείνει, ἐὰν μὴ ἐπιλάβηταί τις, καὶ οἱ ῥήτορες οὕτω σμικρὰ ἐρωτηθέντες δόλιχον κατατείνουσι τοῦ λόγου· Πρωταγόρας B δὲ ὅδε ἱκανὸς μὲν μακροὺς λόγους καὶ καλοὺς εἰπεῖν, ὡς αὐτὸ δηλοῖ, ἱκανὸς δὲ καὶ ἐρωτηθεὶς ἀποκρίνασθαι κατὰ βραχὺ καὶ ἐρόμενος περιμεῖναί τε καὶ ἀποδέξασθαι τὴν ἀπόκρισιν, ἃ ὀλίγοις ἐστὶ παρεσκευασμένα. νῦν οὖν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, σμικροῦ τινος ἐνδεής εἰμι πάντ' ἔχειν, εἴ μοι ἀποκρίναιο τόδε. τὴν ἀρετὴν φῂς διδακτὸν εἶναι, καὶ ἐγώ, εἴπερ ἄλλῳ τῳ ἀνθρώπων, καὶ σοὶ πείθομαι. ὃ δ' ἐθαύμασά σου λέγοντος, τοῦτό C μοι ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ ἀποπλήρωσον. ἔλεγες γάρ, ὅτι ὁ Ζεὺς τὴν δικαιοσύνην καὶ τὴν αἰδῶ πέμψειε τοῖς ἀνθρώποις, καὶ αὖ πολλαχοῦ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις ἐλέγετο ὑπὸ σοῦ ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ σωφροσύνη καὶ ὁσιότης καὶ πάντα ταῦτα ὡς ἕν τι εἴη συλλήβδην, ἀρετή. ταῦτ' οὖν αὐτὰ δίελθέ μοι ἀκριβῶς τῷ λόγῳ, πότερον ἓν μέν τί ἐστιν ἡ ἀρετή, μόρια δὲ αὐτῆς ἐστιν ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ σωφροσύνη καὶ ὁσιότης, ἢ ταῦτ' ἐστὶν ἃ νῦν δὴ ἐγὼ

D ἔλεγον πάντα ὀνόματα τοῦ αὐτοῦ ἑνὸς ὄντος. τοῦτ'
ἐστὶν ὃ ἔτι ἐπιποθῶ.

XVIII. Ἀλλὰ ῥᾴδιον τοῦτό γ', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες,
ἀποκρίνασθαι, ὅτι ἑνὸς ὄντος τῆς ἀρετῆς μόριά ἐστιν
ἃ ἐρωτᾷς. Πότερον, ἔφην, ὥσπερ προσώπου τὰ μόρια
μόριά ἐστι, στόμα τε καὶ ῥὶς καὶ ὀφθαλμοὶ καὶ ὦτα,
ἢ ὥσπερ τὰ τοῦ χρυσοῦ μόρια οὐδὲν διαφέρει τὰ ἕτερα
τῶν ἑτέρων καὶ τοῦ ὅλου, ἀλλ' ἢ μεγέθει καὶ σμικρό-
E τητι; Ἐκείνως μοι φαίνεται, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὥσπερ τὰ
τοῦ προσώπου μόρια ἔχει πρὸς τὸ ὅλον πρόσωπον.
Πότερον οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, καὶ μεταλαμβάνουσιν οἱ ἄν-
θρωποι τούτων τῶν τῆς ἀρετῆς μορίων οἱ μὲν ἄλλο,
οἱ δὲ ἄλλο, ἢ ἀνάγκη, ἐάνπερ τις ἓν λάβῃ, ἅπαντ'
ἔχειν; Οὐδαμῶς, ἔφη, ἐπεὶ πολλοὶ ἀνδρεῖοί εἰσιν,
ἄδικοι δέ, καὶ δίκαιοι αὖ, σοφοὶ δὲ οὔ. Ἔστι γὰρ οὖν
330 καὶ ταῦτα μόρια τῆς ἀρετῆς, ἔφην ἐγώ, σοφία τε καὶ
ἀνδρεία; Πάντων μάλιστα δήπου, ἔφη· καὶ μέγιστόν
γε ἡ σοφία τῶν μορίων. Ἕκαστον δὲ αὐτῶν ἐστιν,
ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἄλλο, τὸ δὲ ἄλλο; Ναί. Ἦ καὶ δύναμιν
αὐτῶν ἕκαστον ἰδίαν ἔχει, ὥσπερ τὰ τοῦ προσώπου;
οὐκ ἔστιν ὀφθαλμὸς οἷον τὰ ὦτα, οὐδ' ἡ δύναμις αὐτοῦ
ἡ αὐτή· οὐδὲ τῶν ἄλλων οὐδέν ἐστιν οἷον τὸ ἕτερον
οὔτε κατὰ τὴν δύναμιν οὔτε κατὰ τὰ ἄλλα. ἆρ' οὖν
οὕτω καὶ τὰ τῆς ἀρετῆς μόρια οὐκ ἔστι τὸ ἕτερον οἷον
B τὸ ἕτερον, οὔτε αὐτὸ οὔτε ἡ δύναμις αὐτοῦ; ἢ δῆλα
δή, ὅτι οὕτως ἔχει, εἴπερ τῷ παραδείγματί γε ἔοικεν;
Ἀλλ' οὕτως, ἔφη, ἔχει, ὦ Σώκρατες. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον·
Οὐδὲν ἄρα ἐστὶ τῶν τῆς ἀρετῆς μορίων ἄλλο οἷον ἐπι-
στήμη, οὐδ' οἷον δικαιοσύνη, οὐδ' οἷον ἀνδρεία, οὐδ'
οἷον σωφροσύνη, οὐδ' οἷον ὁσιότης. Οὐκ ἔφη. Φέρε
δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, κοινῇ σκεψώμεθα, ποῖόν τι αὐτῶν ἐστιν
ἕκαστον. πρῶτον μὲν τὸ τοιόνδε· ἡ δικαιοσύνη πρᾶ-

γμά τί ἐστιν, ἢ οὐδὲν πρᾶγμα; ἐμοὶ μὲν γὰρ δοκεῖ· τί C
δὲ σοί; Καὶ ἐμοί, ἔφη. Τί οὖν; εἴ τις ἔροιτο ἐμέ
τε καὶ σέ, Ὦ Πρωταγόρα τε καὶ Σώκρατες, εἴπετον
δή μοι, τοῦτο τὸ πρᾶγμα, ὃ ὠνομάσατε ἄρτι, ἡ δικαιο-
σύνη, αὐτὸ τοῦτο δίκαιόν ἐστιν, ἢ ἄδικον; ἐγὼ μὲν
ἂν αὐτῷ ἀποκριναίμην, ὅτι δίκαιον· σὺ δὲ τίν' ἂν ψῆ-
φον θεῖο; τὴν αὐτὴν ἐμοί, ἢ ἄλλην; Τὴν αὐτήν, ἔφη.
Ἔστιν ἄρα τοιοῦτον ἡ δικαιοσύνη, οἷον δίκαιον εἶναι, D
φαίην ἂν ἔγωγε ἀποκρινόμενος τῷ ἐρωτῶντι. οὐκοῦν
καὶ σύ; Ναί, ἔφη. Εἰ οὖν μετὰ τοῦτο ἡμᾶς ἔροιτο·
Οὐκοῦν καὶ ὁσιότητά τινά φατε εἶναι; φαῖμεν ἄν, ὡς
ἐγᾦμαι. Ναί, ἦ δ' ὅς. Οὐκοῦν φατε καὶ τοῦτο πρᾶ-
γμά τι εἶναι; φαῖμεν ἂν ἢ οὔ; Καὶ τοῦτο συνέφη.
Πότερον δὲ τοῦτο αὐτὸ τὸ πρᾶγμά φατε τοιοῦτον πε-
φυκέναι, οἷον ἀνόσιον εἶναι, ἢ οἷον ὅσιον; ἀγανακτή-
σαιμ' ἂν ἔγωγ', ἔφην, τῷ ἐρωτήματι, καὶ εἴποιμ' ἂν
Εὐφήμει, ὦ ἄνθρωπε· σχολῇ μέντ' ἄν τι ἄλλο ὅσιον E
εἴη, εἰ μὴ αὐτή γε ἡ ὁσιότης ὅσιον ἔσται. τί δὲ σύ;
οὐχ οὕτως ἂν ἀποκρίναιο; Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη.

XIX. Εἰ οὖν μετὰ τοῦτ' εἴποι ἐρωτῶν ἡμᾶς, Πῶς
οὖν ὀλίγον πρότερον ἐλέγετε; ἆρ' οὐκ ὀρθῶς ὑμῶν
κατήκουσα; ἐδόξατέ μοι φάναι τὰ τῆς ἀρετῆς μόρια
εἶναι οὕτως ἔχοντα πρὸς ἄλληλα, ὡς οὐκ εἶναι τὸ
ἕτερον αὐτῶν οἷον τὸ ἕτερον· εἴποιμ' ἂν ἔγωγε, ὅτι
Τὰ μὲν ἄλλα ὀρθῶς ἤκουσας, ὅτι δὲ καὶ ἐμὲ οἴει εἰπεῖν
τοῦτο, παρήκουσας· Πρωταγόρας γὰρ ὅδε ταῦτα ἀπε- 331
κρίνατο, ἐγὼ δὲ ἠρώτων. εἰ οὖν εἴποι, Ἀληθῆ ὅδε λέγει,
ὦ Πρωταγόρα; σὺ φῂς οὐκ εἶναι τὸ ἕτερον μόριον οἷον
τὸ ἕτερον τῶν τῆς ἀρετῆς; σὸς οὗτος ὁ λόγος ἐστί; τί
ἂν αὐτῷ ἀποκρίναιο; Ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ὁμο-
λογεῖν. Τί οὖν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ἀποκρινούμεθα αὐτῷ
ταῦτα ὁμολογήσαντες, ἐὰν ἡμᾶς ἐπανέρηται, Οὐκ ἄρα

ἐστὶν ὁσιότης οἷον δίκαιον εἶναι πρᾶγμα, οὐδὲ δικαιοσύνη οἷον ὅσιον, ἀλλ' οἷον μὴ ὅσιον· ἡ δ' ὁσιότης οἷον
B μὴ δίκαιον, ἀλλ' ἄδικον ἄρα, τὸ δὲ ἀνόσιον; τί αὐτῷ ἀποκρινούμεθα; ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ αὐτὸς ὑπέρ γε ἐμαυτοῦ φαίην ἂν καὶ τὴν δικαιοσύνην ὅσιον εἶναι καὶ τὴν ὁσιότητα δίκαιον· καὶ ὑπὲρ σοῦ δέ, εἴ με ἐῴης, ταὐτὰ ἂν ταῦτα ἀποκρινοίμην, ὅτι ἤτοι ταὐτόν ἐστι δικαιότης ὁσιότητι ἢ ὅτι ὁμοιότατον, καὶ μάλιστα πάντων ἥ τε δικαιοσύνη οἷον ὁσιότης καὶ ἡ ὁσιότης οἷον δικαιοσύνη. ἀλλ' ὅρα, εἰ διακωλύεις ἀποκρίνεσθαι, ἢ καὶ σοὶ συν-
C δοκεῖ οὕτως. Οὐ πάνυ μοι δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὕτως ἁπλοῦν εἶναι, ὥστε συγχωρῆσαι τήν τε δικαιοσύνην ὅσιον εἶναι καὶ τὴν ὁσιότητα δίκαιον, ἀλλά τί μοι δοκεῖ ἐν αὐτῷ διάφορον εἶναι. ἀλλὰ τί τοῦτο διαφέρει; ἔφη· εἰ γὰρ βούλει, ἔστω ἡμῖν καὶ δικαιοσύνη ὅσιον καὶ ὁσιότης δίκαιον. Μή μοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὐδὲν γὰρ δέομαι τὸ εἰ βούλει τοῦτο καὶ εἴ σοι δοκεῖ ἐλέγχεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἐμέ τε καὶ σέ. τὸ δ' ἐμέ τε καὶ σέ τοῦτο λέγω, οἰόμενος οὕτω τὸν λόγον βέλτιστ' ἂν
D ἐλέγχεσθαι, εἴ τις τὸ εἰ ἀφέλοι αὐτοῦ. Ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἦ δ' ὅς, προσέοικέ τι δικαιοσύνη ὁσιότητι· καὶ γὰρ ὁτιοῦν ὁτῳοῦν ἀμῃγέπῃ προσέοικε. τὸ γὰρ λευκὸν τῷ μέλανι ἔστιν ὅπῃ προσέοικε, καὶ τὸ σκληρὸν τῷ μαλακῷ, καὶ τἆλλα ἃ δοκεῖ ἐναντιώτατα εἶναι ἀλλήλοις. καὶ ἃ τότε ἔφαμεν ἄλλην δύναμιν ἔχειν καὶ οὐκ εἶναι τὸ ἕτερον οἷον τὸ ἕτερον, τὰ τοῦ προσώπου μόρια, ἀμῃγέπῃ προσέοικε καὶ ἔστι τὸ ἕτερον οἷον τὸ ἕτερον.
E ὥστε τούτῳ γε τῷ τρόπῳ κἂν ταῦτα ἐλέγχοις, εἰ βούλοιο, ὡς ἅπαντά ἐστιν ὅμοια ἀλλήλοις. ἀλλ' οὐχὶ τὰ ὅμοιόν τι ἔχοντα ὅμοια δίκαιον καλεῖν, οὐδὲ τὰ ἀνόμοιόν τι ἔχοντα ἀνόμοια, κἂν πάνυ σμικρὸν ἔχῃ τὸ ὅμοιον. Καὶ ἐγὼ θαυμάσας εἶπον πρὸς αὐτόν· Ἦ γὰρ

οὕτω σοι τὸ δίκαιον καὶ τὸ ὅσιον πρὸς ἄλληλα ἔχει, ὥστε ὅμοιόν τι σμικρὸν ἔχειν ἀλλήλοις; Οὐ πάνυ, ἔφη, οὕτως, οὐ μέντοι οὐδὲ αὖ ὡς σύ μοι δοκεῖς οἴεσθαι. Ἀλλὰ μήν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐπειδὴ δυσχερῶς δοκεῖς μοι 332 ἔχειν πρὸς τοῦτο, τοῦτο μὲν ἐάσωμεν, τόδε δὲ ἄλλο ὧν ἔλεγες ἐπισκεψώμεθα.

XX. Ἀφροσύνην τι καλεῖς; Ἔφη. Τούτῳ τῷ πράγματι οὐ πᾶν τοὐναντίον ἐστὶν ἡ σοφία; Ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ, ἔφη. Πότερον δὲ ὅταν πράττωσιν ἄνθρωποι ὀρθῶς τε καὶ ὠφελίμως, τότε σωφρονεῖν σοι δοκοῦσιν οὕτω πράττοντες, ἢ τοὐναντίον; Σωφρονεῖν, ἔφη. Οὐ- B κοῦν σωφροσύνῃ σωφρονοῦσιν; Ἀνάγκη. Οὐκοῦν οἱ μὴ ὀρθῶς πράττοντες ἀφρόνως πράττουσι, καὶ οὐ σωφρονοῦσιν οὕτω πράττοντες; Συνδοκεῖ μοι, ἔφη. Τοὐναντίον ἄρα ἐστὶ τὸ ἀφρόνως πράττειν τῷ σωφρόνως. Ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν τὰ μὲν ἀφρόνως πραττόμενα ἀφροσύνῃ πράττεται, τὰ δὲ σωφρόνως σωφροσύνῃ; Ὡμολόγει. Οὐκοῦν εἴ τι ἰσχύϊ πράττεται, ἰσχυρῶς πράττεται, καὶ εἴ τι ἀσθενείᾳ, ἀσθενῶς; Ἐδόκει. Καὶ C εἴ τι μετὰ τάχους, ταχέως, καὶ εἴ τι μετὰ βραδυτῆτος, βραδέως; Ἔφη. Καὶ εἴ τι δὴ ὡσαύτως πράττεται, ὑπὸ τοῦ αὐτοῦ πράττεται, καὶ εἴ τι ἐναντίως, ὑπὸ τοῦ ἐναντίου; Συνέφη. Φέρε δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἔστι τι καλόν; Συνεχώρει. Τούτῳ ἔστι τι ἐναντίον πλὴν τὸ αἰσχρόν; Οὐκ ἔστι. Τί δέ; ἔστι τι ἀγαθόν; Ἔστι. Τούτῳ ἔστι τι ἐναντίον πλὴν τὸ κακόν; Οὐκ ἔστι. Τί δέ; ἔστι τι ὀξὺ ἐν φωνῇ; Ἔφη. Τούτῳ μὴ ἔστι τι ἐναντίον ἄλλο πλὴν τὸ βαρύ; Οὐκ ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἑνὶ ἑκάστῳ τῶν ἐναντίων ἓν μόνον ἐστὶν ἐναντίον καὶ οὐ πολλά; Συνωμολόγει. Ἴθι δή, ἦν D δ' ἐγώ, ἀναλογισώμεθα τὰ ὡμολογημένα ἡμῖν. ὡμολογήκαμεν ἓν ἑνὶ μόνον ἐναντίον εἶναι, πλείω δὲ μή;

Ὡμολογήκαμεν. Τὸ δὲ ἐναντίως πραττόμενον ὑπὸ ἐναντίων πράττεσθαι; Ἔφη. Ὡμολογήκαμεν δὲ ἐναντίως πράττεσθαι ὃ ἂν ἀφρόνως πράττηται τῷ σωφρόνως πραττομένῳ; Ἔφη. Τὸ δὲ σωφρόνως πραττόμενον ὑπὸ σωφροσύνης πράττεσθαι, τὸ δὲ ἀφρόνως

E ὑπὸ ἀφροσύνης; Συνεχώρει. Οὐκοῦν εἴπερ ἐναντίως πράττεται, ὑπὸ ἐναντίου πράττοιτ' ἄν; Ναί. Πράττεται δὲ τὸ μὲν ὑπὸ σωφροσύνης, τὸ δὲ ὑπὸ ἀφροσύνης; Ναί. Ἐναντίως; Πάνυ γε. Οὐκοῦν ὑπὸ ἐναντίων ὄντων; Ναί. Ἐναντίον ἄρ' ἐστὶν ἀφροσύνη σωφροσύνῃ; Φαίνεται. Μέμνησαι οὖν, ὅτι ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν ὡμολόγηται ἡμῖν ἀφροσύνη σοφίᾳ ἐναντίον εἶναι; Συνωμολόγει. Ἓν δὲ ἑνὶ μόνον ἐναντίον εἶναι; Φημί.

333 Πότερον οὖν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, λύσωμεν τῶν λόγων; τὸ ἓν ἑνὶ μόνον ἐναντίον εἶναι, ἢ ἐκεῖνον, ἐν ᾧ ἐλέγετο ἕτερον εἶναι σωφροσύνης σοφία, μόριον δὲ ἑκάτερον ἀρετῆς, καὶ πρὸς τῷ ἕτερον εἶναι καὶ ἀνόμοια καὶ αὐτὰ καὶ αἱ δυνάμεις αὐτῶν, ὥσπερ τὰ τοῦ προσώπου μόρια; πότερον οὖν δὴ λύσωμεν; οὗτοι γὰρ οἱ λόγοι ἀμφότεροι οὐ πάνυ μουσικῶς λέγονται· οὐ γὰρ συνᾴδουσιν οὐδὲ συναρμόττουσιν ἀλλήλοις. πῶς γὰρ ἂν

B συνᾴδοιεν, εἴπερ γε ἀνάγκη ἑνὶ μὲν ἓν μόνον ἐναντίον εἶναι, πλείοσι δὲ μή, τῇ δὲ ἀφροσύνῃ, ἑνὶ ὄντι, σοφία ἐναντία καὶ σωφροσύνη αὖ φαίνεται. ἦ γάρ, ὦ Πρωταγόρα; ἔφην ἐγώ. ἢ ἄλλως πως; Ὡμολόγησε καὶ μάλ' ἀκόντως. Οὐκοῦν ἓν ἂν εἴη ἡ σωφροσύνη καὶ ἡ σοφία; τὸ δὲ πρότερον αὖ ἐφάνη ἡμῖν ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἡ ὁσιότης σχεδόν τι ταὐτὸν ὄν. ἴθι δή, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, μὴ ἀποκάμωμεν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τὰ λοιπὰ διασκεψώμεθα. ἆρά τίς σοι δοκεῖ ἀδικῶν ἄνθρωπος

C σωφρονεῖν, ὅτι ἀδικεῖ; Αἰσχυνοίμην ἂν ἔγωγ', ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, τοῦτο ὁμολογεῖν· ἐπεὶ πολλοί γέ φασι τῶν

ἀνθρώπων. Πότερον οὖν πρὸς ἐκείνους τὸν λόγον
ποιήσομαι, ἔφην, ἢ πρὸς σέ; Εἰ βούλει, ἔφη, πρὸς
τοῦτον πρῶτον τὸν λόγον διαλέχθητι τὸν τῶν πολλῶν.
Ἀλλ' οὐδέν μοι διαφέρει, ἐὰν μόνον σύ γε ἀποκρίνῃ,
εἴτ' οὖν δοκεῖ σοι ταῦτα, εἴτε μή. τὸν γὰρ λόγον ἔγωγε
μάλιστα ἐξετάζω, συμβαίνει μέντοι ἴσως καὶ ἐμὲ τὸν
ἐρωτῶντα καὶ τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον ἐξετάζεσθαι.

Τὸ μὲν οὖν πρῶτον ἐκαλλωπίζετο ἡμῖν ὁ Πρωτα- D
γόρας· τὸν γὰρ λόγον ᾐτιᾶτο δυσχερῆ εἶναι· ἔπειτα
μέντοι συνεχώρησεν ἀποκρίνεσθαι.

XXI. Ἴθι δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐξ ἀρχῆς μοι ἀπόκριναι.
δοκοῦσί τινές σοι σωφρονεῖν ἀδικοῦντες; Ἔστω, ἔφη.
Τὸ δὲ σωφρονεῖν λέγεις εὖ φρονεῖν; Ἔφη. Τὸ δ' εὖ
φρονεῖν εὖ βουλεύεσθαι, ὅτι ἀδικοῦσιν; Ἔστω, ἔφη.
Πότερον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἰ εὖ πράττουσιν ἀδικοῦντες, ἢ εἰ
κακῶς; Εἰ εὖ. Λέγεις οὖν ἀγαθὰ ἄττα εἶναι; Λέγω.
Ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ταῦτ' ἐστὶν ἀγαθά, ἅ ἐστιν ὠφέλιμα E
τοῖς ἀνθρώποις; Καὶ ναὶ μὰ Δί', ἔφη, κἂν μὴ τοῖς
ἀνθρώποις ὠφέλιμα ᾖ, ἔγωγε καλῶ ἀγαθά. Καί μοι
ἐδόκει ὁ Πρωταγόρας ἤδη τετραχύνθαι τε καὶ ἀγωνιᾶν
καὶ παρατετάχθαι πρὸς τὸ ἀποκρίνεσθαι. ἐπειδὴ οὖν
ἑώρων αὐτὸν οὕτως ἔχοντα, εὐλαβούμενος ἠρέμα ἠρόμην.
Πότερον, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, λέγεις, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ἃ μηδενὶ 334
ἀνθρώπων ὠφέλιμά ἐστιν, ἢ ἃ μηδὲ τὸ παράπαν
ὠφέλιμα; καὶ τὰ τοιαῦτα σὺ ἀγαθὰ καλεῖς; Οὐδαμῶς,
ἔφη· ἀλλ' ἔγωγε πολλὰ οἶδ', ἃ ἀνθρώποις μὲν ἀνωφελῆ
ἐστι, καὶ σιτία καὶ ποτὰ καὶ φάρμακα καὶ ἄλλα μυρία,
τὰ δέ γε ὠφέλιμα· τὰ δὲ ἀνθρώποις μὲν οὐδέτερα,
ἵπποις δέ· τὰ δὲ βουσὶ μόνον, τὰ δὲ κυσί, τὰ δέ γε
τούτων μὲν οὐδενί, δένδροις δέ, τὰ δὲ τοῦ δένδρου ταῖς
μὲν ῥίζαις ἀγαθά, ταῖς δὲ βλάσταις πονηρά, οἷον καὶ ἡ B
κόπρος πάντων τῶν φυτῶν ταῖς μὲν ῥίζαις ἀγαθὸν

παραβαλλομένη, εἰ δ' ἐθέλοις ἐπὶ τοὺς πτόρθους καὶ τοὺς νέους κλῶνας ἐπιβάλλειν, πάντα ἀπόλλυσιν· ἐπεὶ καὶ τὸ ἔλαιον τοῖς μὲν φυτοῖς ἅπασίν ἐστι πάγκακον καὶ ταῖς θριξὶ πολεμιώτατον ταῖς τῶν ἄλλων ζώων πλὴν ταῖς τοῦ ἀνθρώπου, ταῖς δὲ τοῦ ἀνθρώπου ἀρωγὸν καὶ τῷ ἄλλῳ σώματι. οὕτω δὲ ποικίλον τί ἐστι τὸ ἀγαθὸν καὶ παντοδαπόν, ὥστε καὶ ἐνταῦθα τοῖς μὲν
C *ἔξωθεν τοῦ σώματος ἀγαθόν ἐστι τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ, τοῖς δ' ἐντὸς ταὐτὸ τοῦτο κάκιστον· καὶ διὰ τοῦτο οἱ ἰατροὶ πάντες ἀπαγορεύουσι τοῖς ἀσθενοῦσι μὴ χρῆσθαι ἐλαίῳ, ἀλλ' ἢ ὅ τι σμικροτάτῳ, ἐν τούτοις οἷς μέλλει ἔδεσθαι, ὅσον μόνον τὴν δυσχέρειαν κατασβέσαι τὴν ἐπὶ ταῖς αἰσθήσεσι ταῖς διὰ τῶν χυμῶν γιγνομένην ἐν τοῖς σιτίοις τε καὶ ὄψοις.*

XXII. Εἰ*πόντος οὖν ταῦτα αὐτοῦ, οἱ παρόντες ἀνεθορύβησαν, ὡς εὖ λέγοι. καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον·* Ὦ Πρωτα*γόρα, ἐγὼ τυγχάνω ἐπιλήσμων τις ὢν ἄνθρωπος, καὶ*
D *ἐάν τίς μοι μακρὰ λέγῃ, ἐπιλανθάνομαι περὶ οὗ ἂν ᾖ ὁ λόγος. ὥσπερ οὖν εἰ ἐτύγχανον ὑπόκωφος ὤν, ᾤου ἂν χρῆναι, εἴπερ ἔμελλές μοι διαλέξεσθαι, μεῖζον φθέγγεσθαι ἢ πρὸς τοὺς ἄλλους, οὕτω καὶ νῦν, ἐπειδὴ ἐπιλήσμονι ἐνέτυχες, σύντεμνέ μοι τὰς ἀποκρίσεις καὶ βραχυτέρας ποίει, εἰ μέλλω σοι ἕπεσθαι.* Πῶς *οὖν κελεύεις με βραχέα ἀποκρίνεσθαι; ἢ βραχύτερά σοι,*
E *ἔφη, ἀποκρίνωμαι ἢ δεῖ;* Μηδαμῶς, *ἦν δ' ἐγώ.* Ἀλλ' *ὅσα δεῖ; ἔφη.* Ναί, *ἦν δ' ἐγώ.* Πότερα *οὖν ὅσα ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ δεῖν ἀποκρίνεσθαι, τοσαῦτά σοι ἀποκρίνωμαι, ἢ ὅσα σοί;* Ἀκήκοα *γοῦν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὅτι σὺ οἷός τ' εἶ καὶ αὐτὸς καὶ ἄλλον διδάξαι περὶ τῶν αὐτῶν καὶ μακρὰ λέγειν, ἐὰν βούλῃ, οὕτως, ὥστε τὸν λόγον μηδέποτε ἐπιλιπεῖν, καὶ αὖ βραχέα οὕτως, ὥστε μη-*
335 *δένα σοῦ ἐν βραχυτέροις εἰπεῖν. εἰ οὖν μέλλεις ἐμοὶ δια-*

λέξεσθαι, τῷ ἑτέρῳ χρῶ τρόπῳ πρός με, τῇ βραχυλογίᾳ. Ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, ἐγὼ πολλοῖς ἤδη εἰς ἀγῶνα λόγων ἀφικόμην ἀνθρώποις, καὶ εἰ τοῦτο ἐποίουν, ὃ σὺ κελεύεις, ὡς ὁ ἀντιλέγων ἐκέλευέ με διαλέγεσθαι, οὕτω διελεγόμην, οὐδενὸς ἂν βελτίων ἐφαινόμην, οὐδ' ἂν ἐλέγετο Πρωταγόρου ὄνομα ἐν τοῖς Ἕλλησιν. Καὶ ἐγώ—ἔγνων γὰρ ὅτι οὐκ ἤρεσεν αὐτὸς αὑτῷ ταῖς ἀποκρίσεσι ταῖς ἔμπροσθεν, καὶ ὅτι οὐκ ἐθελήσοι ἑκὼν B εἶναι ἀποκρινόμενος διαλέγεσθαι—ἡγησάμενος οὐκέτι ἐμὸν ἔργον εἶναι παρεῖναι ἐν ταῖς συνουσίαις, Ἀλλά τοι, ἔφην, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, οὐδ' ἐγὼ λιπαρῶς ἔχω παρὰ τὰ σοὶ δοκοῦντα τὴν συνουσίαν ἡμῖν γίγνεσθαι, ἀλλ' ἐπειδὰν σὺ βούλῃ διαλέγεσθαι ὡς ἐγὼ δύναμαι ἕπεσθαι τότε σοι διαλέξομαι. σὺ μὲν γάρ, ὡς λέγεται περὶ σοῦ, φῂς δὲ καὶ αὐτός, καὶ ἐν μακρολογίᾳ καὶ ἐν βραχυλογίᾳ οἷός τ' εἶ συνουσίας ποιεῖσθαι· σοφὸς γὰρ εἶ· ἐγὼ δὲ τὰ μακρὰ ταῦτα ἀδύνατος, ἐπεὶ ἐβου- C λόμην ἂν οἷός τ' εἶναι. ἀλλὰ σὲ ἐχρῆν ἡμῖν συγχωρεῖν τὸν ἀμφότερα δυνάμενον, ἵνα συνουσία ἐγίγνετο· νῦν δὲ ἐπειδὴ οὐκ ἐθέλεις, καὶ ἐμοί τις ἀσχολία ἐστί, καὶ οὐκ ἂν οἷός τ' εἴην σοι παραμεῖναι ἀποτείνοντι μακροὺς λόγους—ἐλθεῖν γάρ ποί με δεῖ—εἶμι· ἐπεὶ καὶ ταῦτ' ἂν ἴσως οὐκ ἀηδῶς σοῦ ἤκουον.

Καὶ ἅμα ταῦτα εἰπὼν ἀνιστάμην ὡς ἀπιών. καί μου ἀνισταμένου ἐπιλαμβάνεται ὁ Καλλίας τῆς χειρὸς D τῇ δεξιᾷ, τῇ δ' ἀριστερᾷ ἀντελάβετο τοῦ τρίβωνος τουτουί, καὶ εἶπεν· Οὐκ ἀφήσομέν σε, ὦ Σώκρατες· ἐὰν γὰρ σὺ ἐξέλθῃς, οὐχ ὁμοίως ἡμῖν ἔσονται οἱ διάλογοι. δέομαι οὖν σου παραμεῖναι ἡμῖν· ὡς ἐγὼ οὐδ' ἂν ἑνὸς ἥδιον ἀκούσαιμι ἢ σοῦ τε καὶ Πρωταγόρου διαλεγομένων· ἀλλὰ χάρισαι ἡμῖν πᾶσιν. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον—ἤδη δὲ ἀνεστήκη ὡς ἐξιών—Ὦ παῖ Ἱππονίκου,

E ἀεὶ μὲν ἔγωγέ σου τὴν φιλοσοφίαν ἄγαμαι, ἀτὰρ καὶ
νῦν ἐπαινῶ καὶ φιλῶ, ὥστε βουλοίμην ἂν χαρίζεσθαί
σοι, εἴ μου δυνατὰ δέοιο. νῦν δ' ἐστὶν ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ
δέοιό μου Κρίσωνι τῷ Ἱμεραίῳ δρομεῖ ἀκμάζοντι
ἕπεσθαι, ἢ τῶν δολιχοδρόμων τῳ ἢ τῶν ἡμεροδρόμων
336 διαθεῖν τε καὶ ἕπεσθαι. εἴποιμι ἄν σοι, ὅτι πολὺ
σοῦ μᾶλλον ἐγὼ ἐμαυτοῦ δέομαι θέουσι τούτοις ἀκολου-
θεῖν, ἀλλ' οὐ γὰρ δύναμαι, ἀλλ' εἴ τι δέει θεάσασθαι ἐν
τῷ αὐτῷ ἐμέ τε καὶ Κρίσωνα θέοντας, τούτου δέου
συγκαθεῖναι· ἐγὼ μὲν γὰρ οὐ δύναμαι ταχὺ θεῖν, οὗτος
δὲ δύναται βραδέως. εἰ οὖν ἐπιθυμεῖς ἐμοῦ καὶ Πρω-
ταγόρου ἀκούειν, τούτου δέου, ὥσπερ τὸ πρῶτόν μοι
ἀπεκρίνατο διὰ βραχέων τε καὶ αὐτὰ τὰ ἐρωτώμενα,
B οὕτω καὶ νῦν ἀποκρίνεσθαι. εἰ δὲ μή, τις ὁ τρόπος
ἔσται τῶν διαλόγων; χωρὶς γὰρ ἔγωγ' ᾤμην εἶναι τὸ
συνεῖναί τε ἀλλήλοις διαλεγομένους καὶ τὸ δημηγορεῖν.
Ἀλλ' ὁρᾷς, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες· δίκαια δοκεῖ λέγειν
Πρωταγόρας ἀξιῶν αὐτῷ τε ἐξεῖναι διαλέγεσθαι ὅπως
βούλεται, καὶ σοὶ ὅπως ἂν αὖ σὺ βούλῃ.

XXIII. Ὑπολαβὼν οὖν ὁ Ἀλκιβιάδης, Οὐ καλῶς
λέγεις, ἔφη, ὦ Καλλία. Σωκράτης μὲν γὰρ ὅδε ὁμο-
λογεῖ μὴ μετεῖναί οἱ μακρολογίας καὶ παραχωρεῖ Πρω-
C ταγόρᾳ, τοῦ δὲ διαλέγεσθαι οἷός τ' εἶναι καὶ ἐπίστασθαι
λόγον τε δοῦναι καὶ δέξασθαι θαυμάζοιμ' ἂν εἴ τῳ
ἀνθρώπων παραχωρεῖ. εἰ μὲν οὖν καὶ Πρωταγόρας
ὁμολογεῖ φαυλότερος εἶναι Σωκράτους διαλεχθῆναι,
ἐξαρκεῖ Σωκράτει· εἰ δὲ ἀντιποιεῖται, διαλεγέσθω
ἐρωτῶν τε καὶ ἀποκρινόμενος, μὴ ἐφ' ἑκάστῃ ἐρωτήσει
μακρὸν λόγον ἀποτείνων, ἐκκρούων τοὺς λόγους καὶ
οὐκ ἐθέλων διδόναι λόγον, ἀλλ' ἀπομηκύνων, ἕως ἂν
D ἐπιλάθωνται περὶ ὅτου τὸ ἐρώτημα ἦν οἱ πολλοὶ τῶν
ἀκουόντων· ἐπεὶ Σωκράτη γε ἐγὼ ἐγγυῶμαι μὴ ἐπι-

λήσεσθαι, οὐχ ὅτι παίζει καί φησιν ἐπιλήσμων εἶναι.
ἐμοὶ μὲν οὖν δοκεῖ ἐπιεικέστερα Σωκράτης λέγειν· χρὴ
γὰρ ἕκαστον τὴν ἑαυτοῦ γνώμην ἀποφαίνεσθαι.

Μετὰ δὲ τὸν Ἀλκιβιάδην, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, Κριτίας ἦν ὁ
εἰπών· Ὦ Πρόδικε καὶ Ἱππία, Καλλίας μὲν δοκεῖ μοι
μάλα πρὸς Πρωταγόρου εἶναι, Ἀλκιβιάδης δὲ ἀεὶ φιλό- E
νεικός ἐστι πρὸς ὃ ἂν ὁρμήσῃ. ἡμᾶς δὲ οὐδὲν δεῖ συμφι-
λονεικεῖν οὔτε Σωκράτει οὔτε Πρωταγόρᾳ, ἀλλὰ κοινῇ
ἀμφοτέρων δεῖσθαι μὴ μεταξὺ διαλῦσαι τὴν ξυνουσίαν.

Εἰπόντος δὲ αὐτοῦ ταῦτα ὁ Πρόδικος, Καλῶς μοι, 337
ἔφη, δοκεῖς λέγειν, ὦ Κριτία· χρὴ γὰρ τοὺς ἐν τοιοῖσδε
λόγοις παραγιγνομένους κοινοὺς μὲν εἶναι ἀμφοῖν τοῖν
διαλεγομένοιν ἀκροατάς, ἴσους δὲ μή. ἔστι γὰρ οὐ
ταὐτόν· κοινῇ μὲν γὰρ ἀκοῦσαι δεῖ ἀμφοτέρων, μὴ
ἴσον δὲ νεῖμαι ἑκατέρῳ, ἀλλὰ τῷ μὲν σοφωτέρῳ πλέον,
τῷ δὲ ἀμαθεστέρῳ ἔλαττον. ἐγὼ μὲν καὶ αὐτός, ὦ
Πρωταγόρα τε καὶ Σώκρατες, ἀξιῶ ὑμᾶς συγχωρεῖν B
καὶ ἀλλήλοις περὶ τῶν λόγων ἀμφισβητεῖν μέν, ἐρίζειν
δὲ μή· ἀμφισβητοῦσι μὲν γὰρ καὶ δι' εὔνοιαν οἱ φίλοι
τοῖς φίλοις, ἐρίζουσι δὲ οἱ διάφοροί τε καὶ ἐχθροὶ
ἀλλήλοις. καὶ οὕτως ἂν καλλίστη ἡμῖν ἡ συνουσία
γίγνοιτο· ὑμεῖς τε γὰρ οἱ λέγοντες μάλιστ' ἂν οὕτως ἐν
ἡμῖν τοῖς ἀκούουσιν εὐδοκιμοῖτε καὶ οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε—
εὐδοκιμεῖν μὲν γάρ ἐστι παρὰ ταῖς ψυχαῖς τῶν ἀ-
κουόντων ἄνευ ἀπάτης, ἐπαινεῖσθαι δὲ ἐν λόγῳ πολ-
λάκις παρὰ δόξαν ψευδομένων—, ἡμεῖς τ' αὖ οἱ ἀκού- C
οντες μάλιστ' ἂν οὕτως εὐφραινοίμεθα, οὐχ ἡδοίμεθα·
εὐφραίνεσθαι μὲν γάρ ἐστι μανθάνοντά τι καὶ φρονή-
σεως μεταλαμβάνοντα αὐτῇ τῇ διανοίᾳ, ἥδεσθαι δὲ
ἐσθίοντά τι ἢ ἄλλο ἡδὺ πάσχοντα αὐτῷ τῷ σώματι.
Ταῦτα οὖν εἰπόντος τοῦ Προδίκου, πολλοὶ πάνυ τῶν
παρόντων ἀπεδέξαντο.

XXIV. Μετὰ δὲ τὸν Πρόδικον Ἱππίας ὁ σοφὸς
εἶπεν, Ὦ ἄνδρες, ἔφη, οἱ παρόντες, ἡγοῦμαι ἐγὼ ἡμᾶς
συγγενεῖς τε καὶ οἰκείους καὶ πολίτας ἅπαντας εἶναι
D φύσει, οὐ νόμῳ· τὸ γὰρ ὅμοιον τῷ ὁμοίῳ φύσει συγ-
γενές ἐστιν, ὁ δὲ νόμος, τύραννος ὢν τῶν ἀνθρώπων,
πολλὰ παρὰ τὴν φύσιν βιάζεται. ἡμᾶς οὖν αἰσχρὸν
τὴν μὲν φύσιν τῶν πραγμάτων εἰδέναι, σοφωτάτους
δὲ ὄντας τῶν Ἑλλήνων, καὶ κατ' αὐτὸ τοῦτο νῦν
συνεληλυθότας τῆς τε Ἑλλάδος εἰς αὐτὸ τὸ πρυτανεῖον
τῆς σοφίας καὶ αὐτῆς τῆς πόλεως εἰς τὸν μέγιστον καὶ
ὀλβιώτατον οἶκον τόνδε, μηδὲν τούτου τοῦ ἀξιώματος
E ἄξιον ἀποφήνασθαι, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ τοὺς φαυλοτάτους
τῶν ἀνθρώπων διαφέρεσθαι ἀλλήλοις. ἐγὼ μὲν οὖν
καὶ δέομαι καὶ συμβουλεύω, ὦ Πρωταγόρα τε καὶ
Σώκρατες, συμβῆναι ὑμᾶς ὥσπερ ὑπὸ διαιτητῶν ἡμῶν
338 συμβιβαζόντων εἰς τὸ μέσον, καὶ μήτε σὲ τὸ ἀκριβὲς
τοῦτο εἶδος τῶν διαλόγων ζητεῖν τὸ κατὰ βραχὺ λίαν,
εἰ μὴ ἡδὺ Πρωταγόρᾳ, ἀλλ' ἐφεῖναι καὶ χαλάσαι τὰς
ἡνίας τοῖς λόγοις, ἵνα μεγαλοπρεπέστεροι καὶ εὐσχη-
μονέστεροι ἡμῖν φαίνωνται, μήτ' αὖ Πρωταγόραν
πάντα κάλων ἐκτείναντα, οὐρίᾳ ἐφέντα, φεύγειν εἰς τὸ
πέλαγος τῶν λόγων ἀποκρύψαντα γῆν, ἀλλὰ μέσον
τι ἀμφοτέρους τεμεῖν. ὡς οὖν ποιήσετε, καὶ πείθεσθέ
B μοι ῥαβδοῦχον καὶ ἐπιστάτην καὶ πρύτανιν ἑλέσθαι,
ὃς ὑμῖν φυλάξει τὸ μέτριον μῆκος τῶν λόγων ἑκατέρου.

XXV. Ταῦτα ἤρεσε τοῖς παροῦσι, καὶ πάντες
ἐπῄνεσαν, καὶ ἐμέ τε ὁ Καλλίας οὐκ ἔφη ἀφήσειν, καὶ
ἑλέσθαι ἐδέοντο ἐπιστάτην. εἶπον οὖν ἐγώ, ὅτι αἰ-
σχρὸν εἴη βραβευτὴν ἑλέσθαι τῶν λόγων. εἴτε γὰρ
χείρων ἔσται ἡμῶν ὁ αἱρεθείς, οὐκ ὀρθῶς ἂν ἔχοι τὸν
χείρω τῶν βελτιόνων ἐπιστατεῖν, εἴτε ὅμοιος, οὐδ'
οὕτως ὀρθῶς· ὁ γὰρ ὅμοιος ἡμῖν ὅμοια καὶ ποιήσει,

ὥστε ἐκ περιττοῦ ᾑρήσεται. ἀλλὰ δὴ βελτίονα ἡμῶν C
αἱρήσεσθε, τῇ μὲν ἀληθείᾳ, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, ἀδύνατον ὑμῖν,
ὥστε Πρωταγόρου τοῦδε σοφώτερόν τινα ἑλέσθαι· εἰ
δὲ αἱρήσεσθε μὲν μηδὲν βελτίω, φήσετε δέ, αἰσχρὸν
καὶ τοῦτο τῷδε γίγνεται, ὥσπερ φαύλῳ ἀνθρώπῳ ἐπι-
στάτην αἱρεῖσθαι· ἐπεὶ τό γ' ἐμὸν οὐδέν μοι διαφέρει.
ἀλλ' οὑτωσὶ ἐθέλω ποιῆσαι, ἵν', ὃ προθυμεῖσθε, συν-
ουσία τε καὶ διάλογοι ἡμῖν γίγνωνται· εἰ μὴ βούλεται
Πρωταγόρας ἀποκρίνεσθαι, οὗτος μὲν ἐρωτάτω, ἐγὼ
δὲ ἀποκρινοῦμαι, καὶ ἅμα πειράσομαι αὐτῷ δεῖξαι, ὡς D
ἐγώ φημι χρῆναι τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον ἀποκρίνεσθαι·
ἐπειδὰν δὲ ἐγὼ ἀποκρίνωμαι ὁπόσ' ἂν οὗτος βούληται
ἐρωτᾶν, πάλιν οὗτος ἐμοὶ λόγον ὑποσχέτω ὁμοίως.
ἐὰν οὖν μὴ δοκῇ πρόθυμος εἶναι πρὸς αὐτὸ τὸ ἐρωτώ-
μενον ἀποκρίνεσθαι, καὶ ἐγὼ καὶ ὑμεῖς κοινῇ δεησό-
μεθα αὐτοῦ ἅπερ ὑμεῖς ἐμοῦ, μὴ διαφθείρειν τὴν συν-
ουσίαν. καὶ οὐδὲν δεῖ τούτου ἕνεκα ἕνα ἐπιστάτην
γενέσθαι, ἀλλὰ πάντες κοινῇ ἐπιστατήσετε. Ἐδόκει E
πᾶσιν οὕτω ποιητέον εἶναι. καὶ ὁ Πρωταγόρας πάνυ
μὲν οὐκ ἤθελεν, ὅμως δὲ ἠναγκάσθη ὁμολογῆσαι ἐρω-
τήσειν, καὶ ἐπειδὰν ἱκανῶς ἐρωτήσῃ, πάλιν δώσειν
λόγον κατὰ σμικρὸν ἀποκρινόμενος. ἤρξατο οὖν ἐρω-
τᾶν οὑτωσί πως.

XXVI. Ἡγοῦμαι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐγὼ ἀνδρὶ
παιδείας μέγιστον μέρος εἶναι περὶ ἐπῶν δεινὸν εἶναι·
ἔστι δὲ τοῦτο τὰ ὑπὸ τῶν ποιητῶν λεγόμενα οἷόν 339
τ' εἶναι ξυνιέναι ἅ τε ὀρθῶς πεποίηται καὶ ἃ μή, καὶ
ἐπίστασθαι διελεῖν τε καὶ ἐρωτώμενον λόγον δοῦναι.
καὶ δὴ καὶ νῦν ἔσται τὸ ἐρώτημα περὶ τοῦ αὐτοῦ μέν,
περὶ οὗπερ ἐγώ τε καὶ σὺ νῦν δὴ διελεγόμεθα, περὶ
ἀρετῆς, μετενηνεγμένον δὲ εἰς ποίησιν· τοσοῦτον μόνον
διοίσει. λέγει γάρ που Σιμωνίδης πρὸς Σκόπαν τὸν

Κρέοντος υἱὸν τοῦ Θετταλοῦ, ὅτι

B Ἄνδρ' ἀγαθὸν μὲν ἀλαθέως γενέσθαι χαλεπόν,
χερσίν τε καὶ ποσὶ καὶ νόῳ τετράγωνον, ἄνευ ψόγου
τετυγμένον.

τοῦτο ἐπίστασαι τὸ ᾆσμα, ἢ πᾶν σοι διεξέλθω; Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον, ὅτι Οὐδὲν δεῖ· ἐπίσταμαί τε γάρ, καὶ πάνυ μοι τυγχάνει μεμεληκὸς τοῦ ᾄσματος. Εὖ, ἔφη, λέγεις. πότερον οὖν καλῶς σοι δοκεῖ πεποιῆσθαι καὶ ὀρθῶς, ἢ οὔ; Πάνυ, ἔφην ἐγώ, καλῶς τε καὶ ὀρθῶς. Δοκεῖ δέ σοι καλῶς πεποιῆσθαι, εἰ ἐναντία λέγει αὐτὸς αὑτῷ ὁ ποιητής; Οὐ καλῶς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. Ὅρα δή, ἔφη, βέλ-
C τιον. Ἀλλ' ὦ 'γαθέ, ἔσκεμμαι ἱκανῶς. Οἶσθα οὖν, ἔφη, ὅτι προϊόντος τοῦ ᾄσματος λέγει που

Οὐδέ μοι ἐμμελέως τὸ Πιττάκειον νέμεται
καίτοι σηφοῦ παρὰ φωτὸς εἰρημένον· χαλεπὸν φάτ'
ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι.

ἐννοεῖς, ὅτι ὁ αὐτὸς οὗτος καὶ τάδε λέγει κἀκεῖνα τὰ ἔμπροσθεν; Οἶδα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. Δοκεῖ οὖν σοι, ἔφη, ταῦτα ἐκείνοις ὁμολογεῖσθαι; Φαίνεταί ἔμοιγε. Καὶ ἅμα μέντοι ἐφοβούμην, μή τι λέγοι. Ἀτάρ, ἔφην ἐγώ,
D σοὶ οὐ φαίνεται; Πῶς γὰρ ἂν φαίνοιτο ὁμολογεῖν αὐτὸς ἑαυτῷ ὁ ταῦτα ἀμφότερα λέγων, ὅς γε τὸ μὲν πρῶτον αὐτὸς ὑπέθετο χαλεπὸν εἶναι ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν γενέσθαι ἀληθείᾳ, ὀλίγον δὲ τοῦ ποιήματος εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν προελθὼν ἐπελάθετο, καὶ Πιττακὸν τὸν ταὐτὰ λέγοντα ἑαυτῷ, ὅτι χαλεπὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι, τοῦτον μέμφεταί τε καὶ οὔ φησιν ἀποδέχεσθαι αὐτοῦ τὰ αὐτὰ ἑαυτῷ λέγοντος. καίτοι ὁπότε τὸν ταὐτὰ λέγοντα αὑτῷ μέμφεται, δῆλον, ὅτι καὶ ἑαυτὸν μέμφεται, ὥστε ἤτοι τὸ
E πρότερον ἢ ὕστερον οὐκ ὀρθῶς λέγει. Εἰπὼν οὖν ταῦτα πολλοῖς θόρυβον παρέσχε καὶ ἔπαινον τῶν ἀκουόντων. καὶ ἐγὼ τὸ μὲν πρῶτον, ὡσπερεὶ ὑπὸ ἀγαθοῦ πύκτου

πληγείς, ἐσκοτώθην τε καὶ ἰλιγγίασα εἰπόντος αὐτοῦ
ταῦτα καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἐπιθορυβησάντων· ἔπειτα, ὥς
γε πρὸς σὲ εἰρῆσθαι τἀληθῆ, ἵνα μοι χρόνος ἐγγένηται
τῇ σκέψει τί λέγοι ὁ ποιητής, τρέπομαι πρὸς τὸν
Πρόδικον, καὶ καλέσας αὐτόν, Ὦ Πρόδικε, ἔφην ἐγώ,
σός μέντοι Σιμωνίδης πολίτης· δίκαιος εἶ βοηθεῖν τῷ
ἀνδρί. δοκῶ οὖν μοι ἐγὼ παρακαλεῖν σέ, ὥσπερ ἔφη 340
Ὅμηρος τὸν Σκάμανδρον πολιορκούμενον ὑπὸ τοῦ
Ἀχιλλέως τὸν Σιμόεντα παρακαλεῖν, εἰπόντα

Φίλε κασίγνητε, σθένος ἀνέρος ἀμφότεροί περ
σχῶμεν.

ἀτὰρ καὶ ἐγὼ σὲ παρακαλῶ, μὴ ἡμῖν ὁ Πρωταγόρας
τὸν Σιμωνίδην ἐκπέρσῃ. καὶ γὰρ οὖν καὶ δεῖται τὸ
ὑπὲρ Σιμωνίδου ἐπανόρθωμα τῆς σῆς μουσικῆς, ᾗ τό
τε βούλεσθαι καὶ ἐπιθυμεῖν διαιρεῖς ὡς οὐ ταὐτὸν ὄν,
καὶ ἃ νῦν δὴ εἶπες πολλά τε καὶ καλά. καὶ νῦν B
σκόπει, εἴ σοι συνδοκεῖ ὅπερ ἐμοί. οὐ γὰρ φαίνεται
ἐναντία λέγειν αὐτὸς αὑτῷ Σιμωνίδης. σὺ γάρ, ὦ
Πρόδικε, προαπόφηναι τὴν σὴν γνώμην. ταὐτόν σοι
δοκεῖ εἶναι τὸ γενέσθαι καὶ τὸ εἶναι, ἢ ἄλλο; Ἄλλο νὴ
Δί', ἔφη ὁ Πρόδικος. Οὐκοῦν, ἔφην ἐγώ, ἐν μὲν τοῖς
πρώτοις αὐτὸς ὁ Σιμωνίδης τὴν ἑαυτοῦ γνώμην ἀπε-
φήνατο, ὅτι ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν ἀληθείᾳ γενέσθαι χαλεπὸν
εἴη; Ἀληθῆ λέγεις, ἔφη ὁ Πρόδικος. Τὸν δέ γε C
Πιττακόν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, μέμφεται, οὐχ ὡς οἴεται Πρω-
ταγόρας, ταὐτὸν ἑαυτῷ λέγοντα, ἀλλ' ἄλλο. οὐ γὰρ
τοῦτο ὁ Πιττακὸς ἔλεγε τὸ χαλεπόν, γενέσθαι ἐσθλόν,
ὥσπερ ὁ Σιμωνίδης, ἀλλὰ τοὔτ', ἔμμεναι· ἔστι δὲ οὐ
ταὐτόν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ὥς φησι Πρόδικος ὅδε, τὸ εἶναι
καὶ τὸ γενέσθαι. εἰ δὲ μὴ τὸ αὐτό ἐστι τὸ εἶναι τῷ
γενέσθαι, οὐκ ἐναντία λέγει ὁ Σιμωνίδης αὐτὸς αὑτῷ.
καὶ ἴσως ἂν φαίη Πρόδικος ὅδε καὶ ἄλλοι πολλοὶ καθ' D

Ἡσίοδον γενέσθαι μὲν ἀγαθὸν χαλεπὸν εἶναι· τῆς γὰρ ἀρετῆς ἔμπροσθεν τοὺς θεοὺς ἱδρῶτα θεῖναι· ὅταν δέ τις αὐτῆς εἰς ἄκρον ἵκηται, ῥηϊδίην δὴ ἔπειτα πέλειν, χαλεπήν περ ἐοῦσαν, ἐκτῆσθαι.

XXVII. Ὁ μὲν οὖν Πρόδικος ἀκούσας ταῦτα ἐπῄνεσέ με· ὁ δὲ Πρωταγόρας, Τὸ ἐπανόρθωμά σοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, μεῖζον ἁμάρτημα ἔχει ἢ ὃ ἐπανορθοῖς. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον, Κακὸν ἄρα μοι εἴργασται, ὡς
E ἔοικεν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, καὶ εἰμί τις γελοῖος ἰατρός· ἰώμενος μεῖζον τὸ νόσημα ποιῶ. Ἀλλ' οὕτως ἔχει, ἔφη. Πῶς δή; ἦν δ' ἐγώ. Πολλὴ ἄν, ἔφη, ἀμαθία εἴη τοῦ ποιητοῦ, εἰ οὕτω φαῦλόν τί φησιν εἶναι τὴν ἀρετὴν ἐκτῆσθαι, ὅ ἐστι πάντων χαλεπώτατον, ὡς ἅπασι δοκεῖ ἀνθρώποις. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον, Νὴ τὸν Δία, εἰς καιρόν γε παρατετύχηκεν ἡμῖν ἐν τοῖς λόγοις Πρόδικος ὅδε. κινδυνεύει γάρ τοι, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ἡ Προ-
341 δίκου σοφία θεία τις εἶναι πάλαι, ἤτοι ἀπὸ Σιμωνίδου ἀρξαμένη, ἢ καὶ ἔτι παλαιοτέρα. σὺ δὲ ἄλλων πολλῶν ἔμπειρος ὢν ταύτης ἄπειρος εἶναι φαίνει, οὐχ ὥσπερ ἐγὼ ἔμπειρος διὰ τὸ μαθητὴς εἶναι Προδίκου τουτουΐ. καὶ νῦν μοι δοκεῖς οὐ μανθάνειν, ὅτι καὶ τὸ χαλεπὸν τοῦτο ἴσως οὐχ οὕτω Σιμωνίδης ὑπελάμβανεν, ὥσπερ σὺ ὑπολαμβάνεις, ἀλλ' ὥσπερ περὶ τοῦ δεινοῦ Πρόδικός με οὑτοσὶ νουθετεῖ ἑκάστοτε, ὅταν ἐπαινῶν ἐγὼ
B ἢ σὲ ἢ ἄλλον τινὰ λέγω, ὅτι Πρωταγόρας σοφὸς καὶ δεινός ἐστιν ἀνήρ, ἐρωτᾷ, εἰ οὐκ αἰσχύνομαι τἀγαθὰ δεινὰ καλῶν—τὸ γὰρ δεινόν, φησί, κακόν ἐστιν· οὐδεὶς γοῦν λέγει ἑκάστοτε, δεινοῦ πλούτου, οὐδὲ δεινῆς εἰρήνης, οὐδὲ δεινῆς ὑγιείας, ἀλλὰ δεινῆς νόσου καὶ δεινοῦ πολέμου καὶ δεινῆς πενίας, ὡς τοῦ δεινοῦ κακοῦ ὄντος—ἴσως οὖν καὶ τὸ χαλεπὸν αὖ οἱ Κεῖοι καὶ ὁ Σιμωνίδης ἢ κακὸν ὑπολαμβάνουσιν ἢ ἄλλο τι, ὃ σὺ

οὐ μανθάνεις. ἐρώμεθα οὖν Πρόδικον· δίκαιον γὰρ
τὴν Σιμωνίδου φωνὴν τοῦτον ἐρωτᾶν. τί ἔλεγεν, ὦ
Πρόδικε, τὸ χαλεπὸν Σιμωνίδης; Κακόν, ἔφη. Διὰ C
ταῦτ' ἄρα καὶ μέμφεται, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Πρόδικε, τὸν
Πιττακὸν λέγοντα Χαλεπὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι, ὥσπερ ἂν
εἰ ἤκουεν αὐτοῦ λέγοντος, ὅτι ἐστὶ κακὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμ-
μεναι. Ἀλλὰ τί οἴει, ἔφη, λέγειν, ὦ Σώκρατες, Σιμω-
νίδην ἄλλο ἢ τοῦτο, καὶ ὀνειδίζειν τῷ Πιττακῷ, ὅτι τὰ
ὀνόματα οὐκ ἠπίστατο ὀρθῶς διαιρεῖν, ἅτε Λέσβιος
ὢν καὶ ἐν φωνῇ βαρβάρῳ τεθραμμένος; Ἀκούεις δή,
ἔφην ἐγώ, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, Προδίκου τοῦδε· ἔχεις τι D
πρὸς ταῦτα λέγειν; Καὶ ὁ Πρωταγόρας, Πολλοῦ γε
δεῖ, ἔφη, οὕτως ἔχειν, ὦ Πρόδικε· ἀλλ' ἐγὼ εὖ οἶδ'
ὅτι καὶ Σιμωνίδης τὸ χαλεπὸν ἔλεγεν ὅπερ ἡμεῖς οἱ
ἄλλοι, οὐ τὸ κακόν, ἀλλ' ὃ ἂν μὴ ῥᾴδιον ᾖ, ἀλλὰ διὰ
πολλῶν πραγμάτων γίγνηται. Ἀλλὰ καὶ ἐγὼ οἶμαι,
ἔφην, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, τοῦτο λέγειν Σιμωνίδην, καὶ
Πρόδικόν γε τόνδε εἰδέναι, ἀλλὰ παίζειν καὶ σοῦ
δοκεῖν ἀποπειρᾶσθαι, εἰ οἷός τ' ἔσει τῷ σαυτοῦ λόγῳ E
βοηθεῖν· ἐπεὶ ὅτι γε Σιμωνίδης οὐ λέγει τὸ χαλεπὸν
κακόν, μέγα τεκμήριόν ἐστιν εὐθὺς τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ῥῆμα·
λέγει γάρ, ὅτι

θεὸς ἂν μόνος τοῦτ' ἔχοι γέρας,

οὐ δήπου τοῦτό γε λέγων, κακὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι, εἴπερ
τὸν θεόν φησι μόνον τοῦτο ἂν ἔχειν καὶ τῷ θεῷ τοῦτο
γέρας ἀπένειμε μόνῳ· ἀκόλαστον γὰρ ἄν τινα λέγοι
Σιμωνίδην Πρόδικος καὶ οὐδαμῶς Κεῖον. ἀλλ' ἅ μοι
δοκεῖ διανοεῖσθαι Σιμωνίδης ἐν τούτῳ τῷ ᾄσματι 342
ἐθέλω σοι εἰπεῖν, εἰ βούλει λαβεῖν μου πεῖραν ὅπως
ἔχω, ὃ σὺ λέγεις τοῦτο, περὶ ἐπῶν· ἐὰν δὲ βούλῃ, σοῦ
ἀκούσομαι. Ὁ μὲν οὖν Πρωταγόρας ἀκούσας μου
ταῦτα λέγοντος, Εἰ σὺ βούλει, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες· ὁ

δὲ Πρόδικός τε καὶ ὁ Ἱππίας ἐκελευέτην πάνυ, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι.

XXVIII. *Ἐγὼ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἅ γέ μοι δοκεῖ περὶ τοῦ ᾄσματος τούτου, πειράσομαι ὑμῖν διεξελθεῖν. Φιλοσοφία γάρ ἐστι παλαιοτάτη τε καὶ πλείστη τῶν Ἑλλήνων ἐν Κρήτῃ τε καὶ ἐν Λακεδαίμονι, καὶ σο-*
B *φισταὶ πλεῖστοι γῆς ἐκεῖ εἰσιν. ἀλλ' ἐξαρνοῦνται καὶ σχηματίζονται ἀμαθεῖς εἶναι, ἵνα μὴ κατάδηλοι ὦσιν, ὅτι σοφίᾳ τῶν Ἑλλήνων περίεισιν, ὥσπερ οὓς Πρωταγόρας ἔλεγε τοὺς σοφιστάς, ἀλλὰ δοκῶσι τῷ μάχεσθαι καὶ ἀνδρείᾳ περιεῖναι, ἡγούμενοι, εἰ γνωσθεῖεν ᾧ περίεισι, πάντας τοῦτο ἀσκήσειν. νῦν δὲ ἀποκρυψάμενοι ἐκεῖνο ἐξηπατήκασι τοὺς ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι λακωνίζοντας, καὶ οἱ μὲν ὦτά τε κατάγνυνται μιμούμενοι*
C *αὐτούς, καὶ ἱμάντας περιειλίττονται καὶ φιλογυμναστοῦσι καὶ βραχείας ἀναβολὰς φοροῦσιν, ὡς δὴ τούτοις κρατοῦντας τῶν Ἑλλήνων τοὺς Λακεδαιμονίους· οἱ δὲ Λακεδαιμόνιοι ἐπειδὰν βούλωνται ἀνέδην τοῖς παρ' αὐτοῖς ξυγγενέσθαι σοφισταῖς καὶ ἤδη ἄχθωνται λάθρᾳ ξυγγιγνόμενοι, ξενηλασίας ποιούμενοι τῶν τε λακωνιζόντων τούτων καὶ ἐάν τις ἄλλος ξένος ὢν ἐπιδημήσῃ, συγγίγνονται τοῖς σοφισταῖς λανθάνοντες τοὺς ξένους, καὶ αὐτοὶ οὐδένα ἐῶσι τῶν νέων εἰς τὰς*
D *ἄλλας πόλεις ἐξιέναι, ὥσπερ οὐδὲ Κρῆτες, ἵνα μὴ ἀπομανθάνωσιν ἃ αὐτοὶ διδάσκουσιν. εἰσὶ δὲ ἐν ταύταις ταῖς πόλεσιν οὐ μόνον ἄνδρες ἐπὶ παιδεύσει μέγα φρονοῦντες, ἀλλὰ καὶ γυναῖκες. Γνοίητε δ' ἄν, ὅτι ἐγὼ ταῦτα ἀληθῆ λέγω, καὶ Λακεδαιμόνιοι πρὸς φιλοσοφίαν καὶ λόγους ἄριστα πεπαίδευνται, ὧδε. εἰ γὰρ ἐθέλει τις Λακεδαιμονίων τῷ φαυλοτάτῳ συγγενέσθαι, τὰ μὲν πολλὰ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις εὑρήσει αὐτὸν*
E *φαῦλόν τινα φαινόμενον, ἔπειτα, ὅπου ἂν τύχῃ τῶν*

λεγομένων, ἐνέβαλε ῥῆμα ἄξιον λόγου βραχὺ καὶ
συνεστραμμένον, ὥσπερ δεινὸς ἀκοντιστής, ὥστε φαί-
νεσθαι τὸν προσδιαλεγόμενον παιδὸς μηδὲν βελτίω.
Τοῦτο οὖν αὐτὸ καὶ τῶν νῦν εἰσιν οἳ κατανενοήκασι
καὶ τῶν πάλαι, ὅτι τὸ λακωνίζειν πολὺ μᾶλλόν ἐστι
φιλοσοφεῖν ἢ φιλογυμναστεῖν, εἰδότες, ὅτι τοιαῦτα
οἷόν τ' εἶναι ῥήματα φθέγγεσθαι τελέως πεπαιδευμένου 343
ἐστὶν ἀνθρώπου. τούτων ἦν καὶ Θαλῆς ὁ Μιλήσιος,
καὶ Πιττακὸς ὁ Μυτιληναῖος, καὶ Βίας ὁ Πριηνεύς,
καὶ Σόλων ὁ ἡμέτερος, καὶ Κλεόβουλος ὁ Λίνδιος, καὶ
Μύσων ὁ Χηνεύς, καὶ ἕβδομος ἐν τούτοις ἐλέγετο
Λακεδαιμόνιος Χίλων. οὗτοι πάντες ζηλωταὶ καὶ
ἐρασταὶ καὶ μαθηταὶ ἦσαν τῆς Λακεδαιμονίων παι-
δείας, καὶ καταμάθοι ἄν τις αὐτῶν τὴν σοφίαν τοιαύ-
την οὖσαν, ῥήματα βραχέα ἀξιομνημόνευτα ἑκάστῳ
εἰρημένα. οὗτοι καὶ κοινῇ ξυνελθόντες ἀπαρχὴν τῆς B
σοφίας ἀνέθεσαν τῷ Ἀπόλλωνι εἰς τὸν νεὼν τὸν ἐν
Δελφοῖς, γράψαντες ταῦτα, ἃ δὴ πάντες ὑμνοῦσι,
γ ν ῶ θ ι σ α υ τ ό ν, καὶ μ η δ ὲ ν ἄ γ α ν.

Τοῦ δὴ ἕνεκα ταῦτα λέγω; Ὅτι οὗτος ὁ τρόπος ἦν
τῶν παλαιῶν τῆς φιλοσοφίας, βραχυλογία τις Λα-
κωνική. καὶ δὴ καὶ τοῦ Πιττακοῦ ἰδίᾳ περιεφέρετο
τοῦτο τὸ ῥῆμα ἐγκωμιαζόμενον ὑπὸ τῶν σοφῶν, τὸ
χ α λ ε π ὸ ν ἐ σ θ λ ὸ ν ἔ μ μ ε ν α ι. ὁ οὖν Σιμωνίδης, ἅτε C
φιλότιμος ὢν ἐπὶ σοφίᾳ, ἔγνω, ὅτι, εἰ καθέλοι τοῦτο τὸ
ῥῆμα ὥσπερ εὐδοκιμοῦντα ἀθλητὴν καὶ περιγένοιτο
αὐτοῦ, αὐτὸς εὐδοκιμήσει ἐν τοῖς τότε ἀνθρώποις. εἰς
τοῦτο οὖν τὸ ῥῆμα καὶ τούτου ἕνεκα τούτῳ ἐπιβου-
λεύων κολοῦσαι αὐτὸ ἅπαν τὸ ᾆσμα πεποίηκεν, ὥς
μοι φαίνεται.

XXIX. *Ἐπισκεψώμεθα δὴ αὐτὸ κοινῇ ἅπαντες,*
εἰ ἄρα ἐγὼ ἀληθῆ λέγω. Εὐθὺς γὰρ τὸ πρῶτον τοῦ

D ᾄσματος μανικὸν ἂν φανείη, εἰ βουλόμενος λέγειν, ὅτι ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν γενέσθαι χαλεπόν, ἔπειτα ἐνέβαλε τὸ μέν. τοῦτο γὰρ οὐδὲ πρὸς ἕνα λόγον φαίνεται ἐμβεβλῆσθαι, ἐὰν μή τις ὑπολάβῃ πρὸς τὸ τοῦ Πιττακου ῥῆμα ὥσπερ ἐρίζοντα λέγειν τὸν Σιμωνίδην· λέγοντος τοῦ Πιττακοῦ, ὅτι Χαλεπὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι, ἀμφισβητοῦντα εἰπεῖν, ὅτι Οὔκ, ἀλλὰ γενέσθαι μὲν χαλεπὸν ἄνδρα ἀγαθόν ἐστιν, ὦ Πιττακέ, ὡς ἀληθῶς,—οὐκ ἀληθείᾳ ἀγαθόν, οὐκ ἐπὶ τούτῳ λέγει τὴν ἀλήθειαν,
E ὡς ἄρα ὄντων τινῶν τῶν μὲν ὡς ἀληθῶς ἀγαθῶν, τῶν δὲ ἀγαθῶν μέν, οὐ μέντοι ἀληθῶς· εὔηθες γὰρ τοῦτο γε φανείη ἂν καὶ οὐ Σιμωνίδου· ἀλλ' ὑπερβατὸν δεῖ θεῖναι ἐν τῷ ᾄσματι τὸ ἀλαθέως, οὑτωσί πως ὑπειπόντα τὸ τοῦ Πιττακοῦ, ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ θείημεν αὐτὸν λέγοντα τὸν Πιττακὸν καὶ Σιμωνίδην ἀποκρινόμενον, εἰπόντα· Ὦ ἄνθρωποι, χαλεπὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι, τὸν
344 δὲ ἀποκρινόμενον, ὅτι Ὦ Πιττακέ, οὐκ ἀληθῆ λέγεις· οὐ γὰρ εἶναι, ἀλλὰ γενέσθαι μέν ἐστιν ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν χερσί τε καὶ ποσὶ καὶ νόῳ τετράγωνον, ἄνευ ψόγου τετυγμένον, χαλεπὸν ἀλαθέως. οὕτω φαίνεται πρὸς λόγον τὸ μὲν ἐμβεβλημένον καὶ τὸ ἀλαθέως ὀρθῶς ἐπ' ἐσχάτῳ κείμενον. καὶ τὰ ἐπιόντα πάντα τούτῳ μαρτυρεῖ, ὅτι οὕτως εἴρηται. πολλὰ μὲν γὰρ ἔστι καὶ
B περὶ ἑκάστου τῶν ἐν τῷ ᾄσματι εἰρημένων ἀποδεῖξαι, ὡς εὖ πεποίηται· πάνυ γὰρ χαριέντως καὶ μεμελημένως ἔχει· ἀλλὰ μακρὸν ἂν εἴη αὐτὸ οὕτω διελθεῖν. ἀλλὰ τὸν τύπον αὐτοῦ τὸν ὅλον διεξέλθωμεν καὶ τὴν βούλησιν, ὅτι παντὸς μᾶλλον ἔλεγχός ἐστι τοῦ Πιττακείου ῥήματος διὰ παντὸς τοῦ ᾄσματος.

XXX. Λέγει γὰρ μετὰ τοῦτο ὀλίγα διελθών, ὡς ἂν εἰ λέγοι λόγον, ὅτι γενέσθαι μὲν ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν χαλεπὸν ἀλαθέως, οἷόν τε μέντοι ἐπί γε χρόνον τινά·

γενόμενον δὲ διαμένειν ἐν ταύτῃ τῇ ἕξει καὶ εἶναι ἄνδρα C
ἀγαθόν, ὡς σὺ λέγεις, ὦ Πιττακέ, ἀδύνατον καὶ οὐκ ἀνθρώπειον, ἀλλὰ θεὸς ἂν μόνος τοῦτο ἔχοι τὸ γέρας,

ἄνδρα δ' οὐκ ἔστι μὴ οὐ κακὸν ἔμμεναι,
ὃν ἂν ἀμήχανος συμφορὰ καθέλῃ.

τίνα οὖν ἀμήχανος συμφορὰ καθαιρεῖ ἐν πλοίου ἀρχῇ; δῆλον ὅτι οὐ τὸν ἰδιώτην· ὁ μὲν γὰρ ἰδιώτης ἀεὶ καθῄρηται, ὥσπερ οὖν οὐ τὸν κείμενόν τις ἂν καταβάλοι, ἀλλὰ τὸν μὲν ἑστῶτά ποτε καταβάλοι ἄν τις, ὥστε κείμενον ποιῆσαι, τὸν δὲ κείμενον οὔ, οὕτω καὶ τὸν D
εὐμήχανον ὄντα ποτὲ ἀμήχανος ἂν συμφορὰ καθέλοι, τὸν δὲ ἀεὶ ἀμήχανον ὄντα οὔ· καὶ τὸν κυβερνήτην μέγας χειμὼν ἐπιπεσὼν ἀμήχανον ἂν ποιήσειε, καὶ γεωργὸν χαλεπὴ ὥρα ἐπελθοῦσα ἀμήχανον ἂν θείη, καὶ ἰατρὸν ταὐτὰ ταῦτα. τῷ μὲν γὰρ ἐσθλῷ ἐγχωρεῖ κακῷ γενέσθαι, ὥσπερ καὶ παρ' ἄλλου ποιητοῦ μαρτυρεῖται τοῦ εἰπόντος

αὐτὰρ ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς τοτὲ μὲν κακός, ἄλλοτε δ' ἐσθλός·

τῷ δὲ κακῷ οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ γενέσθαι, ἀλλ' ἀεὶ εἶναι E
ἀνάγκη. ὥστε τὸν μὲν εὐμήχανον καὶ σοφὸν καὶ ἀγαθὸν ἐπειδὰν ἀμήχανος συμφορὰ καθέλῃ, οὐκ ἔστι μὴ οὐ κακὸν ἔμμεναι· σὺ δὲ φῄς, ὦ Πιττακέ, χαλεπὸν ἐσθλὸν ἔμμεναι· τὸ δ' ἔστι γενέσθαι μὲν χαλεπόν, δυνατὸν δὲ [ἐσθλόν], ἔμμεναι δὲ ἀδύνατον.

πράξας μὲν γὰρ εὖ πᾶς ἀνὴρ ἀγαθός,
κακὸς δ' εἰ κακῶς.

τίς οὖν εἰς γράμματα ἀγαθὴ πρᾶξίς ἐστι, καὶ τίς ἄνδρα 345
ἀγαθὸν ποιεῖ εἰς γράμματα; δῆλον ὅτι ἡ τούτων μάθησις. τίς δὲ εὐπραγία ἀγαθὸν ἰατρὸν ποιεῖ; δῆλον ὅτι ἡ τῶν καμνόντων τῆς θεραπείας μάθησις. κακὸς δὲ κακῶς. τίς οὖν ἂν κακὸς ἰατρὸς γένοιτο; δῆλον ὅτι ᾧ πρῶτον μὲν ὑπάρχει ἰατρῷ εἶναι, ἔπειτα ἀγαθῷ

ἰατρῷ. οὗτος γὰρ ἂν καὶ κακὸς γένοιτο, ἡμεῖς δὲ οἱ ἰατρικῆς ἰδιῶται οὐκ ἄν ποτε γενοίμεθα κακῶς πράξαντες οὔτε ἰατροὶ οὔτε τέκτονες οὔτε ἄλλο οὐδὲν τῶν
B *τοιούτων· ὅστις δὲ μὴ ἰατρὸς ἂν γένοιτο κακῶς πράξας, δῆλον ὅτι οὐδὲ κακὸς ἰατρός. οὕτω καὶ ὁ μὲν ἀγαθὸς ἀνὴρ γένοιτ' ἄν ποτε καὶ κακὸς ἢ ὑπὸ χρόνου ἢ ὑπὸ νόσου ἢ ὑπὸ ἄλλου τινὸς περιπτώματος—αὕτη γὰρ μόνη ἐστὶ κακὴ πρᾶξις, ἐπιστήμης στερηθῆναι—, ὁ δὲ κακὸς ἀνὴρ οὐκ ἄν ποτε γένοιτο κακός· ἔστι γὰρ ἀεί· ἀλλ' εἰ μέλλει κακὸς γενέσθαι, δεῖ αὐτὸν πρότερον ἀγαθὸν γενέσθαι. ὥστε καὶ τοῦτο τοῦ ᾄσματος πρὸς τοῦτο τείνει, ὅτι εἶναι μὲν ἄνδρα ἀγαθὸν οὐχ οἷόν τε*
C *διατελοῦντα ἀγαθόν, γενέσθαι δὲ ἀγαθὸν οἷόν τε, καὶ κακόν γε τὸν αὐτὸν τοῦτον· ἐπὶ πλεῖστον δὲ καὶ ἄριστοι εἰσιν οὓς ἂν οἱ θεοὶ φιλῶσι.*

XXXI. *Ταῦτά τε οὖν πάντα πρὸς τὸν* Πιττακὸν *εἴρηται, καὶ τὰ ἐπιόντα γε τοῦ ᾄσματος ἔτι μᾶλλον δηλοῖ φησὶ γάρ·*

> Τοὔνεκεν οὔ ποτ' ἐγὼ τὸ μὴ γενέσθαι δυνατὸν
> διζήμενος κενεὰν ἐς ἄπρακτον ἐλπίδα μοῖραν αἰῶνος
> βαλέω,
> πανάμωμον ἄνθρωπον, εὐρυεδοῦς ὅσοι καρπὸν αἰνύμεθα χθονός.
> ἔπειθ' ὑμῖν εὑρὼν ἀπαγγελέω,

D *φησίν. οὕτω σφόδρα καὶ δι' ὅλου τοῦ ᾄσματος ἐπεξέρχεται τῷ τοῦ* Πιττακοῦ *ῥήματι.*

> *πάντας δ' ἐπαίνημι καὶ φιλέω*
> *ἑκὼν ὅστις ἔρδῃ*
> *μηδὲν αἰσχρόν· ἀνάγκῃ δ' οὐδὲ θεοὶ μάχονται.*

καὶ τοῦτ' ἐστὶ πρὸς τὸ αὐτὸ τοῦτο εἰρημενον· οὐ γὰρ οὕτως ἀπαίδευτος ἦν Σιμωνίδης, *ὥστε τούτους φάναι*

ἐπαινεῖν, ὃς ἂν ἑκὼν μηδὲν κακὸν ποιῇ, ὡς ὄντων τινῶν, οἳ ἑκόντες κακὰ ποιοῦσιν. ἐγὼ γὰρ σχεδόν τι οἶμαι τοῦτο, ὅτι οὐδεὶς τῶν σοφῶν ἀνδρῶν ἡγεῖται οὐδένα ἀνθρώπων ἑκόντα ἐξαμαρτάνειν, οὐδὲ αἰσχρά E *τε καὶ κακὰ ἑκόντα ἐργάζεσθαι, ἀλλ' εὖ ἴσασιν, ὅτι πάντες οἱ τὰ αἰσχρὰ καὶ κακὰ ποιοῦντες ἄκοντες ποιοῦσι. καὶ δὴ καὶ ὁ Σιμωνίδης οὐχ ὃς ἂν μὴ κακὰ ποιῇ ἑκών, τούτων φησὶν ἐπαινέτης εἶναι, ἀλλὰ περὶ ἑαυτοῦ λέγει τοῦτο τὸ ἑκών. ἡγεῖτο γὰρ ἄνδρα καλὸν κἀγαθὸν πολλάκις αὑτὸν ἐπαναγκάζειν φίλον τινὶ γίγνεσθαι καὶ ἐπαινέτην, οἷον ἀνδρὶ πολλάκις συμβῆναι* 346 *μητέρα ἢ πατέρα ἀλλόκοτον ἢ πατρίδα ἢ ἄλλο τι τῶν τοιούτων. τοὺς μὲν οὖν πονηρούς, ὅταν τοιοῦτόν τι αὐτοῖς συμβῇ, ὥσπερ ἀσμένους ὁρᾶν καὶ ψέγοντας ἐπιδεικνύναι καὶ κατηγορεῖν τὴν πονηρίαν τῶν γονέων ἢ πατρίδος, ἵνα αὐτοῖς ἀμελοῦσιν αὐτῶν μὴ ἐγκαλῶσιν οἱ ἄνθρωποι μηδ' ὀνειδίζωσιν, ὅτι ἀμελοῦσιν, ὥστε ἔτι* B *μᾶλλον ψέγειν τε αὐτοὺς καὶ ἔχθρας ἑκουσίους πρὸς ταῖς ἀναγκαίαις προστίθεσθαι· τοὺς δ' ἀγαθοὺς ἐπικρύπτεσθαί τε καὶ ἐπαινεῖν ἀναγκάζεσθαι, καὶ ἐάν τι ὀργισθῶσι τοῖς γονεῦσιν ἢ πατρίδι ἀδικηθέντες, αὐτοὺς ἑαυτοὺς παραμυθεῖσθαι καὶ διαλλάττεσθαι προσαναγκάζοντας ἑαυτοὺς φιλεῖν τοὺς ἑαυτῶν καὶ ἐπαινεῖν. πολλάκις δέ, οἶμαι, καὶ Σιμωνίδης ἡγήσατο καὶ αὐτὸς ἢ τύραννον ἢ ἄλλον τινὰ τῶν τοιούτων ἐπαινέσαι καὶ ἐγκωμιάσαι οὐχ ἑκών, ἀλλ' ἀναγκαζόμενος. ταῦτα δὴ* C *καὶ τῷ Πιττακῷ λέγει, ὅτι Ἐγώ, ὦ Πιττακέ, οὐ διὰ ταῦτά σε ψέγω, ὅτι εἰμὶ φιλόψογος· ἐπεὶ*

ἔμοιγ' ἐξαρκεῖ ὃς ἂν μὴ κακὸς ᾖ
μηδ' ἄγαν ἀπάλαμνος,
εἰδώς τ' ὀνησίπολιν δίκαν ὑγιὴς ἀνήρ·
οὔ μιν ἐγὼ μωμήσομαι·

οὐ γάρ εἰμι φιλόμωμος·
τῶν γὰρ ἠλιθίων ἀπείρων γενέθλα,
ὥστ' εἴ τις χαίρει ψέγων, ἐμπλησθείη ἂν ἐκείνους μεμφόμενος.
πάντα τοι καλά, τοῖσί τ' αἰσχρὰ μὴ μέμικται.

D οὐ τοῦτο λέγει, ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἔλεγε, πάντα τοι λευκά, οἷς μέλανα μὴ μέμικται· γελοῖον γὰρ ἂν εἴη πολλαχῇ· ἀλλ' ὅτι αὐτὸς καὶ τὰ μέσα ἀποδέχεται, ὥστε μὴ ψέγειν. καὶ οὐ ζητῶ, ἔφη, πανάμωμον ἄνθρωπον, εὐρυεδοῦς ὅσοι καρπὸν αἰνύμεθα χθονός· ἔπειθ' ὑμῖν εὑρὼν ἀπαγγελέω. ὥστε τούτου γ' ἕνεκα οὐδένα ἐπαινέσομαι, ἀλλά μοι ἐξαρκεῖ, ἂν ᾖ μέσος καὶ μηδὲν κακὸν ποιῇ, ὡς ἐγὼ πάντας φιλέω καὶ ἐπαίνημι—καὶ
E τῇ φωνῇ ἐνταῦθα κέχρηται τῇ τῶν Μυτιληναίων, ὡς πρὸς Πιττακὸν λέγων τὸ πάντας δὲ ἐπαίνημι καὶ φιλέω ἑκών (ἐνταῦθα δεῖ ἐν τῷ ἑκὼν διαλαβεῖν λέγοντα), ὅστις ἔρδῃ μηδὲν αἰσχρόν, ἄκων δ' ἔστιν οὓς ἐγὼ ἐπαινῶ καὶ φιλῶ. σὲ οὖν, καὶ εἰ μέσως
347 ἔλεγες ἐπιεικῆ καὶ ἀληθῆ, ὦ Πιττακέ, οὐκ ἄν ποτε ἔψεγον· νῦν δέ—σφόδρα γὰρ καὶ περὶ τῶν μεγίστων ψευδόμενος δοκεῖς ἀληθῆ λέγειν, διὰ ταῦτά σε ἐγὼ ψέγω.

Ταῦτά μοι δοκεῖ, ὦ Πρόδικε καὶ Πρωταγόρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, Σιμωνίδης διανοούμενος πεποιηκέναι τοῦτο τὸ ᾆσμα.

XXXII. Καὶ ὁ Ἱππίας, Εὖ μέν μοι δοκεῖς, ἔφη,
B ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ σὺ περὶ τοῦ ᾄσματος διεληλυθέναι· ἔστι μέντοι, ἔφη, καὶ ἐμοὶ λόγος περὶ αὐτοῦ εὖ ἔχων, ὃν ὑμῖν ἐπιδείξω, ἂν βούλησθε. Καὶ ὁ Ἀλκιβιάδης, Ναί, ἔφη, ὦ Ἱππία, εἰσαῦθίς γε· νῦν δὲ δίκαιόν ἐστιν ἃ ὡμολογησάτην πρὸς ἀλλήλω Πρωταγόρας καὶ Σωκράτης, Πρωταγόρας μὲν εἰ ἔτι βούλεται ἐρωτᾶν,

ἀποκρίνεσθαι Σωκράτη, εἰ δὲ δὴ βούλεται Σωκράτει
ἀποκρίνεσθαι, ἐρωτᾶν τὸν ἕτερον. Καὶ ἐγὼ εἶπον·
Ἐπιτρέπω μὲν ἔγωγε Πρωταγόρᾳ ὁπότερον αὐτῷ
ἴδιον· εἰ δὲ βούλεται, περὶ μὲν ᾀσμάτων τε καὶ ἐπῶν C
ἐάσωμεν, περὶ δὲ ὧν τὸ πρῶτον ἐγώ σε ἠρώτησα, ὦ
Πρωταγόρα, ἡδέως ἂν ἐπὶ τέλος ἔλθοιμι μετὰ σοῦ
σκοπούμενος. καὶ γὰρ δοκεῖ μοι τὸ περὶ ποιήσεως
διαλέγεσθαι ὁμοιότατον εἶναι τοῖς συμποσίοις τοῖς τῶν
φαύλων καὶ ἀγοραίων ἀνθρώπων. καὶ γὰρ οὗτοι διὰ
τὸ μὴ δύνασθαι ἀλλήλοις δι' ἑαυτῶν συνεῖναι ἐν τῷ
πότῳ, μηδὲ διὰ τῆς ἑαυτῶν φωνῆς καὶ τῶν λόγων
τῶν ἑαυτῶν ὑπὸ ἀπαιδευσίας τιμίας ποιοῦσι τὰς αὐ-
λητρίδας, πολλοῦ μισθούμενοι ἀλλοτρίαν φωνὴν τὴν D
τῶν αὐλῶν, καὶ διὰ τῆς ἐκείνων φωνῆς ἀλλήλοις σύν-
εισιν. ὅπου δὲ καλοὶ κἀγαθοὶ συμπόται καὶ πεπαι-
δευμένοι εἰσίν, οὐκ ἂν ἴδοις οὔτ' αὐλητρίδας οὔτε ὀρχη-
στρίδας οὔτε ψαλτρίας, ἀλλ' αὐτοὺς αὑτοῖς ἱκανοὺς
ὄντας συνεῖναι ἄνευ τῶν λήρων τε καὶ παιδιῶν τούτων
διὰ τῆς αὑτῶν φωνῆς, λέγοντάς τε καὶ ἀκούοντας ἐν
μέρει ἑαυτῶν κοσμίως, κἂν πάνυ πολὺν οἶνον πίωσιν. E
οὕτω δὲ καὶ αἱ τοιαίδε συνουσίαι, ἐὰν μὲν λάβωνται
ἀνδρῶν οἷοίπερ ἡμῶν οἱ πολλοί φασιν εἶναι, οὐδὲν
δέονται ἀλλοτρίας φωνῆς, οὐδὲ ποιητῶν, οὓς οὔτε
ἀνερέσθαι οἷόν τ' ἐστὶ περὶ ὧν λέγουσιν, ἐπαγόμενοί
τε αὐτοὺς οἱ πολλοὶ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις οἱ μὲν ταῦτά φασι
τὸν ποιητὴν νοεῖν, οἱ δ' ἕτερα, περὶ πράγματος δια-
λεγόμενοι, ὃ ἀδυνατοῦσιν ἐξελέγξαι· ἀλλὰ τὰς μὲν
τοιαύτας συνουσίας ἐῶσι χαίρειν, αὐτοὶ δ' ἑαυτοῖς
σύνεισι δι' ἑαυτῶν, ἐν τοῖς ἑαυτῶν λόγοις πεῖραν ἀλ- 348
λήλων λαμβάνοντες καὶ διδόντες. τοὺς τοιούτους μοι
δοκεῖ χρῆναι μᾶλλον μιμεῖσθαι ἐμέ τε καὶ σέ, κατα-
θεμένους τοὺς ποιητὰς αὐτοὺς δι' ἡμῶν αὐτῶν πρὸς

ἀλλήλους τοὺς λόγους ποιεῖσθαι, τῆς ἀληθείας καὶ ἡμῶν αὐτῶν πεῖραν λαμβάνοντας. κἂν μὲν βούλῃ ἔτι ἐρωτᾶν, ἕτοιμός εἰμί σοι παρέχειν ἀποκρινόμενος· ἐὰν δὲ βούλῃ, σὺ ἐμοὶ παράσχες, περὶ ὧν μεταξὺ ἐπαυσάμεθα διεξιόντες, τούτοις τέλος ἐπιθεῖναι.

B Λέγοντος οὖν ἐμοῦ ταῦτα καὶ τοιαῦτα ἄλλα, οὐδὲν ἀπεσάφει ὁ Πρωταγόρας, ὁπότερα ποιήσοι. εἶπεν οὖν ὁ Ἀλκιβιάδης πρὸς τὸν Καλλίαν βλέψας, Ὦ Καλλία, δοκεῖ σοι, ἔφη, καὶ νῦν καλῶς Πρωταγόρας ποιεῖν, οὐκ ἐθέλων εἴτε δώσει λόγον εἴτε μὴ διασαφεῖν; ἐμοὶ γὰρ οὐ δοκεῖ. ἀλλ' ἤτοι διαλεγέσθω ἢ εἰπέτω, ὅτι οὐκ ἐθέλει διαλέγεσθαι, ἵνα τούτῳ μὲν ταῦτα συνειδῶμεν, Σωκράτης δὲ ἄλλῳ τῳ διαλέγηται, ἢ ἄλλος ὅστις ἂν C βούληται ἄλλῳ. Καὶ ὁ Πρωταγόρας αἰσχυνθείς, ὥς γέ μοι ἔδοξε, τοῦ τε Ἀλκιβιάδου ταῦτα λέγοντος καὶ τοῦ Καλλίου δεομένου καὶ τῶν ἄλλων σχεδόν τι τῶν παρόντων, μόγις προὐτράπετο εἰς τὸ διαλέγεσθαι καὶ ἐκέλευεν ἐρωτᾶν αὐτὸν ὡς ἀποκρινούμενος.

XXXIII. Εἶπον δὴ ἐγώ, Ὦ Πρωταγόρα, μὴ οἴου διαλέγεσθαί μέ σοι ἄλλο τι βουλόμενον ἢ ἃ αὐτὸς ἀπορῶ ἑκάστοτε, ταῦτα διασκέψασθαι. ἡγοῦμαι γὰρ πάνυ λέγειν τι τὸν Ὅμηρον τὸ

D σύν τε δύ' ἐρχομένω, καί τε πρὸ ὃ τοῦ ἐνόησεν.

εὐπορώτεροι γάρ πως ἅπαντές ἐσμεν οἱ ἄνθρωποι πρὸς ἅπαν ἔργον καὶ λόγον καὶ διανόημα· μοῦνος δ' εἴπερ τε νοήσῃ, αὐτίκα περιιὼν ζητεῖ ὅτῳ ἐπιδείξηται καὶ μεθ' ὅτου βεβαιώσηται, ἕως ἂν ἐντύχῃ. ὥσπερ καὶ ἐγὼ ἕνεκα τούτου σοὶ ἡδέως διαλέγομαι μᾶλλον ἢ E ἄλλῳ τινί, ἡγούμενος σὲ βέλτιστ' ἂν ἐπισκέψασθαι καὶ περὶ τῶν ἄλλων, περὶ ὧν εἰκὸς σκοπεῖσθαι τὸν ἐπιεικῆ, καὶ δὴ καὶ περὶ ἀρετῆς. τίνα γὰρ ἄλλον ἢ σέ; ὅς γε οὐ μόνον αὐτὸς οἴει καλὸς κἀγαθὸς εἶναι,

ὥσπερ τινὲς ἄλλοι αὐτοὶ μὲν ἐπιεικεῖς εἰσιν, ἄλλους
δὲ οὐ δύνανται ποιεῖν· σὺ δὲ καὶ αὐτὸς ἀγαθὸς εἶ καὶ
ἄλλους οἷός τ' εἶ ποιεῖν ἀγαθούς, καὶ οὕτω πεπίστευκας
σαυτῷ, ὥστε καὶ ἄλλων ταύτην τὴν τέχνην ἀποκρυπτο-
μένων σύ γ' ἀναφανδὸν σεαυτὸν ὑποκηρυξάμενος εἰς
πάντας τοὺς Ἕλληνας, σοφιστὴν ἐπονομάσας, σεαυτὸν 349
ἀπέφηνας παιδεύσεως καὶ ἀρετῆς διδάσκαλον, πρῶτος
τούτου μισθὸν ἀξιώσας ἄρνυσθαι. πῶς οὖν οὐ σὲ
χρῆν παρακαλεῖν ἐπὶ τὴν τούτων σκέψιν καὶ ἐρωτᾶν
καὶ ἀνακοινοῦσθαι; οὐκ ἔσθ' ὅπως οὔ. καὶ νῦν δὴ
ἐγὼ ἐκεῖνα, ἅπερ τὸ πρῶτον ἠρώτων περὶ τούτων, πά-
λιν ἐπιθυμῶ ἐξ ἀρχῆς τὰ μὲν ἀναμνησθῆναι παρὰ σοῦ, B
τὰ δὲ συνδιασκέψασθαι. ἦν δέ, ὡς ἐγᾦμαι, τὸ ἐρώ-
τημα τόδε· σοφία καὶ σωφροσύνη καὶ ἀνδρεία καὶ
δικαιοσύνη καὶ ὁσιότης, πότερον ταῦτα, πέντε ὄντα
ὀνόματα, ἐπὶ ἑνὶ πράγματί ἐστιν, ἢ ἑκάστῳ τῶν ὀνο-
μάτων τούτων ὑπόκειταί τις ἴδιος οὐσία καὶ πρᾶγμα
ἔχον ἑαυτοῦ δύναμιν ἕκαστον, οὐκ ὂν οἷον τὸ ἕτερον
αὐτῶν τὸ ἕτερον; ἔφησθα οὖν σὺ οὐκ ὀνόματα ἐπὶ ἑνὶ
εἶναι, ἀλλὰ ἕκαστον ἰδίῳ πράγματι τῶν ὀνομάτων τού- C
των ἐπικεῖσθαι, πάντα δὲ ταῦτα μόρια εἶναι ἀρετῆς,
οὐχ ὡς τὰ τοῦ χρυσοῦ μόρια ὅμοιά ἐστιν ἀλλήλοις καὶ
τῷ ὅλῳ, οὗ μόριά ἐστιν, ἀλλ' ὡς τὰ τοῦ προσώπου
μόρια καὶ τῷ ὅλῳ, οὗ μόριά ἐστιν, καὶ ἀλλήλοις ἀνό-
μοια, ἰδίαν ἕκαστα δύναμιν ἔχοντα. ταῦτα εἰ μέν σοι
δοκεῖ ἔτι ὥσπερ τότε, φάθι· εἰ δὲ ἄλλως πως, τοῦτο
διόρισαι, ὡς ἔγωγέ οὐδέν σοι ὑπόλογον τίθεμαι, ἐάν πῃ
ἄλλῃ νῦν φήσῃς· οὐ γὰρ ἂν θαυμάζοιμι, εἰ τότε ἀπο-
πειρώμενός μου ταῦτα ἔλεγες.

XXXIV. Ἀλλ' ἐγώ σοι, ἔφη, λέγω, ὦ Σώκρατες, D
ὅτι ταῦτα πάντα μόρια μέν ἐστιν ἀρετῆς, καὶ τὰ μὲν
τέτταρα αὐτῶν ἐπιεικῶς παραπλήσια ἀλλήλοις ἐστίν,

ἡ δὲ ἀνδρεία πάνυ πολὺ διαφέρον πάντων τούτων. ὧδε
δὲ γνώσει, ὅτι ἐγὼ ἀληθῆ λέγω· εὑρήσεις γὰρ πολλοὺς
τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἀδικωτάτους μὲν ὄντας καὶ ἀνοσιωτά-
τους καὶ ἀκολαστοτάτους καὶ ἀμαθεστάτους, ἀνδρειο-
τάτους δὲ διαφερόντως. Ἔχε δή, ἔφην ἐγώ· ἄξιον γάρ
τοι ἐπισκέψασθαι ὃ λέγεις· πότερον τοὺς ἀνδρείους
E θαρραλέους λέγεις, ἢ ἄλλο τι; Καὶ ἴτας γε, ἔφη, ἐφ'
ἃ οἱ πολλοὶ φοβοῦνται ἰέναι. Φέρε δή, τὴν ἀρετὴν
καλόν τι φῂς εἶναι, καὶ ὡς καλοῦ ὄντος αὐτοῦ σὺ διδά-
σκαλον σαυτὸν παρέχεις; Κάλλιστον μὲν οὖν, ἔφη,
εἰ μὴ μαίνομαί γε. Πότερον οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ μέν τι
αὐτοῦ αἰσχρόν, τὸ δέ τι καλόν, ἢ ὅλον καλόν; Ὅλον
που καλὸν ὡς οἷόν τε μάλιστα. Οἶσθα οὖν, τίνες εἰς
350 τὰ φρέατα κολυμβῶσι θαρραλέως; Ἔγωγε, ὅτι οἱ
κολυμβηταί. Πότερον διότι ἐπίστανται, ἢ δι' ἄλλο
τι; Ὅτι ἐπίστανται. Τίνες δὲ ἀπὸ τῶν ἵππων πολε-
μεῖν θαρραλέοι εἰσί; πότερον οἱ ἱππικοί, ἢ οἱ ἄφιπποι;
Οἱ ἱππικοί. Τίνες δὲ πέλτας ἔχοντες; οἱ πελταστι-
κοί, ἢ οἱ μή; Οἱ πελταστικοί. καὶ τἆλλά γε πάντα,
εἰ τοῦτο ζητεῖς, ἔφη, οἱ ἐπιστήμονες τῶν μὴ ἐπισταμέ-
B νων θαρραλεώτεροί εἰσι, καὶ αὐτοὶ ἑαυτῶν, ἐπειδὰν
μάθωσιν, ἢ πρὶν μαθεῖν. Ἤδη δέ τινας ἑόρακας, ἔφην,
πάντων τούτων ἀνεπιστήμονας ὄντας, θαρροῦντας δὲ
πρὸς ἕκαστα τούτων; Ἔγωγε, ἦ δ' ὅς, καὶ λίαν γε
θαρροῦντας. Οὐκοῦν οἱ θαρραλέοι οὗτοι καὶ ἀνδρεῖοί
εἰσιν; Αἰσχρὸν μέντ' ἄν, ἔφη, εἴη ἡ ἀνδρεία· ἐπεὶ
οὗτοί γε μαινόμενοί εἰσι. Πῶς οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, λέγεις
τοὺς ἀνδρείους; οὐχὶ τοὺς θαρραλέους εἶναι; Καὶ νῦν
γ', ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν οὗτοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, οἱ οὕτω θαρραλέοι
C ὄντες οὐκ ἀνδρεῖοι, ἀλλὰ μαινόμενοι φαίνονται; καὶ
ἐκεῖ αὖ οἱ σοφώτατοι οὗτοι καὶ θαρραλεώτατοί εἰσι,
θαρραλεώτατοι δὲ ὄντες ἀνδρειότατοι; καὶ κατὰ τοῦ-

τον τὸν λόγον ἡ σοφία ἂν ἀνδρεία εἴη; Οὐ καλῶς, ἔφη, μνημονεύεις, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἃ ἔλεγόν τε καὶ ἀπεκρινόμην σοι. ἔγωγε ἐρωτηθεὶς ὑπὸ σοῦ, εἰ οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι θαρραλέοι εἰσίν, ὡμολόγησα· εἰ δὲ καὶ οἱ θαρραλέοι D ἀνδρεῖοι, οὐκ ἠρωτήθην· εἰ γάρ με τότε ἤρου, εἶπον ἄν, ὅτι οὐ πάντες. τοὺς δὲ ἀνδρείους ὡς οὐ θαρραλέοι εἰσί, τὸ ἐμὸν ὁμολόγημα, οὐδαμοῦ ἐπέδειξας, ὡς οὐκ ὀρθῶς ὡμολόγησα. ἔπειτα τοὺς ἐπισταμένους αὐτοὺς ἑαυτῶν θαρραλεωτέρους ὄντας ἀποφαίνεις καὶ μὴ ἐπισταμένων ἄλλων, καὶ ἐν τούτῳ οἴει τὴν ἀνδρείαν καὶ τὴν σοφίαν ταὐτὸν εἶναι. τούτῳ δὲ τῷ τρόπῳ μετιὼν καὶ τὴν ἰσχὺν οἰηθείης ἂν εἶναι σοφίαν. πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ εἰ οὕτω μετιὼν ἔροιό με, εἰ οἱ ἰσχυροὶ δυνατοί εἰσι, φαίην ἄν· ἔπειτα, εἰ οἱ ἐπιστάμενοι παλαίειν δυνατώτεροί E εἰσι τῶν μὴ ἐπισταμένων παλαίειν καὶ αὐτοὶ αὑτῶν, ἐπειδὰν μάθωσιν, ἢ πρὶν μαθεῖν, φαίην ἄν· ταῦτα δὲ ἐμοῦ ὁμολογήσαντος, ἐξείη ἄν σοι χρωμένῳ τοῖς αὐτοῖς τεκμηρίοις τούτοις λέγειν, ὡς κατὰ τὴν ἐμὴν ὁμολογίαν ἡ σοφία ἐστὶν ἰσχύς. ἐγὼ δὲ οὐδαμοῦ οὐδ' ἐνταῦθα ὁμολογῶ τοὺς δυνατοὺς ἰσχυροὺς εἶναι, τοὺς μέντοι ἰσχυροὺς δυνατούς· οὐ γὰρ ταὐτὸν εἶναι 351 δύναμίν τε καὶ ἰσχύν, ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν καὶ ἀπὸ ἐπιστήμης γίγνεσθαι, τὴν δύναμιν, καὶ ἀπὸ μανίας τε καὶ ἀπὸ θυμοῦ, ἰσχὺν δὲ ἀπὸ φύσεως καὶ εὐτροφίας τῶν σωμάτων. οὕτω δὲ κἀκεῖ οὐ ταὐτὸν εἶναι θάρσος τε καὶ ἀνδρείαν. ὥστε συμβαίνει τοὺς μὲν ἀνδρείους θαρραλέους εἶναι, μὴ μέντοι τούς γε θαρραλέους ἀνδρείους πάντας· θάρσος μὲν γὰρ καὶ ἀπὸ τέχνης γίγνεται ἀνθρώποις B καὶ ἀπὸ θυμοῦ τε καὶ ἀπὸ μανίας, ὥσπερ ἡ δύναμις, ἀνδρεία δὲ ἀπὸ φύσεως καὶ εὐτροφίας τῶν ψυχῶν γίγνεται.

XXXV. Λέγεις δέ τινας, ἔφην, ὦ Πρωταγόρα,

τῶν ἀνθρώπων εὖ ζῆν, τοὺς δὲ κακῶς; Ἔφη. Ἆρ'
οὖν δοκεῖ σοι ἄνθρωπος ἂν εὖ ζῆν, εἰ ἀνιώμενός τε καὶ
ὀδυνώμενος ζῴη; Οὐκ ἔφη. Τί δ', εἰ ἡδέως βιοὺς τὸν
βίον τελευτήσειεν, οὐκ εὖ ἄν σοι δοκοῖ οὕτω βεβιω-
C κέναι; Ἔμοιγ', ἔφη. Τὸ μὲν ἄρα ἡδέως ζῆν ἀγαθόν,
τὸ δ' ἀηδῶς κακόν. Εἴπερ τοῖς καλοῖς γ', ἔφη, ζῴη
ἡδόμενος. Τί δή, ὦ Πρωταγόρα; μὴ καὶ σύ, ὥσπερ
οἱ πολλοί, ἡδέα ἄττα καλεῖς κακὰ καὶ ἀνιαρὰ ἀγαθά;
ἐγὼ γὰρ λέγω, καθ' ὃ ἡδέα ἐστὶν, ἆρα κατὰ τοῦτο οὐκ
ἀγαθά, μὴ εἴ τι ἀπ' αὐτῶν ἀποβήσεται ἄλλο; καὶ
αὖθις αὖ τὰ ἀνιαρὰ ὡσαύτως οὕτως οὐ καθ' ὅσον ἀνι-
αρά, κακά; Οὐκ οἶδα, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔφη, ἁπλῶς οὕ-
D τως, ὡς σὺ ἐρωτᾷς, εἰ ἐμοὶ ἀποκριτέον ἐστίν, ὡς τὰ
ἡδέα τε ἀγαθά ἐστιν ἅπαντα καὶ τὰ ἀνιαρὰ κακά·
ἀλλά μοι δοκεῖ οὐ μόνον πρὸς τὴν νῦν ἀπόκρισιν ἐμοὶ
ἀσφαλέστερον εἶναι ἀποκρίνασθαι, ἀλλὰ καὶ πρὸς
πάντα τὸν ἄλλον βίον τὸν ἐμὸν, ὅτι ἔστι μὲν ἃ τῶν
ἡδέων οὐκ ἔστιν ἀγαθά, ἔστι δ' αὖ καὶ ἃ τῶν ἀνιαρῶν
οὐκ ἔστι κακά, ἔστι δ' ἃ ἔστι, καὶ τρίτον ἃ οὐδέτερα,
οὔτε κακὰ οὔτ' ἀγαθά. Ἡδέα δὲ καλεῖς, ἦν δ' ἐγώ,
οὐ τὰ ἡδονῆς μετέχοντα ἢ ποιοῦντα ἡδονήν; Πάνυ γ',
E ἔφη. Τοῦτο τοίνυν λέγω, καθ' ὅσον ἡδέα ἐστίν, εἰ οὐκ
ἀγαθά, τὴν ἡδονὴν αὐτὴν ἐρωτῶν εἰ οὐκ ἀγαθόν ἐστιν.
Ὥσπερ σὺ λέγεις, ἔφη, ἑκάστοτε, ὦ Σώκρατες, σκο-
πώμεθα αὐτό, καὶ ἐὰν μὲν πρὸς λόγον δοκῇ εἶναι τὸ
σκέμμα καὶ τὸ αὐτὸ φαίνηται ἡδύ τε καὶ ἀγαθόν, συγ-
χωρησόμεθα· εἰ δὲ μή, τότε ἤδη ἀμφισβητήσομεν.
Πότερον οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, σὺ βούλει ἡγεμονεύειν τῆς
σκέψεως, ἢ ἐγὼ ἡγῶμαι; Δίκαιος, ἔφη, σὺ ἡγεῖσθαι·
σὺ γὰρ καὶ κατάρχεις τοῦ λόγου. Ἆρ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ,
352 τῇδέ πῃ καταφανὲς ἂν ἡμῖν γένοιτο; ὥσπερ εἴ τις
ἄνθρωπον σκοπῶν ἐκ τοῦ εἴδους ἢ πρὸς ὑγίειαν ἢ πρὸς

ἄλλο τι τῶν τοῦ σώματος ἔργων, ἰδὼν τὸ πρόσωπον καὶ τὰς χεῖρας ἄκρας εἴποι, Ἴθι δή μοι ἀποκαλύψας καὶ τὰ στήθη καὶ τὸ μετάφρενον ἐπίδειξον, ἵνα ἐπισκέψωμαι σαφέστερον· καὶ ἐγὼ τοιοῦτόν τι ποθῶ πρὸς τὴν σκέψιν· θεασάμενος, ὅτι οὕτως ἔχεις πρὸς τὸ ἀγαθὸν καὶ τὸ ἡδύ, ὡς φῄς, δέομαι τοιοῦτόν τι εἰπεῖν, Ἴθι δή μοι, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, καὶ τόδε τῆς διανοίας ἀποκάλυψον, B πῶς ἔχεις πρὸς ἐπιστήμην; πότερον καὶ τοῦτό σοι δοκεῖ ὥσπερ τοῖς πολλοῖς ἀνθρώποις, ἢ ἄλλως; δοκεῖ δὲ τοῖς πολλοῖς περὶ ἐπιστήμης τοιοῦτόν τι, οὐκ ἰσχυρόν, οὐδ' ἡγεμονικόν, οὐδ' ἀρχικὸν εἶναι· οὐδὲ ὡς περὶ τοιούτου αὐτοῦ ὄντος διανοοῦνται, ἀλλ' ἐνούσης πολλάκις ἀνθρώπῳ ἐπιστήμης, οὐ τὴν ἐπιστήμην αὐτοῦ ἄρχειν, ἀλλ' ἄλλο τι, τοτὲ μὲν θυμόν, τοτὲ δὲ ἡδονήν, τοτὲ δὲ λύπην, ἐνίοτε δὲ ἔρωτα, πολλάκις δὲ φόβον, ἀτεχνῶς διανοούμενοι περὶ τῆς ἐπιστήμης, ὥσπερ περὶ ἀνδραπόδου, περιελκομένης ὑπὸ τῶν ἄλλων C ἁπάντων. ἆρ' οὖν καὶ σοὶ τοιοῦτόν τι περὶ αὐτῆς δοκεῖ, ἢ καλόν τε εἶναι ἡ ἐπιστήμη καὶ οἷον ἄρχειν τοῦ ἀνθρώπου, καὶ ἐάνπερ γιγνώσκῃ τις τἀγαθὰ καὶ τὰ κακά, μὴ ἂν κρατηθῆναι ὑπὸ μηδενός, ὥστε ἄλλ' ἄττα πράττειν ἢ ἃ ἂν ἡ ἐπιστήμη κελεύῃ, ἀλλ' ἱκανὴν εἶναι τὴν φρόνησιν βοηθεῖν τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ; Καὶ δοκεῖ, ἔφη, ὥσπερ σὺ λέγεις, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἅμα, εἴπερ τῳ ἄλλῳ, αἰσχρόν ἐστι καὶ ἐμοὶ σοφίαν καὶ D ἐπιστήμην μὴ οὐχὶ πάντων κράτιστον φάναι εἶναι τῶν ἀνθρωπείων πραγμάτων. Καλῶς γε, ἔφην ἐγώ, σὺ λέγων καὶ ἀληθῆ. οἶσθα οὖν, ὅτι οἱ πολλοὶ τῶν ἀνθρώπων ἐμοί τε καὶ σοὶ οὐ πείθονται, ἀλλὰ πολλούς φασι γιγνώσκοντας τὰ βέλτιστα οὐκ ἐθέλειν πράττειν, ἐξὸν αὐτοῖς, ἀλλὰ ἄλλα πράττειν. καὶ ὅσους δὴ ἐγὼ ἠρόμην, ὅ τι ποτὲ αἴτιόν ἐστι τούτου, ὑπὸ ἡδονῆς φασιν

ἡττωμένους ἢ λύπης ἢ ὧν νῦν δὴ ἐγὼ ἔλεγον, ὑπό τινος τούτων κρατουμένους ταῦτα ποιεῖν τοὺς ποιοῦντας. Πολλὰ γὰρ οἶμαι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, καὶ ἄλλα οὐκ ὀρθῶς λέγουσιν οἱ ἄνθρωποι. Ἴθι δὴ μετ' ἐμοῦ ἐπιχείρησον πείθειν τοὺς ἀνθρώπους καὶ διδάσκειν ὅ ἐστιν
353 αὐτοῖς τοῦτο τὸ πάθος, ὅ φασιν ὑπὸ τῶν ἡδονῶν ἡττᾶσθαι καὶ οὐ πράττειν διὰ ταῦτα τὰ βέλτιστα, ἐπεὶ γιγνώσκειν γε αὐτά. ἴσως γὰρ ἄν, λεγόντων ἡμῶν, ὅτι Οὐκ ὀρθῶς λέγετε, ὦ ἄνθρωποι, ἀλλὰ ψεύδεσθε, ἔροιντ' ἂν ἡμᾶς· Ὦ Πρωταγόρα τε καὶ Σώκρατες, εἰ μή ἐστι τοῦτο τὸ πάθημα ἡδονῆς ἡττᾶσθαι, ἀλλὰ τί ποτ' ἐστί, καὶ τί ὑμεῖς αὐτό φατε εἶναι; εἴπατον ἡμῖν. Τί δέ, ὦ Σώκρατες, δεῖ ἡμᾶς σκοπεῖσθαι τὴν τῶν πολλῶν δόξαν ἀνθρώπων, οἳ ὅ τι ἂν τύχωσι, τοῦτο λέγου-
B σιν; Οἶμαι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, εἶναί τι ἡμῖν τοῦτο πρὸς τὸ ἐξευρεῖν περὶ ἀνδρείας, πρὸς τἆλλα μόρια τὰ τῆς ἀρετῆς πῶς ποτ' ἔχει. εἰ οὖν σοι δοκεῖ ἐμμένειν οἷς ἄρτι ἔδοξεν ἡμῖν, ἐμὲ ἡγήσασθαι, ᾗ οἶμαι ἂν ἔγωγε κάλλιστα φανερὸν γενέσθαι, ἕπου· εἰ δὲ μὴ βούλει, εἴ σοι φίλον, ἐῶ χαίρειν. Ἀλλ', ἔφη, ὀρθῶς λέγεις· καὶ πέραινε, ὥσπερ ἤρξω.

XXXVI. Πάλιν τοίνυν, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἰ ἔροιντο ἡμᾶς,
C Τί οὖν φατε τοῦτο εἶναι, ὃ ἡμεῖς ἥττω εἶναι τῶν ἡδονῶν ἐλέγομεν; εἴποιμ' ἂν ἔγωγε πρὸς αὐτοὺς ὡδί· Ἀκούετε δή· πειρασόμεθα γὰρ ὑμῖν ἐγώ τε καὶ Πρωταγόρας φράσαι. ἄλλο τι γάρ, ὦ ἄνθρωποι, φατὲ ὑμῖν τοῦτο γίγνεσθαι ἐν τοῖσδε; οἷον πολλάκις ὑπὸ σίτων καὶ ποτῶν καὶ ἀφροδισίων κρατούμενοι ἡδέων ὄντων, γιγνώσκοντες, ὅτι πονηρά ἐστιν, ὅμως αὐτὰ πράττειν; Φαῖεν ἄν. Οὐκοῦν ἐροίμεθ' ἂν αὐτοὺς ἐγώ
D τε καὶ σὺ πάλιν, Πονηρὰ δὲ αὐτὰ πῇ φατε εἶναι; πότερον ὅτι τὴν ἡδονὴν ταύτην ἐν τῷ παραχρῆμα παρέχει

καὶ ἡδύ ἐστιν ἕκαστον αὐτῶν, ἢ ὅτι εἰς τὸν ὕστερον χρόνον νόσους τε ποιεῖ καὶ πενίας καὶ ἄλλα τοιαῦτα πολλὰ παρασκευάζει; ἢ κἂν εἴ τι τούτων εἰς τὸ ὕστερον μηδὲν παρασκευάζει, χαίρειν δὲ μόνον ποιεῖ, ὅμως δ' ἂν κακὰ ἦν, ὅτι μαθόντα χαίρειν ποιεῖ καὶ ὁπῃοῦν; ἆρ' οἰόμεθα ἂν αὐτούς, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ἄλλο τι ἀποκρίνασθαι, ἢ ὅτι οὐ κατὰ τὴν αὐτῆς τῆς ἡδονῆς τῆς παραχρῆμα ἐργασίαν κακά ἐστιν, ἀλλὰ διὰ τὰ ὕστερον E *γιγνόμενα, νόσους τε καὶ τἆλλα; Ἐγὼ μὲν οἶμαι, ἔφη ὁ Πρωταγόρας, τοὺς πολλοὺς ἂν ταῦτα ἀποκρίνασθαι. Οὐκοῦν νόσους ποιοῦντα ἀνίας ποιεῖ, καὶ πενίας ποιοῦντα ἀνίας ποιεῖ;—ὁμολογοῖεν ἄν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι. Συνέφη ὁ Πρωταγόρας. Οὐκοῦν φαίνεται, ὦ ἄνθρωποι, ὑμῖν, ὥς φαμεν ἐγώ τε καὶ Πρωταγόρας, δι' οὐδὲν ἄλλο ταῦτα κακὰ ὄντα ἢ διότι εἰς ἀνίας τε ἀποτελευτᾷ καὶ ἄλλων ἡδονῶν ἀποστερεῖ;—ὁμολογοῖεν* 354 *ἄν. Συνεδόκει ἡμῖν ἀμφοῖν. Οὐκοῦν πάλιν ἂν αὐτοὺς τὸ ἐναντίον εἰ ἐροίμεθα, Ὦ ἄνθρωποι, οἱ λέγοντες αὖ ἀγαθὰ ἀνιαρὰ εἶναι, ἆρα οὐ τὰ τοιάδε λέγετε, οἷον τά τε γυμνάσια καὶ τὰς στρατείας καὶ τὰς ὑπὸ τῶν ἰατρῶν θεραπείας τὰς διὰ καύσεών τε καὶ τομῶν καὶ φαρμακειῶν καὶ λιμοκτονιῶν γιγνομένας, ὅτι ταῦτα ἀγαθὰ μέν ἐστιν, ἀνιαρὰ δέ;—φαῖεν ἄν. Συνεδόκει. Πότερον οὖν κατὰ τόδε ἀγαθὰ αὐτὰ καλεῖτε, ὅτι ἐν* B *τῷ παραχρῆμα ὀδύνας τὰς ἐσχάτας παρέχει καὶ ἀλγηδόνας, ἢ ὅτι εἰς τὸν ὕστερον χρόνον ὑγίειαί τε ἀπ' αὐτῶν γίγνονται καὶ εὐεξίαι τῶν σωμάτων καὶ τῶν πόλεων σωτηρίαι καὶ ἄλλων ἀρχαὶ καὶ πλοῦτοι;—φαῖεν ἄν, ὡς ἐγῷμαι. Συνεδόκει. Ταῦτα δὲ ἀγαθά ἐστι δι' ἄλλο τι ἢ ὅτι εἰς ἡδονὰς ἀποτελευτᾷ καὶ λυπῶν ἀπαλλαγάς τε καὶ ἀποτροπάς; ἢ ἔχετέ τι ἄλλο τέλος λέγειν, εἰς ὃ ἀποβλέψαντες αὐτὰ ἀγαθὰ* C

καλεῖτε, ἀλλ' ἢ ἡδονάς τε καὶ λύπας;—οὐκ ἂν φαῖεν,
ὡς ἐγᾦμαι. Οὐδ' ἐμοὶ δοκεῖ, ἔφη ὁ Πρωταγορας.
Οὐκοῦν τὴν μὲν ἡδονὴν διώκετε ὡς ἀγαθὸν ὄν, τὴν
δὲ λύπην φεύγετε ὡς κακόν; Συνεδόκει. Τοῦτ' ἄρα
ἡγεῖσθ' εἶναι κακόν, τὴν λύπην, καὶ ἀγαθὸν τὴν ἡδονήν,
ἐπεὶ καὶ αὐτὸ τὸ χαίρειν τότε λέγετε κακὸν εἶναι, ὅταν
μειζόνων ἡδονῶν ἀποστερῇ ἢ ὅσας αὐτὸ ἔχει, ἢ λύπας
D μείζους παρασκευάζῃ τῶν ἐν αὐτῷ ἡδονῶν· ἐπεὶ εἰ κατ'
ἄλλο τι αὐτὸ τὸ χαίρειν κακὸν καλεῖτε καὶ εἰς ἄλλο τι
τέλος ἀποβλέψαντες, ἔχοιτε ἂν καὶ ἡμῖν εἰπεῖν. ἀλλ'
οὐχ ἕξετε. Οὐδ' ἐμοὶ δοκοῦσιν, ἔφη ὁ Πρωταγόρας.
Ἄλλο τι οὖν πάλιν καὶ περὶ αὐτοῦ τοῦ λυπεῖσθαι
ὁ αὐτὸς τρόπος; τότε καλεῖτε αὐτὸ τὸ λυπεῖσθαι ἀγα-
θόν, ὅταν ἢ μείζους λύπας τῶν ἐν αὐτῷ οὐσῶν ἀπαλ-
λάττῃ ἢ μείζους ἡδονὰς τῶν λυπῶν παρασκευάζῃ; ἐπεὶ
εἰ πρὸς ἄλλο τι τέλος ἀποβλέπετε, ὅταν καλῆτε αὐτὸ
τὸ λυπεῖσθαι ἀγαθόν, ἢ πρὸς ὃ ἐγὼ λέγω, ἔχητε ἡμῖν
E εἰπεῖν. ἀλλ' οὐχ ἕξετε. Ἀληθῆ, ἔφη, λέγεις, ὁ Πρω-
ταγόρας. Πάλιν τοίνυν, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἴ με ἀνέροισθε, ὦ
ἄνθρωποι, Τίνος οὖν δήποτε ἕνεκα πολλὰ περὶ τούτου
λέγεις καὶ πολλαχῇ; συγγιγνώσκετέ μοι, φαίην ἂν
ἔγωγε. πρῶτον μὲν γὰρ οὐ ῥᾴδιον ἀποδεῖξαι, τί ἐστι
ποτὲ τοῦτο, ὃ ὑμεῖς καλεῖτε τῶν ἡδονῶν ἥττω εἶναι·
ἔπειτα ἐν τούτῳ εἰσὶ πᾶσαι αἱ ἀποδείξεις. ἀλλ' ἔτι
355 καὶ νῦν ἀναθέσθαι ἔξεστιν, εἴ πῃ ἔχετε ἄλλο τι φάναι
εἶναι τὸ ἀγαθὸν ἢ τὴν ἡδονήν, ἢ τὸ κακὸν ἄλλο τι ἢ τὴν
ἀνίαν, ἢ ἀρκεῖ ὑμῖν τὸ ἡδέως καταβιῶναι τὸν βίον ἄνευ
λυπῶν; εἰ δὲ ἀρκεῖ, καὶ μὴ ἔχετε μηδὲν ἄλλο φάναι
εἶναι ἀγαθὸν ἢ κακόν, ὃ μὴ εἰς ταῦτα τελευτᾷ, τὸ μετὰ
τοῦτο ἀκούετε. φημὶ γὰρ ὑμῖν τούτου οὕτως ἔχοντος
γελοῖον τὸν λόγον γίγνεσθαι, ὅταν λέγητε, ὅτι πολλάκις
γιγνώσκων τὰ κακὰ ἄνθρωπος ὅτι κακά ἐστιν, ὅμως

πράττει αὐτά, ἐξὸν μὴ πράττειν, ὑπὸ τῶν ἡδονῶν ἀγόμενος καὶ ἐκπληττόμενος· καὶ αὖθις αὖ λέγετε, ὅτι B *γιγνώσκων ὁ ἄνθρωπος τἀγαθὰ πράττειν οὐκ ἐθέλει διὰ τὰς παραχρῆμα ἡδονάς, ὑπὸ τούτων ἡττώμενος.*

XXXVII. *Ὡς δὲ ταῦτα γελοῖά ἐστι, κατάδηλον ἔσται, ἐὰν μὴ πολλοῖς ὀνόμασι χρώμεθα ἄρα, ἡδεῖ τε καὶ ἀνιαρῷ καὶ ἀγαθῷ καὶ κακῷ, ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ δύο ἐφάνη ταῦτα, δυοῖν καὶ ὀνόμασι προσαγορεύωμεν αὐτά, πρῶτον μὲν ἀγαθῷ καὶ κακῷ, ἔπειτ' αὖθις ἡδεῖ τε καὶ ἀνιαρῷ. θέμενοι δὴ οὕτω λέγωμεν, ὅτι γιγνώσκων ὁ ἄνθρωπος τὰ κακὰ ὅτι κακά ἐστιν, ὅμως αὐτὰ ποιεῖ.* C *ἐὰν οὖν τις ἡμᾶς ἔρηται διὰ τί, ἡττώμενος φήσομεν. Ὑπὸ τοῦ; ἐκεῖνος ἐρήσεται ἡμᾶς· ἡμῖν δὲ ὑπὸ μὲν ἡδονῆς οὐκέτι ἔξεστιν εἰπεῖν· ἄλλο γὰρ ὄνομα μετείληφεν ἀντὶ τῆς ἡδονῆς τὸ ἀγαθόν. ἐκείνῳ δὴ ἀποκρινώμεθα καὶ λέγωμεν, ὅτι ἡττώμενος—Ὑπὸ τίνος; φήσει. τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ, φήσομεν νὴ Δία. ἂν οὖν τύχῃ ὁ ἐρόμενος ἡμᾶς ὑβριστὴς ὤν, γελάσεται καὶ ἐρεῖ· Ἦ γελοῖον λέ-* D *γετε πρᾶγμα, εἰ πράττει τις κακὰ γιγνώσκων, ὅτι κακά ἐστιν, οὐ δέον αὐτὸν πράττειν, ἡττώμενος ὑπὸ τῶν ἀγαθῶν. ἆρα, φήσει, οὐκ ἀξίων ὄντων νικᾶν ἐν ὑμῖν τῶν ἀγαθῶν τὰ κακά, ἢ ἀξίων; φήσομεν δῆλον ὅτι ἀποκρινόμενοι, ὅτι οὐκ ἀξίων ὄντων· οὐ γὰρ ἂν ἐξημάρτανεν ὅν φαμεν ἥττω εἶναι τῶν ἡδονῶν.* Κατὰ τί δέ, *φήσει ἴσως, ἀνάξιά ἐστι τἀγαθὰ τῶν κακῶν, ἢ τὰ κακὰ τῶν ἀγαθῶν; ἢ κατ' ἄλλο τι ἢ ὅταν τὰ μὲν μείζω, τὰ δὲ σμικρότερα ᾖ; ἢ πλείω τὰ δὲ ἐλάττω [ᾖ];—οὐχ* E *ἕξομεν εἰπεῖν ἄλλο ἢ τοῦτο. Δῆλον ἄρα, φήσει, ὅτι τὸ ἡττᾶσθαι τοῦτο λέγετε, ἀντὶ ἐλαττόνων ἀγαθῶν μείζω κακὰ λαμβάνειν.—Ταῦτα μὲν οὖν οὕτω. μεταλάβωμεν δὴ τὰ ὀνόματα πάλιν τὸ ἡδύ τε καὶ ἀνιαρὸν ἐπὶ τοῖς αὐτοῖς τούτοις, καὶ λέγωμεν, ὅτι ἄνθρωπος πράττει,*

τότε μὲν ἐλέγομεν τὰ κακά, νῦν δὲ λέγωμεν τὰ ἀνι-
356 αρά, γιγνώσκων ὅτι ἀνιαρά ἐστιν, ἡττώμενος ὑπὸ τῶν ἡδέων, δῆλον ὅτι ἀναξίων ὄντων νικᾶν. καὶ τίς ἄλλη ἀξία ἡδονῇ πρὸς λύπην ἐστὶν ἀλλ' ἢ ὑπερβολὴ ἀλλήλων καὶ ἔλλειψις; ταῦτα δ' ἐστὶ μείζω τε καὶ σμικρότερα γιγνόμενα ἀλλήλων καὶ πλείω καὶ ἐλάττω καὶ μᾶλλον καὶ ἧττον. εἰ γάρ τις λέγοι, ὅτι Ἀλλὰ πολὺ διαφέρει, ὦ Σώκρατες, τὸ παραχρῆμα ἡδὺ τοῦ εἰς τὸν ὕστερον χρόνον καὶ ἡδέος καὶ λυπηροῦ, μῶν ἄλλῳ τῳ, φαίην ἂν ἔγωγε, ἢ ἡδονῇ καὶ λύπῃ; οὐ γὰρ ἔσθ' ὅτῳ
B ἄλλῳ. ἀλλ' ὥσπερ ἀγαθὸς ἱστάναι ἄνθρωπος, συνθεὶς τὰ ἡδέα καὶ συνθεὶς τὰ λυπηρά, καὶ τὸ ἐγγὺς καὶ τὸ πόρρω στήσας ἐν τῷ ζυγῷ, εἰπέ, πότερα πλείω ἐστίν. ἐὰν μὲν γὰρ ἡδέα πρὸς ἡδέα ἱστῇς, τὰ μείζω ἀεὶ καὶ πλείω ληπτέα· ἐὰν δὲ λυπηρὰ πρὸς λυπηρά, τὰ ἐλάττω καὶ σμικρότερα. ἐὰν δὲ ἡδέα πρὸς λυπηρά, ἐὰν μὲν τὰ ἀνιαρὰ ὑπερβάλληται ὑπὸ τῶν ἡδέων, ἐάν τε τὰ ἐγγὺς ὑπὸ τῶν πόρρω, ἐάν τε τὰ πόρρω ὑπὸ τῶν ἐγγύς, ταύ-
C την τὴν πρᾶξιν πρακτέον, ἐν ᾗ ἂν ταῦτ' ἐνῇ· ἐὰν δὲ τὰ ἡδέα ὑπὸ τῶν ἀνιαρῶν, οὐ πρακτέα. μή πῃ ἄλλῃ ἔχει, φαίην ἄν, ταῦτα, ὦ ἄνθρωποι; οἶδ', ὅτι οὐκ ἂν ἔχοιεν ἄλλως λέγειν. Συνεδόκει καὶ ἐκείνῳ. Ὅτε δὴ τοῦτο οὕτως ἔχει, τόδε μοι ἀποκρίνασθε, φήσω. φαίνεται ὑμῖν τῇ ὄψει τὰ αὐτὰ μεγέθη ἐγγύθεν μὲν μείζω, πόρρωθεν δὲ ἐλάττω· ἢ οὔ; Φήσουσι. Καὶ τὰ παχέα καὶ τὰ πολλὰ ὡσαύτως; καὶ αἱ φωναὶ αἱ ἴσαι ἐγγύθεν μὲν
D μείζους, πόρρωθεν δὲ σμικρότεραι; Φαῖεν ἄν. Εἰ οὖν ἐν τούτῳ ἡμῖν ἦν τὸ εὖ πράττειν, ἐν τῷ τὰ μὲν μεγάλα μήκη καὶ πράττειν καὶ λαμβάνειν, τὰ δὲ σμικρὰ καὶ φεύγειν καὶ μὴ πράττειν, τίς ἂν ἡμῖν σωτηρία ἐφάνη τοῦ βίου; ἆρα ἡ μετρητικὴ τέχνη, ἢ ἡ τοῦ φαινομένου δύναμις; ἢ αὕτη μὲν ἡμᾶς ἐπλάνα καὶ ἐποίει ἄνω τε

καὶ κάτω πολλάκις μεταλαμβάνειν ταὐτὰ καὶ μετα-
μέλειν καὶ ἐν ταῖς πράξεσι καὶ ἐν ταῖς αἱρέσεσι τῶν
μεγάλων τε καὶ σμικρῶν, ἡ δὲ μετρητικὴ ἄκυρον μὲν
ἂν ἐποίησε τοῦτο τὸ φάντασμα, δηλώσασα δὲ τὸ ἀλη- E
θὲς ἡσυχίαν ἂν ἐποίησεν ἔχειν τὴν ψυχὴν μένουσαν
ἐπὶ τῷ ἀληθεῖ καὶ ἔσωσεν ἂν τὸν βίον;—ἆρ' ἂν ὁμο-
λογοῖεν οἱ ἄνθρωποι πρὸς ταῦτα ἡμᾶς τὴν μετρητικὴν
σώζειν ἂν τέχνην, ἢ ἄλλην; Τὴν μετρητικήν, ὡμο-
λόγει. Τί δ', εἰ ἐν τῇ τοῦ περιττοῦ καὶ ἀρτίου αἱρέσει
ἡμῖν ἦν ἡ σωτηρία τοῦ βίου, ὁπότε τὸ πλέον ὀρθῶς ἔδει
ἑλέσθαι καὶ ὁπότε τὸ ἔλαττον, ἢ αὐτὸ πρὸς ἑαυτὸ ἢ
τὸ ἕτερον πρὸς τὸ ἕτερον, εἴτ' ἐγγὺς εἴτε πόρρω εἴη, τί
ἂν ἔσωζεν ἡμῖν τὸν βίον; ἆρ' ἂν οὐκ ἐπιστήμη; καὶ 357
ἆρ' ἂν οὐ μετρητική τις, ἐπειδήπερ ὑπερβολῆς τε καὶ
ἐνδείας ἐστὶν ἡ τέχνη; ἐπειδὴ δὲ περιττοῦ τε καὶ
ἀρτίου, ἆρα ἄλλη τις ἢ ἀριθμητική;—ὁμολογοῖεν ἂν
ἡμῖν οἱ ἄνθρωποι· ἢ οὔ; Ἐδόκουν ἂν καὶ τῷ Πρω-
ταγόρᾳ ὁμολογεῖν. Εἶεν, ὦ ἄνθρωποι. ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἡδο-
νῆς τε καὶ λύπης ἐν ὀρθῇ τῇ αἱρέσει ἐφάνη ἡμῖν ἡ
σωτηρία τοῦ βίου οὖσα, τοῦ τε πλέονος καὶ ἐλάττονος
καὶ μείζονος καὶ σμικροτέρου καὶ πορρωτέρω καὶ ἐγ-
γυτέρω, ἆρα πρῶτον μὲν οὐ μετρητικὴ φαίνεται, ὑπερ- B
βολῆς τε καὶ ἐνδείας οὖσα καὶ ἰσότητος πρὸς ἀλλήλας
σκέψις; Ἀλλ' ἀνάγκη. Ἐπεὶ δὲ μετρητική, ἀνάγκη
δήπου τέχνη καὶ ἐπιστήμη. Συμφήσουσιν. Ἥτις μὲν
τοίνυν τέχνη καὶ ἐπιστήμη ἐστὶν αὕτη, εἰσαῦθις σκε-
ψόμεθα· ὅτι δὲ ἐπιστήμη ἐστί, τοσοῦτον ἐξαρκεῖ πρὸς
τὴν ἀπόδειξιν, ἣν ἐμὲ δεῖ καὶ Πρωταγόραν ἀποδεῖξαι
περὶ ὧν ἤρεσθ' ἡμᾶς. ἤρεσθε δέ, εἰ μέμνησθε, ἡνίκα C
ἡμεῖς ἀλλήλοις ὡμολογοῦμεν ἐπιστήμης μηδὲν εἶναι
κρεῖττον, ἀλλὰ τοῦτο ἀεὶ κρατεῖν, ὅπου ἂν ἐνῇ, καὶ
ἡδονῆς καὶ τῶν ἄλλων ἁπάντων· ὑμεῖς δὲ δὴ ἔφατε τὴν

ἡδονὴν πολλάκις κρατεῖν καὶ τοῦ εἰδότος ἀνθρώπου,
ἐπειδὴ δὲ ὑμῖν οὐχ ὡμολογοῦμεν, μετὰ τοῦτο ἤρεσθε
ἡμᾶς Ὦ Πρωταγόρα τε καὶ Σώκρατες, εἰ μή ἐστι
τοῦτο τὸ πάθημα ἡδονῆς ἡττᾶσθαι, ἀλλὰ τί ποτ' ἐστὶ
D καὶ τί ὑμεῖς αὐτό φατε εἶναι; εἴπετε ἡμῖν. εἰ μὲν οὖν
τότε εὐθὺς ὑμῖν εἴπομεν, ὅτι ἀμαθία, κατεγελᾶτε ἂν
ἡμῶν· νῦν δὲ ἂν ἡμῶν καταγελᾶτε, καὶ ὑμῶν αὐτῶν
καταγελάσεσθε. καὶ γὰρ ὑμεῖς ὡμολογήκατε ἐπιστή-
μης ἐνδείᾳ ἐξαμαρτάνειν περὶ τὴν τῶν ἡδονῶν αἵρεσιν
καὶ λυπῶν τοὺς ἐξαμαρτάνοντας· ταῦτα δέ ἐστιν ἀγαθά
τε καὶ κακά. καὶ οὐ μόνον ἐπιστήμης, ἀλλὰ καὶ εἰς
τὸ πρόσθεν ἔτι ὡμολογήκατε, ὅτι μετρητικῆς. ἡ δὲ
E ἐξαμαρτανομένη πρᾶξις ἄνευ ἐπιστήμης ἴστε που καὶ
αὐτοὶ ὅτι ἀμαθίᾳ πράττεται. ὥστε τοῦτ' ἐστὶ τὸ
ἡδονῆς ἥττω εἶναι, ἀμαθία ἡ μεγίστη· ἧς Πρωταγόρας
ὅδε φησὶν ἰατρὸς εἶναι καὶ Πρόδικος καὶ Ἱππίας· ὑμεῖς
δὲ διὰ τὸ οἴεσθαι ἄλλο τι ἢ ἀμαθίαν εἶναι οὔτε αὐτοὶ
οὔτε τοὺς ὑμετέρους παῖδας παρὰ τοὺς τούτων διδα-
σκάλους τούσδε τοὺς σοφιστὰς πέμπετε, ὡς οὐ διδα-
κτοῦ ὄντος, ἀλλὰ κηδόμενοι τοῦ ἀργυρίου καὶ οὐ διδόν-
τες τούτοις κακῶς πράττετε καὶ ἰδίᾳ καὶ δημοσίᾳ.

358 XXXVIII. Ταῦτα μὲν τοῖς πολλοῖς ἀποκεκριμέ-
νοι ἂν ἦμεν. ὑμᾶς δὲ δὴ μετὰ Πρωταγόρου ἐρωτῶ, ὦ
Ἱππία τε καὶ Πρόδικε—κοινὸς γὰρ δὴ ἔστω ὑμῖν ὁ
λόγος—πότερον δοκῶ ὑμῖν ἀληθῆ λέγειν, ἢ ψεύδεσθαι.
Ὑπερφυῶς ἐδόκει ἅπασιν ἀληθῆ εἶναι τὰ εἰρημένα.
Ὁμολογεῖτε ἄρα, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, τὸ μὲν ἡδὺ ἀγαθὸν εἶναι,
τὸ δὲ ἀνιαρὸν κακόν. τὴν δὲ Προδίκου τοῦδε διαίρεσιν
τῶν ὀνομάτων παραιτοῦμαι· εἴτε γὰρ ἡδὺ εἴτε τερπνὸν
B λέγεις εἴτε χαρτόν, εἴτε ὁπόθεν καὶ ὅπως χαίρεις τὰ
τοιαῦτα ὀνομάζων, ὦ βέλτιστε Πρόδικε, τοῦτό μοι
πρὸς ὃ βούλομαι ἀπόκριναι. Γελάσας οὖν ὁ Πρόδικος

συνωμολόγησε, καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι. Τί δὲ δή, ὦ ἄνδρες, ἔφην
ἐγώ, τὸ τοιόνδε; αἱ ἐπὶ τούτου πράξεις ἅπασαι, ἐπὶ
τοῦ ἀλύπως ζῆν καὶ ἡδέως, ἆρ' οὐ καλαί; καὶ τὸ καλὸν
ἔργον ἀγαθόν τε καὶ ὠφέλιμον; Συνεδόκει. Εἰ ἄρα,
ἔφην ἐγώ, τὸ ἡδὺ ἀγαθόν ἐστιν, οὐδεὶς οὔτε εἰδὼς οὔτε
οἰόμενος ἄλλα βελτίω εἶναι ἢ ἃ ποιεῖ, καὶ δυνατά,
ἔπειτα ποιεῖ ταῦτα, ἐξὸν τὰ βελτίω· οὐδὲ τὸ ἥττω C
εἶναι αὑτοῦ ἄλλο τι τοῦτ' ἐστὶν ἢ ἀμαθία, οὐδὲ κρείττω
ἑαυτοῦ ἄλλο τι ἢ σοφία. Συνεδόκει πᾶσι. Τί δὲ δή;
ἀμαθίαν ἄρα τὸ τοιόνδε λέγετε, τὸ ψευδῆ ἔχειν δόξαν
καὶ ἐψεῦσθαι περὶ τῶν πραγμάτων τῶν πολλοῦ ἀξίων;
Καὶ τοῦτο πᾶσι συνεδόκει. Ἄλλο τι οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ,
ἐπί γε τὰ κακὰ οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν ἔρχεται, οὐδὲ ἐπὶ ἃ οἴεται
κακὰ εἶναι, οὐδ' ἔστι τοῦτο, ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐν ἀνθρώπου
φύσει, ἐπὶ ἃ οἴεται κακὰ εἶναι ἐθέλειν ἰέναι ἀντὶ τῶν D
ἀγαθῶν· ὅταν τε ἀναγκασθῇ δυοῖν κακοῖν τὸ ἕτερον
αἱρεῖσθαι, οὐδεὶς τὸ μεῖζον αἱρήσεται, ἐξὸν τὸ ἔλαττον.
Ἅπαντα ταῦτα συνεδόκει ἅπασιν ἡμῖν. Τί οὖν; ἔφην
ἐγώ, καλεῖτέ τι δέος καὶ φόβον; καὶ ἆρα ὅπερ ἐγώ
(πρὸς σὲ λέγω, ὦ Πρόδικε); προσδοκίαν τινὰ λέγω
κακοῦ τοῦτο, εἴτε φόβον εἴτε δέος καλεῖτε. Ἐδόκει
Πρωταγόρᾳ μὲν καὶ Ἱππίᾳ δέος τε καὶ φόβος εἶναι E
τοῦτο, Προδίκῳ δὲ δέος, φόβος δ' οὔ. Ἀλλ' οὐδέν,
ἔφην ἐγώ, ὦ Πρόδικε, διαφέρει· ἀλλὰ τόδε· εἰ ἀληθῆ
τὰ ἔμπροσθέν ἐστιν, ἆρά τις ἀνθρώπων ἐθελήσει ἐπὶ
ταῦτα ἰέναι, ἃ δέδοικεν, ἐξὸν ἐπὶ ἃ μή; ἢ ἀδύνατον ἐκ
τῶν ὡμολογημένων, ἃ γὰρ δέδοικεν ὡμολόγηται ἡγεῖ-
σθαι κακὰ εἶναι· ἃ δὲ ἡγεῖται κακά, οὐδένα οὔτε ἰέναι
ἐπὶ ταῦτα οὔτε λαμβάνειν ἑκόντα. Ἐδόκει καὶ ταῦτα 359
πᾶσιν.

XXXIX. Οὕτω δὴ τούτων ὑποκειμένων, ἦν δ'
ἐγώ, ὦ Πρόδικέ τε καὶ Ἱππία, ἀπολογείσθω ἡμῖν

Πρωταγόρας ὅδε, ἃ τὸ πρῶτον ἀπεκρίνατο πῶς ὀρθῶς
ἔχει, μὴ ἃ τὸ πρῶτον παντάπασι· τότε μὲν γὰρ δὴ
πέντε ὄντων μορίων τῆς ἀρετῆς οὐδὲν ἔφη εἶναι τὸ
ἕτερον οἷον τὸ ἕτερον, ἰδίαν δὲ αὑτοῦ ἕκαστον ἔχειν
δύναμιν· ἀλλ' οὐ ταῦτα λέγω, ἀλλ' ἃ τὸ ὕστερον εἶπε.
τὸ γὰρ ὕστερον ἔφη τὰ μὲν τέτταρα ἐπιεικῶς παρα-
πλήσια ἀλλήλοις εἶναι, τὸ δὲ ἓν πάνυ πολὺ διαφέρειν
B τῶν ἄλλων, τὴν ἀνδρείαν. γνώσεσθαι δέ μ' ἔφη τε-
κμηρίῳ τῷδε. εὑρήσεις γάρ, ὦ Σώκρατες, ανθρώπους
ἀνοσιωτάτους μὲν ὄντας καὶ ἀδικωτάτους καὶ ἀκολα-
στοτάτους καὶ ἀμαθεστάτους, ἀνδρειοτάτους δέ· ᾧ
γνώσει, ὅτι πολὺ διαφέρει ἡ ἀνδρεία τῶν ἄλλων μορίων
τῆς ἀρετῆς. καὶ ἐγὼ εὐθὺς τότε πάνυ ἐθαύμασα τὴν
ἀπόκρισιν καὶ ἔτι μᾶλλον, ἐπειδὴ ταῦτα μεθ' ὑμῶν
διεξῆλθον. ἠρόμην δ' οὖν τοῦτον, εἰ τοὺς ἀνδρείους
λέγοι θαρραλέους. ὁ δὲ Καὶ ἴτας γ', ἔφη. μέμνησαι,
ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, ταῦτα ἀποκρινόμενος; Ὡμο-
C λόγει. Ἴθι δή, ἔφην ἐγώ, εἰπὲ ἡμῖν, ἐπὶ τίνα λέγεις
ἴτας εἶναι τοὺς ἀνδρείους; ἢ ἐφ' ἅπερ οἱ δειλοί; Οὐκ
ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν ἐφ' ἕτερα. Ναί, ἦ δ' ὅς. Πότερον οἱ
μὲν δειλοὶ ἐπὶ τὰ θαρραλέα ἔρχονται, οἱ δὲ ἀνδρεῖοι
ἐπὶ τὰ δεινά; Λέγεται δή, ὦ Σώκρατες, οὕτως ὑπὸ
τῶν ἀνθρώπων. Ἀληθῆ, ἔφην ἐγώ, λέγεις· ἀλλ' οὐ
D τοῦτο ἐρωτῶ, ἀλλὰ σὺ ἐπὶ τί φῂς ἴτας εἶναι τοὺς ἀν-
δρείους; ἆρ' ἐπὶ τὰ δεινά, ἡγουμένους δεινὰ εἶναι, ἢ
ἐπὶ τὰ μή; Ἀλλὰ τοῦτό γ', ἔφη, ἐν οἷς σὺ ἔλεγες τοῖς
λόγοις ἀπεδείχθη ἄρτι, ὅτι ἀδύνατον. Καὶ τοῦτο, ἔφην
ἐγώ, ἀληθὲς λέγεις. ὥστ' εἰ τοῦτο ὀρθῶς ἀπεδείχθη,
ἐπὶ μὲν ἃ δεινὰ ἡγεῖται εἶναι οὐδεὶς ἔρχεται, ἐπειδὴ τὸ
ἥττω εἶναι ἑαυτοῦ εὑρέθη ἀμαθία οὖσα. Ὡμολόγει.
Ἀλλὰ μὴν ἐπὶ ἅ γε θαρροῦσι πάντες αὖ ἔρχονται, καὶ
E δειλοὶ καὶ ἀνδρεῖοι, καὶ ταύτῃ γε ἐπὶ τὰ αὐτὰ ἔρχονται

οἱ δειλοί τε καὶ οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι. Ἀλλὰ μέντοι, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, πᾶν γε τοὐναντίον ἐστὶ ἐπὶ ἃ οἵ τε δειλοὶ ἔρχονται καὶ οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι. αὐτίκα εἰς τὸν πόλεμον οἱ μὲν ἐθέλουσιν ἰέναι, οἱ δὲ οὐκ ἐθέλουσι. Πότερον, ἔφην ἐγώ, καλὸν ὂν ἰέναι, ἢ αἰσχρόν; Καλόν, ἔφη. Οὐκοῦν εἴπερ καλόν, καὶ ἀγαθὸν ὡμολογήσαμεν ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν; τὰς γὰρ καλὰς πράξεις ἁπάσας ἀγαθὰς ὡμολογήσαμεν. Ἀληθῆ λέγεις, καὶ ἀεὶ ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ οὕτως. Ὀρθῶς γε, ἔφην ἐγώ. ἀλλὰ ποτέρους φῂς 360
εἰς τὸν πόλεμον οὐκ ἐθέλειν ἰέναι, καλὸν ὂν καὶ ἀγαθόν; Τοὺς δειλούς, ἦ δ᾽ ὅς. Οὐκοῦν, ἦν δ᾽ ἐγώ, εἴπερ καλὸν καὶ ἀγαθόν, καὶ ἡδύ; Ὡμολόγηται γοῦν, ἔφη. Ἆρ᾽ οὖν γιγνώσκοντες οἱ δειλοὶ οὐκ ἐθέλουσιν ἰέναι ἐπὶ τὸ κάλλιόν τε καὶ ἄμεινον καὶ ἥδιον; Ἀλλὰ καὶ τοῦτο ἐὰν ὁμολογῶμεν, ἔφη, διαφθεροῦμεν τὰς ἔμπροσθεν ὁμολογίας. Τί δ᾽ ὁ ἀνδρεῖος; οὐκ ἐπὶ τὸ κάλλιόν τε καὶ ἄμεινον καὶ ἥδιον ἔρχεται; Ἀνάγκη, ἔφη, ὁμολογεῖν. Οὐκοῦν ὅλως οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι οὐκ αἰσχροὺς B
φόβους φοβοῦνται, ὅταν φοβῶνται, οὐδὲ αἰσχρὰ θάρρη θαρροῦσιν; Ἀληθῆ, ἔφη. Εἰ δὲ μὴ αἰσχρά, ἆρ᾽ οὐ καλά; Ὡμολόγει· Εἰ δὲ καλά, καὶ ἀγαθά; Ναί. Οὐκοῦν καὶ οἱ δειλοὶ καὶ οἱ θρασεῖς καὶ οἱ μαινόμενοι τοὐναντίον αἰσχρούς τε φόβους φοβοῦνται καὶ αἰσχρὰ θάρρη θαρροῦσιν; Ὡμολόγει. Θαρροῦσι δὲ τὰ αἰσχρὰ καὶ κακὰ δι᾽ ἄλλο τι ἢ δι᾽ ἄγνοιαν καὶ ἀμαθίαν; Οὕτως ἔχει, ἔφη. Τί οὖν; τοῦτο, δι᾽ ὃ δειλοί εἰσιν οἱ C
δειλοί, δειλίαν ἢ ἀνδρείαν καλεῖς; Δειλίαν ἔγωγ᾽, ἔφη. Δειλοὶ δὲ οὐ διὰ τὴν τῶν δεινῶν ἀμαθίαν ἐφάνησαν ὄντες; Πάνυ γ᾽, ἔφη. Διὰ ταύτην ἄρα τὴν ἀμαθίαν δειλοί εἰσιν; Ὡμολόγει. Δι᾽ ὃ δὲ δειλοί εἰσι, δειλία ὁμολογεῖται παρὰ σοῦ; Συνέφη. Οὐκοῦν ἡ τῶν δεινῶν καὶ μὴ δεινῶν ἀμαθία δειλία ἂν εἴη; Ἐπένευσεν.

D Ἀλλὰ μήν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἐναντίον ἀνδρεία δειλίᾳ. Ἔφη.
Οὐκοῦν ἡ τῶν δεινῶν καὶ μὴ δεινῶν σοφία ἐναντία τῇ
τούτων ἀμαθίᾳ ἐστί; Καὶ ἐνταῦθα ἔτι ἐπένευσεν. Ἡ
δὲ τούτων ἀμαθία δειλία; Πάνυ μόγις ἐνταῦθα ἐπέ-
νευσεν. Ἡ σοφία ἄρα τῶν δεινῶν καὶ μὴ δεινῶν
ἀνδρεία ἐστίν, ἐναντία οὖσα τῇ τούτων ἀμαθίᾳ; Οὐ-
κέτι ἐνταῦθα οὔτ' ἐπινεῦσαι ἠθέλησεν ἐσίγα τε. Καὶ
ἐγὼ εἶπον· Τί δή, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, οὔτε σὺ φῂς ἃ ἐρωτῶ
E οὔτε ἀπόφῃς; Αὐτός, ἔφη, πέρανον. Ἕν γ', ἔφην ἐγώ,
μόνον ἐρόμενος ἔτι σέ, εἴ σοι ὥσπερ τὸ πρῶτον ἔτι
δοκοῦσιν εἶναί τινες ἄνθρωποι ἀμαθέστατοι μέν, ἀν-
δρειότατοι δέ. Φιλονεικεῖν μοι, ἔφη, δοκεῖς, ὦ Σώ-
κρατες, τὸ ἐμὲ εἶναι τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον. χαριοῦμαι
οὖν σοι, καὶ λέγω, ὅτι ἐκ τῶν ὡμολογημένων ἀδύνατόν
μοι δοκεῖ εἶναι.

XL. Οὔτοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ἄλλου ἕνεκα ἐρωτῶ πάντα
ταῦτα ἢ σκέψασθαι βουλόμενος, πῶς ποτ' ἔχει τὰ
περὶ τῆς ἀρετῆς καὶ τί ποτ' ἐστὶν αὐτὸ ἡ ἀρετή. οἶδα
361 γὰρ ὅτι, τούτου φανεροῦ γενομένου, μάλιστα ἂν κατά-
δηλον γένοιτο ἐκεῖνο, περὶ οὗ ἐγώ τε καὶ σὺ μακρὸν
λόγον ἑκάτερος ἀπετείναμεν, ἐγὼ μὲν λέγων, ὡς οὐ
διδακτὸν ἀρετή, σὺ δ', ὡς διδακτόν. καί μοι δοκεῖ
ἡμῶν ἡ ἄρτι ἔξοδος τῶν λόγων ὥσπερ ἄνθρωπος κατη-
γορεῖν τε καὶ καταγελᾶν, καὶ εἰ φωνὴν λάβοι, εἰπεῖν
ἄν, ὅτι Ἄτοποί γ' ἐστέ, ὦ Σώκρατές τε καὶ Πρωτα-
γόρα. σὺ μὲν λέγων, ὅτι οὐ διδακτόν ἐστιν ἀρετὴ ἐν
B τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν, νῦν σεαυτῷ τἀναντία σπεύδεις, ἐπι-
χειρῶν ἀποδεῖξαι, ὡς πάντα χρήματα ἐστὶν ἐπιστήμη,
καὶ ἡ δικαιοσύνη καὶ ἡ σωφροσύνη καὶ ἡ ἀνδρεία, ᾧ
τρόπῳ μάλιστ' ἂν διδακτὸν φανείη ἡ ἀρετή. εἰ μὲν
γὰρ ἄλλο τι ἦν ἢ ἐπιστήμη ἡ ἀρετή, ὥσπερ Πρωτα-
γόρας ἐπεχείρει λέγειν, σαφῶς οὐκ ἂν ἦν διδακτόν·

*νῦν δὲ εἰ φανήσεται ἐπιστήμη ὅλον, ὡς σὺ σπεύδεις,
ὦ Σώκρατες, θαυμάσιον ἔσται μὴ διδακτὸν ὄν. Πρω-
ταγόρας δ' αὖ διδακτὸν τότε ὑποθέμενος, νῦν τοὐναντίον* C
*ἔοικε σπεύδοντι, ὀλίγου πάντα μᾶλλον φανῆναι αὐτὸ
ἢ ἐπιστήμην· καὶ οὕτως ἂν ἥκιστα εἴη διδακτόν. ἐγὼ
οὖν, ὦ Πρωταγόρα, πάντα ταῦτα καθορῶν ἄνω κάτω
ταραττόμενα δεινῶς, πᾶσαν προθυμίαν ἔχω καταφανῆ
αὐτὰ γενέσθαι, καὶ βουλοίμην ἂν ταῦτα διεξελθόντας
ἡμᾶς ἐξελθεῖν καὶ ἐπὶ τὴν ἀρετὴν ὅ τι ἔστι, καὶ πάλιν
ἐπισκέψασθαι περὶ αὐτοῦ, εἴτε διδακτὸν εἴτε μὴ διδα-
κτόν, μὴ πολλάκις ἡμᾶς ὁ Ἐπιμηθεὺς ἐκεῖνος καὶ ἐν* D
*τῇ σκέψει σφήλῃ ἐξαπατήσας, ὥσπερ καὶ ἐν τῇ δια-
νομῇ ἠμέλησεν ἡμῶν, ὡς φῂς σύ. ἤρεσεν οὖν μοι καὶ
ἐν τῷ μύθῳ ὁ Προμηθεὺς μᾶλλον τοῦ Ἐπιμηθέως· ᾧ
χρώμενος ἐγὼ καὶ προμηθούμενος ὑπὲρ τοῦ βίου τοῦ
ἐμαυτοῦ παντός, πάντα ταῦτα πραγματεύομαι, καὶ εἰ
σὺ ἐθέλοις, ὅπερ καὶ κατ' ἀρχὰς ἔλεγον, μετὰ σοῦ ἂν
ἥδιστα ταῦτα συνδιασκοποίην. Καὶ ὁ Πρωταγόρας,
Ἐγὼ μέν, ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἐπαινῶ σου τὴν προ-
θυμίαν καὶ τὴν διέξοδον τῶν λόγων. καὶ γὰρ οὔτε* E
*τἆλλα οἶμαι κακὸς εἶναι ἄνθρωπος, φθονερός τε ἥκιστ'
ἀνθρώπων· ἐπεὶ καὶ περὶ σοῦ πρὸς πολλοὺς δὴ εἴρηκα,
ὅτι ὧν ἐντυγχάνω πολὺ μάλιστα ἄγαμαι σέ, τῶν μὲν
τηλικούτων καὶ πάνυ· καὶ λέγω γε, ὅτι οὐν ἂν θαυμά-
ζοιμι, εἰ τῶν ἐλλογίμων γένοιο ἀνδρῶν ἐπὶ σοφίᾳ.
καὶ περὶ τούτων δὲ εἰσαῦθις, ὅταν βούλῃ, διέξιμεν·
νῦν δ' ὥρα ἤδη καὶ ἐπ' ἄλλο τι τρέπεσθαι. Ἀλλ', ἦν* 362
*δ' ἐγώ, οὕτω χρὴ ποιεῖν, εἴ σοι δοκεῖ. καὶ γὰρ ἐμοὶ
οἶπερ ἔφην ἰέναι πάλαι ὥρα, ἀλλὰ Καλλίᾳ τῷ καλῷ
χαριζόμενος παρέμεινα.*

Ταῦτ' εἰπόντες καὶ ἀκούσαντες ἀπῇμεν.

ΕΚ ΤΩΝ

ΣΙΜΩΝΙΔΟΥ ΤΟΥ ΚΕΙΟΥ

ΠΡΟΣ

ΣΚΟΠΑΝ ΤΟΝ ΚΡΕΟΝΤΟΣ ΘΕΣΣΑΛΟΝ.

Ἄνδρ' ἀγαθὸν μὲν ἀλαθέως γενέσθαι χαλεπὸν Στρ. α'.
χερσίν τε καὶ ποσὶ καὶ νόῳ τετράγωνον, ἄνευ ψόγου
τετυγμένον.

⏑ ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ – – ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ – – – ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ ⏑ ⏑ ⏓
⏑ ⏑⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ – – ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ –
– ⏑́ ⏑ – – ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ –
⏑ ⏑́ ⏑́ ⏑ – –
– ⏑ ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ – – ⏑́ ⏑ ⏑ – – – ⏓

Οὐδέ μοι ἐμμελέως τὸ Πιττάκειον νέμεται, Ἀντ. α'.
καίτοι σοφοῦ παρὰ φωτὸς εἰρημένον· χαλεπὸν φάτ'
ἐσλὸν ἔμμεναι.
θεὸς ἂν μόνος τοῦτ' ἔχοι γέρας· ἄνδρα δ' οὐκ ἐστὶ μὴ
οὐ κακὸν ἔμμεναι,
ὃν ἂν ἀμάχανος συμφορὰ καθέλῃ.
πράξαις γὰρ εὖ πᾶς ἀνὴρ ἀγαθός,
κακὸς δ', εἰ κακῶς, καὶ
τοὐπιπλεῖστον ἄριστοι, τούς κε θεοὶ φιλῶσιν.
Ἔμοιγ' ἐξαρκεῖ
ὃς ἂν μὴ κακὸς ᾖ Ἐπῳδος.
μηδ' ἄγαν ἀπάλαμνος εἰδώς τ' ὀνασίπολιν δίκαν,
ὑγιὴς ἀνήρ.
οὔ μιν ἐγὼ μωμάσομαι·
οὐ γὰρ ἐγὼ φιλόμωμος·
τῶν γὰρ ἀλιθίων ἀπείρων γενέθλα.

πάντα τοι καλὰ τοῖσί τ' αἰσχρὰ μὴ μέμικται.
Τοὔνεκεν οὔποτ' ἐγὼ τὸ μὴ γενέσθαι δυνατὸν Στρ. β′.
διζημένος, κενεὰν ἐς ἄπρακτον ἐλπίδα μοῖραν αἰῶνος βαλέω,
πανάμωμον ἄνθρωπον, εὐρυεδοῦς ὅσοι κάρπον αἰνύμεθα χθονός.
ἔπειτ' ὔμμιν εὑρὼν ἀπαγγελέω.
πάντας δ' ἐπαίνημι καὶ φιλέω,
ἑκὼν ὅστις ἔρδῃ
μηδὲν αἰσχρόν· ἀνάγκᾳ δ' οὐδὲ θεοὶ μάχονται.

* * * * * * * *

ANALYSIS.

Chap. I.—Introductory conversation between Socrates and a friend: the latter, being informed that Protagoras is in Athens, and that Socrates has just met him, desires to hear the particulars of the interview. Several other persons are supposed to be present; throughout the rest of the dialogue Socrates is speaking, and relates what has just passed in the house of Callias.

Chap. II.—Socrates describes the visit he had received that morning, while still in bed, from his young friend Hippocrates, who insists on an immediate introduction to Protagoras. It being too early to call, Socrates proposes a walk.

Chap. III.—During the walk, Socrates elicits from his friend his object in seeking to place himself under Protagoras. At first it seems as though he intended to follow his master's profession, that of a Sophist: but he afterwards avails himself of a suggestion of Socrates, and, disclaiming all professional views, declares that he is anxious to become the pupil of Protagoras only for the sake of a liberal education.

Chap. IV.—What is a Sophist? Socrates asks.—One who is learned in wisdom.—But in what wisdom? for a painter also is learned in that wisdom which relates to the production of pictures.—He makes men able speakers.—On what subjects?—Hippocrates confesses that he cannot tell.

Chap. V.—Socrates remarks on the imprudence of the step his friend was about to take so hastily, and on the extreme caution required in all educational matters, owing to the sensibility of the mind to injury.

Chap. VI.—They finish the conversation begun during the walk, and with some difficulty obtain admittance to the house of Callias, where Protagoras is staying.

Chap. VII.—Description of the scene which presented itself to them on entering: Protagoras and other Sophists lounging upon couches, surrounded by groups of admiring pupils, with whom they are engaged in various and animated conversation.

Chap. VIII.—Socrates introduces his friend to Protagoras, and explains the object of his visit: Protagoras in reply alludes with great complacency to his own success in the profession of a Sophist, and his open assumption of the name, as a point of difference between himself and others. A formal discussion is agreed on; the guests arrange themselves accordingly, and prepare to listen.

Chap. IX.—Socrates opens the conversation by asking Protagoras what benefits Hippocrates will derive from his teaching.—He will become better every day.—But in what respects?—In private and in public life,—in the management of his own affairs and of the affairs of the state.—Then in fact you profess to make men good citizens.—That is exactly, says Protagoras, the profession that I make.

Chap. X.—But I always thought, Socrates replies, that virtue could not be taught: first, because the State allows uneducated persons to interfere in public matters, implying thereby that virtue forms no part of education; secondly, because the most distinguished men, Pericles

for instance, have been unable to impart their good qualities to their children.

[Chap: XI.—XVI. Protagoras' answer.]

Chap. XI.—The fable of Prometheus and Epimetheus on the origin of mankind.

Chap. XII.—The fable continued. Justice and Modesty the essential conditions of human society: all must therefore partake of them in some sense or other. This is in answer to Socrates' first objection.

Chap. XIII.—The notion of punishment, whether for the purpose of reformation or of example, implies that virtue can be taught.

Chap. XIV.—He proceeds to meet the second objection, that the sons of the best men are often among the worst: and first, if men did not teach their children virtue, they would not themselves be virtuous.

Chap. XV.—But they do teach them virtue, as is proved by the whole course of ordinary Greek education.

Chap. XVI.—The different degrees of virtue, as of excellence in any other art or accomplishment, are the result of natural gifts: but the worst specimens of civilized men are better than savages,—another proof that virtue can be taught. And whereas all men, Protagoras concludes, are more or less able to teach virtue, I am one of those who profess to be better able to do so than the generality of mankind.

Chap. XVII.—Socrates expresses a hope that Protagoras is not like the ordinary run of orators, whose set speeches will not bear sifting by question and answer; and proceeds to try him by raising a discussion on the unity or plurality of the virtues.

Chap. XVIII.—Protagoras thinks that the several virtues are parts of a whole, called by the general name

of Virtue.—Like each other, as the particles of gold are, or unlike, as the parts of a face?—Unlike each other.—Is it not the nature of justice to be just, and of holiness to be holy?—It is.

Chap. XIX.—But if justice be not like holiness, must it not be unholy, and holiness unjust?—Protagoras is now at a loss for a reply: after an unsuccessful attempt, on his part, to parry the question, Socrates proposes to change the subject.

Chap. XX.—Is not folly contrary to wisdom? Socrates asks.—It is.—And is not acting foolishly the contrary to acting with self-control?—Yes.—Folly, then, is contrary to self-control.—Granted.—Is there more than one contrary to every single thing?—Only one.—Then we must retract one of our two assertions; either wisdom and self-control are the same thing, or folly has more than one contrary.—Protagoras now admits that wisdom and self-control are pretty much the same thing.

Chap. XXI.—Socrates is on the point of proving the same of justice, when Protagoras succeeds in introducing a rhetorical flourish on the nature of the Good, which is applauded by all present.

Chap. XXII.—Finding that his opponent will not be kept to the point, Socrates pleads another engagement and rises to depart: Callias detains him at the request of his guests, who are anxious to hear out the discussion.

Chap. XXIII.—Speeches of Alcibiades and Prodicus—the former taking the part of Socrates, the latter indulging in some of his favourite verbal distinctions.

Chap. XXIV.—Speech of Hippias: he proposes that an umpire be chosen to arbitrate between the two disputants.

Chap. XXV.—Socrates demurs to this proposition, but expresses his readiness to answer, if Protagoras will now become the questioner in his turn.

Chap. XXVI.—Protagoras begins by quoting a poem of Simonides, and inducing Socrates to commit himself to the truth of its sentiments. He then endeavours to show that the poet, and consequently Socrates, contradicts himself: for after having said at the commencement that 'To become a good man is hard,' he proceeds to find fault with the saying of Pittacus, ''Tis hard to be good.' But Socrates shows that, so far from there being any inconsistency in these two statements, the whole argument of the passage turns on the distinction between 'being' and 'becoming.'

Chap. XXVII.—To this explanation Protagoras objects, that Simonides could not have meant to say that it was easy to be good, when all mankind think it the hardest thing of all. Hence arises a discussion on the meaning of the word 'hard,' which is broken off by Socrates offering to criticise the poem of Simonides, and to state what, in his opinion, was the author's real meaning.

Chap. XXVIII.—And first, since this saying of Pittacus, like the other maxims of the Seven Sages, had obtained great currency and reputation, Simonides thought to gain credit by refuting it.

Chap. XXIX.—The opening lines of the poem are directed against the use of the word 'be' in the proverb in question: had Pittacus said that to 'become' good was hard, he would have spoken correctly enough.

Chap. XXX.—The reason is, that for a man to become good is difficult, yet not impossible, but to be, i.e. to continue good, is only possible for God.

Chap. XXXI.—Simonides is content, therefore, that the absence of evil should entitle a man to his affection and praise, without vainly seeking for the presence of positive good.

Chap. XXXII.—Socrates having finished, Alcibiades now proposes that the original discussion be resumed. Socrates observes that it is of no use to quote any more poetry, if their object be to arrive at the truth: but he is ready either to ask or to answer questions, whichever Protagoras chooses. After various efforts to avoid coming to a decision, Protagoras at length desires Socrates to interrogate him.

Chap. XXXIII.—Having soothed his antagonist by a compliment, Socrates now repeats his former question, adding at the same time that he does not hold Protagoras bound by his previous answers: Are wisdom, self-control, courage, justice, and holiness, five names for one and the same thing? or are they five several parts of Virtue? If the latter, do they resemble one another, or not?

Chap. XXXIV.—Four of them are pretty much alike, Protagoras answers, but courage is different from the rest.—But the examples of riding, swimming, fighting, &c., prove that men are most courageous in what they understand best, and therefore this virtue also may be included under the same general definition, as dependent upon knowledge.—Yet that sort of daring which is the result of knowledge may also be the result of passion or madness; and so must be distinguished from courage, which is partly constitutional, and partly acquired by good mental training.

Chap. XXXV.—Very well, says Socrates. You admit that pleasant things are good, in so far as they are pleasant, and painful things evil, in so far as they are

painful?—I am not sure of that.—I mean, is no pleasure considered in itself a good thing?—Let us examine the question more closely.—Perhaps then this will help us out: What is your idea of knowledge? Do you think, with the many, that knowledge is weak and unable to control the passions? or, with me, that if it be really present, a man cannot act otherwise than as knowledge prescribes?—I should be the last man to deny that knowledge is of all human things the mightiest.—What then do people mean, when they talk of being overpowered by pleasure or pain?

Chap. XXXVI.—When people say, continues Socrates, that they pursue what is pleasant though they know it to be evil,—we must ask them, How do you know such things to be evil? Is it not because they terminate in pain, and deprive us of other pleasures? Again, when painful things are spoken of as good, such as military service, surgical treatment, &c., is it not because their after results are pleasant? So that, turn the question how you will, you cannot avoid the conclusion that pain is an evil, and pleasure a good.—On all these points Protagoras assented.—It follows then that it is an absurdity to speak of a man, who knows evil to be evil, practising it because he is overpowered by pleasure.

Chap. XXXVII.—For if pleasant and good, painful and evil be convertible terms, that statement may be put into two forms, either of which will show its absurdity. We may say that a man who knows evil to be evil does it because he is overpowered with good; or that he does what is painful, knowing it be painful, being overpowered by pleasure. Doing evil must therefore consist in choosing the lesser good, that is, the lesser pleasure, instead of the greater: and the only test of the fitness or unfitness of actions consists in counting up the pleasures and pains

which they respectively produce, and striking a balance. But this test can only be applied by science, and that science a knowledge of measurements: the man who chooses the less pleasure, or the greater pain, measures incorrectly: this can only be through want of knowledge: hence being overpowered by pleasure is ignorance, and that the greatest.

Chap. XXXVIII.—Again, if you admit that the pleasant is good, it follows that no one encounters willingly that which he knows or believes to be evil. Do you agree with me that there is such a thing as fear, and that it may be defined as the expectation of evil? If so, then no one will encounter what he fears, if he can help it.—To these propositions all assented.

Chap. XXXIX.—What then becomes of Protagoras' former answer, that courage was of a different nature from the other virtues? Brave men do not encounter what they believe to be formidable, that is evil, for that was proved to be impossible: but what they encounter, they believe to be pleasant, good, and honourable. And cowards do not encounter what is pleasant, good, and honourable, because they believe it to be formidable or evil. It follows then that courage, no less than the other virtues, is to be referred to knowledge, for it is the knowledge of what is, and is not, really formidable.

Chap. XL.—Socrates finally points out the contradiction in which both parties have been involved: Protagoras, who all along maintained that virtue could be taught, and still professes to teach it himself, having constantly denied that it is science or knowledge; while he himself, who started with denying that it could be taught, has taken great pains to prove it to be science, and therefore capable of being taught.

NOTES.

I. Πρωταγόρας ἢ Σοφισταί, ἐνδεικτικός.

309 ἢ δῆλα δὴ ὅτι] "An id quidem dubium non est quin..." Cic. ap. Priscian. in a translation of the present passage. ἢ serves to correct the former question, as in Menex. init. Τί μάλιστα σὺ πρὸς βουλευτήριον; ἢ δῆλα δὴ ὅτι παιδεύσεως καὶ φιλοσοφίας ἐπὶ τέλει ἡγεῖ εἶναι; Phaedr. init. Τίς οὖν δὴ ἡ διατριβή; ἢ δῆλον ὅτι τῶν λόγων ὑμᾶς Λυσίας εἱστία; Below 312 E. 330 B.—κυνηγεσίου] Xen. Sympos. IV. 63. οὐχ οὕτω διέθηκας, ὥστε διὰ τοὺς σοὺς λόγους ἐρῶντες ἐκυνοδρομοῦμεν ἀλλήλους ζητοῦντες;] —ὥρᾳ, "bloom," cf. Phaedr. 234 A, 240 D; and for the allusion to Alcibiades, Sympos. 213 B, C.—καὶ μὴν καὶ] "and by the bye." Below, καὶ οὖν (a rare combination of particles) is "*and so* I am *only just* (καὶ ἄρτι) come from him."—ὥς γ' ἐν αὐτοῖς ἡμῖν εἰρῆσθαι] "between ourselves." Xen. Sympos. IV. 25. ὡς ἐν ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς εἰρῆσθαι. αὐτὸς=*solus*, as in the phrase αὐτοὶ γάρ ἐσμεν, Ar. Ach. 504. Plat. Parm. 137 A. Legg. VIII. 836 B.—οὐ σὺ μέντοι κ.τ.λ.] "surely you agree with Homer, don't you?" Phaedr. 261 C. οἱ ἀντίδικοι τί δρῶσιν; οὐκ ἀντιλέγουσι μέντοι; Charm. 159 B. οὐ τῶν καλῶν μέντοι ἡ σωφροσύνη ἐστί. Other examples of this interrogative force of μέντοι will be found in Heindorf and Stallbaum: and without an interrogation, below 330 D. 339 E. The reference is to Odyss. x. 279, πρῶτον ὑπηνήτῃ, τοῦ περ χαριεστάτη ἥβη.

C. οὐ γὰρ δήπου ἐνέτυχες] "I don't suppose you have met." See below on 361 E.—Πῶς δ' οὐ μέλλει] "quidni?" Stallbaum: who rightly, I think, defends σοφώτατον, the reading of the MSS. Heindorf prefers, and Bekker and the Zurich editors read, σοφώτερον on the authority of Ficinus' Latin version only. "Superlativus ironiæ Socraticæ longe accommodatior. Pertinet enim τὸ σοφώτατον ad Protagoram."—Ἀλλ' ἢ σοφῷ τινι ἡμῖν, κ.τ.λ.] "Why how is this, have you just left one of our wise men?" ἀλλ' ἢ expresses a question with surprise, Phaedr. 261 B. ἀλλ' ἢ τὰς Νέ-

στορος καὶ Ὀδυσσέως τέχνας μόνον περὶ λόγων ἀκήκοας; Gorg. init. ἀλλ' ἤ, τὸ λεγόμενον, κατόπιν ἑορτῆς ἥκομεν καὶ ὑστεροῦμεν; Aesch. Choeph. 220, ἀλλ' ἦ δόλον τιν', ὦ ξέν', ἀμφί μοι πλέκεις;—ἡμῖν is "in our opinion," cf. Jelf, Gr. Gr. § 600. 1.

D. Σοφωτάτῳ μὲν οὖν] A good instance of the *corrective* force of μὲν οὖν (Lat. *immo*), implying that a statement is true as far as it goes, but not the whole truth, or not put strongly enough. So in Aesch. Agam. 1396, τάδ' ἂν δικαίως ἦν, ὑπερδίκως μὲν οὖν, ὑπερδίκως corrects δικαίως just as σοφωτάτῳ does σοφῷ here.—Ὦ τί λέγεις;] "ὦ est mirantis, ὦ compellantis." Stallb. —συγγεγονώς] In Plato συγγίγνεσθαι is most commonly used of the relation of master and pupil: though sometimes of ordinary intercourse, as here and at 329 A. 342 D. Compare a passage otherwise interesting in Meno 91 E. Πρωταγόρας δὲ ἄρα ὅλην τὴν Ἑλλάδα ἐλάνθανε διαφθείρων τοὺς συγγιγνομένους καὶ μοχθηροτέρους ἀποπέμπων ἢ παρελάμβανε πλέον ἢ τετταράκοντα ἔτη. See also below 316 C. 318 *passim*. 342 C.

310 Τί οὖν οὐ διηγήσω;] "Why do you not *at once* repeat it to us?" Sympos. 173 B, and compare below, 317 D. Τί οὖν, ἔφην ἐγώ, οὐ καὶ Πρόδικον καὶ Ἱππίαν ἐκαλέσαμεν; Charm. 154 E. τί οὖν οὐκ ἀπεδύσαμεν...καὶ ἐθεασάμεθα; So likewise in Soph. Oed. Tyr. 1002. τί δῆτ' ἔγωγ' οὐ τοῦδε τοῦ φόβου σ', ἄναξ, | ἐπείπερ εὔνους ἦλθον, ἐξελυσάμην. See also on 342 E. —καθιζόμενος ἐνταυθί] All recent editors read ἐνταυθί with the Bodleian and two other of the best MSS. instead of the old reading ἐνταυθοῖ. On the question whether ἐνταυθοῖ can be used of a state of rest, see Mr Shilleto on Dem. Fals. Leg. §§ 92, 356. No doubt ἐνταυθοῖ might stand here, after the analogy of such phrases as εἰς τὸν αὐτὸν θᾶκον καθίζοιτο Rep. VII. 516 E: but the authority of the best MSS. is decisive. τὸν παῖδα τουτονί] Pointing to a slave.—ἀλλ' οὖν ἀκούετε] "Well then, listen."

II. βαθέος ὄρθρου] Crito 43 A. Ar. Vesp. 216. St Luke xxiv. 1.—Φάσωνος δὲ ἀδελφός] For this well-known use of δὲ compare Eur. Hec. 534. ὦ παῖ Πηλέως, πατὴρ δ' ἐμός...and a variety of examples in Elmsley on Med. 940.

B. τὴν θύραν...ἔκρουε] κόπτειν and κρούειν are both used of knocking for admittance, though the former is more strictly Attic; Phrynichus indeed disapproves of κρούειν altogether, but many passages are against him, as Heindorf observes, below 314 D. We also find πατάσσειν and ἀράσσειν of violent knocking, Ar. Ran. 38. Eur. Hec. 1044. On the other hand, ψοφεῖν is to knock on

coming out, a necessary precaution as the doors of the ancients opened back into the street. Cf. Lobeck. Phryn. p. 177. Ar. Nub. 132, where this distinction is explained by the Scholiast.—Ἱπποκράτης, ἔφην, οὗτος] "So you are here, Hippocrates?" not "heus tu," which would have required οὗτος to come first.—μή τι νεώτερον ἀγγέλλεις;] Here there is a play on the double meaning of "news" and "misfortune." Socrates asks for the former, Hippocrates wilfully understands him to mean the latter. εἰ μὴ = ἀλλά, as in Ar. Eq. 186. μῶν ἐκ καλῶν εἶ κἀγαθῶν; ΑΛΛ. μὰ τοὺς θεούς, | εἰ μὴ 'κ πονηρῶν γ'...according to the certain correction of Elmsley.—Εὖ ἂν λέγοις] "I am glad to hear it." Soph. Oed. Col. 647, μέγ' ἂν λέγοις δώρημα τῆς ξυνουσίας.—τηνικάδε] "so early." Crito l. c. στὰς παρ' ἐμοί is to be joined with ἔφη.—πρώην = the day before yesterday, as in the phrase χθὲς καὶ πρώην. Compare above: τρίτην γε ἤδη ἡμέραν. ἄρτι is "*only* just," which is also the force of γε in ἑσπέρας γε.

C. ἐπιψηλαφήσας τοῦ σκίμποδος] "Feeling his way to the bed, as it was still dark." The σκίμπους was a low and mean kind of bed, contemptuously ascribed to Socrates in the Nubes (254, 709), called also ἀσκάντης (ib. 633), and ὀκλαδίας (folding like a camp-stool, from ὀκλάζω, Eq. 1384, 1386.—δῆτα] repeats the former answer with emphasis: "only last night, I assure you."—ἐξ Οἰνόης] There were two Attic demi of this name: cf. Arnold on Thuc. II. 18. One was near Eleutherea, on the high road by the passes of Cithaeron to Thebes; the other near Marathon. The former of these, as Sauppe points out, must here be intended, as it was the nearest way by which a runaway slave could reach the frontier.—ὑπό τινος ἄλλου ἐπελαθόμην] "I had it put out of my head by something else." Apol. 17 A. ἐγὼ δ' οὖν καὶ αὐτὸς ὑπ' αὐτῶν ὀλίγου ἐμαυτοῦ ἐπελαθόμην. Ar. Nub. 854. ἀλλ' ὅ τι μάθοιμ' ἑκάστοτε, | ἐπελανθανόμην εὐθὺς ὑπὸ πλήθους τῶν ἐτῶν.—ἦλθον] "returned." For examples, see Heindorf.—καὶ ἔτι μὲν ἐνεχείρησα] "and though I *still* made the attempt," i. e. notwithstanding the lateness of the hour. Cf. Xen. Anab. VI. 2. 15. Ξενοφῶν δὲ ἔτι μὲν ἐπεχείρησεν ἀπαλλαγεὶς τῆς στρατιᾶς ἐκπλεῦσαι· θυομένῳ δ' αὐτῷ κ.τ.λ. In these instances ἔτι refers to some unexpressed obstacle: ἔπειτα is "yet afterwards," δέ being omitted, as it regularly is after πρῶτον μέν.—λίαν πόῤῥω τῶν νυκτῶν] "too far gone in the night." Sympos. 217 D. διελεγόμην πόῤῥω τῶν νυκτῶν. Herod. II. 121. 4. ὡς πρόσω ἦν τῆς νυκτός. IX. 44. ὡς δὲ πρόσω τῆς νυκτὸς προελήλατο. Elsewhere, πόῤῥω with Gen. is "far from," as in Theaet. 151 C. πόῤῥω ὄντες

τοῦ εἰδέναι. Phaedr. 238 B. οὐκέτι πόῤῥω διθυράμβων φθέγγομαι. Νύκτες in the plural, hours or watches of the night, Rep. x. 621 B. Xen. Cyrop. IV. 5. 13. v. 3. 52.

D. ἐκ τοῦ κόπου] ἐκ in the sense of "after" is stronger than μετά: "statim et continuo post." Stallb. Cf. Phaedr. 251 A. ἰδόντα δὲ αὐτόν, οἷον ἐκ τῆς φρίκης, μεταβολή τε καὶ ἱδρὼς καὶ θερμότης ἀήθης λαμβάνει.—ἀναστὰς οὕτω δεῦρο ἐπ.] οὕτω thus introduced after a participle, like the Lat. *ita demum*, gives clearness and emphasis to a sequence: "then and not till then." cf. 314 C. διαπερανάμενοι οὕτως ἐσίοιμεν. 326 D. ὑπογράψαντες γραμμὰς...οὕτω κ.τ.λ. Phaedo 61 D. καθεζόμενος οὕτως ἤδη τὰ λοιπὰ διελέγετο. Rep. IX. 576 E. ἰδόντες οὕτω δόξαν ἀποφαινώμεθα. There is a slightly different usage of οὕτω after a verb, below 325 A.—πτοίησιν] "excitement." Dr Wagner on Phaedo 68 C. observes that πτοεῖσθαι is a word almost exclusively used by poets and philosophers: in the latter it denotes an inordinate desire not based upon rational grounds.—μῶν τί σε ἀδικεῖ Πρωταγόρας] In Jelf Gr. Gr. § 873, this is cited as an unusual instance of μῶν answered in the affirmative. But surely the form of this, as of every other question, turns upon the *expected* answer.—ἂν αὐτῷ διδῷς...ἐκεῖνον] αὐτὸς and ἐκεῖνος both refer to Protagoras: cf. 318 C. So Phaedo 111 B. τὰς δὲ ὥρας αὐτοῖς κρᾶσιν ἔχειν τοιαύτην, ὥστε ἐκείνους ἀνόσους εἶναι. Euthyphr. 14 D. τίς αὕτη ἡ ὑπηρεσία ἐστὶ τοῖς θεοῖς; αἰτεῖν τε φῂς αὐτοὺς καὶ διδόναι ἐκείνοις. Thuc. I. 132. παιδικά ποτε ὢν αὐτῷ καὶ πιστότατος ἐκείνῳ.—Εἰ γάρ...φίλων] "I wish it may only depend on this; for I will leave nothing remaining of my own or my friends' property." "I would it did" is expressed by εἰ γὰρ ἦν. For the sense of ἐπιλείπειν, the passage cited from Phileb. 52 D. is not exactly to the point: the word there means rather "to omit." A nearer approach to it is Xen. Anab. I. 8. 18. τὸ ἐπιλειπόμενον = the part left behind. Odyss. VIII. 475. ἐπὶ δὲ πλεῖον ἐλέλειπτο.

E. τῶν φίλων is the gen. of τὰ τῶν φίλων, the single τῶν serving for both articles; cf. Stallb. Gorg. 454 E.—αὐτὰ ταῦτα = δι' αὐτὰ ταῦτα, Sympos. 204 A. αὐτὸ γὰρ τοῦτό ἐστι χαλεπὸν ἀμαθία. A slightly different explanation is given by Riddell, Dig. § 18.—οὔτ' ἀκήκοα οὐδέν, sc. αὐτοῦ. Compare 313 B. ὃν οὔτε γιγνώσκεις ὡς φῂς οὔτε διείλεξαι οὐδεπώποτε, sc. αὐτῷ. Lysias, Orat. XXII. p. 166. § 25. οἷς ὑμεῖς χαριεῖσθε καὶ προθυμοτέρους ποιήσετε, sc. αὐτούς.—ἦ, ὅτε] ἦ as the form of the first person is the reading of most MSS. of Plato even before a vowel. Hermann's notion (Praef. Oed. Tyr. p. xix.) that ἦ is the aorist, and ἦν the imperfect, is probably

unfounded.—*τί οὐ βαδίζομεν*] An expression of impatience, like *τί οὖν οὐ διηγήσω* above. Cf. Lys. 211 D. Crat. 420 B. Gorg. 468 D.

311 *παρὰ Καλλίᾳ τῷ Ἱππονίκου*] The scene of Xenophon's Symposium, as well as of this dialogue, is laid at his house. See his life in the Dict. of Biogr. (Callias, No. 6).—*μήπω γ', ὦ γαθέ*] The old reading was *μήπω, 'γαθέ*. Heindorf corrected *μήπω, ὦ 'γαθέ*. and was followed by editors down to Cobet, whose conjecture *μηπωγωγαθε* has been generally approved. He refers to Phædr. 242 A. *μήπω γε, ὦ Σώκρατες πρὶν ἂν τὸ καῦμα παρέλθῃ*. As Sauppe remarks, *μήπω* in Attic writers is usually followed by *γέ*. The bracketing of *ἐκεῖσε ἴωμεν* is also due to Cobet. Kroschel alone (unsuccessfully, I think) maintains the genuineness of the words. *δεῦρο ἐξαναστῶμεν εἰς τὴν αὐλήν*] "let us turn out into the court here." Phaedo 116 A. *ἀνίστατο εἰς οἴκημά τι*. Pseudo-Plat. Theag. 129 B. *ἐμὲ δὲ δεῖ ἐξαναστῆναι*. Eur. Heracl. 59. *ἀνίστασθαί σε χρὴ | ἐς Ἄργος, οὗ σε λεύσιμος μένει δίκη*.—*διατρίψωμεν* includes the notions of "associating" and "conversing." Cf. Euthyphr. init. *τὰς ἐν Λυκείῳ καταλιπὼν διατριβὰς ἐνθάδε νῦν διατρίβεις*. Phædo 59 D. *διατρίβοντες μετ' ἀλλήλων*. Of course this does not apply to *διατρίβει* below; the sense in either case being determined by the context.—*ὥστε...αὐτόν*] "So don't be afraid, we shall catch him;" the form of the sentence corresponding exactly with the English idiom. Cf. Xen. Cyrop. v. 4. 36. *θάῤῥει, ἔφη, ὦ Κῦρε, οὐδέν σε δεήσει τῷ ἀγαθῷ ἀνδρὶ μάχεσθαι*. Ibid. vii. 3. 13. *ἀλλὰ θάῤῥει, ἔφη, ὦ Κῦρε, ου μή σε κρύψω*. Soph. Œd. Col. 1185. *οὐ γάρ σε, θάρσει, πρὸς βίαν παρασπάσει | γνώμης*.

III. B. *ἀποπειρώμενος τοῦ Ἱπποκράτους τῆς ῥώμης*] "with a view of testing his determination;" *ῥώμη* occurs in this sense, Thuc. ii. 43. vii. 18. and the verb *ῥώννυμι*, ii. 8. iv. 72.—*τελῶν* is the future, as usual after *ἰέναι*, *ἔρχεσθαι*, &c. So 311 E. *ἐρχόμεθα τελοῦντες τὰ χρήματα*. 313 A. *οἶσθα εἰς οἷόν τινα κίνδυνον ἔρχει ὑποθήσων τὴν ψυχήν*.—*ὡς παρὰ τίνα...γενησόμενος*] "In what capacity do you mean to attend him, and what do you expect to become?"—*ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἐπενόεις...εἴ τίς σε ἤρετο...τί ἂν ἀπεκρίνω*] "Triplici etiam εἰ in protasi Menon. p. 74 B. *εἴ τίς σε ἀνέροιτο τοῦτο ὃ νῦν δὴ ἐγὼ ἔλεγον, τί ἐστι σχῆμα, ὦ Μένων; εἰ αὐτῷ εἶπες ὅτι στρογγυλότης, εἴ σοι εἶπεν ἅπερ ἐγώ, πότερον σχῆμα ἡ στρογγυλότης ἐστὶν ἢ σχῆμά τι, εἶπες δήπου ἂν ὅτι σχῆμά τι*." Heindorf. The change of tenses should here be remarked: "intending" is a continuous action, expressed by the imperfect; whereas "asking" and "answering" are momentary, and the aorist is used. Comp. 313 A. 357 D. Jelf,

§ 401. 4.—*ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ*] In the use of this phrase, as of *κἂν εἰ*, two constructions are to be noticed: (1) A verb follows to which *ἂν* can be referred: in this case *ἂν* is generally repeated, and the first *ἂν* serves merely to prepare the mind for the conditional character of the sentence. Thus we have *τί ἂν ἀπεκρίνω* here: compare below 318 B. (*κἂν εἰ* and *ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ*), 353 D. *κἂν εἰ...παρασκευάζει ...ὅμως δ' ἂν κακὰ ἦν*. Jelf, §§ 430, 432. (2) Where no such verb follows, the construction is elliptical: see on 328 A. and compare 341 C. 343 E. 346 D.

D. *ἂν μὲν ἐξικνῆται...προσαναλίσκοντες*] "If our own funds go far enough, and we can persuade him by their means, *spending them only*; but if they fall short, spending our friends' money also." That the ellipse must be supplied in this manner was first shewn by Heindorf.—*εἰ οὖν τις...ἔροιτο*] The change to the optative from the *εἴ τις ἤρετο* of former questions is worth noticing: it indicates the substitution of a possible for an impossible case. See below on 335 C.—*εἰπέ μοι, ὦ Σώκρατές τε καὶ Ἱππ.*] Compare Euthyd. 283 B. *εἰπέ μοι, ὦ Σώκρατές τε καὶ ὑμεῖς οἱ ἄλλοι*. Lach. 186 E. *σὺ δ', ὦ Λάχης καὶ Νικία, εἴπετον ἡμῖν ἑκάτερος*. On the contrary, Sympos. 188 B. *καὶ γὰρ πάχναι καὶ χάλαζαι καὶ ἐρυσῖβαι ἐκ πλεονεξίας καὶ ἀκοσμίας περὶ ἄλληλα τῶν τοιούτων γίγνεται ἐρωτικῶν...* an instance of the so-called "schema Pindaricum."

E. *τί ὄνομα, ἄλλο γε λεγόμενον*] "what *distinct* name," corresponding to *ἀγαλματοποιὸς* &c.——*ἀγαλματοποιόν*] Heindorf remarks that *τὸ ὄνομα τὸν ἀγαλματοποιὸν* would be more idiomatic, e.g. Crat. 402 D. *ἐκ τούτων τῶν ὀνομάτων ἡ Τηθὺς τὸ ὄνομα σύγκειται*. Sometimes, however, as in this place, *ὄνομα* is not repeated. Crat. 392 B. *Πότερον οἴει Ὅμηρον ὀρθότερον ἡγεῖσθαι τῶν ὀνομάτων κεῖσθαι τῷ παιδί, τὸν Ἀστυάνακτα ἢ τὸν Σκαμάνδριον.*

Σοφιστήν] For a full discussion of the character and reputation of the Sophists see Mr Grote's History, ch. 67, and an able critique on some of Grote's positions, by Mr Cope, in the Journal of Classical and Sacred Philology, Vol. I. 145–188. From their pages I extract the definition of a Sophist, as given by Xenophon, Plato, and Aristotle; all, it must be borne in mind, representing the one-sided judgment of philosophers. Xen. Memor. I. 6. 13. *καὶ τὴν σοφίαν ὡσαύτως τοὺς μὲν ἀργυρίου τῷ βουλομένῳ πωλοῦντας, σοφιστὰς ὥσπερ πόρνους ἀποκαλοῦσιν*. Plat. Soph. 268 C. *μιμητὴς δ' ὢν τοῦ σοφοῦ δῆλον ὅτι παρώνυμον αὐτοῦ τι λήψεται, καὶ σχεδὸν ἤδη μεμάθηκα ὅτι τοῦτον δεῖ προσειπεῖν ἀληθῶς αὐτὸν ἐκεῖνον τὸν παντάπασιν ὄντως σοφιστήν*. Arist. de Soph. Elench. c. 1. *ἔστι γὰρ ἡ σο-*

φιστικὴ φαινομένη σοφία, οὖσα δ' οὔ, καὶ ὁ σοφιστὴς χρηματιστὴς ἀπὸ φαινομένης σοφίας ἀλλ' οὐκ οὔσης. The present passage, which has not, so far as I am aware, been brought forward by either of the above writers, appears to me to have a twofold bearing on this much vexed question. On the one hand, the Sophist belongs as much to a recognised *profession* as the statuary or poet; on the other hand, that profession is not an honourable one, as even the would-be pupil of Protagoras, Hippocrates, is constrained to admit (εἴπερ γε ἃ διανοοῦμαι χρὴ λέγειν). May we not suppose that, as professors of Rhetoric, the Sophists enjoyed a large share of popularity, qualified by a large, perhaps an equal, amount of adverse public opinion? This divided state of the feeling towards them would be the natural result of their teaching, attractive as it was to the young, and not positively immoral, while at the same time it arrayed against itself all the conservative tendencies and all the philosophic earnestness of the age. [See also the passages from Mr Mill's Review of Grote's Plato (Dissertations and Discussions, III. 308. foll.) quoted in the preface.]—ὀνομάζουσα...εἶναι] See Wagner on Apol. 23 A. ὄνομα δὲ τοῦτο λέγεσθαι σοφὸς εἶναι—Εἰ οὖν...παρὰ τὸν Πρωταγόραν] sc. τί ἂν φαίης; as in Phaedr. 268 B, C. Crat. 392 C.

312 ὑπέφαινέ τι ἡμέρας] Heindorf cites Xen. Anab. IV. 3. 9. ὡς τάχιστα ἕως ὑπέφαινε, and ibid. iv. 2. 7. Cyrop. IV. 5. 14. ἐπεὶ δὲ ἡμέρα ὑπέφαινε. But these instances do not prove his assertion that ὑποφαίνει is used absolutely.—Εἰς τοὺς Ἕλληνας] Comp. 348 E. σεαυτὸν ὑποκηρυξάμενος εἰς πάντας τοὺς Ἕλληνας. Tim. 25 B. εἰς ἅπαντας ἀνθρώπους διαφανὴς τῇ ἀρετῇ. Sympos. 179 B. ἱκανὴν μαρτυρίαν παρέχεται ὑπὲρ τοῦδε τοῦ λόγου εἰς τοὺς Ἕλληνας.—σαυτὸν] Bekker and most recent editors read thus, but the best MSS. all have αὐτὸν, which I retained in the former edition, and should not have altered. Comp. Phaedo 91 C. ὅπως μὴ ἐγὼ...ἑαυτόν τε καὶ ὑμᾶς ἐξαπατήσας...οἰχήσομαι. Soph. Trach. 451. εἰ δ' αὐτὸς αὑτὸν ὧδε παιδεύεις...with Hermann's note. Jelf. § 654 b.—ἀλλ' ἄρα ...ὑπολαμβάνεις] ἀλλ' ἄρα is "but after all" (Apol. 25 A. Euthyd. 290 E.), and the question commences at μὴ οὐ τοιαύτην ὑπολαμβάνεις, well rendered by Stallbaum, "numquid non talem putas?" The μὴ and the οὐ must be kept distinct, and the latter joined closely with τοιαύτην. Cf. Phaedo 67 B. μὴ καθαρῷ γὰρ καθαροῦ ἐφάπτεσθαι μὴ οὐ θεμιτὸν ᾖ. Meno 89 C. μὴ τοῦτο οὐ καλῶς ὡμολογήσαμεν; Sympos. 194 C. ἀλλὰ μὴ οὐχ οὗτοι ἡμεῖς ὦμεν. See also Riddell, § 138.

B. *ἡ παρὰ τοῦ γραμματιστοῦ, κ.τ.λ.*] The three branches of Athenian education, *γράμματα, μουσική, γυμναστική*. Compare below, 326 A. sqq. Pseudo-Plat. Theag. 122 E. Xen. Lacon. II. 1. Aristotle (Pol. VIII. 3. 7) adds as a fourth branch *γραφική*, drawing.—*ἐπὶ τέχνῃ*] "with a view to practising it as a profession," opp. to *ἐπὶ παιδείᾳ*. Cf. 315 A. So *ἰδιώτης* throughout this dialogue is "a non-professional person," (opp. *σοφιστής*, Soph. 221 D.) and *ἰδιωτεύειν*, below 326 E, is opposed to *ἐπαΐειν*, "to have a professional knowledge of a subject," 314 A. 327 C. The student may refer with profit to a note of Dr Thompson on Gorg. 455 B, on the "oft-recurring distinction of *δημιουργὸς* and *ἰδιώτης*, equivalent in the time of Plato to that between professional and unprofessional, clerk and layman, the learned and the vulgar."—*τοιαύτῃ* "of the latter kind."

IV. C. *θαυμάζοιμ' ἂν εἰ οἶσθα.*] Plato's usual construction, e. g. 315 E. 336 C. *θαυμάζοιμ' ἂν εἴ τῳ ἀνθρώπων παραχωρεῖ.* This 4th chapter is a good example of Socrates' dialectic method on a small scale: his opponent is at once brought to acknowledge that he knows nothing about the meaning of the term he employs, in this case *σοφιστής*.—*ὥσπερ τοὔνομα λέγει*] The speaker derives *σοφιστὴς* from *σοφὸς* and *εἰδέναι*, as if *ὁ τῶν σοφῶν ἴστης*. The true derivation, it is almost needless to add, is *σοφίζω*, "to make wise," and the idea conveyed is that of "teaching," not of "knowing." On this whole class of words in *-τής* Mr Cope has some good remarks, p. 182.—*τῶν σοφῶν*] The neuter throughout this chapter, as in Theaet. 157 C. *παρατίθημι ἑκάστων τῶν σοφῶν ἀπογεύσασθαι...* where it has been mistaken for the masculine.

D. *τῶν τι σοφῶν εἰσὶν οἱ ζωγρ. ἐπ.*] "What is the object of (*circa quam rem versentur*, Steph.) those wise things in which painters are skilled." For the position of *τί*, cf. Gorg. 449 A. *τίνα σε χρὴ καλεῖν ὡς τίνος ἐπιστήμονα τέχνης*; Sympos. 206 B. *τῶν τίνα τρόπον διωκόντων αὐτό*. Pseudo-Plat. Theag. 125 B, *εἰ ἠρόμεθα τῶν τί σοφῶν*; ibid. C. *Τῶν τί σοφῶν λέγεις, ὦ Εὐριπίδη*; See also Jelf § 883. 2, and for the construction *σοφός τι*, § 579. 2.—*καὶ τἆλλα οὕτως*] "Intelligi potest *ἔχει*." Stallb. Rather, I should think, *εἴποιμεν ἄν*, and so in p. 319 B, the words *καὶ τἆλλα πάντα οὕτως* are dependent upon *ὁρῶ* preceding.—*τί ἂν ἀποκριναίμεθα*] This necessary correction was first made by Bekker. C. F. Hermann, however, defends *ἀποκρινοίμεθα*, the reading of all the MSS., "Nimirum ut aoristis *ἔροιτο* et *εἴποιμεν* respondeat; at præsens his eo facilius admiscebitur, quod ipsi praesentibus carent."—*ἐπιστάτην*

τοῦ π.δ.λ.] Another instance of the weakness of the ancients in etymology: there is evidently a confusion between the senses of ἐπιστάτης and ἐπιστήμων. Cf. Crat. 414 E. τὸ μέτριον, οἶμαι, δεῖ φυλάττειν καὶ τὸ εἰκὸς σὲ τὸν σοφὸν ἐπιστάτην.

E. ἢ δῆλον ὅτι] Compare the opening words of the dialogue, ἢ δῆλα δὴ ὅτι...Here ἢ is not in the MSS. and was first added by Heindorf. τὸν μαθητὴν ποιεῖ] sc. ἐπιστήμονα. Sympos. 196 E. ποιητὴς ὁ θεὸς σοφὸς οὕτως, ὥστε καὶ ἄλλων ποιῆσαι, sc. σοφόν. Comp. below 348 E.

313 πολλὰ ἂν περιεσκέψω] See the note on 311 B. The construction returns to the imperfect immediately afterwards, τούς τε φίλους ἂν παρεκάλεις.—εἴτ' ἐπιτρεπτέον εἴτε οὔ] In the second member of a *dependent* disjunctive sentence (utrum...necne) the negative may be either οὐ or μή. See just below and compare Rep. 451 D. σκοπῶμεν, ἡμῖν πρέπει ἢ οὔ with Rep. I. 339 A. εἰ δὲ ἀληθὴς ἢ μή, πειράσομαι μαθεῖν. If the sentence is *independent*, (sive... sive non) μὴ only is used. Sympos. 200 D. ἐπεὶ ἐν τῷ γε νῦν παρόντι, εἴτε βούλει εἴτε μή, ἔχεις.—ὃ δὲ...τὴν ψυχὴν] For the epexegesis τὴν ψυχήν, and the return to the neuter pronoun ἐν ᾧ, compare Rep. IX. 583 E. ὃ μεταξὺ ἄρα νῦν δὴ ἀμφοτέρων ἔφαμεν εἶναι, τὴν ἡσυχίαν, τοῦτό ποτε ἀμφότερα ἔσται, λύπη τε καὶ ἡδονή, and more in Heind. and Stallb. on Gorg. 483 A.—καὶ ἐν ᾧ πάντ' ἐστὶ κ.τ.λ.] "and on which your all depends whether for good or ill success, according as it turns out healthy or unhealthy." Cf. Eur. Alcest. 278. ἐν σοὶ δ' ἐσμὲν καὶ ζῆν καὶ μή. Iph. T. 1057. Ar. Ach. 474. infra 356 C. ἐν τούτῳ ἡμῖν ἦν τὸ εὖ πράττειν. Plato regularly uses χρηστὸς and πονηρὸς of bodily or mental health. See below 313 D. 326 B. Theaet. 167 B. ἀλλ' οἶμαι, πονηρᾷ ψυχῆς ἕξει δοξάζοντα συγγενῆ αὐτοῖς χρηστὴ ἐποίησε δοξάσαι ἕτερα τοιαῦτα.—περὶ δὲ τούτου] On the repetition of δὲ "in apodosi" I need only refer to Buttmann's Midias, Excurs. XII. Other instances in Plato are infra 325 C. Phaedo 78 C. τὰ δὲ ἄλλοτ' ἄλλως καὶ μηδέποτε κατὰ ταὐτά, ταῦτα δὲ εἶναι τὰ ξύνθετα. ibid. 80 D. 81 B. 113 E. 114 A. &c.

B. ὄρθριος ἥκων] So Homer, Il. I. 423. χθιζὸς ἔβη κατὰ δαῖτα, and elsewhere.—πάντως συνεστέον] πάντως is "at all events," "in any case," "come what may," its usual sense in Plato. συνεστέον appears to be a solitary instance of the verbal adjective from εἰμὶ or any of its compounds. On συνεῖναι Ast remarks, "tam de discipulo quam de magistro usurpatur:" see below 316 C. 318 A. and the note on συγγίγνεσθαι, 309 D.—οὔτε διείλεξαι] Above, 310 E.

C. Ἆρ' οὖν] Est "nonne," ut sexcenties. Stallb. —ἔμπορός τις. ἢ κάπηλος] The difference between ἔμπορος the wholesale, and κάπηλος the retail dealer, is explained Rep. II. 371 D. ἢ οὐ καπήλους καλοῦμεν τοὺς πρὸς ὠνήν τε καὶ πρᾶσιν διακονοῦντας, ἱδρυμένους ἐν ἀγορᾷ, τοὺς δὲ πλανήτας ἐπὶ τὰς πόλεις ἐμπόρους; Soph. 223 D. τῆς μεταβλητικῆς οὐχ ἡ μὲν κατὰ πόλιν ἀλλαγή, σχεδὸν αὐτῆς ἥμισυ μέρος ὄν, καπηλικὴ προσαγορεύεται; Ναί. Τὸ δέ γε ἐξ ἄλλης εἰς ἄλλην πόλιν διαλλαττόμενον ὠνῇ καὶ πράσει ἐμπορική; Τί δ' οὔ; Compare Polit. 260 C. Legg. VIII. 849 D. Pseudo-Dem. adv. Aristog. I. p. 784. § 57. εἰ δὲ κάπηλός ἐστι πονηρίας καὶ παλιγκάπηλος καὶ μεταβολεύς· and the Scholiast on Ar. Plut. 1156.—ὅπως γε μὴ...ἐξαπατήσῃ] Dawes, as is well known, has laid down that ὅπως is never joined with an aorist *of the same form as the future* (this I believe to be the clearest mode of stating his rule), i. e. with the aor. 1 act. or middle; and that wherever the MSS. exhibit such aorists, they are to be altered into the corresponding futures. Bekker therefore, whom Sauppe alone follows, reads ἐξαπατήσει, contrary to all the MSS. But Heindorf had already remarked that he could not venture to do so, "admodum dubitans de veritate præcepti illius Dawesiani," and had cited instances of the aorist, which it was impossible to correct, from Xen. Cyrop. VII. 5. 82. Ar. Eccl. 117. In the latter passage indeed, ὅπως προμελετήσαιμεν is now read, but in many more of the Attic Drama the metre forbids any alteration. It is now generally agreed that Dawes was wrong in attempting to reduce all the passages to a Procrustean standard, though in such cases the future was undoubtedly *preferred*. "The difference between the two forms doubtless is, that the fut. ind. represents the proposed end as something existing in fut. time, the aor. conj. as something of which the future realisation is only conceived, but without any notion of its actually existing." Jelf, Gr. Gr. § 812, where Dawes' canon is fully discussed, and the ellipse, as in the present instance, of ὅρα before ὅπως, illustrated.

D. ὧν ἄγουσιν ἀγωγίμων] The antecedent to ὧν is ὅ τι following, and so just below ἀγνοοῦσιν ὧν πωλοῦσιν ὅ τι χρ. ἢ πον., not τούτων ὧν πωλοῦσιν.—ὡς δ' αὔτως] This is more Attic than ὡσαύτως δέ. cf. Phaedo. 102 E. (ubi v. Stallbaum.) Polit. 310 D. Xen. Anab. v. 6. 9. But the other form also occurs, Gorg. 460 E. Sympos. 186 E.

E. τυγχάνει ἐπιστήμων τούτων] Heindorf would insert ὢν after ἐπιστήμων. But the participle is omitted, Phaedr. 263 D. Gorg.

502 B. Rep. II. 369 B. Porson is therefore wrong on Hec. 782, where he follows the authority of Phrynichus, and has been corrected by Hermann, Elmsley and others.—*μὴ περὶ τοῖς φιλτάτοις... κινδυνεύῃς*] "take care that you do not stake your dearest objects upon the hazard of a die." A proverbial expression: see Stallbaum. In *κυβεύῃς τε καὶ κινδυνεύῃς* there is a hendiadys. After *περὶ* we should rather have expected a genitive of the object risked, as in the phrases *περιδίδομαι περὶ τῆς κεφαλῆς*, Ar. Eq. 791. *περίδου μοι περὶ θυμητιδᾶν ἁλῶν*, Ar. Ach. 772; and so with *κινδυνεύω*, Herod. VIII. 74, and with *κυβεύω*, Xen. Hell. VI. 3. 16. Riddell § 127 translates *περὶ* "in the sphere of," comparing Phaedo 114 D, *θαρρεῖν χρὴ περὶ τῇ ἑαυτοῦ ψυχῇ ἄνδρα.* The phrase *τὰ φίλτατα* is used literally, Legg. I. 650 A. *ἐπιτρέποντα αὑτοῦ θυγατέρας τε καὶ υἱεῖς καὶ γυναῖκα, οὕτως ἐν τοῖς φιλτάτοις κινδυνεύσαντα ἦθος ψυχῆς θεάσασθαι·* metaphorically, of the soul, here and in Gorg. 513 A. *σὺν τοῖς φιλτάτοις ἡ αἵρεσις ἡμῖν ἔσται,* where see Dr Thompson's note. Observe how the preposition is varied in these three instances: the use of *σὺν* especially in the last passage is curious, "with *risk or damage to* what ought to be dearest to us."

314 *παρὰ τοῦ καπήλου*] This is Heindorf's correction for *παρά του κ.*, adopted by most succeeding editors; he remarks that the article is used as in modern languages. So *τὸν ἐπαΐοντα* just below.—*καταθέμενον οἴκαδε*] "take them home and lay them down." Cf. on 310 A. In the later Attic *οἴκαδε* has sometimes the meaning of *οἴκοι*, Lobeck Phryn. p. 44,—but never, so far as I am aware, in Plato.—*τὸν ἐπαΐοντα*] "the physician," one who "has a professional knowledge" on the subject of meats and drinks; cf. on 312 B.

B. *καταθέντα τὴν τιμὴν*] This verb is used especially of ready money payments. For Protagoras' account of his own practice in this respect, see below, 328 B.—*ἔτι νέοι, ὥστε*] Cf. Eur. Androm. 80. *γέρων γ' ἐκεῖνος ὥστε σ' ὠφελεῖν παρών.* Xen. Cyrop. IV. 5. 15, *ὀλίγοι ἐσμὲν ὥστε ἐγκρατεῖς εἶναι αὐτῶν.* Xen. Memor. III. 13. 3. *ψυχρόν, ἔφη, ὥστε λούσασθαι ἐστίν.* We need not take *νέοι ὥστε* as =*νεώτεροι ἢ ὥστε*, and so on; see Heindorf's notes, and Ast on Phædr. 250 A, who remarks: "in his locis *ὥστε* nihil aliud est nisi gerundii periphrasis, ut *ὥστε διελέσθαι ad explicandum, ὥστε λούσασθαι ad lavandum.*" The other view is adhered to in Jelf, § 863. 2. obs. 3. Translate: "we are still rather young (or 'full young,' not 'too young') to explain so great a matter." A frequent sense both of *διαιρεῖν* and *διαιρεῖσθαι*, e. g. 339 A.—*Ἱππίας ὁ*

Ἠλεῖος] The conceit and ostentation of this Sophist are fully brought out in this Dialogue, and in the two which bear his name. See especially Hipp. Maj. 285 sqq. and compare Grote, VIII. 513—521.—*οἶμαι δὲ καὶ Πρόδικον τὸν Κεῖον*] The ellipse of *αὐτόθι εἶναι* is obvious enough. Heindorf refers to Lach. 180 A. Euthyphr. 3 E. Sympos. 176 A. Xen. Sympos. VIII. 7. For the character of Prodicus, compare Grote, p. 511—513.

VI. C. *Δόξαν ἡμῖν ταῦτα*] Xen. Anab. IV. 1. 13. *δόξαν δὲ ταῦτα, ἐκήρυξαν οὕτω ποιεῖν.* On the contrary, Xen. Hell. III. 2. 19. *δόξαντα δὲ ταῦτα καὶ περανθέντα, τὰ μὲν στρατεύματα ἀπῆλθεν.* See Jelf, § 384, where the principle is explained. Riddell's Digest, § 8. —*ἐπιστάντες...ἐνέπεσεν*] "we stopped to discuss a question which had arisen between us on the way." Cf. Phileb. 64 C. *ἐπὶ μὲν τοῖς τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ προθύροις καὶ τῆς οἰκήσεως ἐφεστάναι.* Legg. VII. 799 D. *ἀτόπου γὰρ τὰ νῦν ἐμπεπτωκότος λόγου.*—*διαπεραινόμενοι οὕτως ἐσίομεν*] Compare 310 D. *ἀναστὰς οὕτω δεῦρο ἐπορευόμην.* The phrases *περαίνειν λόγον* and *περαίνεσθαι λόγον* are used indifferently: see Heind. on Phaedr. 263 E.—*δοκεῖ οὖν μοι*] "Now if I remember right." Theaet. 142 C. *δοκεῖ γάρ μοι ὀλίγον πρὸ τοῦ θανάτου ἐντυχεῖν αὐτῷ*, cf. 144 D. infra 315 E. 330 E. Sympos. 173 B. Euthyd. 273 A. Charm. 162 C.; and for the omission of *ὡς*, Stallb. on Gorg. 460 A. Ast. on Phaedr. 278 C.

D. *κινδυνεύει...ἄχθεσθαι τοῖς φοιτῶσιν*] "I dare say he is annoyed at all who come." This use of *κινδυνεύω*, so common in Plato, is only found once in Herodotus, IV. 105, twice in Thucydides, IV. 117, VI. 87, and about as often in Demosthenes. The technical sense of *φοιτᾶν*, "ludum frequentare," occurs below, 326 C; it is here simply "frequentare."—"Ἔα est vocula mirantis et indignantis. v. Valcken. ad Eur. Hippol. 905." Stallbaum.—*οὐ σχολὴ αὐτῷ*] "My master is engaged:" a frequent use of *αὐτός*, exemplified in the *αὐτὸς ἔφα* of the Pythagoreans. Rep. I. 327 B. *ἠρόμην ὅπου αὐτὸς εἴη.* Ar. Nub. 218—220. *φέρε γὰρ τίς οὗτος οὑπὶ τῆς κρεμάθρας ἀνήρ;* | ΜΑΘ. *αὐτός.* ΣΤΡ. *τίς αὐτός;* ΜΑΘ. *Σωκράτης.* ΣΤΡ. *ὦ Σώκρατες.* | *ἴθ᾽ οὗτος, ἀναβόησον αὐτόν μοι μέγα.* Ar. Fragm. 261. *ἀνοιγέτω τις δώματ᾽· αὐτὸς ἔρχεται.* Theophr. Char. II. *καὶ τοὺς ἅπαντας ἐπιστῆναι κελεῦσαι, ἕως ἂν αὐτὸς παρέλθῃ.* cf. Cic. N. D. 1. 5. —*ἀμφοῖν τοῖν χεροῖν*] This is more Attic than the old reading *ταῖν χεροῖν.* Thus in Legg. X. 898 A. the MSS. and Edd. give *τούτοιν δὴ τοῖν κινήσεοιν* without any variety of reading. Compare Jelf, § 388. 3.—*τὴν θύραν...ἐπήραξε*] "slammed the door quite impatiently, as hard as he could." The words *ὡς οἷός τ᾽ ἦν* are parenthetical.

ἐγκεκλῃμένης] So Bekk. Sauppe, Krosch. for the reading of the MSS. ἐγκεκλειμένης or -εισμένης. Comp. Dr. Thompson on Phaedr. 251 D. who remarks, "It is now pretty generally acknowledged that κλῄω, κλῄσω, κέκλῃκα, &c. are the true and only Attic forms." I like Hirschig's συγ- for ἐγ- better than most of his conjectures: συγκλείω would at least be the more usual word: but the text may stand.

E. εἰσάγγειλον οὖν] Xen. Sympos. I. 11. Φίλιππος δ' ὁ γελωτοποιὸς κρούσας τὴν θύραν, εἶπε τῷ ὑπακούσαντι εἰσαγγεῖλαι.—μόγις ποτέ] "ægre tandem, vix tandem." Stallb. Nothing can be more gratuitous than Hirschig's conjecture, μόγις πως.

VII. ἐν τῷ προστῴῳ] The πρόστωον appears to have been a portico running round the four sides of the inner court. The side opposite the entrance is τὸ κατ' ἀντικρὺ πρόστωον (315 C.), and the ταμεῖον (ibid. D.) or storeroom adjoins one of the porticoes: cf. Ar. Eccl. 14.—ἑξῆς δ' αὐτῷ] Jelf, § 593. 2.—ἐκ τοῦ ἐπὶ θάτερα] The phrase occurs Thuc. VII. 37, and ἐκ τοῦ ἐπ' ἀριστερά, Euthyd. 297 C. These instances support Arnold's view of the passage in Thuc. I. 2. ἐκ τοῦ ἐπὶ πλεῖστον...ἀστασίαστον οὖσαν, whereby the harshness of making ἐκ τοῦ οὖσαν equivalent to ἐκ τοῦ εἶναι is avoided.—ὁ ὁμομήτριος] Plut. Pericl. 165 D. ἦν μὲν αὐτῷ (τῷ Περικλεῖ) γυνὴ προσήκουσα μὲν κατὰ γένος, συνῳκηκυῖα δ' Ἱππονίκῳ πρότερον, ἐξ οὗ Καλλίαν ἔτεκε τὸν πλούσιον· ἔτεκε δὲ καὶ παρὰ τῷ Περικλεῖ Ξάνθιππον καὶ Πάραλον.

315 Χαρμίδης ὁ Γλαύκωνος] His intimacy with Socrates appears from the dialogue which bears his name, and from Sympos. 222 B.—ἐπὶ τέχνῃ μανθάνει] See on 312 B. The words following, ὡς σοφιστὴς ἐσόμενος, bring out the meaning still more clearly.—τὸ μὲν πολὺ ξένοι] The apodosis, as frequently happens, is not the nearest δέ, but ἦσαν δέ τινες καὶ τῶν ἐπιχωρίων. Compare, for the fact here recorded of the Sophists, Protagoras' own words, p. 316 C. and the note there.

B. "I was particularly amused to see how careful they were never to get into the way of Protagoras, but whenever he and his party turned, how gracefully and regularly these anxious listeners parted to the right and left, and, wheeling round every time, fell in behind him in the nicest manner possible." ἐπειδὴ ἀναστρέφοι is the same as ὁπότε ἀναστρέφοι, the optative alone expressing the frequency of the action. Cf. Jelf, § 419, 1.—Τὸν δὲ μέτ' εἰσενόησα] βίην Ἡρακληείην, Od. XI. 601. In this playful introduction of the words of Homer there may perhaps be a sly comparison of the Sophists and their teaching with Homer's ghosts whom they did

their best to resemble, by maintaining the identity of "being" and "seeming to be."—ἔφη Ὅμηρος] The usual formula of quotation, ὡς being omitted. Meno 76 D. ἐκ τούτων δὴ σύνες ὅ τι λέγω, ἔφη Πίνδαρος. Theaet. 170 E. μάλα μυρίοι δῆτα, φησὶν Ὅμηρος. Legg. I. 630 B. φράζει Τυρταῖος.

C. Ἐρυξίμαχος ὁ Ἀκουμενοῦ] Both father and son were celebrated physicians, and the latter a friend of Phaedrus, Phaedr. 268 A, and an interlocutor in Plato's Symposium.—πολῖταί τε αὐτοῦ] Those from Elis, the countrymen of Hippias.—περὶ φύσεώς τε καὶ τῶν μετεώρων] Compare 318 E. Hipp. Maj. 285 B. Hipp. Min. 367 E. The physical and astronomical pursuits of Sophists and philosophers were contemptuously called μετέωρα, high-flown speculations. Polit. 299 B. μετεωρόλογον, ἀδολέσχην τινὰ σοφιστήν. Amat. 132 B. ἀδολεσχοῦσι μὲν οὖν οὗτοι περὶ τῶν μετεώρων καὶ φλυαροῦσι φιλοσοφοῦντες. So of Protagoras, Eupolis in Κόλαξι (fr. 159 Meineke) ἔνδοθι μέν ἐστι Πρωταγόρας ὁ Τήϊος, | ὃς ἀλαζονεύεται μὲν ἀλιτήριος | περὶ τῶν μετεώρων. Socrates himself did not escape the charge: Apol. 18 B. κατηγόρουν ἐμοῦ μᾶλλον οὐδὲν ἀληθές, ὡς ἔστι τις Σωκράτης, σοφὸς ἀνήρ, τά τε μετέωρα φροντιστής. cf. 23 D. Ar. Nub. 228.

D. Καὶ μὲν δὴ καὶ Τάνταλόν γε εἰσεῖδον] Od. XI. 582. καὶ μὴν Τάνταλον εἰσεῖδον. There is perhaps an allusion to the avarice of Prodicus. Crat. 384 B. εἰ μὲν οὖν ἐγὼ ἤδη ἀκηκόη παρὰ Προδίκου τὴν πεντηκοντάδραχμον ἐπίδειξιν.—ἐπεδήμει γὰρ ἄρα] "for in fact Prodicus was staying there;" or better, perhaps, with Stallbaum, "had arrived in Athens," as above, 309 D. 310 E. The combination γὰρ ἄρα is illustrated by Heindorf from Rep. IV. 438 A. Legg. III. 698 D. Sympos. 205 B.—ἐγκεκαλυμμένος] Compare Ar. Nub. 10. ἐν πέντε σισύραις ἐγκεκορδυλημένος. | ἀλλ' εἰ δοκεῖ, ῥέγκωμεν ἐγκεκαλυμμένοι. The force of καὶ in καὶ μάλα is intensive or *epitatic*, as in καὶ πάνυ, καὶ πολύς, καὶ ἄρτι, &c. Cf. Theaet. 142 D. τούς τε λόγους οὓς διελέχθη αὐτῷ διηγήσατο, καὶ μάλα ἀξίους ἀκοῆς. Phaedr. 265 A. καὶ μάλ' ἀνδρικῶς. Polit. 291 A. καὶ μάλα τινὰς ἀτόπους. Rep. III. 413 C. καὶ μάλ' εἰκότως ὀκνεῖν.—Παυσανίας τε ὁ ἐκ Κ.] Pausanias and Agathon are both characters in Plato's Symposium, and the former in Xenophon's also. Both wrote tragedies, Schol. Plat. ad Sympos. init.—μειράκιον...καλός.] The figure πρὸς τὸ σημαινόμενον, like παιδικὰ τυγχάνει ὤν. Compare Theaet. 146 B. ἀλλὰ τῶν μειρακίων τινὰ κέλευέ σοι ἀποκρίνεσθαι. Lysias, Orat. III. p. 99, § 32. ἐξέπλευσα ἐκ τῆς πόλεως ἔχων τὸ μειράκιον· ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἀφικόμην, πάλιν ἦγον αὐτόν, κ.τ.λ.

E. *ἔδοξα ἀκοῦσαι*] See on 314 C. *δοκεῖ οὖν μοι, ὁ θυρωρός, κ.τ.λ.*—*τοῦτ' οὖν*] This, for the common reading *τοῦτο τ' ἦν*, is supported only by a single MS., a *manu secundâ*, but is preferred by Heindorf, Schleiermacher, and the Zurich editors. It seems doubtful whether *ἦν* could be used for *παρῆν*.—*τὼ 'Αδειμάντω*] Of the son of Cepis nothing is known; the other is mentioned, Xen. Hell. I. 4. 21: his unpopularity is alluded to in Ar. Ran. 1513, *μετ' 'Αδειμάντου τοῦ Λευκολόφου | κατὰ γῆς ταχέως ἀποπέμψω.*—*λιπαρῶς ἔχων*] *ἐπιμελῶς, προσεδρευτικῶς.* Schol. Compare 335 B.

316 *ὡς φῇς σὺ καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι*] Cf. Rep. IV. 424 C. *ὥς φησί τε Δάμων καὶ ἐγὼ πείθομαι.* VII. 530 D. *ὡς οἵ τε Πυθαγόρειοι φασί, καὶ ἡμεῖς, ὦ Γλαύκων, συγχωροῦμεν.* Sympos. 186 E.—*'Αλκιβιάδης... Κριτίας ὁ Καλλαίσχρου.*] His friendship with Alcibiades and Critias was laid as a crime to Socrates by his accusers; the latter, as one of the Thirty Tyrants, had taken the lead in all their acts of cruelty. Compare Xen. Memor. I. 2. 12.—*σμίκρ' ἄττα διατρίψαντες*] "Paullulum morati." Heind. Stallb. The words *σμίκρ. ἄττα* do not prove that *διατρίψαντες* includes the notion of conversing, as at 311 E. Compare Rep. III. 404 A. *καὶ ἐὰν σμικρὰ ἐκβῶσι τῆς τεταγμένης διαίτης.* VII. 527 A. *ὅσοι καὶ σμικρὰ γεωμετρίας ἔμπειροι.* Legg. IV. 713 A. *ἆρ' οὖν μύθῳ σμικρά γ' ἔτι προσχρηστέον.* Æn. III. 610. haud *multa* moratus.

VIII. B. *πρὸς σέ τοι ἤλθομεν*] For *τοι* most MSS. give *τι*, which is retained by Bekker, and approved by Orellius; though it seems difficult to explain satisfactorily. The sense requires emphasis, not qualification. On the other hand, *τοι* after a pronoun has a well-known force in calling attention. Compare Ar. Plut. 1099. *σέ τοι λέγω, | ὦ Καρίων, ἀνάμεινον·* with more in Heindorf. Jelf, § 736. 2.—*τὴν φύσιν...ἡλικιώταις*] "He is considered, in point of natural ability, a fair match for the youth of his age."

C. *τοῦτο δὲ οἴεται οἱ μάλιστα γενέσθαι*] "that it *must* happen to him. The aorist without *ἂν* thus used for the future, expresses absolute certainty. Other instances in Plato are Phaedo 67 B. *πολλὴ ἐλπὶς ἀφικομένῳ οἷ ἐγὼ πορεύομαι, ἐκεῖ ἱκανῶς, εἴπερ που ἄλλοθι, κτήσασθαι*...where see Heindorf. ibid. 68 A. *οἷ ἀφικομένοις ἐλπίς ἐστιν οὗ διὰ βίου ἤρων τυχεῖν.* Sympos. 193 D. *εἰς τὸ ἔπειτα ἐλπίδας μεγίστας παρέχεται καταστήσας ἡμᾶς εἰς τὴν ἀρχαίαν φύσιν καὶ ἰασάμενος μακαρίους καὶ εὐδαίμονας ποιῆσαι.* Compare Jelf, § 403. 2.—*μόνος οἴει δεῖν, κ.τ.λ.*] The order of the words is *οἴει δεῖν διαλέγεσθαι μόνος πρὸς μόνους.* The use of the nominative needs no illustration.—*ξένον γὰρ ἄνδρα, κ.τ.λ.*] "Callide in postremis reticet,

quod addere poterat, χρήματα διδόντας. Apol. 19 E. τούτων ἕκαστος (Gorgias, Prodicus, Hippias, quos modo nominavit) οἷός τ' ἐστὶν ἰὼν εἰς ἑκάστην τῶν πόλεων τοὺς νέους, οἷς ἔξεστι τῶν ἑαυτῶν πολιτῶν προῖκα ξυνεῖναι ᾧ ἂν βούλωνται, τούτους πείθουσι τὰς ἐκείνων ξυνουσίας ἀπολιπόντας σφίσι ξυνεῖναι χρήματα διδόντας καὶ χάριν προσειδέναι, quæ Platoni sublegit ineptus ille imitator, qui Theagem dialogum confinxit, p. 128 A." Heindorf. Protagoras was dead when Socrates made his defence, and is therefore not included in the list.—ὀθνείων] "strangers," persons not related, here merely opposed to οἰκείων. Elsewhere ὀθνεῖος generally means "foreign:" but comp. Eur. Alc. 532. ὀθνεῖος, ἤ σοι συγγενὴς γεγῶσά τις;

D. τὸν ταῦτα πράττοντα] These words are added to make the sense clearer:—"he who does this, I say, must be cautious."—τὸ ἐπαχθὲς is "the odium," nearly = φθόνος.—Ἴκκος] Compare Legg. VIII. 839 E. The references to ancient writers are there collected by Ast.

E. Ἡρόδικος ὁ Σηλυμβριανὸς] Rep. III. 406 A. Phaedr. 227 D. Σηλυμβρία, rather than Σηλυβρία, is the form attested by inscriptions at Athens, as well as by the best MSS. of Plato. τὸ δὲ ἀρχαῖον Μεγαρεύς, "a native of Megara." He usually bore the name of his adopted country: thus Herodotus of Halicarnassus was called ὁ Θουριεύς, Epicharmus the Coan "Siculus." Hor. Ep. I. ii. 58. In the phrase οὐδένος ἥττων σοφιστής, οὐδένος is masculine, not neuter: comp. Xen. Memor. I. 5. 6. δουλεύειν δουλείαν οὐδεμιᾶς ἧττον αἰσχράν. Agathocles the musician is mentioned Lach. 180 D, Pythoclides Alcib. II. 118 C.—ὥσπερ λέγω] "as I said just now," as in Phaedo 58 C. τοῦτο δὲ ἔτυχεν, ὥσπερ λέγω, τῇ προτεραίᾳ τῆς δίκης γεγονός. Apol. 21 A. καί, ὅπερ λέγω, μὴ θορυβεῖτε.

317 κατὰ τοῦτο εἶναι] "on this point at least," i. e. his open assumption of the name of Sophist. τὸ κατὰ τοῦτο εἶναι would be more usual, as in the phrases τὸ νῦν εἶναι, τὸ σύμπαν εἶναι, &c., but the omission of the article is supported by Polit. 330 C. τὰ παρὰ τῶν εἰδότων εἰς δύναμιν εἶναι γέγραμμένα. Isæus de Menecl. hered. § 40. κατὰ δύναμιν εἶναι. In these cases εἶναι is not a mere pleonasm, but has a qualifying force nearly = γέ. So in ἑκὼν εἶναι.—ἡγοῦμαι γὰρ αὐτοὺς οὔ τι διαπράξασθαι] I believe that there are instances enough to justify Madvig's conclusion (Syntax, § 205 Eng. transl.), that after verbs of *thinking* the negative may be either οὐ or μή: though not, as he appears to hold, that οὐ is the more usual of the two. Comp. below 328 E. ἡγούμην οὐκ εἶναι ἀνθρωπίνην ἐπιμέλειαν, and the mixed construction at 319 B. where

see note. The difference of course is in the point of view, *οὐ* being used when the result is conceived of as independent of the speaker's mind; and in general this distinction does not affect the sense, though in particular cases the choice of particles is no doubt significant. For *οὔ τι*, "haudquaquam," comp. Phaedo 81 D. Phileb. 13 C. 52 A. Phaedr. 242 D. Rep. II. 358 C. V. 451 A.—*οὐ γὰρ λαθεῖν...προσχήματα*] "inasmuch as their secret was discovered by those able to manage state affairs, that is, by the very men to deceive whom these disguises were assumed." *πράττειν* is used absolutely, for *τὰ τῆς πόλεως πράγματα πράττειν*. Compare Dem. de Cor. p. 240. § 57. *τῶν μὲν ἐν τῷ πολιτεύεσθαι καὶ πράττειν δωροδοκούντων καὶ διαφθειρομένων ἐπὶ χρήμασι, τῶν δὲ κ.τ.λ.* Ar. Nub. 419. *νικᾶν πράττων καὶ βουλεύων καὶ τῇ γλώττῃ πολεμίζων*, and frequently in the Memorabilia.—*τὸ οὖν ἀποδιδράσκοντα...τοὺς ἀνθρώπους*] "Now when a man tries to escape, and instead of succeeding is caught in the act, there is great folly even (*καὶ*) in the attempt, and he cannot but increase men's ill-will towards him." For the construction compare Rep. I. 331 B. *τὸ γὰρ μηδὲ ἄκοντά τινα ἐξαπατῆσαι ἢ ψεύσασθαι,...μέγα μέρος εἰς τοῦτο ἡ τῶν χρημάτων κτῆσις συμβάλλεται.* The words *πολλὴ μωρία καὶ τοῦ ἐπιχειρήματος* will, I believe, enable us to correct a passage in the Laws, VII. 818 D. *ταῦτ' οὖν δὴ πάντα ὡς μὲν οὐκ ἀναγκαῖά ἐστι μαθήματα τῷ μέλλοντι σχεδὸν ὁτιοῦν τῶν καλλίστων μαθημάτων εἴσεσθαι, πολλὴ καὶ μωρία τοῦ διανοήματος.* This is the reading of modern edd. and of most MSS. instead of *πολλὴ ἡ μωρία*, as in the old editions: if we further transpose *μωρία καί*, as here, we shall have the proper emphasis on *διανοήματος*, "even in the notion."

B. *τούτων τὴν ἐναντίαν ἅπασαν*] "the direct opposite of theirs." Cf. Polit. 310 D. *δέον ποιεῖν ἀμφότερα τὰ γένη τούτων τοὐναντίον ἅπαν.*—*ἄλλας*] sc. *εὐλαβείας*, precautions.—*σὺν θεῷ εἰπεῖν*] "thank Heaven," a modest way of disclaiming merit. Theaet. 151 B. Legg. IX. 858 D. Ar. Plut. 114. *ξὺν θεῷ δ' εἰρήσεται.*

C. *εἰμὶ ἐν τῇ τέχνῃ*] "artem factito," or as we should say, "I have been in my profession." Compare below 319 C. Phaedo 59 A. *ὡς ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ ἡμῶν ὄντων.* Rep. VI. 489 B. *οἱ ἐπιεικέστατοι τῶν ἐν φιλοσοφίᾳ*, i.e. *τῶν φιλοσόφων·* and for the fact Meno 91 E. *οἶμαι γὰρ αὐτὸν ἀποθανεῖν ἐγγὺς καὶ ἑβδομήκοντα ἔτη γεγονότα, τετταράκοντα δὲ ἐν τῇ τέχνῃ ὄντα· καὶ ἐν ἅπαντι τῷ χρόνῳ τούτῳ ἔτι εἰς τὴν ἡμέραν ταυτηνὶ εὐδοκιμῶν οὐδὲν πέπαυται.*—*τὰ ξύμπαντα*] "Totius vitae anni." Heindorf.—*οὐδένος ὅτου οὐ πάντων...*] An inverse attraction, *οὐδείς* following the case of the relative *ὅστις*.

Compare Phaedo 117 D. *κλαίων καὶ ἀγανακτῶν οὐδένα ὅντινα οὐ κατέκλασε τῶν παρόντων.* Jelf, Gr. Gr. § 824. 1. 2. and see below on 323 C. For the pleonasm *πάντων*, cf. Dem. Leptin. p. 458. § 3. *οὐ γάρ ἐστιν ἐφ' ὅτῳ τοῦτο οὐ πεπόνθατε τῶν πάντων.* Hippias speaks of himself as much younger than Protagoras, Hipp. Maj. 282 E.—*περὶ τούτων ἁπάντων ἐναντίον*] *ἁπάντων* must be taken with *τῶν ἔνδον ὄντων*, not, as would appear at first sight, with *τούτων*. The involution is certainly a harsh one, but there is no doubt of the sense: the position of *ἁπάντων* may perhaps be emphatic, as Stallbaum suggests: "cum vi quadam praemissum."—*ἐνδείξασθαι καὶ καλλωπίσασθαι, ὅτι κ.τ.λ.*] "show off and plume himself on our having come as his admiring followers." Compare Theaet. 195 D. *καλλωπιζόμενος ὥς τι εὑρηκότων ἡμῶν καλόν.* Crito 52 C. *ἐκαλλωπίζου ὡς οὐκ ἀγανακτῶν*, and for the sense of *ἐρασταί*, Euthyd. 276 D. *ἐθορύβησαν οἱ ἐρασταὶ τοῖν ἀνδροῖν, ἀγασθέντες τῆς σοφίας αὐτοῖν.* Meno 70 B. *ἐραστὰς ἐπὶ σοφίᾳ.* infra 343 A.

D. *Τί οὖν...ἐκαλέσαμεν*] See the note on 310 A.—*ὁ Καλλίας ἔφη*] Here also the emphatic word is put first. Rep. v. 450 A. *ὁ Γλαύκων ἔφη.*—*Ἐδόκει χρῆναι*] The asyndeton is especially frequent with *δοκεῖν*. e. g. 315 E. *ἔδοξα ἀκοῦσαι.* 338 E. *ἐδόκει πᾶσιν οὕτω ποιητέον εἶναι.*—*καὶ αὐτοί τε ἀντιλαβόμενοι*] Heindorf wished to strike out *τε*, rightly rejecting the idea of *καὶ...τε* being used for "and also." But in reality *τε* answers to *ἐν δὲ τούτῳ* following, and the words *ἐκεῖ γὰρ προϋπῆρχε τὰ βάθρα* are parenthetical. Comp. Phaedo 63 C. *νῦν δὲ εὖ ἴστε ὅτι παρ' ἄνδρας τε ἐλπίζω ἀφίξεσθαι ἀγαθούς,—καὶ τοῦτο μὲν οὐκ ἂν πάνυ διισχυρισαίμην· ὅτι μέντοι παρὰ θεοὺς δεσπότας πάνυ ἀγαθοὺς ἥξειν, εὖ ἴστε ὅτι, εἴπερ τι ἄλλο τῶν τοιούτων, διισχυρισαίμην ἂν καὶ τοῦτο.* See also Shilleto on Dem. Fals. Leg. § 176, where both these passages are referred to. Even without a parenthesis, *τε* is sometimes answered by *δέ*. Euthyphr. 3 E. *ἀλλὰ σύ τε κατὰ νοῦν ἀγωνιεῖ τὴν δίκην, οἶμαι δὲ καὶ ἐμὲ τὴν ἐμήν.* Sympos. 186 E. *ἥ τε οὖν ἰατρική, ὥσπερ λέγω, πᾶσα, διὰ τοῦ θεοῦ τούτου κυβερνᾶται, ὡσαύτως δὲ καὶ γυμναστικὴ καὶ γεωργία.* In these cases the second clause is the more important one, Jelf, § 754. 5.—*κατεσκευάζομεν*] sc. *συνέδριον*, a "divan" or "conclave." Not the seats, for they were there already.—For *Καλλίας* Hermann reads *Κριτίας* from conjecture, because Callias, he thinks, was arranging the seats, and Critias and Alcibiades were mentioned together, p. 316 A. This refinement seems to me misplaced: if *πάντες ἡμεῖς* does not include Alcibiades, why should it include Callias?

E. *ἀναστήσαντες*] Compare Euthyd. 273 D. *ἐγελασάτην γοῦν ἄμφω βλέψαντες εἰς ἀλλήλους* (ἀλλήλω Steph. Bekk.). Gorg. 481 D. *ἐγώ τε καὶ σὺ νῦν τυγχάνομεν ταὐτόν τι πεπονθότε.* Soph. 218 D. *νῷν ἡγησαμένοις.* Ar. Ran. 565. *νὼ δείσασαι.* In Phaedr. 278 B. *νὼ καταβάντε* is now rightly read with nearly all the MSS., and Heindorf would here introduce *ἀναστήσαντε* on conjecture; but these instances are sufficient to prove that the use of the dual is extremely irregular, and in such cases the MSS. are our only safe guide. So with regard to the genders: see 314 D.

IX. 318 *ὅ τι οὖν αὐτῷ ἀποβήσεται*] Apol. 39 C. *τὸ δὲ* (*whereas in fact*) *ὑμῖν πολὺ ἐναντίον ἀποβήσεται, ὡς ἐγώ φημι.*—*ταὐτὰ ταῦτα*] A sort of adverbial use, like Lat. "itidem." Cf. 344 D. Meno 90 D. In the singular, Sympos. 178 E. *ταὐτὸν δὲ τοῦτο καὶ τὸν ἐρώμενον ὁρῶμεν...*—*ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιον ἐπιδιδόναι*] Compare Xen. Oecon. III. 10. *εἶναι τινές μοι δοκοῦσιν ἡλικίαι καὶ ἵππων καὶ ἀνθρώπων, αἳ εὐθύς τε χρήσιμοί εἰσι καὶ ἐπὶ τὸ βέλτιον ἐπιδιδόασιν.* Elsewhere, as almost always in Plato, *ἐπιδιδόναι* by itself means "to improve," *ἐπίδοσις* "improvement," e.g. Theaet. 146 B. *τοῖσδε δὲ πρέποι τε ἂν τοῦτο καὶ πολὺ πλεῖον ἐπιδιδοῖεν· τῷ γὰρ ὄντι ἡ νεότης εἰς πᾶν ἐπίδοσιν ἔχει* (*admits of*).

B. *ὃ μὴ τυγχάνεις ἐπιστάμενος*] Bekker reads *τυγχάνοις* without MS. authority, because the optative precedes. But compare p. 319 C. p. 320 D., where *ὡς πρέπει* follows a historic tense, p. 340 E. Gorg. 464 D. *ὥστ' εἰ δέοι ἐν παισὶ διαγωνίζεσθαι ὀψοποιόν τε καὶ ἰατρόν,...πότερος ἐπαΐει περὶ τῶν χρηστῶν σιτίων καὶ πονηρῶν.* "Though the particular nature of the object is unknown or indefinite, the event itself is considered as certain and real." Jelf, § 826. 4.—*ἀλλὰ μὴ οὕτως*] Cf. p. 331 C. *μή μοι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ· οὐδὲν γὰρ δέομαι.* Meno 74 D. *ἀλλὰ μή μοι οὕτως, ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ κ.τ.λ.* Ar. Nub. 84. *μή μοί γε τοῦτον μηδαμῶς τὸν Ἵππιον.* This construction is rather an aposiopesis than an ellipse: compare Jelf, § 897.—*ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ...εἰ αὐτὸν ἐπανέροιτο...εἴποι ἂν*] See above, on 311 B.—*Ζευξίππου τοῦ Ἡρακλεώτου*] Neither Zeuxippus nor Orthagoras are elsewhere mentioned, unless the words *τὸν Ἡρακλεώτην ξένον* in Xen. Sympos. IV. 63. refer to the former.

C. *Τί δὴ φῂς βελτίω ἔσεσθαι*] For the constr. *τί βελτίω* see on 312 D. *τῶν τί σοφῶν.* It is equivalent to *εἰς ὅ τι βελτίων* just below.—*ἀκούσας ἐκείνου...ἐπανέροιτο αὐτόν...συγγιγνόμενος ἐκείνῳ*] Observe the change of pronouns all referring to Orthagoras, and compare the note on 310 D. *ἂν αὐτῷ διδῷς ἀργύριον καὶ πείθῃς ἐκεῖνον.*

D. *οἱ μὲν γὰρ ἄλλοι λωβῶνται τοὺς νέους*] It is amusing to see how coolly Protagoras disposes of the charge so often brought against himself: compare a passage already cited from the Meno, 91 E. This union of effrontery with imposture is expressed in the word *ἀλαζονεία*, so frequently applied to the Sophists: see Ruhnken on Timaeus, s. v. *ἀλαζών*. Xen. Memor. 1. 7. Ar. Nub. 102, 1492. Isocr. c. Soph. § 1. Add Phaedo 92 D. *ἐγὼ δὲ τοῖς διὰ τῶν εἰκότων τὰς ἀποδείξεις ποιουμένοις λόγοις ξύνοιδα οὖσιν ἀλαζόσι*...where the leading doctrine of the Sophists is clearly alluded to.

E. *τὰς γὰρ τέχνας αὐτοὺς πεφευγότας, κ.τ.λ.*] "for when they have escaped from their school-studies, these teachers drive them back again, sorely against their will, into the old routine." Compare the popular judgment respecting philosophy as expressed by Callicles, Gorg. 484 C. sqq. *φιλοσοφία γάρ τοί ἐστιν, ὦ Σώκρατες, χαρίεν, ἄν τις αὐτοῦ μετρίως ἅψηται ἐν τῇ ἡλικίᾳ· ἐὰν δὲ περαιτέρω τοῦ δέοντος ἐνδιατρίψῃ, κ.τ.λ.* The astronomical pursuits of Hippias were illustrated at p. 315 C: for the rest, cf. Hipp. Maj. 225 C. *ἃ σὺ ἀκριβέστατα ἐπίστασαι ἀνθρώπων διαιρεῖν, περί τε γραμμάτων δυνάμεως καὶ συλλαβῶν καὶ ῥυθμῶν καὶ ἁρμονιῶν.—ὅπως ἂν...διοικοῖ*] *ὅπως* is here not final (*that*) but modal (*how*). Lys. 207 E. *προθυμοῦνται ὅπως ἂν εὐδαιμονοίης*. Rep. III. 393 D. *ὅτι οὐκ αὖ μανθάνεις ὅπως ἂν τοῦτο γένοιτο*. Ibid. 415 C. *τοῦτον οὖν τὸν μῦθον ὅπως ἂν πεισθεῖεν, ἔχεις τινὰ μηχανήν*; and comp. Jelf, § 810. 4. Riddell, § 68.

319 *Ἆρ'...ἕπομαί σου τῷ λόγῳ;*] *λόγος* is here "meaning," *λέγειν* "to mean," as in the ever-recurring phrase *μανθάνω ὃ λέγεις*, "I understand what you mean."—*Αὐτὸ μὲν οὖν τοῦτό ἐστιν...ὃ ἐπαγγέλλομαι*] "Nay (you need not ask, for) that is exactly the profession that I *do* make." The *Πρωταγόρου ἐπάγγελμα*, according to Arist. Rhet. II. 24. 11. was "to make the worse appear the better reason," *τὸν ἥττω λόγον κρείττω ποιεῖν*. Compare Cic. Brut. II. 8. (30). "Tum Leontinus Gorgias, Thrasymachus Chalcedonius, Protagoras Abderites, Prodicus Ceus, Hippias Eleus, in honore magno fuit, aliique multi temporibus eisdem docere se profitebantur arrogantibus sane verbis, *quemadmodum causa inferior* (ita enim loquebantur) *dicendo fieri superior posset*." Ar. Nub. 113 sqq. 244 sq. 883. 889 sqq.—*κέκτησαι, εἴπερ κέκτησαι*] It is rare to find an instance of the verb thus repeated with *εἴπερ*· the elliptical construction is far more common, e.g. Parmen. 150 A. *Ἐν μὲν ὅλῳ ἄρα τῷ ἑνὶ οὐκ ἂν εἴη σμικρότης, ἀλλ' εἴπερ, ἐν μέρει*. Ar.

Nub. 226. *ἔπειτ' ἀπὸ ταρροῦ τοὺς θεοὺς ὑπερφρονεῖς, | ἀλλ' οὐκ ἀπὸ τῆς γῆς, εἴπερ;* The commentators on either passage will supply references.

X. B. *ὅπως ἀπιστῶ*] MSS. and Edd. before the Zurich read *ὅπως ἂν ἀπιστῶ*. Here likewise *ὅπως* is *modal*—"*I have no means* of disbelieving," i. e. "I know not *how* I am to disbelieve." In this case *ὅπως ἂν ἀπιστοίην* might have been written, as well as *ὅπως ἀπιστῶ·* but not *ὅπως ἂν ἀπιστῶ*. The principle is that of the *conjunctivus deliberativus*, (Jelf, § 417.) *ἀπιστῶ*; "*am I to* disbelieve?"..."No, I don't know how *I am to* disbelieve"...whence the use of *ἂν* is rejected by Hermann, Opusc. IV. 94.—*ὅθεν δὲ αὐτὸ ἡγοῦμαι οὐ διδακτὸν εἶναι μηδ' ὑπ' ἀνθρώπων κ.τ.λ.*] The mixed construction of the two negatives may be thus explained: in the one case it is *ἡγοῦμαι εἶναι οὐ διδακτόν*, "I think that it is—not to be taught"—in the other *ἡγοῦμαι μὴ εἶναι παρασκευαστόν*, "I think it is not—to be provided." Comp. Soph. Philoct. 1058. *οἶμαι σοῦ κάκιον οὐδὲν ἂν |...τούτων κρατύνειν, μηδ' ἐπιθύνειν χερί.* If the view suggested in the note on 327 A. be correct, we may suppose that in these instances the construction was changed for the sake of variety.—*ὥσπερ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι Ἕλληνες*] sc. *φασί*.—*τοὺς οἰκοδόμους μεταπεμπομένους συμβούλους*] "that *the people* send for the masons as advisers." Ast and Sauppe rightly take *μεταπεμπομένους* as the middle voice: Heindorf's instances for the passive are only of the aor. *μετεπέμφθην*, which is hardly sufficient to prove his point.

C. *οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον*] Phaedo 87 D. Rep. VI. 487 C. *ἀποδέχονται*, sc. *αὐτοῦ·* see on 324 C.—*οἱ τοξόται ἀφελκύσωσιν*] sc. *ἀπὸ τοῦ βήματος*, expressed in Xen. Memor. III. 6. 1. Compare Ar. Eq. 665. *κᾆθ' εἷλκον αὐτὸν οἱ πρυτάνεις χοἱ τοξόται.* Eccles. 258 sqq. and the references in Liddell and Scott's Lexicon, s.v. *τοξόται*.—*ἐξαίρωνται*] "turn him out of the assembly," or as we should say, "the house."

D. *τούτοις...ὅτι οὐδαμόθεν μαθών,...ἐπιχειρεῖ*] The change of construction from the plural to the singular is explained in Jelf, § 390 b. A simple instance is Eur. Androm. 421. *οἰκτρὰ γὰρ τὰ δυστυχῆ | βροτοῖς ἅπασι, κἂν θυραῖος ὢν κυρῇ.* The colloquial liveliness of his style renders this transition especially frequent in Plato: compare below 324 A. 334 C. Phaedo 62 D. Theaet. 179 A. Gorg. 478 B. 505 D. Polit. 299 A. Rep. III. 413 D. V. 463 D. VI. 496 C. VIII. 558 A. Legg. II. 670 A. It is not uncommon, however, in other writers, and is also found in Latin.—*ἔπειτα*] "yet," "nevertheless," as in p. 343 D. *εἶτα* 341 E.—*μὴ τοίνυν ὅτι*

τὸ κοινὸν...ἀλλὰ ἰδίᾳ] Comp. Jelf, § 762. 2, 3. Riddell, § 154. The elliptical nature of this construction will explain a seeming pleonasm in Sympos. 179 B. *οὐ μόνον ὅτι ἄνδρες ἀλλὰ καὶ αἱ γυναῖκες*, i. e. "I do not only say that, &c.," where either *οὐ μόνον* or *οὐχ ὅτι* would have sufficed. For the omission of *καὶ* after *ἀλλὰ* compare Apol. 40 D. *μὴ ὅτι ἰδιώτην τινά, ἀλλὰ τὸν μέγαν βασιλέα. τοίνυν* is cumulative: "Nay, not only is public business conducted on this principle, but in private life," &c.

E. *οὐχ οἷοί τε ἄλλοις παραδιδόναι*] With this sense of *παραδιδόναι*, "to impart," compare Theaet. 198 B. *καλοῦμέν γε παραδιδόντα μὲν διδάσκειν, παραλαμβάνοντα δὲ μανθάνειν·* below, *παραδίδωσι* is "sends to an instructor," as often from Herodotus (I. 73) downwards. Compare Legg. VII. 811 E. *τοὺς νέους αὐτοῖς παραδιδόναι διδάσκειν τε καὶ παιδεύειν.—ἃ μὲν διδασκάλων εἴχετο*] "in all that depended upon teachers." A passage in the Meno, p. 94 A. B. will illustrate both the idiom and the fact.

320 *νέμονται ὥσπερ ἄφετοι*] Comp. Plut. Lucull. p. 507 E. *βόες ἱεραὶ νέμονται...κατὰ τὴν χώραν ἄφετοι*. Plato applies the phrase to those who have passed the active period of life, Rep. VI. 498 C.—*εἰ δὲ βούλει*] A polite expression of deference: in Plato's use of it three cases may, I think, be distinguished: (1) Sometimes the concession is real: Lach. 188 C. *ἁπλοῦν τό γ' ἐμόν, ὦ Νικία, περὶ λόγων ἐστίν· εἰ δὲ βούλει, οὐχ ἁπλοῦν, ἀλλὰ διπλοῦν.* So when *εἰ* is repeated: Rep. IV. 432 A. *εἰ μὲν βούλει, φρονήσει, εἰ δὲ βούλει, ἰσχύϊ, εἰ δέ, καὶ πλήθει ἢ χρήμασιν...*"if you prefer it," "if you will." (2) There is no concession, but the phrase has become a mere copula (*atque etiam*, Ast): Crat. 411 D. *εἴη δ' ἂν [ἡ φρόνησις] καὶ ὄνησιν ὑπολαβεῖν φορᾶς· ἀλλ' οὖν περί γε τὸ φέρεσθαι ἐστίν. εἰ δὲ βούλει, ἡ γνώμη παντάπασι δηλοῖ γονῆς σκέψιν καὶ νώμησιν· τὸ γὰρ νωμᾶν καὶ τὸ σκοπεῖν ταὐτόν. εἰ δὲ βούλει, αὐτὸ ἡ νόησις τοῦ νέου ἐστὶν ἕσις...*" let me add:" (3) Ironically, in clenching an argument: Theaet. 196 E. *εἰ δὲ βούλει, καὶ νῦν ἐν τῷ παρόντι κεχρήμεθ' αὖ τῷ ἀγνοεῖν τε καὶ συνιέναι, ὡς προσῆκον αὐτοῖς χρῆσθαι, εἴπερ στερόμεθα ἐπιστήμης...*"by your leave," "with all due deference." To this last head I would refer it in the text: the idea conveyed is, "if you are not yet satisfied, what will you say to this?"

Κλεινίαν τὸν Ἀλκιβιάδου...ἀδελφόν] *μαινόμενον ἄνθρωπον*, as his brother calls him, Alcib. I. 118 E. The Clinias of the Euthydemus was his first cousin: see that dialogue, p. 275 A.—*δεδιὼς περὶ αὐτοῦ μὴ διαφθαρῇ δή*] "for fear, as he said, of his being corrupted" ...*δεδιέναι περί τινι* is more frequent, as at 322 B. But the genitive

occurs Xen. Cyrop. I. 4. 22, and *θαρρῶ περὶ τῶν γονέων*, Rep. IX. 574 B. The change of construction involved in *ἐπαίδευε μὴ διαφθαρῇ* is common enough; it recurs in almost every page of Thucydides, to go no farther.—*ἐν Ἀρίφρονος*] sc. *οἴκῳ*. So Theaet. 206 A. *ἐν κιθαριστοῦ*, but in Charm. 155 C. *ἐν ἐμαυτοῦ* is "in my senses."—*γεγονέναι*] "had elapsed." Phaedo 108 C. *ἕως ἂν δή τινες χρόνοι γένωνται*.—*ἀπέδωκε τούτῳ*] i. e. Ariphron sent him back to Pericles. For the change of nominatives compare Phaedr. 258 B. *Οὐκοῦν ἐὰν μὲν οὗτος (ὁ λόγος) ἐμμένῃ, γεγηθὼς ἀπέρχεται ἐκ τοῦ θεατροῦ ὁ ποιητής· ἐὰν δὲ ἐξαλιφῇ (ὁ λόγος) καὶ ἄμοιρος γένηται (ὁ ποιητὴς) λογογραφίας τε καὶ τοῦ ἄξιος εἶναι συγγράφειν, πενθεῖ αὐτός τε καὶ οἱ ἑταῖροι*...and for that of *τούτου...τούτῳ*, Gorg. 510 B. *εἴ τις τούτου (τοῦ τυράννου) πολὺ βελτίων εἴη, φοβοῖτο δήπου ἂν αὐτὸν ὁ τύραννος καὶ τούτῳ (τῷ βελτίονι) ἐξ ἅπαντος τοῦ νοῦ οὐκ ἄν ποτε δύναιτο φίλος γενέσθαι*.

B. *κάμπτομαι...λέγειν*] "I change my mind, and begin to think there is something in what you say." Comp. Thuc. III. 58. *καίτοι ἀξιοῦμεν...καμφθῆναι ὑμᾶς καὶ μεταγνῶναι, εἴ τι ὑπὸ Θηβαίων ἐπείσθητε*.—*μὴ φθονήσῃς, ἀλλ' ἐπίδειξον*] Comp. Meno 71 D. *εἰπὸν καὶ μὴ φθονήσῃς*. Rep. I. 338 A. *μὴ φθονήσῃς καὶ Γλαύκωνα τόνδε διδάξαι καὶ τοὺς ἄλλους*. Below 327 A. Ion 530 D.

C. *ὑπέλαβον...οὕτω διεξιέναι*] "answered that he was to proceed." *οὕτω* is merely pleonastic, as in 325 A. *οὕτω πράττειν*.—*Ἦν γάρ ποτε*] In beginning a story, "once upon a time" is more frequently expressed by *οὕτω ποτέ*. Ar. Vesp. 1182. *οὕτω ποτ' ἦν μῦς καὶ γαλῆ*. Compare Lysis 216 C. *σκεψώμεθα, μὴ ἔτι μᾶλλον ἡμᾶς λανθάνει τὸ φίλον ὡς ἀληθῶς οὐδὲν τούτων ὄν, ἀλλὰ τὸ μήτε ἀγαθὸν μήτε κακὸν φίλον οὕτω ποτὲ γιγνόμενον τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ*. Phaedr. 237 B. *ἦν οὕτω δὴ παῖς, μᾶλλον δὲ μειρακίσκος, μάλα καλός*. On the other hand, Tim. 23 C. *ἦν γὰρ δή ποτε, ὦ Σόλων, ὑπὲρ τὴν μεγίστην φθορὰν ὕδασιν*...a curious expression for the "antediluvian" times.—*θνητὰ γένη* includes the animal kingdom in general, as the sequel shows.

XI. D. *τυποῦσιν αὐτὰ θεοὶ γῆς ἔνδον*] Compare Psal. cxxxix. 15. Paradise Lost, VII. 456–474. "Out of the ground up rose, &c."—*καὶ τῶν ὅσα πυρὶ καὶ γῇ κεράννυται*] i. e. air and water. The ancients conceived of the four elements, not, as is often supposed, as what we should call "simple substances," but as states of matter, representing different degrees of density. Thus if the two extremes earth and fire (ether) were presupposed, the other two might be conceived as resulting from their admixture in different

proportions: and they might speak indifferently of two or of four elements, precisely as we speak either of three or of seven primary colours, according to the point of view. See Humboldt's Cosmos, III. 34, cited by Paley on Ov. Fast. I. 105. Hor. Od. I. 16. 13.—For *τῶν ὅσα = τούτων ὅσα*, see Jelf, § 444. 5. c. Riddell, Dig. § 30. Instances with *ὅσος* are Theaet. 204 D. *ταὐτὸν ἄρα ἔν γε τοῖς ὅσα ἐξ ἀριθμοῦ ἐστί.* Soph. 241 E. *περὶ τεχνῶν τῶν ὅσαι περὶ ταὐτά εἰσι.* Rep. v. 469 B. *ὅταν τις...τελευτήσῃ τῶν ὅσοι ἂν...ἀγαθοὶ κριθῶσι.* VI. 510 A. *ἐν τοῖς ὅσα πυκνά τε καὶ λεῖα καὶ φανὰ ξυνέστηκε* ...and often with the relative, e. g. Phaedo 92 D. Theaet. 168 A. Legg. IX. 871 E.—*Προμηθεῖ καὶ Ἐπιμηθεῖ*] Sons of Iapetus and Clymene, Hes. Theog. 507–511. See the following story also in Op. et D. 42–105.—*παραιτεῖται...αὐτὸς νεῖμαι*] "Obtains leave from Prometheus to assign them himself." With the construction comp. Il. IX. 183. *Πολλὰ μάλ' εὐχομένω γαιηόχῳ Ἐννοσιγαίῳ | ῥηϊδίως πεπιθεῖν μεγάλας φρένας Αἰακίδαο.* Herod. IV. 146. *παραιτήσαντο αἱ γυναῖκες...ἐσελθεῖν ἐς τὴν ἑρκτήν.* Thuc. IV. 63. *παρῃτεῖτο μηδὲν τούτων δρᾶν.*

E. *νέμων δὲ τοῖς μὲν ἰσχὺν, κ.τ.λ.*] The poetical colouring and phraseology of this description are probably meant to ridicule the declamatory style of the Sophists. The whole passage is more or less rhythmical, and the words *ἐμηχανᾶτο...σωτηρίαν* form an iambic line.—*τοὺς δ' ἀσθενεστέρους...τοὺς δὲ*] I think the Zurich editors and Hermann are right in retaining this reading, instead of the correction *τὰ δ' ἀσθενέστερα...τὰ δέ.* It is difficult to conceive so great a harshness finding its way by mistake into all the MSS. except one. We must understand *θῆρας.*—*σμικρότητι ἤμπισχε*, like *ἀμφιεννὺς θριξὶ* below, is an exceptional construction. Verbs of clothing generally take the double accusative. In *ηὖξε μεγέθει* the dative is likewise poetical.—*πτηνὸν φυγὴν*] "escape in flight:" the ambiguity of the latter word in English must be guarded against.

321 *δυνατοῖς δὲ καὶ καύματα*] "sc. *ἀμῦναι.* Deinceps mutatur structurae tenor: nam poterat sic pergi: *καὶ εἰς εὐνὰς ἰοῦσιν ἱκανοῖς ἅμα ὑπάρχειν στρωμνὴ οἰκεία κ.τ.λ.*" Stallbaum.

B. *ὑποδῶν τὰ μὲν ὁπλαῖς, τὰ δὲ ὄνυξι κ.τ.λ.*] *ὑποδῶν* (for *ὑπὸ ποδῶν*) is a certain correction admitted by all the recent editors. This conjecture occurred independently, I believe, to Cobet and Badham, well-known friends and coadjutors in the critical art. For *ὄνυξι* all MSS. read *θριξί*, and the statement that some animals are protected by hair on the soles of their feet has long perplexed the editors: Stephens proposes *τύλοις*, Orellius *ἄθριξι δέρμασι.* The

emendation in the text was suggested to Stallbaum by a passage of Xenophon, Memor. 1. 2. 54: *αὐτοί τε γὰρ αὐτῶν ὄνυχάς τε καὶ τρίχας καὶ τύλους ἀφαιροῦσι.*—*βορὰ* is usually synonymous with *τροφή*, but is here clearly distinguished: it denotes the act of preying.—The words *εἰς τὰ ἄλογα* after *τὰς δυνάμεις* are wanting in the two best MSS., and are omitted by Hermann and most subsequent editors. I have likewise followed Sauppe and Kroschel in reading (with MS. authority) *λοιπὸν δ' ἀκίνητον* instead of *λοιπὸν δὴ ἀ.*—*οὐ πάνυ τι σοφὸς*] It is usual to translate *οὐ πάνυ* "not at all," and Donaldson maintains that this is the only sense in good Attic, denying that the phrase can ever mean "not very." The latter however is justified by Riddell, § 139: and Dr Thompson on Gorg. 457 E. thinks that "we shall have to admit that the same negative is sometimes used in the qualified and sometimes in the unqualified sense by the same author."

C. *ἠπόρει ὅ τι χρήσαιτο*] sc. *αὐτῷ*, expressed at 320 B, omitted Lys. 213 C. Rep. II. 368 B.—*ἐμμελῶς πάντων ἔχοντα*] "suitably provided with (literally *situated in respect of*) all things." Cf. Jelf, § 528.—*τὸν δὲ ἄνθρωπον...ἄοπλον*] Plutarch. de Fortuna, p. 98 D. *μόνος δὲ ὁ ἄνθρωπος κατὰ τὸν Πλάτωνα γυμνὸς καὶ ἄνοπλος καὶ ἀνυπόδετος καὶ ἄστρωτος ὑπὸ τῆς φύσεως ἀπολέλειπται.* Lucr. v. 222 sqq. Tum porro puer, ut saevis projectus ab undis | Navita, nudus humi jacet, infans, indigus omni | Vitali auxilio. 228 sqq. At variae crescunt pecudes, &c.

ἀπορίᾳ οὖν ἐχόμενος] The Bodleian and Vatican MSS. read *σχόμενος*, which is approved by Orelli and admitted into the text by Sauppe. Winckelmann conjectured *συσχόμενος*. If any alteration were necessary, I should much prefer *συνεχόμενος*: and CYN might easily drop out after OYN.

D. *τὴν ἔντεχνον σοφίαν σὺν πυρί*] See of course the Prom. Vinct. *passim*: the chief passages are v. 7 sq. *τὸ σὸν γὰρ ἄνθος, παντέχνου πυρὸς σέλας, | θνητοῖσι κλέψας ὤπασεν.* 109-111. *ναρθηκοπλήρωτον δὲ θηρῶμαι πυρὸς | πηγὴν κλοπαίαν, ἣ διδάσκαλος τέχνης | πάσης βροτοῖς πέφηνε καὶ μέγας πόρος.* 254. *ἀφ' οὗ γε πολλὰς ἐκμαθήσονται τέχνας.* Plat. Polit. 274 C. *ὅθεν δὴ τὰ πάλαι λεχθέντα παρὰ θεῶν δῶρα ἡμῖν δεδώρηται...πῦρ μὲν παρὰ Προμηθέως, τέχναι δὲ παρ' Ἡφαίστου καὶ τῆς συντέχνου.*—*εἰς μὲν τὴν ἀκρόπολιν*] The apodosis is at *εἰς δὲ τὸ τῆς Ἀθηνᾶς*...and the words *πρὸς δὲ...ἦσαν* are parenthetical.—*οὐκέτι*] "Not now." It will not do to translate with Stallbaum "nondum;" and there is clearly no reference to past time. Comp. Tim. 45 D. *ξυμφυὲς οὐκέτι τῷ πλησίον ἀέρι*

γινόμενον. Sympos. 204 D. οὐ πάνυ ἔφην ἔτι ἔχειν...προχείρως ἀποκρίνασθαι. Xen. Agesil. II. 26. Cyrop. IV. 3. 4.—αἱ Διὸς φυλακαὶ] "Intelliguntur Κράτος et Βία. Hesiod. Theog. 385 sq. Καὶ Κράτος ἠδὲ Βίην ἀριδείκετα γείνατο τέκνα (Στύξ), | τῶν οὐκ ἔστ' ἀπάνευθε Διὸς δόμος οὐδέ τις ἕδρη | οὐδ' ὁδὸς ὅππη μὴ κείνοις Θεὸς ἡγεμονεύει, | ἀλλ' αἰεὶ πὰρ Ζηνὶ βαρυκτύπῳ ἑδριόωνται. Callim. Hymn. in Jov. 67. σή τε Βίη τό τε Κάρτος, ὃ καὶ πέλας εἵσαο δίφρου, ubi vid. Spanhem." Heindorf. Comp. Aesch. Prom. 12.

322 δι' Ἐπιμηθέα] It was the consequence of his original blunder.—θείας μέτεσχε μοίρας] Compare Phaedr. 230 A. θείας τινὸς καὶ ἀτύφου μοίρας φύσει μέτεχον...μοῖρα is here simply *sors*, "condition:" two other usages of the word may be noted as especially Platonic: (1) Like the Lat. *in numero esse* or *haberi*, "to be reckoned among:" Phileb. 54 C. ἐν τῇ τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ μοίρᾳ ἐκεῖνό ἐστι τὸ δέ τινος ἕνεκα γιγνόμενον εἰς ἄλλην, ὦ ἄριστε, μοῖραν θετέον. Cf. D. Crito 51 B. Legg. XI. 923 B. (2) As a mere periphrasis, Legg. II. 656 B. ὡς ἐν παιδιᾶς μοίρᾳ. Phileb. 60 B. μέτοχον εἶναι τῆς τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ μοίρας. I would not apply this last passage to the present case, so as to make θείας μοίρας = τοῦ θείου.—ζώων μόνον θεοὺς ἐνόμισε] "was the only animal that believed in the existence of gods:" the full phrase occurs Legg. x. 886 A. πάντες Ἕλληνές τε καὶ βάρβαροι νομίζουσιν εἶναι θεούς. See the difference between νομίζειν θεοὺς and νομίζειν τοὺς θεοὺς well explained in Liddell and Scott's Lexicon.

B. πολιτικὴν...ἧς μέρος πολεμική] This throws some light upon a passage of Arist. Pol. II. 6. 7. ἔτι δὲ καλῶς ἔχει προσθεῖναι καὶ πρὸς τοὺς γειτνιῶντας τόπους, εἰ δεῖ τὴν πόλιν ζῆν βίον πολιτικόν.—ὅτ' οὖν ἀθροισθεῖεν] See on 315 B. ἐπειδὴ αὐτὸς ἀναστρέφοι.

C. αἰδῶ τε καὶ δίκην] Comp. Hesiod, Op. et D. 190. δίκη δ' ἐν χερσὶ καὶ αἰδὼς | οὐκ ἔσται, βλάψει δ' ὁ κακὸς τὸν ἀρείονα φῶτα. Ibid. 197. ἀθανάτων μετὰ φῦλον ἴτην προλιπόντ' ἀνθρώπους | Αἰδὼς καὶ Νέμεσις τὰ δὲ λείψεται ἄλγεα λυγρὰ | θνητοῖς ἀνθρώποισι, κακοῦ δ' οὐκ ἔσσεται ἀλκή.—τίνα οὖν τρόπον δοίη] In the oratio obliqua οὖν is somewhat rare. Cf. Sympos. 219 D. ὥστε οὔθ' ὅπως οὖν ὀργιζοίμην εἶχον...οὔθ' ὅπῃ προσαγαγοίμην αὐτὸν εὐπόρουν. Observe the return to the direct narrative immediately afterwards.—νείμω] the conj. deliberativus. Cf. on 319 B.—ἰδιώταις] Compare above, on 312 B. ἰδιώτης and ἰατρὸς are opposed, p. 345 A. ἡμεῖς δὲ οἱ ἰατρικῆς ἰδιῶται. Theaet. 178 C. ὅταν τις οἰηθῇ ἰδιώτης αὐτὸν πυρετὸν λήψεσθαι (*that a fever will seize him*, not *that he will "take a fever,"* which would require αὐτός)...καὶ ἕτερος, ἰατρὸς δέ, ἀντοιηθῇ,

cf. Rep. III. 389 B.—καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι δημιουργοί] sc. ἕκαστος πολλοῖς ἱκανὸς ἰδιώταις...δημιουργοί, "craftsmen," includes both trades and professions. Odyss. XVII. 383. οἱ δημιοεργοὶ ἔασι, | μάντιν, ἢ ἰητῆρα κακῶν, ἢ τέκτονα δούρων· and so of a physician, Sympos. 186 D.

D. τὸν μὴ δυνάμενον] "whoever is unable," *if* there be any such. τὸν οὐ δυν. would point to a particular case: "this man, because he cannot."—ὅταν...ᾖ λόγος] The article is commonly added, as at 334 D. περὶ οὗ ἂν ᾖ ὁ λόγος. But compare Euthyphr. 5 C. πολὺ ἂν ἡμῖν πρότερον περὶ ἐκείνου λόγος γένοιτο. Hipp. Maj. 293 D. περὶ οὗ ἂν λόγος ᾖ. We say indifferently "when there is a question" and "when the question is."

323 διὰ δικαιοσύνης...ἰέναι] This well-known construction means nothing more than "to be just," Jelf, § 627. 1. Comp. Legg. I. 632 C. τοὺς μὲν διὰ φρονήσεως, τοὺς δὲ δι' ἀληθοῦς δόξης ἰόντας. Xen. Cyrop. II. 2. 24. ἡ γὰρ πονηρία διὰ τῶν παραυτίκα ἡδονῶν πορευομένη...VIII. 1. 26. τοὺς ἄλλους ᾤετ' ἂν τῶν μὲν αἰσχρῶν κερδῶν ἀπέχεσθαι, διὰ τοῦ δικαίου δ' ἐθέλειν πορεύεσθαι.—ὡς παντὶ προσῆκον] Compare Jelf, § 700. a.—ἢ μὴ εἶναι πόλεις] The clause to which ἢ refers (*if this is not so*) being suppressed, ἢ has the force of "otherwise." Comp. Phaedr. 245 D. τοῦτο δὲ οὔτ' ἀπόλλυσθαι οὔτε γίγνεσθαι δυνατόν, ἢ πάντα τε οὐρανὸν πᾶσάν τε γῆν συμπεσοῦσαν στῆναι. Ib. 271 D. δεῖ δὴ...δύνασθαι ἀκολουθεῖν ἢ μηδὲ εἰδέναι. Parmen. 164 C. τοῦτο γὰρ αὐτοῖς ἔτι λείπεται ἢ μηδένος εἶναι ἄλλοις. See also Soph. Oed. Col. 1402-1404. In these cases there is an ellipse of ἀναγκαῖον ὄν, or rather it is implied in the kindred terms προσῆκον, δυνατόν, δεῖ, λείπεται, ἔξεστι.—Ἵνα δὲ μὴ οἴῃ ἀπατᾶσθαι ὡς κ.τ.λ.] "That you may not fancy yourself deceived *as to the fact of* men's really thinking"... Cf. Crat. 413 D. ἴσως γὰρ ἄν σε καὶ τὰ ἐπίλοιπα ἐξαπατήσαιμι ὡς οὐκ ἀκηκοὼς λέγω. Xen. Anab. V. 7. 6. Ἔστιν οὖν ὅστις τοῦτο δύναιτ' ἂν ὑμᾶς ἐξαπατῆσαι, ὡς ὁ ἥλιος κ.τ.λ.

B. δικαιοσύνη is here "the administration of justice," as at Gorg. 464 B...where Bekker reads (but wrongly) δικαστική.—ὁ ἐκεῖ ...τἀληθῆ λέγειν] ἐκεῖ = ἐν ταῖς ἄλλαις τέχναις. τἀληθῆ λέγειν is added to explain ὅ. Compare a similar epexegesis at p. 351 A. τὸ μὲν...τὴν δύναμιν, and above 313 A. ὃ δὲ περὶ πλείονος τοῦ σώματος ἡγεῖ, τὴν ψυχήν.—ὡς ἀναγκαῖον] There is no need to suppose that ὂν has been lost *per homoeoteleuton*. Gorg. 495 C. ἄλλο τι οὖν ὡς ἕτερον τὴν ἀνδρείαν τῆς ἐπιστήμης δύο ταῦτα ἔλεγες; Phaedr. 269 C. τὸ δὲ ἕκαστα τούτων πιθανῶς λέγειν τε καὶ τὸ ὅλον συνίστασθαι, οὐδὲν ἔργον (*as being no great matter*), αὐτοὺς δεῖν παρ' ἑαυτῶν τοὺς

μαθητὰς σφῶν πορίζεσθαι ἐν τοῖς λόγοις. In the latter passage *ὡς*, as well as *ὃν*, is omitted: cf. Jelf, § 700. a.

C. *οὐδένα ὅντινα οὐχὶ*] See above on 317 C. It is worth remarking that whereas *οὐδεὶς* was there attracted to the case of the relative (*οὐδένος ὅτου οὐ...πατὴρ ἂν εἴην = οὐδεὶς ἐστιν ὅτου οὐ κ.τ.λ.*), we have here the contrary and far more common attraction, the words being equivalent to *οὐδένα εἶναι ὅστις οὐχ ἁμωσγέπως μετέχει.—ταῦτα λέγω*] cf. Riddell, Dig. §§ 18. 41.

D. *ὥστε τι τούτων ἐπιχειρεῖν ποιεῖν*] i.e. *θυμεῖσθαι νουθετεῖν διδάσκειν κολάζειν*. The frequent occurrence of *διδάσκειν* in such combinations as the present (cf. infra 325 A. *διδάσκειν καὶ κολάζειν*, Apol. 26 A. *διδ. καὶ νουθετεῖν*) is characteristic of Socrates' teaching, which made virtue synonymous with knowledge, and vice with ignorance.

E. *ὧν ἐστιν ἕν*] "Instances of this kind are" &c.—*πολιτικὴ ἀρετὴ* is here not the virtue of a *πολιτικὸς* or statesman, but that of a *πολίτης*· "the duties we owe to society."

324 *ἐθέλεις ἐννοῆσαι*] This use of *ἐθέλω* contains the germ of the English "will" as an auxiliary verb. It is thus followed by a future *διδάξει*, as at 342 D.—*πρὸς τούτῳ τὸν νοῦν ἔχων*] Compare Ar. Nub. 1009. *ἢν ταῦτα ποιῇς ἁγὼ φράζω, | καὶ πρὸς τούτοις προσέχῃς τὸν νοῦν.*

B. *ὅτι ἠδίκησεν*] This transition from the plural to the singular has been already noticed, on p. 319 D. The opinion here put into the mouth of Protagoras was also Plato's own. Gorg. 525 B. *προσήκει δὲ παντὶ τῷ ἐν τιμωρίᾳ ὄντι, ὑπ' ἄλλου ὀρθῶς τιμωρουμένῳ, ἢ βελτίονι γίγνεσθαι καὶ ὀνίνασθαι ἢ παραδείγματι τοῖς ἄλλοις γίγνεσθαι.* Cf. Legg. IX. 854 D. Senec. de Ira I. 16.

C. *τιμωροῦνται δὲ καὶ κολάζονται*] Arist. Rhet. 1. 10. 17. *διαφέρει δὲ τιμωρία καὶ κόλασις· ἡ μὲν γὰρ κόλασις τοῦ πάσχοντος ἕνεκά ἐστιν, ἡ δὲ τιμωρία τοῦ ποιοῦντος, ἵνα ἀποπληρωθῇ.* For *κολάζεσθαι = κολάζειν*, compare Ar. Vesp. 405. *νῦν ἐκεῖνο, νῦν ἐκεῖνο | τοὐξύθυμον, ᾧ κολαζό- | μεσθα, κέντρον ἐντέτατ' ὀξύ.—Ἀθηναῖοί εἰσι τῶν ἡγουμένων*] Comp. Phaedr. 259 B. *λέγεται δ' ὥς ποτ' ἦσαν οὗτοι ἄνθρωποι τῶν πρὶν Μούσας γεγονέναι.* Rep. II. 360 A. *εὐθὺς διαπράξασθαι τῶν ἀγγέλων γενέσθαι τῶν περὶ τὸν βασιλέα.—ἀποδέχονται...συμβουλεύοντος*] *ἀποδέχεσθαί τινος* is to receive *opinions* from a person, i.e. "to agree" with him. Comp. 337 C. *εἰπόντος τοῦ Προδίκου...ἀπεδέξαντο.* 339 D. *οὐ φησιν ἀποδέχεσθαι αὐτοῦ τὰ αὐτὰ ἑαυτῷ λέγοντος.*

XIV. D. *λοιπὴ ἡ ἀπορία*] The MSS. read *λοιπὴ ἀπορία*, but the

article seems required, and might easily have dropt out after λοιπή. It was restored by Heindorf, whom Hirschig and Kroschel follow.—διδάσκουσιν ἃ διδασκάλων ἔχεται] See on 319 E. We might have expected διδάσκονται as below, p. 325 A, and usually of parents educating their children: bnt this distinction is sometimes neglected, Pors. Med. 297. So παιδεύειν and παιδεύσασθαι are used indiscriminately, Meno 93 D. 94 A.—λόγον] "an argument." In the words ὅταν ᾖ λόγος, above 322 D. λόγος is the *subject-matter* of an argument, i.e. a question. Cf. 314 C.

E. εἰ...οὐ τεκτονική, οὐδὲ χαλκεία, κ.τ.λ.] εἰ is followed by οὐ, (1) when the particulars ennmerated are opposed to one another, as is the case here; (2) when the negation rests on some particular notion, as at 341 A. εἰ οὐκ αἰσχύνομαι. Comp. Jelf, § 744. Obs.

325 ἓν αὐτὸ προσαγορεύω εἶναι] Compare above 311 E. ὀνομάζουσι τὸν ἄνδρα εἶναι. Phileb. 13 B. πάσας ἡδονὰς ἀγαθὸν εἶναι προσαγορεύεις.—εἰ τοῦτ' ἐστὶν οὗ δεῖ...ἄνευ δὲ τούτου μή] "if this be a thing whereof all mnst partake, and with which every lesson must be learnt, and every deed done, without which no lesson learnt and no deed done"...οὕτω, i.e. μετὰ τούτου, as is shown by the words following, ἄνευ δὲ τούτου μή. Comp. Phaedo 67 E. ὅτι ἐγγυτάτω ὄντα τοῦ τεθνάναι οὕτω ζῆν. Gorg. 507 D.

B. σκέψαι ὡς θαυμασίως γίγνονται οἱ ἀγαθοί] "just think what strange people you make of your virtuous men," or, "in what a strange position you put them." The next sentence shows that οἱ ἀγαθοί must still mean the fathers who educate (τοὺς υἱεῖς διδάσκονται), and not the sons who are educated: we cannot therefore translate "in what a wonderful way your good men are produced," though the most obvious rendering. The sense wonld be better expressed by θαυμάσιοι γίγνονται as Schleiermacher conjectured. But Sauppe and Kroschel defend the adverb, citing θαυμασίως πέφυκε from Phaedo 60 B, ἡδέως γίγνεσθαι and καλῶς γίγνεσθαι from Plntarch. Dr Thompson thinks that perhaps an adjective ἄτοποι or the like has dropped out after θαυμασίως.—ἐφ' ᾧ δὲ ἥ τε ζημία θάνατος] The MSS. read ἐφ' ὧν, but the dative would have been more appropriate even if ἐφ' οἷς had not preceded. Cf. Aeschin. in Ctes. p. 89. § 251. ἐφ' οἷς ἐστιν ἐκ τῶν νόμων ζημία θάνατος. Lysias, Orat. XXII. p. 164. § 7. ἐφ' οἷς θάνατος ἡ ζημία. In these phrases ζημία takes the article as denoting the *legal* punishment. The position of τε is curious: we should have expected θάνατός τε ἡ ζημία, answering to the apodosis καὶ πρὸς τῷ θανάτῳ κ.τ.λ.

C. ταῦτα δ' ἄρα οὐ διδάσκονται] Compare, both for the repeti-

tion of δὲ (above 313 A.) and for the sense of δ' ἄρα, "after all," Phileb. 30 B. τῶν δ' αὐτῶν τούτων ὄντων ἐν ὅλῳ τε οὐρανῷ καὶ κατὰ μέγαλα μέρη, καὶ πρόσετι καλῶν καὶ εἰλικρινῶν, ἐν τούτοις δ' οὐκ ἄρα μεμηχανῆσθαι τὴν τῶν καλλίστων καὶ τιμιωτάτων φύσιν. ἄρα is repeated from τὰ μὲν ἄλλα ἄρα preceding, as in Crito 50 E. ἢ πρὸς μὲν ἄρα σοι τὸν πατέρα οὐκ ἐξ ἴσου ἦν τὸ δίκαιον...πρὸς δὲ τὴν πατρίδα ἄρα καὶ τοὺς νόμους ἐξέσται σοι; cf. also Apol. 34 C. Phaedo 68 A. Meno 91 D. Rep. x. 600 D. Legg. xi. 931 C.—Οἴεσθαί γε χρή] sc. διδάσκεσθαι καὶ ἐπιμελεῖσθαι. The phrase occurs, Crito, 53 C. 54 B. Phaedo 68 B.—ἐπειδὰν θᾶττον] i. e. ἐπειδὰν τάχιστα, *simul atque*. Alcib. i. 105 A. ἐὰν θᾶττον εἰς τὸν Ἀθηναίων δῆμον παρέλθῃς. Cf. Ep. vii. 324 B. Xen. Cyrop. iii. 3. 20.

XV. D. παρ' ἕκαστον] "*during*," or "at the very time of," everything done or said. So the phrase παρ' αὐτὰ τἀδικήματα, Lat. *flagrante delicto*, Dem. de Cor. p. 229. § 15. Pantaenet. p. 966. § 3.—ἐὰν μὲν ἑκὼν πείθηται] sc. εὖ ἂν ἔχοι. This is not quite a parallel case with that at p. 311 D: see the note there. Comp. Ar. Plut. 468. Thesm. 536. ἐὰν μέν, as usual, is followed by εἰ δὲ μή.

E. γραμμάτων τε καὶ κιθαρίσεως] Compare Legg. vii. 810 A—812 A. and another *locus classicus* on Athenian education, Ar. Nub. 961 sqq., where the phrase εἰς διδασκάλων is illustrated by ἐς κιθαριστοῦ, *v.* 964, cf. 973. ἐν παιδοτρίβου.—ὥσπερ τότε τὴν φωνὴν] τότε is "formerly," "at the time I spoke of before," as constantly in the Attic writers. The time in question is determined by ἐπειδὰν θᾶττον συνιῇ τὰ λεγόμενα.—ἐπὶ τῶν βάθρων] "subsellia scholastica." So Demosthenes casts in the teeth of his opponent, de Cor. p. 313. § 322. παῖς μὲν ὢν μετὰ πολλῆς ἐνδείας, ἐτράφης ἅμα τῷ πατρὶ πρὸς τῷ διδασκαλείῳ προσεδρεύων, τὸ μέλαν τρίβων καὶ τὰ βάθρα σπογγίζων καὶ τὸ παιδαγωγεῖον κορῶν.

326 διέξοδοι καὶ ἔπαινοι καὶ ἐγκώμια] "Tales, and eulogies, and lays of the brave men of old." It is scarcely possible to distinguish these; probably all refer to the epic poems, as the μελοποιοὶ are mentioned below.—ἕτερα τοιαῦτα] used adverbially. Cf. 318 A.—ὅπως ἂν...μηδὲν κακουργῶσι] See Jelf, § 810. 1. Heindorf on Phaedo 59 E. The latter shows that the principle of the aorist, as expressing a momentary action, holds good in the use of the conjunctive after ὅπως ἄν, whereas the present (like the imperfect indicative) implies continuance. Compare the note on 311 B.

B. εἰς τὰ κιθαρίσματα ἐντείνοντες] "setting them to music." Cf. Phaedo 60 D. ἐντείνας τοὺς τοῦ Αἰσώπου λόγους. Phileb. 38 E.

τὰ πρὸς αὐτὸν ῥηθέντα ἐντείνας εἰς φωνήν. Ar. Nub. 969. ἐντειναμένους τὴν ἁρμονίαν ἣν οἱ πατέρες παρέδωκαν. So *intendere* in Latin: Pers. VI. 4. Atque marem strepitum fidis intendisse Latinae.—τοὺς ῥυθμούς...οἰκειοῦσθαι ταῖς ψυχαῖς] Comp. Rep. III. 401 D. καταδύεται εἰς τὸ ἐντὸς τῆς ψυχῆς ὅ τε ῥυθμὸς καὶ ἁρμονία, καὶ ἐρρωμενέστατα ἅπτεται αὐτῆς φέροντα τὴν εὐσχημοσύνην, καὶ ποιεῖ εὐσχήμονα, ἐάν τις ὀρθῶς τραφῇ.—γιγνόμενοι] Hirschig's conjecture γενόμενοι is approved by Dr Thompson.—πᾶς γὰρ ὁ βίος δεῖται] Comp. Cic. Off. I. 40. (145).—ἔτι τοίνυν...πέμπουσιν] Rep. III. 403 C. μετὰ δὴ μουσικὴν γυμναστικῇ θρεπτέοι οἱ νεανίαι.

C. καὶ ταῦτα ποιοῦσιν οἱ μάλιστα δυνάμενοι] "This is what is done by those who are best able to educate their sons:" in other words, "I have described the highest standard of education." This need not imply, as Heindorf thinks, that those who cannot reach that standard are to have no education at all: though his conjecture, ποιοῦσι μάλιστα οἱ μάλιστα δυνάμενοι, would undoubtedly yield a clearer sense.—πρωϊαίτατα is to be joined with τῆς ἡλικίας. Compare Jelf, § 527.—ἐκ διδασκάλων ἀπαλλαγῶσιν] Crat. 407 D. ἐκ μὲν οὖν θεῶν πρὸς θεῶν ἀπαλλαγῶμεν.—κατὰ τούτους ζῆν κατὰ παράδειγμα] i. e. ὡς κατὰ παράδειγμα. Comp. Ar. Plut. 314. σὺ δ' Ἀρίστυλλος ὑποχάσκων ἐρεῖς, with Dobree's note in Advers. Plat. Polit. 298 B. χρήματα μισθὸν λαμβάνοντες. Legg. VIII. 836 A. γυναικῶν ἀνδρῶν καὶ ἀνδρῶν γυναικῶν. IX. 854 E. τοὺς δὲ ἄλλους παράδειγμα ὀνήσει γενόμενος ἀκλεής.

D. ὑπογράψαντες γραμμὰς...διδόασι] "rule lines beforehand with their pen, and thus set the copy." ὑπογράφειν in Plato means (1) either to *draw* or *write beforehand*, as in the text: γραμμὰς however, which cannot mean "letters," restricts it to the former: (2) to *prescribe*, e.g. νόμους, Legg. IV. 711 B. V. 734 E. This is not the sense, however, of νόμους ὑπογράψασα just below: keeping up the metaphor from γραμμάς, the laws are here compared to lines which the state draws in order to define the limits of right action: (3) to *sketch in outline*, Lat. *adumbrare:* Theaet. 171 D. ᾗ ἡμεῖς ὑπεγράψαμεν. Legg. XI. 934 C. καθάπερ ζώγραφον ὑπογράφειν ἔργα ἑπόμενα τῇ γραφῇ. For the use of οὕτω comp. on 310 D. —ὡς δὲ καὶ ἡ πόλις] Comp. Rep. VII. 530 D. κινδυνεύει ὡς πρὸς ἀστρονομίαν ὄμματα πέπηγεν, ὡς πρὸς ἐναρμόνιον φορὰν ὦτα παγῆναι. According to Heindorf and Stallbaum these are the only two passages in Attic *prose* in which ὡς for οὕτως occurs: but comp. below 338 A.

XVI. E. ἐν τοῖς ἔμπροσθεν] At 323 A.

327 *οὐδένα δεῖ ἰδιωτεύειν*] No one must be an *ἰδιώτης*, but every one an *ἐπαΐων* or *δημιουργός*. See above, on 312 B. and compare 327 C. *δίκαιον αὐτὸν εἶναι καὶ δημιουργὸν τούτου τοῦ πράγματος* (*τῆς δικαιοσύνης*).—*ἐνθυμήθητι...προελόμενος*] "rem considera quovis alio studiorum disciplinarumque genere *in exemplum* assumpto." Heindorf.—*ἐπέπληττε τὸν μὴ καλῶς αὐλοῦντα*] Stallbaum, after Heindorf, objects to this accusative, which is supported only by Il. XXIII. 580. *ἄλλον ἐπιπλήξειν Δαναῶν*, and a verse preserved by Stobæus, *κακοὶ γὰρ εὐτυχοῦντες ἐπιπλήττουσί με*, both instances admitting of easy correction. He therefore joins the words *πᾶς πάντα ἐδίδασκε τὸν μὴ καλῶς αὐλοῦντα*, leaving *καὶ ἐπέπληττε* out of the construction; as is the case with *οὐδ' ἀποκρύπτεται* below. Cf. Phaedo 94 D, with Wagner's note.—*καὶ μὴ ἐφθόνει τούτου*] *ἐφθόνει* does not mean "envied his accomplishment," but "grudged imparting it;" as at 320 B. *μὴ φθονήσῃς, ἀλλ' ἐπίδειξον*.

B. *οἴει ἄν τι, ἔφη, μᾶλλον...γίγνεσθαι*] i. e. *οἴει μᾶλλον τι ἂν γίγνεσθαι*, *ἂν* being thrown forward as much as possible, by a well-known rule: see on 311 B. For the position of *τι*, compare Xen. Cyrop. 1. 6. 11. *οἴει τι, ἔφη, ἧττόν τι τοῦτο εἶναι αἰσχρόν*. Plat. Lys. 204 E. *οὐ γὰρ πάνυ, ἔφη, τι αὐτοῦ τοὔνομα λέγουσιν*.

C. *οὗτος ἂν ἐλλόγιμος ηὐξήθη*] i. e. *ὥστε ἐλλόγιμος γίγνεσθαι*, by a *prolepsis adjectivi*, Jelf, § 439. 2. Comp. Rep. IV. 424 E. *ἐννόμους τε καὶ σπουδαίους ἐξ αὐτῶν ἄνδρας αὐξάνεσθαι*. VIII. 565 C. *τοῦτον τρέφειν τε καὶ αὔξειν μέγαν*. Legg. III. 681 A. *τῶν οἰκήσεων τούτων μειζόνων αὐξανομένων ἐκ τῶν ἐλαττόνων*. Xen. Cyrop. IV. 2. 3. Dem. Olynth. II. p. 19. § 5. Philipp. III. p. 116. § 27. Eur. Bacch. 183. So *ἀρθεὶς μέγας*, Ar. Vesp. 1023. Dem. Olynth. II. p. 20. § 8. Aesch. Agam. 751. *μέγαν τελεσθέντα φωτὸς ὄλβον*. Eur. Med. 296. *ἐκδιδάσκεσθαι σοφούς*.—*ἀλλ' οὖν αὐληταί γ' ἄν*] "Frequens *ἀλλ' οὖν γε*. Soph. 254 C. *ἀλλ' οὖν λόγου γε ἐνδεεῖς μηδὲν γιγνώμεθα*. Aeschin. adv. Ctes. § 3. *ἀλλ' οὖν προβάλλεταί γέ τι πρὸ τῆς αἰσχύνης*. al. vel etiam *ἀλλὰ...γοῦν*, ut Phaedon. 71 B. Vulgata scriptura orta videtur ex *διττογραφίᾳ*. Sed *ἀλλ' οὖν...γοῦν* fateor me non meminisse usquam legere." Stallbaum; who brackets *οὖν*, while Ast cancels it. The above instances support Mr Shilleto's conjecture *γ' ἄν* for *γοῦν*, of the correctness of which I think there can be little doubt. *ἄν*, though not indispensable, is certainly wanted. [It would appear that others have hit upon the same correction. Kroschel assigns it to Nattmann: Hirschig gives it as his own.]—*ἐν νόμοις καὶ ἀνθρώποις τεθραμμένων*] Comp. Legg. I. 625 A. *ἐπειδὴ δὲ ἐν τοιούτοις ἤθεσι τέθραφθε νομικοῖς*. *ἀνθρώποις*, "civilized men,"

opposed to the ἄγριοί τινες just below.—δίκαιον αὐτὸν εἶναι...εἰ δέοι] Note the omission of ἄν, which makes the assertion more confident. The apodosis is first stated as a fact, οἷον δίκαιον αὐτὸν εἶναι, and then shown to have been only conditional by the protasis εἰ δέοι. This is common enough with the indicative (comp. Jelf, § 858), but rare with the infinitive. The directness of the statement is increased by the return to the indicative in ἐστὶ immediately afterwards: see above on 318 B.—κρίνεσθαι πρός] "to be *judged in comparison* with," i. e. "to be compared with."

D. ἀλλ' εἶεν ἄγριοί τινες] "but whom we are to suppose savages." Comp. Rep. VIII. 549 A. καὶ δούλοις μέν τις ἂν ἄγριος εἴη ὁ τοιοῦτος. Meno, 89 E. οὐ μήτε διδάσκαλοι μήτε μαθηταὶ εἶεν, καλῶς ἂν αὐτὸ εἰκάζοντες εἰκάζοιμεν μὴ διδακτὸν εἶναι.—οὓς πέρυσι...ἐπὶ Ληναίῳ] Athenaeus says (v. p. 240) that the play of Pherecrates called Ἄγριοι, was produced in B.C. 421; and proceeds to charge Plato with confusion of ideas as to the time when he conceived this dialogue to be held. Unquestionably most of the circumstances mentioned point to a much earlier date: Alcibiades is πρῶτον ὑπηνήτης (init.), and the sons of Pericles, who died before him in the plague B.C. 430, are present at the discussion (315 A. 328 C). Socrates himself is still comparatively young, and is treated as such by Protagoras (314 B. 361 E). On the other hand, since Callias acts as master of the house, his father Hipponicus was probably dead: he was killed at Delium, B.C. 424. Schleiermacher, who discusses these and some other chronological difficulties, decides in favour of B.C. 432; suggesting that the comedy might have been already produced previous to the representation mentioned by Athenaeus, and that Hipponicus might have been abroad, perhaps in the army before Potidaea. According to Brandis, the Protagoras points to the eighty-seventh Olympiad (B.C. 432—429), and any more exact determination is disputable (Dict. of Biogr., art. *Prodicus*).—Εὐρυβάτῳ καὶ Φρυνώνδᾳ] The profligacy of these men had made their names proverbial. Aeschin. in Ctes. p. 73. § 137. ἀλλ' οἶμαι, οὔτε Φρυνώνδας οὔτ' Εὐρύβατος οὔτ' ἄλλος τις τῶν πάλαι πονηρῶν τοιοῦτος μάγος καὶ γόης ἐγένετο.

E. δύνανται ἕκαστος] Jelf, § 478.—οὐδείς σοι φαίνεται. εἶθ' ὥσπερ κ.τ.λ.] Not being able to assign any satisfactory meaning to εἶτα, Heindorf proposes φαίνεται εἶναι. ὥσπερ...and this conjecture is approved by Stallbaum. If any alteration were required, I should much prefer C. F. Hermann's reading, φαίνεται εἷς· it derives some support from the εἷς following, and the change of Θ into C is the

slightest possible. But later editors retain the MS. reading, referring to Ar. Nub. 581. *εἶτα τὸν θεοῖσιν ἐχθρὸν βυρσοδέψην Παφλαγόνα| ἡνίχ' ᾑρεῖσθε στρατηγόν*...where *εἶτα* undoubtedly has the meaning "for example." Kroschel remarks: "videntur Graeci particula *εἶτα* nonnunquam paulo liberius usi esse, ut a nostratibus partic. *nun* saepe usurpatur."

328 "For instance, if you were to inquire for a teacher of Greek, not a single one would be forthcoming; nor yet, I imagine, if you were to ask who could instruct the sons of our mechanics in the very trade which they have each learnt already from their father, as well as he and his friends in the same trade were able to teach them; if you asked, I say, who could teach them further (*ἔτι*), I think it would be hard to find an instructor for them; whereas for boys altogether ignorant of the trade, it would be quite easy: and this is the case with virtue and all those other qualities." The sentence is perplexed by a double anacoluthon; by the repetion of *οὐ ῥᾴδιον οἶμαι* after *οὐδέ γ' ἄν, οἶμαι*, and of *τούτους ἔτι τις ἂν διδάξειε* after *τίς ἂν ἡμῖν διδάξειε·* but the meaning is sufficiently clear. *ἡμῖν* is the dativus commodi.—*ἀλλὰ κἂν εἰ...ἀγαπητόν*] The order of the words is: *ἀλλὰ (εἴη) ἂν ἀγαπητόν, καὶ εἰ ἔστι τις ὅστις ὀλίγον διαφέρει ἡμῶν προβιβ. εἰς ἀρ.* It is in this way that the construction of *κἂν εἰ* and *ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ* in such cases is to be explained. See above on 311 B, below 341 C. 343 E. 346 D. For the constr. *διαφέρει ἡμῶν προβιβάσαι*, cf. Gorg. 527 B. *ἀλλὰ γὰρ μεταβιβάζειν τὰς ἐπιθυμίας...οὐδὲν τούτων διέφερον ἐκεῖνοι.* Rep. VI. 495 E. *δοκεῖς οὖν τι, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, διαφέρειν αὐτοὺς ἰδεῖν ἀργυρίου κτησαμένου χαλκέως.*

B. *ὀνῆσαί τινα*] This, the reading of all recent editions, was first proposed by Dobree, Advers. II. 391. According to the common reading *νοῆσαι τινὰ, τινὰ* of course is the neuter plural, "that I have some *notions*." But compare Rep. x. 600 D. *εἴπερ οἷός τ' ἦν πρὸς ἀρετὴν ὀνῆσαι τοὺς ἀνθρώπους.* That the words are often confounded is shown by the various readings on Theaet. 169 C. Gorg. 512 A. Translate: "I think that I could assist a man in becoming an accomplished gentleman." In Riddell's Dig. § 128 *νοῆσαι* is retained, and the passage translated "to notice a person [favourably] in regard of his fitness for becoming," &c. This must have been an oversight: the sense thus elicited is much less suitable to the context.—*τὸν τρόπον...πεποίημαι*] "The plan I have adopted in requiring payment is this." Observe *τοιοῦτον* with reference to what follows, for the more strictly correct *τοιόνδε.*—*ἐπειδὰν*

γὰρ] γὰρ introduces the explanation, like *videlicet* or *quippe:* "that is to say," "namely."—ἀποδέδωκεν...κατέθηκε] The change of tense is not without its significance: ἀποδέδωκε, "pays down at once," κατέθηκε, "proceeds to pay." Comp. Phaedo 80 D. αὕτη δὲ δὴ ἡμῖν ἡ τοιαύτη καὶ οὕτω πεφυκυῖα ἀπαλλαττομένη τοῦ σώματος εὐθὺς διαπεφύσηται καὶ ἀπόλωλεν. Theaet. 183 C. τούτων γὰρ περανθέντων καὶ ἐμὲ δεῖ ἀπηλλάχθαι, "I ought at once to be discharged."—ἐλθὼν εἰς ἱερὸν ὀμόσας] Comp. Aeschin. in Timarch. p. 16. § 114. λαβὼν εἰς τὴν ἑαυτοῦ χεῖρα τὰ ἱερὰ καὶ ὀμόσας μὴ λαβεῖν δῶρα...εἰληφὼς ἠλέγχθη.

C. τῶνδε] "Ad praesentes Paralum et Xanthippum, ut semper pronom. ὅδε, refertur." Heindorf. For the omission of ἐστὶ cf. Theaet. 143 D. σοὶ δὴ οὐκ ὀλίγιστοι πλησιάζουσι, καὶ δικαίως· ἄξιος γὰρ τά τε ἄλλα καὶ γεωμετρίας ἕνεκα.

D. ἐπὶ μὲν πολὺν...ἔβλεπον] "for some time still continued gazing at him as if enchanted." I think κεκηλημένος and ἔβλεπον should be taken together, both being comprised in the idea of "fascination." Comp. Menex. 235 A. ἑκάστοτε ἕστηκα ἀκροώμενος καὶ κηλούμενος. Ibid. B. οὕτως ἔναυλος ὁ λόγος τε καὶ ὁ φθόγγος παρὰ τοῦ λέγοντος ἐνδύεται εἰς τὰ ὦτα, ὥστε μόγις τετάρτῃ ἢ πέμπτῃ ἡμέρᾳ ἀναμιμνήσκομαι ἐμαυτοῦ καὶ αἰσθάνομαι οὗ γῆς εἰμί.

E. ἡγούμην οὐκ εἶναι] See on 317 A.—νῦν δὲ πέπεισμαι] The reader unversed in Plato must here be reminded that this apparent acquiescence is only a specimen of the Socratic irony, and the prelude to the utter discomfiture of Protagoras.—ἐπεκδιδάξει] "will proceed to explain." Euthyphr. 7 A.

329 εἰ δὲ ἐπανέροιτο, κ.τ.λ.] "but if he should ask one of them any thing further, like books they are unable either to give an answer or to ask any question themselves: nay, if one were to put even a trifling question about what they have said, just as brazen vessels when struck ring long and continue ringing, unless you apply your hand to them, so these orators when asked some trifling question spin out their reply to great length." To suppose, with Stallbaum, an opposition between ἐπανέροιτο and ἐπερωτήσῃ, as if two different kinds of questions were meant, or to read οὐχ ὥσπερ τὰ βιβλία with C. F. Hermann, is to miss the point of the passage: there is a real opposition, but no contradiction, between the short and pertinent answers which the orators cannot make, and the long rambling speeches which they can.—μακρὸν ἠχεῖ καὶ ἀποτείνει] sc. τὸν ἦχον. Comp. Gorg. 458 C. καὶ νῦν ἴσως πόρρω ἀποτενοῦμεν, ἢν διαλεγώμεθα, where in like manner τὸν λόγον is implied in διαλεγώ-

μεθα. In *μακρὸν ἀποτείνει* there is a prolepsis, as at 327 C. *ἐλλόγιμος ηὐξήθη*. Comp. 335 C. *ἀποτείνοντα μακροὺς λόγους*. 336 C. 361 A.—*δολιχὸν κατατείνουσι τοῦ λόγου*] Here likewise *δολιχὸν* = *ὥστε δολιχὸν εἶναι*. The expression is clearly equivalent to *δολιχὸν τὸν λόγον κατατείνουσι·* but it is difficult to decide whether *δολιχὸν* is masculine or neuter. We have such phrases as *ἄτοπα τῆς σμικρολογίας*, Theaet. 175 A. *ἀμήχανον εὐδαιμονίας*, Apol. 41 C: others, like the present, ambiguous, as in Rep. I. 328 E. *χαλεπὸν τοῦ βίου*. Epist. VI. 322 E. *συχνὸν τοῦ βίου·* others again where the adjective follows the gender of the noun, Crat. 391 B. *ὀρθοτάτη τῆς σκέψεως*. Rep. III. 416 B. *τὴν μεγίστην τῆς εὐλαβείας*. Gorg. 519 E. *συχνοὺς τείνω τῶν λόγων*.

B. *ὡς αὐτὰ δηλοῖ*] "as the fact proves." *αὐτὸ* is more usual in phrases of this kind, e.g. *αὐτὸ δείξει*, Hipp. Maj. 288 B. *αὐτὸ σημανεῖ*, Eur. Bacch. 976. *αὐτό που λέγει*, Ar. Eq. 204. But the plural is justified by Xen. Cyrop. VI. 1. 7. *ὅπου αὐτὰ τὰ ἔργα δεικνύει τὸ κράτιστον*.—*ἃ ὀλίγοις ἐστὶ παρεσκευασμένα*, "which is an accomplishment few possess."—*σμικροῦ τινὸς...τόδε*] The optative is well accounted for by Heindorf: "In his *σμικροῦ τινος ἐνδεής εἰμι ὥστε πάντ' ἔχειν*, *nunc paullulum quid requiro ut omnia habeam*, quum haec lateat sententia, *νῦν οὖν πάντ' ἂν ἔχοιμι*, recte subjunguntur seqq. *εἴ μοι ἀποκρίναιο τόδε*.—*εἴπερ ἄλλῳ τῳ...καὶ σοὶ πείθομαι*] "if I would believe any one at all (supposing him to say so), I believe you." When the conditional protasis itself depends on some other (expressed or implied) condition, *ἂν* is used with *εἰ*. Cf. Jelf, § 860. 1. Dem. Fals. Leg. p. 395. § 190. *ἐπεὶ εἰ μὴ διὰ τὸ τούτους βούλεσθαι σῶσαι, ἐξώλης ἀπολοίμην καὶ προώλης, εἰ προσλαβών γ' ἂν ἀργύριον πάνυ πολὺ μετὰ τούτων ἐπρέσβευσα·* with Mr Shilleto's note. Editors object to the repetition *πειθοίμην ἄν... πείθομαι*, but are not agreed as to which word they would expunge.

C. *ὃ δ' ἐθαύμασά σου...ἀποπλήρωσον*] "as to what I wondered at in you while you were speaking, on this pray satisfy my mind." Comp. Theaet. 161 B. *ὃ θαυμάζω τοῦ ἑταίρου σου Πρωταγόρου*. Apol. 17 A. *μάλιστα δὲ αὐτῶν ἓν ἐθαύμασα τῶν πολλῶν ὧν ἐψεύσαντο*. Meno 95 C. *καὶ Γοργίου μάλιστα ταῦτα ἄγαμαι*. Polit. 286 A. *οὗ δειχθέντος τὴν τοῦ πυνθανομένου ψυχὴν ὁ βουλόμενος ἀποπληρῶσαι, πρὸς τῶν αἰσθήσεων τινὰ προσαρμόττων, ἱκανῶς πληρώσει*.—*πολλαχοῦ ἐν τοῖς λόγοις*] cf. 323 A. 323 E. 325 A.—*ἡ δικαιοσύνη...ὁσιότης*] See below on 357 A.—*ἃ νῦν δὴ ἐγὼ ἔλεγον*] "which I just now mentioned." *δὴ* gives emphasis and exactness to the time implied by the verb: *νῦν δὴ* is therefore with a past tense "just now,"

with a present "at this very moment," with a future "immediately." The usage with past tenses is almost confined to Plato (Shilleto Fals. Leg. § 72), but occurs Ar. Pac. 5, ποῦ γὰρ ἦν νῦν δὴ 'φέρες; Examples in reference to future time are collected by Heindorf on Soph. 221 C. Comp. above 317 E. νῦν δὴ ἄν, ἔφη, λέγοις, and for one with the present, below 349 A. Plato rarely omits δὴ with a past tense: Theaet. 142 B. καὶ νῦν ἤκουον.

D. ὃ ἔτι ἐπιποθῶ] Rep. IX. 571 A. οἶσθ' οὖν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ὃ ἔτι ἐπιποθῶ.—ἑνὸς ὄντος τῆς ἀρετῆς] See on 354 C.—ὥσπερ προσώπου τὰ μόρια μόριά ἐστι] The features of a face are *parts* in a different sense from the particles of gold, because they differ from one another. Hence μόρια is repeated.—ἀλλ' ἦ] Comp. Jelf, § 773. 5. Riddell, § 148.

E. μεταλαμβάνουσιν...ἄλλο] μεταλαμβάνω, μετέχω, μέτειμι only take the acc. with μέρος or μοῖρα, i.e. when the word itself expresses the *partitive* genitive. Jelf, § 535. Obs. 1. So here ἄλλο τῶν μορίων exactly = ἄλλο μέρος.—Ἔστι γὰρ οὖν καὶ ταῦτα] "What, are these then parts of virtue?" the γὰρ denoting surprise. There is no reason to suppose, with Ast, that γὰρ οὖν cannot be used interrogatively.

330 ἄλλο, τὸ δὲ ἄλλο] i.e. τὸ μὲν ἄλλο, τὸ δὲ ἄλλο. A constant ellipse in Plato: see below 331 B. 334 A. 343 E. 355 D. Phileb. 56 D. πῇ ποτε διορισάμενος οὖν ἄλλην, τὴν δὲ ἄλλην θείη τις ἂν ἀριθμητικήν; Polit. 291 E. Rep. V. 451 E.—οὐκ ἔστιν ὀφθαλμός. It is observable that the asyndeton is especially frequent when the second statement explains or illustrates the first. Comp. 330 E. ἆρ' οὐκ ὀρθῶς ὑμῶν κατήκουσα; ἐδόξατέ μοι φάναι. 343 D. 348 A. 352 A.

B. ἢ δῆλα δὴ...] See on 309 A.

C. τὴν αὐτὴν ἐμοί, ἢ ἄλλην;] For the omission of πότερον, see Theaet. 151 E. γόνιμον ἢ ἀνεμιαῖον τυγχάνει ὄν. 161 D. ὀρθὴ ἢ ψευδής. Ibid. 203 A. Phileb. 27 E. Legg. II. 670 B. IX. 859 A. Phædr. 270 A.—τοιοῦτον...οἷον δίκαιον εἶναι] "The nature then of justice is to be just." So below: φατὲ τοιοῦτον πεφυκέναι οἷον ἀνόσιον εἶναι...and 331 A. οὐκ ἄρα ἐστὶν ὁσιότης οἷον δίκαιον εἶναι πρᾶγμα.

D. Εὐφήμει, κ.τ.λ.] "Mind what you say, my friend: it will be hard indeed for anything else to be holy, if," &c. σχολῇ in Plato has often the sense of *vix:* sometimes *vix ac ne vix quidem,* or with εἰ preceding, as here, "much less:" Phaedo 65 B. εἰ αὗται τῶν περὶ τὸ σῶμα αἰσθήσεων μὴ ἀκριβεῖς εἰσι μηδὲ σαφεῖς, σχολῇ γε

αἱ ἄλλαι. For the use of *μέντοι*, comp. 309 A. 339 E. Sympos. 176 B. *τοῦτο μέντοι εὖ λέγεις*, with Stallbaum's note. Jelf, § 880 f.

E. *ἐδόξατέ μοι φάναι*] "You said, if I remember right;" as at 314 C. 315 E. See also on 330 A.—*τὰ* before *μόρια* was first inserted by Hirschig, followed by Sauppe and Kroschel.

331 *Οὐκ ἄρα ἐστὶν...τὸ δὲ ἀνόσιον;*] "It appears, then, that it is not the nature of holiness to be a just thing, nor yet of justice to be a holy thing: but rather to be one that is not holy, and so of holiness to be a thing that is not just: so that, if the premisses be true (*ἄρα* inferential), the one (*τὸ μὲν*, sc.) is an unjust as the other is an unholy thing."

B. *ἤτοι ταὐτόν γε ἐστι*] Most modern editors omit *γέ*, with the two best MSS. But comp. Apol. 27 D. *τοὺς δὲ δαίμονας οὐχὶ ἤτοι θεούς γε ἡγούμεθα ἢ θεῶν παῖδας;* Gorg. 460 A. 467 E.

C. *τί τοῦτο διαφέρει;*] "what does it matter?" The reader might easily be misled by the *διάφορον* preceding.—*Μή μοι...ἀφέλοι αὐτοῦ*] "Pardon me," said I, "for I don't at all want your 'if you wish' and 'if you think so' to be put to proof, but myself and you. Now this is what I mean by 'myself and you:' I think the best way of sifting the matter under consideration will be to put 'ifs' out of the question." Comp. on 318 B. *ἀλλὰ μὴ οὕτως.*

D. *κἂν ταῦτα ἐλέγχοις*] There is in reality only one point to which *ταῦτα* refers, namely, that all things may be proved to be alike: but the plural is often used in such cases, e.g. Phaedo 70 D. *καὶ τοῦτο ἱκανὸν τεκμήριον τοῦ ταῦτ' εἶναι, εἰ τῷ ὄντι φανερὸν γένοιτο, ὅτι οὐδαμόθεν ἄλλοθεν γίγνονται οἱ ζῶντες ἢ ἐκ τῶν τεθνεώτων.* Gorg. 447 A. *τούτων μέντοι* (i. e. *τοῦ ἐπιδείξασθαι*) *αἴτιος Χαιρεφῶν ὅδε.*

E. *κἂν πάνυ σμικρὸν ἔχῃ τὸ ὅμοιον*] The force of the article must be preserved in translating: "even if the point of resemblance (or dissimilarity, as the case may be: there is no occasion to read *τὸ ἀνόμοιον ἢ τὸ ὅμοιον*) which it possesses be very minute." —*Ἦ γὰρ οὕτω σοι...ἀλλήλοις*] "Is that your idea of the relation between justice and holiness, that they have 'some small point' of resemblance?"—*ου μέντοι οὐδὲ αὖ ὡς*—] "Referas *οὐ* ad verbum primarium vel universam sententiam: *οὐδὲ* ad *οὕτως*, quod in voc. *ὡς* continetur." Stallbaum.

332 *τόδε δὲ...ἐπισκεψώμεθα*] "Let us select for examination the following from among those you named."—*Ἀφροσύνην τι καλεῖς;*] "Is there a *thing* you call folly?" So 332 C. *ἔστι τι καλόν; ἔστι τι ἀγαθόν;* "is there such a *thing* as beauty? as good?" Comp.

Soph. 237 D. Καὶ τοῦτό ἡμῖν που φανερόν, ὡς καὶ τὸ τὶ τοῦτο ῥῆμα (this word *something*) ἐπ' ὄντι λέγομεν ἑκάστοτε· μόνον γὰρ αὐτὸ λέγειν, ὥσπερ γυμνὸν καὶ ἀπηρημωμένον ἀπὸ τῶν ὄντων ἁπάντων, ἀδύνατον.—πᾶν τοὐναντίον] Comp. on 317 B. τὴν ἐναντίαν ἅπασαν ὁδόν.—ἢ τοὐναντίον] i. e. ἢ μὴ σωφρονεῖν. The MSS. read ἢ εἰ τοὐναντίον ἔπραττον. But ἔπραττον cannot be right after ὅταν πράττωσιν and though εἰ may be defended (as by Winckelmann, who compares p. 344 E. Rep. II. 370 B.) it is better, with most recent editors, to treat both words as a gloss.

C. Τούτῳ μή ἐστι τι ἐναντίον......;] This is nearly the same as τούτῳ ἐστι τι ἐναντίον just above, but implies a more decided expectation of an answer in the negative.

D. ἀναλογισώμεθα τὰ ὡμολογημένα ἡμῖν.] "Let us sum up our admissions." Cf. Rep. VII. 524 D. ἀλλ' ἐκ τῶν προειρημένων, ἔφην, ἀναλογίζου. The usual meaning in Plato, as elsewhere, is to "think over."

E. 'Εναντίον ἄρ' ἐστὶν ἀφροσύνη σωφροσύνῃ] The modern editors read σωφροσύνῃ from one MS. in place of σωφροσύνης, in order to produce uniformity throughout the passage. I mention this "in tironum gratiam," to show that the genitive or dative is used with perfect indifference.—Πότερον...λύσωμεν τῶν λόγων] λύσωμεν, "are we to retract:" Gorg. 480 E. οὐκοῦν ἢ κἀκεῖνα λυτέον, ἢ τάδε ἀνάγκη συμβαίνειν. This is not quite the same in sense as λύεται ἡ ἀπορία, "the difficulty is solved," above 324 E. but rather resembles the phrase λύειν νόμον, to *abrogate* a law.

333 τὸ ἓν ἑνὶ μόνον, κ.τ.λ.] "that which maintained that one thing," &c. For this use of the neuter article comp. Phaedo 94 B. εἰ ὀρθὴ ἡ ὑπόθεσις ἦν, τὸ ψυχὴν ἁρμονίαν εἶναι.—πρὸς τῷ ἕτερον εἶναι] Comp. Legg. VI. 773 C. πρὸς τῷ γελοῖα εἶναι θυμὸν ἂν ἐγείραι πολλοῖς. Without εἶναι: Sympos: 195 C. νέος μὲν οὖν ἐστί· πρὸς δὲ τῷ νέῳ ἁπαλός.—οὐ πάνυ μουσικῶς...συναρμόττουσιν ἀλλήλοις] "Gorg. 461 A. ἡγησάμενος οὐ συνᾴδειν τὰ λεγόμενα. Theaet. 175 E. οὐδέ γ' ἁρμονίαν λόγων λαβόντας. Soph. 261 D. τὰ μὲν ἐφεξῆς λεγόμενα καὶ δηλοῦντά τι ξυναρμόττει, τὰ δὲ τῇ συνεχείᾳ μηδὲν σημαίνοντα ἀναρμοστεῖ. Hipp. Maj. 292 C. al. Ceterum bene Heindorfius. 'In his lenem ignosco Sophistae irrisionem, qui supra 326 B. πάντα τὸν βίον εὐρυθμίας καὶ εὐαρμοστίας δεῖσθαι dixisset.'" Stallbaum.

B. πλείοσι δὲ μή] "Argumentationis ratio πλείω δὲ μὴ requirit, quod vellem codices suppeditassent. Idem Heindorfius desideravit." Stallbaum. This is true as regards the mere *form* of the argument; but ἐν ἑνὶ μόνον ἐναντίον is a convertible proposition,

and it makes no difference in the reasoning whether *ἀφροσύνη is ἐναντίον πλείοσιν*, or *has πλείω ἐναντία*.—ἦ γάρ, ὦ Πρωταγόρα] sc. οὕτως ἔχει, i. e. οὐ συνᾴδειν τοὺς λόγους τούτους.—τὸ δὲ πρότερον αὖ... ταὐτὸν ὄν] "while just before, on the other hand, it was proved (ἐφάνη ὄν) to us that justice and holiness are pretty much the same thing."—ὅτι ἀδικεῖ] "*in that* he acts unjustly." ὅ τι would be wrong.

C. Αἰσχυνοίμην ἄν...τῶν ἀνθρώπων] "I should be ashamed for my part, Socrates, to avow this: (for *my* part, I say,) since there are many who do." The latter part of the sentence is added in explanation of the emphatic ἔγωγε· hence ἐπεὶ has in appearance, though not in reality, the sense of "though." Cf. below 335 C.—εἴτ' οὖν δοκεῖ...εἴτε μή] These words depend on ἀποκρίνῃ, not on διαφέρει..."if you will only answer whether this be your own opinion or not."

D. ἐκαλλωπίζετο] "affected shyness," as at Sympos. 174 A: a somewhat different meaning of the word from that at 317 C, though it may be referred to the same general notion of "giving oneself airs," "putting on a *fair appearance*."—Τὸ δὲ σωφρονεῖν... ὅτι ἀδικοῦσιν] "And by being prudent, do you mean thinking rightly?" He said yes. "And by thinking rightly that they are well advised when they act unjustly?" ὅτι ἀδικοῦσιν, as ὅτι ἀδικεῖ above.

E. τετραχύνθαι τε καὶ ἀγωνιᾶν καὶ παρατετάχθαι] "to be exasperated and agitated and doggedly prepared to answer." παρατάσσεσθαι is properly applied to soldiers drawn up in line of battle, whence its use of one who "makes a determined stand" in argument.

334 πολλὰ οἶδ', ἃ ἀνθρώποις μὲν κ.τ.λ.] Stallbaum well remarks that the perplexed character of this sentence is in accordance with the feelings of the speaker. To render it intelligible, we must supply τὰ μὲν before ἀνωφελῆ (see on 330 A.), corresponding to τὰ δέ γε ὠφέλιμα· the apodosis to ἀνθρώποις μὲν (τὰ μὲν ἀνωφελῆ ..τὰ δέ γε ὠφέλιμα) will then be τὰ δὲ (ἀνθρώποις μὲν οὐδέτερα, ἵπποις δέ). Translate: "I know of many things, some of which are hurtful to men, such as meats, drinks, drugs, and many other things, whilst others are beneficial; and of many more which to men are neither the one nor the other, whereas to horses they may be either." After ἵπποις δὲ it is easy to supply the opposite of οὐδέτερα, i. e. ἢ ὠφέλιμα ἢ ἀνωφελῆ.—ἀνωφελὴς in Attic has often a bad sense, like the Lat. *inutilis*; e. g. Xen. Hell. I. 7.

27. Mem. II. 6. 4, and such appears to be its meaning in Rep. VIII. 560 D. *μετὰ πολλῶν καὶ ἀνωφελῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν·* cf. 561 A. *τὴν τῶν μὴ ἀναγκαίων καὶ ἀνωφελῶν ἡδονῶν ἐλευθέρωσιν τε καὶ ἄνεσιν.*

B. *εἰ δ' ἐθέλοις...πάντα ἀπόλλυσιν*] Comp. Charm. 154 D. *οὗτος μέντοι, εἰ ἐθέλοι ἀποδῦναι, δόξει σοι ἀπρόσωπος εἶναι.* Thuc. II. 39. *εἰ...ἐθέλοιμεν κινδυνεύειν, περιγίγνεται ἡμῖν*...(where however Arnold reads *ἐθέλομεν*, after Bekker; see his note). See also above on 318 B.—*τοῖς μὲν ἔξωθεν...τῷ ἀνθρώπῳ*] Jelf, § 611. Obs. 1.

C. *ἀπαγορεύουσι τοῖς ἀσθενοῦσι μὴ χρῆσθαι*] In this construction *μὴ* is sometimes omitted, but rarely, Jelf, § 749. Obs. See also Buttm. Mid. Excurs. XI. The transition to the singular in *μέλλει* has been already noticed; cf. on 319 D.—*ὡς εὖ λέγοι*] "Paullo fortius hoc dictum quam *ὅτι οὕτως εὖ λέγοι*." Stallbaum. In fact it is "*how* well he spoke." Comp. Crito 43 B. *ἀλλὰ καὶ σοῦ πάλαι θαυμάζω αἰσθανόμενος, ὡς ἡδέως καθεύδεις.* Above 315 B. *ἰδὼν ἥσθην, ὡς καλῶς εὐλαβοῦντο.* So *ἀναθορυβεῖν* with nearly the same construction, Sympos. 198 A. *ἔφη ὁ Ἀριστόδημος ἀναθορυβῆσαι τοὺς παρόντας, ὡς πρεπόντως τοῦ νεανίου εἰρηκότος.*

E. *ὅτι σὺ οἷός τ' εἶ...διδάξαι*] "that you both possess the faculty yourself, and can teach it to others, of speaking," &c. This was also the boast of Gorgias and other Sophists: comp. Phaedr. 267 A. *Τισίαν δὲ Γοργίαν τε ἐάσομεν εὕδειν, οἳ πρὸ τῶν ἀληθῶν τὰ εἰκότα εἶδον ὡς τιμητέα μᾶλλον, τά τε αὖ σμικρὰ μέγαλα καὶ τὰ μέγαλα σμικρὰ φαίνεσθαι διὰ ῥώμην λόγου, καινά τ' ἀρχαίως τά τ' ἐναντία καινῶς, συντομίαν τε λόγων καὶ ἄπειρα μήκη περὶ πάντων ἀνεῦρον.* The passage may be consulted for some curious details about Polus, Protagoras, &c. Gorg. 449 C. ΓΟΡ. *Εἰσὶ μέν, ὦ Σώκρατες, ἔνιαι τῶν ἀποκρίσεων ἀναγκαῖαι διὰ μακρῶν τοὺς λόγους ποιεῖσθαι· οὐ μὴν ἀλλὰ πειράσομαί γε ὡς διὰ βραχυτάτων, καὶ γὰρ αὖ καὶ τοῦτο ἕν ἐστιν ὧν φημί, μηδένα ἂν ἐν βραχυτέροις ἐμοῦ τὰ αὐτὰ εἰπεῖν.* ΣΩ. *Τούτου μὴν δεῖ, ὦ Γοργία· καί μοι ἐπίδειξιν αὐτοῦ τούτου ποίησαι, τῆς βραχυλογίας, μακρολογίας δὲ εἰσαῦθις.* See also Meno 70 E.

335 *εἰ τοῦτο ἐποίουν...οὕτω διελεγόμην*] This sort of asyndeton is not unfrequent in Plato. Comp. Rep. II. 359 B. *μάλιστ' ἂν αἰσθοίμεθα εἰ τοιόνδε ποιήσαιμην τῇ διανοίᾳ, δόντες ἐξουσίαν ἑκατέρῳ ποιεῖν ὅ τι ἂν βούληται, τῷ τε δικαίῳ καὶ τῷ ἀδίκῳ, εἶτ' ἐπακολουθήσαιμεν θεώμενοι, ποῖ ἡ ἐπιθυμία ἑκάτερον ἄξει.*—*ὅτι οὐκ ἤρεσεν ...καὶ ὅτι οὐκ ἐθελήσοι*] The change from the indicative to the optative, from the fact to the more or less probable inference, explains itself. Comp. Rep. IV. 420 C. *λέγων ὅτι οὐ τοῖς καλλίστοις*

τοῦ ζώου τὰ κάλλιστα φάρμακα *προστίθεμεν*—οἱ γὰρ ὀφθαλμοὶ κάλλιστον ὂν οὐκ ὀστρείῳ ἐναληλιμμένοι εἶεν ἀλλὰ μέλανι. Euthyphr. extr. with Stallbaum's note. Thuc. II. 80. λέγοντες ὅτι...*κρατήσουσι*, καὶ ὁ περίπλους οὐκέτι *ἔσοιτο* Ἀθηναίοις. With the optative first, Thuc. VIII. 50. γνοὺς δὲ ὁ Φρύνιχος ὅτι *ἔσοιτο* (*there would most likely be*) περὶ τῆς τοῦ Ἀλκιβιάδου καθόδου λόγος καὶ ὅτι Ἀθηναῖοι *ἐνδέξονται* αὐτήν (*that if so, the result would be sure to follow*). Cf. Jelf, § 802.

B. ἐμὸν ἔργον, "my business:" a common phrase, as Gorg. 459 E. οὐ γὰρ σὸν ἔργον.

C. τὰ μακρὰ ταῦτα ἀδύνατος] i. e. οὐ δύναμαι. Comp. Polit. 295 B. ἐπεὶ τοῦτ' ἂν δυνατὸς ὤν, ὡς οἶμαι, κ.τ.λ.—ἐπεὶ ἐβουλόμην ἂν οἷός τ' εἶναι] For ἐπεὶ comp. on 333 C. The imperfect indicative shows that the speaker feels his wish cannot now be realized: "I should have liked." The ἂν (=*in that case*, Jelf, § 858. Obs. 3), brings out the impossibility still more clearly.—ἀλλὰ σὲ ἐχρῆν ...ἵνα συνουσία ἐγίγνετο] Here also he is speaking of what is past, and therefore impossible: he does not ask Protagoras to change his mind. It is common, but I think not strictly correct, to translate (as Jelf does, § 813) ἵνα ὡς ὅπως with the indicative by "in which case I should:" this fails to express the *final* conjunction, which ought rather to be rendered *that in that case*, or *that so*. "You who are master of both styles ought to have given way, that so a conversation might have taken place." It is to be observed that ἂν is never used in this construction, Jelf, l. c. Other examples in Plato are Crito 44 D, Meno 89 B, Sympos. 181 E; and with the aorist, Theaet. 161 C. ἵνα ἤρξατο. Euthyd. 304 E. ἵνα ἤκουσας.—ἀποτείνοντι μακροὺς λόγους] See above on 329 A.

D. τοῦ τρίβωνος τουτουΐ] The τρίβων of Socrates, his usual dress, is alluded to in Sympos. 219 B. Ar. Nub. 870...in the latter passage with a pun on the double meaning of "cloak" and "practised knave."—ἀνεστήκη] This form of the later Attic for -ειν is now restored to Plato wherever a MS. sanctions it. Stallbaum in his last edition (Praef. p. vii.), remarks that both forms occur indifferently. The same may be said of the augment, which in the pluperfect is either omitted (as here) or inserted.—καὶ νῦν is an emphatic *now*, opposed to ἀεὶ μέν. Comp. Rep. II. 367 E. Καὶ ἐγὼ ἀκούσας ἀεὶ *μὲν* δὴ τὴν φύσιν τοῦ τε Γλαύκωνος καὶ τοῦ Ἀδειμάντου ἠγάμην, ἀτὰρ οὖν *καὶ τότε* πάνυ γε ἥσθην καὶ εἶπον.

E. Κρίσωνι τῷ Ἱμεραίῳ δρομεῖ] "σταδιοδρόμος cursu is vicit certamine Olympico Ol. 83, 84, 85. Vid. Diod. Sic. XII. 5. 23. 29.

Dionys. Hal. Ant. Rom. XI. init. Pausan. v. 23." Heindorf. Dobree thought the words δρομεῖ ἀκμάζοντι spurious: and Hirschig brackets them.—δολιχοδρόμων...ἡμεροδρόμων] The former were those who could run the δόλιχος or long course, as distinguished from the σταδιοδρόμοι· the latter are described by Livy XXXI. 24. "hemerodromos vocant Graeci, ingens die uno cursu emetientes spatium."

336 εἴποιμι ἄν σοι] "Haec superioribus ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ δέοιο κ.τ.λ. adduntur, quasi non praecessisset νῦν δ' ἐστίν." Stallbaum.—πολὺ σοῦ μᾶλλον ἐγὼ ἐμαυτοῦ δέομαι] "I am much more anxious on my own account, than you can be for me."—ἀλλ' οὐ γὰρ δύναμαι] "But (I do not), *for* I cannot."—συγκαθεῖναι] intrans., "to bring himself down to my level." Comp. Theaet. 168 B. ἵλεῳ τῇ διανοίᾳ συγκαθεὶς ὡς ἀληθῶς σκέψει τί ποτε λέγομεν. Rep. VIII. 563 A. Ar. Eq. 430. ἔξειμι γάρ σοι λαμπρὸς ἤδη καὶ μέγας καθιείς.—ἀπεκρίνατο... αὐτὰ τὰ ἐρωτώμενα] For the constr. ἀποκρίνεσθαί τι, *ad aliquid respondere*, cf. Gorg. 448 D. Τὸ ἐρωτώμενον οὐ πάνυ μοι φαίνεται ἀποκρίνεσθαι. 449 B. Hipp. Maj. 287 A. Crito 48 D. See however below 338 D. the construction with πρός.

B. χωρὶς "a different thing," as we should say. Phileb. 44 A. εἴπερ χωρὶς τοῦ μὴ λυπεῖσθαι καὶ τοῦ χαίρειν ἡ φύσις. Euthyd. 289 D. Soph. Oed. Col. 808. χωρὶς τό τ' εἰπεῖν πολλὰ καὶ τὰ καίρια.—δημηγορεῖν] In Plato this means not merely to make long set speeches, but to use *ad captandum* arguments. Comp. Gorg. 482 C. ὦ Σώκρατες, δοκεῖς νεανιεύεσθαι ἐν τοῖς λόγοις ὡς ἀληθῶς δημηγόρος ὤν. καὶ νῦν ταῦτα δημηγορεῖς, where Heindorf renders it *nugari*. 503 B. 519 D. Theaet. 162 D. Rep. I. 350 E. Legg. VII. 817 C. So δημηγορικός, Gorg. 482 E. ubi Schol. δημηγορικὰ τὰ πρὸς τὴν τῶν πολλῶν βλέποντα δόξαν.—ὅπως ἂν αὖ σὺ βούλῃ] The construction is changed from ὅπως βούλεται for the sake of politeness: "how he likes" and "however you may be pleased to like."

XXIII. C. θαυμάζοιμ' ἂν εἰ...παραχωρεῖ] Comp. on 312 C. The regular constr. is παραχωρεῖν τινι τῆς ὁδοῦ. Xen. Cyr. VII. 5.20: thus we have here π. Πρωταγόρᾳ μακρολογίας, and π. τοῦ οἷός τ' εἶναι διαλέγεσθαι.—μακρὸν λόγον ἀποτείνων] See on 335 C.—ἐκκρούων τοὺς λόγους] "eluding the arguments." Comp. Dem. Fals. Leg. p. 385. § 157. ἐκκρούσας οὗτος εἰς τὴν ὑστεραίαν. Mid. p. 540. § 104. τοσαύτας τέχνας καὶ σκήψεις οὗτος εὑρίσκων ἐκκρούει. Boeot. de Dot. p. 1021. § 54. ἵνα...ἐξ ἀρχῆς με συκοφαντῇ καὶ τὴν δίκην ταυτὴν ἐκκρούῃ. Theaet. 154 E. ξυνελθόντες σοφιστικῶς εἰς μάχην τοιαύτην ἀλλήλων τοὺς λόγους τοῖς λόγοις ἐκρούομεν· where the old read-

ing was ἐκκρούομεν, and Heindorf proposes ἐξεκρούομεν. But his own note shows how the word may there be understood; "Vox ducta e pugilatu, cujus proprium κρούειν:" citing Rep. IV. 422 B.

D. οὐχ ὅτι] "although:" literally, "not but that." Theaet. 157 B. τὸ δ' εἶναι πανταχόθεν ἐξαιρετέον (*we must get rid of the idea of "being"*) οὐχ ὅτι ἡμεῖς πολλὰ καὶ ἄρτι ἠναγκάσμεθα ὑπὸ συνηθείας καὶ ἀνεπιστημοσύνης χρῆσθαι αὐτῷ. Gorg. 450 E. ἀλλ' οὔτοι τούτων γε οὐδεμίαν οἶμαί σε βούλεσθαι ῥητορικὴν καλεῖν, οὐχ ὅτι τῷ ῥήματι οὕτως εἶπες. Lys. 220 A. in the protasis, οὐχ ὅτι πολλάκις λέγομεν, ὡς περὶ πολλοῦ ποιούμεθα χρυσίον καὶ ἀργύριον· ἀλλὰ μὴ οὐδέν τι μᾶλλον οὕτω τό γε ἀληθὲς ἔχῃ.—ἐπιεικέστερα, "fairer, more reasonable." In Plato, ἐπιεικής is often merely = ἀγαθός, cf. 347 A. 348 E. and the note on 349 D.

E. διαλῦσαι τὴν ξυνουσίαν] Comp. Lys. 223 B. ἡττηθέντες οὖν αὐτῶν διελύσαμεν τὴν συνουσίαν. Hipp. Maj. 286 D. ἀπιὼν οὖν ἐκ τῆς συνουσίας ἐμαυτῷ ὠργιζόμην. In these places συνουσία is not the conversation, but the meeting itself, the *conversazione:* and so when it is used in the plural, as above 335 B. ἐν ταῖς συνουσίαις. Ar. Thesm. 21. αἱ σοφαὶ συνουσίαι.

337 ὁ Πρόδικος, Καλῶς μοι, ἔφη] He is here ridiculing the fondness of Prodicus for minute verbal distinctions: κοινὸς and ἴσος, ἀμφισβητεῖν and ἐρίζειν, εὐδοκιμεῖν and ἐπαινεῖσθαι, εὐφραίνεσθαι and ἥδεσθαι. Comp. below, 340 A. 341 A. 358 A. D. Charm. 163 D. καὶ γὰρ Προδίκου μυρία τινὰ ἀκήκοα περὶ ὀνομάτων διαιροῦντος. Euthyd. 277 E. πρῶτον γάρ, ὥς φησι Πρόδικος, περὶ ὀνομάτων ὀρθότητος μαθεῖν δεῖ. 305 C. Meno 75 E. Lach. 197 D. Phaedr. 267 B. Crat. 384 B.—κοινοὺς μὲν...ἴσους δὲ μή] The words are joined by Andoc. in Alcib. p. 29. § 7. Dem. de Cor. p. 227. § 8. Aphob. p. 844. § 1.—μὴ ἴσον δὲ νεῖμαι κ.τ.λ.] Comp. Gorg. 492 C. μηδὲν πλέον νέμοντες τοῖς φίλοις τοῖς αὐτῶν ἢ τοῖς ἐχθροῖς. Thuc. III. 48. μήτε οἴκτῳ πλέον νείμαντες μήτ' ἐπιεικείᾳ. The ellipse is supplied in a verse of Eurip. ap. Plat. Gorg. 484 E. νέμων τὸ πλεῖστον ἡμέρας τούτῳ μέρος.

B. ἀμφισβητεῖν μέν, ἐρίζειν δὲ μή] "to debate, but not to wrangle."—εὐδοκιμοῖτε καὶ οὐκ ἐπαινοῖσθε] καὶ οὐ, καὶ μή are rarely used for ἀλλ' οὐκ, ἀλλὰ μή (*instead of*). Eur. Orest. 543. 544. ζηλωτὸς ὅστις εὐτύχησεν εἰς τέκνα, | καὶ μὴ 'πισήμους ξυμφορὰς ἐκτήσατο.

C. ἀπεδέξαντο] "agreed:" the almost invariable sense of this word in Plato, e.g. 324 C. 339 D.—ἡγοῦμαι ἐγὼ ἡμᾶς] ἡμᾶς for ὑμᾶς is Heindorf's correction, now generally adopted. "Non

enim Hippias se a ceteris segregat, ut proxima verba ἡμᾶς οὖν αἰσχρὸν κ.τ.λ. probant." Kroschel.——φύσει, οὐ νόμῳ] Into the question whether the distinction here insisted on between "nature" and "convention" was really characteristic of the Sophists as a body, the negative of which has been maintained by Mr Grote, I shall not presume to enter critically: I will however set down a few passages, and leave the reader to draw his own conclusions. The present passage is, I think, decisive as regards Hippias: and it is confirmed by Xen. Memor. IV. 4. 14. *καὶ ὁ Ἱππίας, Νόμους δ' ἔφη, ὦ Σώκρατες, πῶς ἄν τις ἡγήσαιτο σπουδαῖον πρᾶγμα εἶναι ἢ τὸ πείθεσθαι αὐτοῖς, οὕς γε πολλάκις αὐτοὶ οἱ θέμενοι ἀποδοκιμάσαντες μετατίθενται.* Of Protagoras: Theaet. 172 B. *ἀλλ' ἐκεῖ οὗ λέγω, ἐν τοῖς δικαίοις καὶ ἀδίκοις καὶ ὁσίοις καὶ ἀνοσίοις, ἐθέλουσιν ἰσχυρίζεσθαι ὡς οὐκ ἔστι φύσει αὐτῶν οὐδὲν οὐσίαν ἑαυτοῦ ἔχων, ἀλλὰ τὸ κοινῇ δόξαν τοῦτο γίγνεται ἀληθὲς τότε ὅταν δόξῃ καὶ ὅσον ἂν δοκῇ χρόνον. καὶ ὅσοι γε δὴ μὴ παντάπασι τὸν Πρωταγόρου λόγον λέγουσιν, ὧδέ πως τὴν σοφίαν ἄγουσι.* Taken in connexion with the above, the following passage must at least include the Sophists, even if others are also intended. Legg. x. 889 E. *Θεούς, ὦ μακαριέ, εἶναι πρῶτόν φασιν οὗτοι τέχνῃ, οὐ φύσει ἀλλά τισι νόμοις, καὶ τούτους ἄλλους ἄλλῃ, ὅπῃ ἕκαστοι ἑκάστοις συνωμολόγησαν νομοθετούμενοι· καὶ δὴ καὶ τὰ καλὰ φύσει μὲν ἄλλα εἶναι, νόμῳ δὲ ἕτερα· τὰ δὲ δὴ δίκαια οὐδ' εἶναι τὸ πάραπαν φύσει, ἀλλ' ἀμφισβητοῦντας διατελεῖν ἀλλήλοις καὶ μετατιθεμένοις ἀεὶ ταῦτα· ἃ δ' ἂν μετάθωνται καὶ ὅταν τότε κύρια ἕκαστα εἶναι, γιγνόμενα τέχνῃ καὶ τοῖς νόμοις, ἀλλ' οὐ δή τινι φύσει* (read, with Dr Thompson, *οὐδ' ᾗ τινι φύσει*, comparing 919 D. *μηδ' ἥντινα κοινωνίαν*). Arist. de Soph. El. c. 12. *ὥσπερ ὁ Καλλικλῆς ἐν τῷ Γοργίᾳ γέγραπται λέγων, καὶ οἱ ἀρχαῖοι δὲ πάντες ᾤοντο συμβαίνειν...ἐναντία γὰρ εἶναι φύσιν καὶ νόμον, καὶ τὴν δικαιοσύνην κατὰ νόμον μὲν εἶναι καλόν, κατὰ φύσιν δ' οὐ καλόν...ἦν δὲ τὸ μὲν κατὰ φύσιν αὐτοῖς τὸ ἀληθές, τὸ δὲ κατὰ νόμον τὸ τοῖς πολλοῖς δοκοῦν.* —*τὸ γὰρ ὅμοιον τῷ ὁμοίῳ*] Sympos. 195 B. *ὁ γὰρ παλαιὸς λόγος εὖ ἔχει, ὡς ὅμοιον ὁμοίῳ ἀεὶ πελάζει.* Gorg. 510 B. Lys. 214 B. Legg. VI. 773 B. Comp. Phaedr. 240 C. *ἥλικα γὰρ καὶ ὁ παλαιὸς λόγος τέρπειν τὸν ἥλικα.* Hom. Od. XVII. 218. *αἰεί τοι τὸν ὅμοιον ἄγει θεὸς ὡς τὸν ὅμοιον.*

XXIV. D. *ὁ δὲ νόμος τύραννος ὤν*] The allusion is to a fragment of Pindar preserved in Gorg. 484 B. (Fragm. incert. p. 245. Dissen.) *Νόμος ὁ πάντων βασιλεὺς θνατῶν τε καὶ ἀθανάτων· οὗτος... ἄγει δικαιῶν τὸ βιαιότατον ὑπερτάτᾳ χειρί.* Legg. III. 690 C. IV. 714 E.—*πολλὰ...βιάζεται*] So with the accusative, Dem. Lept. p. 501,

§ 161, *μηδὲν οὖν φιλονείκει, Λεπτίνη, μηδὲ βιάζου τοιοῦτον·* and passively, Soph. Ant. 66. *ὡς βιάζομαι τάδε.*—*κατ' αὐτὸ τοῦτο*] "in this very character," as *σοφώτατοι.*—*τῆς Ἑλλάδος...τὸ πρυτανεῖον τῆς σοφίας*] So Athens was called by Pythias, ap. Athen. v. 187 D. *ἑστίαν καὶ πρυτανεῖον τῆς Ἑλλάδος.*—*ἀποφήνασθαι*] *ἀποφαίνειν* in Plato is "to prove," *ἀποφαίνεσθαι* "to express an opinion."

E. *συμβῆναι...μέσον*] *συμβῆναι ὑμᾶς εἰς τὸ μέσον* are to be joined "to meet one another halfway:" and the words *ὥσπερ ὑπὸ διαιτ. ἡμ. συμβιβ.* are equivalent to *ὑφ' ἡμ. ὥσπερ ὑπὸ διαιτ. συμβιβ.* Comp. Rep. VIII. 545 E. *ὡς πρὸς παῖδας ἡμᾶς παιζούσας,* i. e. *πρὸς ἡμᾶς ὡς πρὸς παῖδας παιζούσας.* Tim. 27 B. *εἰσαγαγόντα αὐτοὺς ὡς εἰς δικαστὰς ἡμᾶς.* Ibid. 79 A. *ῥεῖν ὥσπερ δι' αὐλῶνος τοῦ σώματος τὰ τῶν φλεβῶν ποιεῖ ῥεύματα.*

338 *κατὰ βραχὺ*] Comp. on 329 B.—*πάντα κάλων ἐκτείναντα*] "stretching every rope," i. e. "straining every nerve:" a proverbial expression, in which *ἐφιέναι, ἐξιέναι, κινεῖν* are also used. Comp. Eur. Med. 278. *ἐχθροὶ γὰρ ἐξιᾶσι πάντα δὴ κάλων.* Ar. Eq. 756.—*οὐρίᾳ ἐφέντα*] sc. *ἑαυτόν,* like *συγκαθεῖναι,* above 336 A.—*εἰς τὸ πέλαγος τῶν λόγων*] Comp. Parm. 137 A. *πῶς δὴ τηλικόνδε ὄντα διανεῦσαι τοιοῦτόν τε καὶ τοσοῦτον πέλαγος λόγων;* Rep. v. 453 D. *οὐκοῦν καὶ ἡμῖν νευστέον καὶ πειρατέον σώζεσθαι ἐκ τοῦ λόγου.*—*ἀποκρύψαντα γῆν*] "out of sight of land." Cf. Thuc. v. 65. *ἐπειδὴ ἀναχωροῦντες ἐκεῖνοί τε ἀπέκρυψαν, καὶ σφεῖς ἡσυχάζον*...with Arnold's note. Virg. Aen. III. 291. Phaeacum abscondimus arces.—*μέσον ...τεμεῖν*] Comp. Polit. 262 B. *διὰ μέσων δὲ ἀσφαλέστερον ἰέναι τέμνοντας.* Epist. VIII. 355 D. *δίκαιον ἂν ἴσως καὶ σύμφερον γένοιτο ὑμῖν πᾶσι μεσὸν τεμεῖν.*—*ὡς οὖν ποιήσετε, κ.τ.λ.*] Stallbaum explains *ὡς ποιήσετε* as = *ὅπως ποιήσετε,* in the imperative sense: for which see on 313 C. He compares *ποιήσετε καὶ πείθεσθε* with Soph. Ant. 885 sqq. *οὐκ ἄξετε...καὶ...ἄφετε.* I still adhere to this explanation: the passage referred to by the Zurich editors, Legg. v. 747 E. *οἷς ὅ γε νοῦν ἔχων νομοθέτης ἐπισκεψάμενος, ὡς ἄνθρωπον οἷόν τ' ἐστι σκοπεῖν τὰ τοιαῦτα, οὕτω πειρῷτ' ἂν τιθέναι τοὺς νόμους,* is clearly of another kind. If we accent *ὧς* = *οὕτως,* with Bekker, *πείσεσθε* will also be necessary: and see on 326 D.—*ἐπιστάτην*] Compared with *ῥαβδοῦχον,* I think this word must be taken in the same sense as at Legg. XII. 949 A. *ἄθλων ἐπιστάτας καὶ βραβέας.* Comp. Xen. Lacon. VIII. 4. *οἱ ἐν τοῖς γυμνικοῖς ἀγῶσιν ἐπιστάται.*

B. *εἴτε γὰρ χείρων ἔσται*] For the construction compare 322 C. *ἐρωτᾷ οὖν Ἑρμῆς Δία, τίνα οὖν τρόπον δοίη...πότερον ὡς αἱ τέχναι νενέμηνται.*

C. ἀλλὰ δή] *at enim.* "But you will appoint, *you say*, a better man than us." Comp. Crito 54 A. Rep. II. 365 D. In this sense Demosthenes frequently uses ἀλλὰ νὴ Δία—ἀδύνατον ὑμῖν ὥστε...ἑλέσθαι] ὥστε is merely pleonastic. Comp. Phaedr. 258 B. ὅταν ἱκανὸς γένηται ῥήτωρ ἢ βασιλεύς, ὥστε λαβὼν τὴν Λυκούργου ἢ Σόλωνος ἢ Δαρείου δύναμιν ἀθάνατος γενέσθαι. Ibid. 269 D. Gorg. 461 B. Polit. 295 A. Rep. IV. 433 B. and many more. Thuc. VIII. 79. δόξαν ὥστε διαναυμαχεῖν.—εἰ δὲ αἱρήσεσθε μὲν...διαφέρει] "But if you appoint one who is not superior, though you maintain he is, this also is an indignity to *Protagoras*, to have a president set over him like a common man: for so far as *I* am concerned, it makes no difference."

D. ἐμοὶ λόγον ὑποσχέτω] "let him give account to me," by answering my questions in return: so δώσειν λόγον below.

E. πάνυ μὲν οὐκ] "not at all," the almost invariable meaning of οὐ πάνυ. —κατὰ σμικρὸν] Lat. *minutatim*, like κατὰ βραχύ, 329 B. 338 A. Comp. Soph. 217 D. κατὰ σμικρὸν ἔπος πρὸς ἔπος ποιεῖσθαι τὴν συνουσίαν. Rep. I. 344 A. οὐ κατὰ σμικρὸν...ἀλλὰ συλλήβδην. Elsewhere it is *paulatim*, Theaet. 180 E. Rep. III. 401 C. 407 D. and *paululum*, Soph. 241 C. Crat. 400 B. Rep. IV. 487 C. So Cic. Acad. II. 29 (92), *minutatim interrogati*.—περὶ ἐπῶν δεινὸν εἶναι] Comp. 326 A. ἔπη here includes verses of all kinds: the ἔπη properly so called, and the μέλη or lyric poetry.

339 καὶ ἐπίστασθαι διελεῖν] "to explain," as at 314 B.—Σιμωνίδης πρὸς Σκόπαν] Comp. Theocr. XVI. 36 sqq. and see the curious story of the death of Scopas, and Simonides' providential escape in Cic. de Orat. II. 86 (352, 353). I have followed the Zurich editors in printing the entire fragment, as restored by Hermann and others, at the end of the dialogue.

B. τετράγωνον] "*perfect* as a square." Arist. Rhet. III. 11. 2. τὸν ἀγαθὸν ἄνδρα φάναι εἶναι τετράγωνον μεταφορά· ἄμφω γὰρ τέλεια. Eth. Nic. I. 10. 11. ἀεὶ γὰρ ἢ μάλιστα πάντων πράξει καὶ θεωρήσει τὰ κατ' ἀρετὴν καὶ τὰς τύχας οἴσει κάλλιστα καὶ πάντῃ πάντως ἐμμελῶς ὅ γ' ἀληθῶς ἀγαθὸς καὶ τετράγωνος ἄνευ ψόγου. Like Horace's "in se ipso totus teres atque *rotundus*" (Sat. II. 7. 86), the word refers to the αὐτάρκεια or independence of the wise man, proof against all assaults from without. In this sense the word is adopted by Dante, Parad. XVII. 24. Ben *tetragono* ai colpi di ventura.—πάνυ μοι τυγχάνει μεμεληκὸς] "I happen to have paid great attention to the poem." The perf. μεμέληκε is omitted in Liddell

and Scott: it occurs Crat. 428 B. Meno 81 A.—ἔφην ἐγώ, καλῶς τε καὶ ὀρθῶς] καλῶς was restored by Bekker on conjecture: the common reading is ἔφην ἔγωγε, καὶ ὀρθῶς, and the two best MSS. give τε for γε.

C. προϊόντος τοῦ ᾄσματος λέγει που] On referring to the restored fragment it will be seen that five lines have been omitted: the words Οὐδέ μοι...ἔμμεναι are antistrophic to those above, Ἄνδρ' ἀγαθὸν...τετυγμένον.—Οὐδέ μοι...εἰρημένον] *Neque recte et convenienter quamvis a viro sapiente dictum judicatur a me Pittaci illud* etc. *Judicandi* hac potestate verbum νέμειν imprimis frequentat Sophocles. Oed. Col. 879. τάνδ' ἄρ' οὐκέτι νεμῶ πόλιν. El. 150. σέ, σ' ἔγωγε νέμω θεόν. Aj. 1331. φίλον σ' ἐγὼ μέγιστον Ἀργείων νέμω. Trach. 483. ἥμαρτον, εἴ τι τήνδ' ἁμαρτίαν νέμεις. Heindorf. Compare Arist. Eth. Nic. IV. 3. 21. ἄνευ γὰρ ἀρετῆς οὐ ῥᾴδιον φέρειν ἐμμελῶς τὰ εὐτυχήματα.

D. ὀλίγον δὲ...προελθών] i.e. ὀλίγον δὲ προελθὼν εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν τοῦ ποιήματος.—οὔ φησιν...λέγοντος] "he declares he cannot agree with him when he says the same thing as himself." ἑαυτῷ refers to Simonides throughout.—τὸ πρότερον is used adverbially: otherwise τὸ ὕστερον would also have been required.—θόρυβον is here applause: so ἀνεθορύβησαν, 334 C.

E. ἐσκοτώθην καὶ ἰλιγγίασα] "I was blinded and turned giddy." Comp. Gorg. 486 B. ἀλλ' ἰλιγγιῴης ἂν καὶ χασμῷο οὐκ ἔχων ὅτι εἴποις. Ibid. 527 A. Lys. 216 C. ἀλλὰ τῷ ὄντι αὐτὸς ἰλιγγιῶ ὑπὸ τῆς τοῦ λόγου ἀπορίας.—ὥς γε πρὸς σὲ εἰρῆσθαι τἀληθῆ] Comp. 309 A. ὥς γ' ἐν ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς εἰρῆσθαι.—ἵνα μοι χρόνος ἐγγένηται] All the recent editors have adopted this reading for ἐκγένηται, though on slight MS. authority: the phrase occurs Phaedo 86 E. Sympos. 184 A, whereas χρόνος ἐκγίγνεται is never found.—σός μέντοι Σιμωνίδης πολίτης] "*surely* Simonides is your countryman." Cf. 309 A. 330 D.—δοκῶ οὖν μοι ἐγὼ παρακαλεῖν σέ] "I have made up my mind to summon you to his aid." In this sense δοκῶ μοι is generally followed by a future, as in Crat. 391 A. δοκῶ μοι ὧδε ἂν μᾶλλον πεισθήσεσθαί σοι. Ar. Plut. 1186. αὐτός μοι δοκῶ... ἐνθάδ' αὐτοῦ καταμενεῖν, but sometimes, as here, by the present. Phaedr. 230 E. ἐγὼ μέν μοι δοκῶ κατακεῖσθαι (where however Dr Thompson retains the old reading κατακείσεσθαι). So with the aorist, Euthyd. 288 C. ἐγὼ οὖν μοι δοκῶ καὶ αὐτὸς πάλιν ὑφηγήσασθαι. Xen. Memor. II. 7. 11. νῦν δέ μοι δοκῶ εἰς ἔργων ἀφορμὴν αὐτὸ ποιῆσαι. Of course παρακαλεῖν might be taken as a future: but I agree with Sauppe in thinking the present more suitable.

The word is repeated immediately afterwards, where it can only be a present.

340 σχῶμεν] ... ἐπεὶ τάχα ἄστυ μέγα Πριάμοιο ἄνακτος | ἐκπέρσει. Il. xxi. 308 sqq. whence the expression τὸν Σιμωνίδην ἐκπέρσῃ. For instances of πορθεῖν as applied to *persons*, Heindorf refers to Eur. Phoen. 565. Soph. Aj. 896. Trach. 1104. Comp. Soph. Oed. Tyr. 1456. μήτε μ' ἂν νόσον | μήτ' ἄλλο πέρσαι μηδέν. Aj. 1198. κεῖνος γὰρ ἔπερσεν ἀνθρώπους. Eur. Herc. Fur. 700. πέρσας δείματα θηρῶν. Pind. Pyth. ix. 141. ἔπραθε φασγάνου ἀκμᾷ. We may here translate it "demolish."—τῆς σῆς μουσικῆς] here simply "accomplishment." μουσική in its widest sense included all mental culture: comp. on 312 B. Phaedo 61 A. ὡς φιλοσοφίας μὲν οὔσης μεγίστης μουσικῆς. Crat. 406 A. τὰς δὲ Μούσας καὶ ὅλως τὴν μουσικὴν ἀπὸ τοῦ μῶσθαι, ὡς ἔοικε, καὶ τῆς ζητήσεως τε καὶ φιλοσοφίας τὸ ὄνομα τοῦτο ἐπωνόμασε.

B. ταὐτόν σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι τὸ γενέσθαι καὶ τὸ εἶναι;] It is scarcely necessary to remark that the distinction between "being" and "becoming" lay at the root of all ancient, as well as modern, metaphysical systems; the form it assumed with some of them may be seen in the Theaetetus; especially p. 152 D. ἐκ δὲ δὴ φορᾶς τε καὶ κινήσεως καὶ κράσεως πρὸς ἄλληλα γίγνεται πάντα, ἃ δὴ φάμεν εἶναι, οὐκ ὀρθῶς προσαγορεύοντες· ἔστι μὲν γὰρ οὐδέποτ' οὐδέν, ἀεὶ δὲ γίγνεται. καὶ περὶ τούτου πάντες ἑξῆς οἱ σοφοὶ πλὴν Παρμενίδου ξυμφέρεσθον, Πρωταγόρας τε καὶ Ἡράκλειτος καὶ Ἐμπεδοκλῆς, καὶ τῶν ποιητῶν οἱ ἄκροι κ.τ.λ. These philosophers are called οἱ ῥέοντες, 181 A.

D. καθ' Ἡσίοδον] Op. et D. 287 sqq. τὴν μέντοι κακότητα καὶ ἰλαδὸν ἔστιν ἑλέσθαι | ῥηϊδίως· λείη μὲν ὁδός, μάλα δ' ἐγγύθι ναίει. | τῆς δ' ἀρετῆς ἱδρῶτα θεοὶ προπάροιθεν ἔθηκαν | ἀθάνατοι· μακρὸς δὲ καὶ ὄρθιος οἶμος ἐπ' αὐτήν, | καὶ τρηχὺς τὸ πρῶτον· ἐπὴν δ' εἰς ἄκρον ἵκηαι, | ῥηϊδίη δ' ἤπειτα πέλει, χαλεπή περ ἐοῦσα. Plato twice quotes the lines, Rep. ii. 364 C. Legg. iv. 718 E. and alludes to them, Phaedr. 272 C.—ἐκτῆσθαι] This word forms no part of the quotation. The forms κεκτῆσθαι and ἐκτῆσθαι both occur in Plato, but the latter I believe in no other Attic writer: in Theaet. 198 D. we have ἡ μὲν πρὶν ἐκτῆσθαι τοῦ κεκτῆσθαι ἕνεκα. 199 A. ὃ μέν τις ἔκτηται μὴ κεκτῆσθαι ἀδύνατόν φαμεν εἶναι...where the use of both forms may apparently be traced to the usual love of variety.

XXVII. E. εἰμί τις γελοῖος ἰατρός· ἰώμενος] A similar construction occurs Phileb. 23 D. εἰμὶ δ', ὡς ἔοικεν, ἐγὼ γελοῖός τις ἱκανῶς κατ' εἴδη διιστάς. Theag. 122 C. μὴ...αἰσθώμεθα γελοῖοι ὄντες ...μηδὲν τῶν αὐτῶν ἡγούμενοι. There is perhaps an allusion to a

line preserved by Plutarch, τὸ φάρμακόν σου τὴν νόσον μείζω ποιεῖ. The force of τις is here intensive, "very ridiculous:" as at 342 E. φαῦλον τινά, "quite ordinary." For an instance of this, less obvious because τις is separated from the adjective, compare Soph. Ant. 951. ἀλλ' ἁ μοιριδία τις δύνασις δεινά· "the power of fate is very terrible."—εἰ οὕτω φαῦλόν τί φησιν εἶναι] Comp. on 312 C. 318 B. Apol. 25 B. πολλὴ γὰρ ἄν τις εὐδαιμονία εἴη περὶ τοὺς νέους, εἰ εἷς μὲν μόνος αὐτοὺς διαφθείρω, οἱ δὲ ἄλλοι ὠφελοῦσιν. There is here a peculiar emphasis in the indicative: "if he *really does* say that virtue is so easy a thing to possess."—ἤτοι ἀπὸ Σιμωνίδου] He is ridiculing Protagoras, who had named the Epic poets and Simonides as the earliest Sophists, p. 316 D. It is said, too, that Protagoras prided himself on his knowledge of the poems of Simonides, and even lectured on them for hire.

341 οὐχ ὥσπερ ἐγὼ ἔμπειρος] sc. εἰμί· the words ὥσπερ ἐγὼ are not, as Stephens thought, parenthetical. Comp. Gorg. 522 A. πεινῆν καὶ διψῆν ἀναγκάζων, οὐχ ὥσπερ ἐγὼ πολλὰ καὶ ἡδέα καὶ παντοδαπὰ εὐωχοῦν ὑμᾶς. Sympos. 179 E. καὶ ἐποίησαν τὸν θάνατον αὐτοῦ ὑπὸ γυναικῶν γενέσθαι, οὐχ ὥσπερ Ἀχιλλέα τὸν τῆς Θετίδος υἱὸν ἐτίμησαν. Ibid. 189 C. Ep. VII. 333 A. Eur. Bacch. 928. ἀλλ' ἐξ ἕδρας σοι πλόκαμος ἐξέστηχ' ὅδε, | οὐχ ὡς ἐγώ νιν ὑπὸ μίτρᾳ καθήρμοσα. Ar. Eq. 783. ἐπὶ ταῖσι πέτραις οὐ φροντίζει σκληρῶς σε καθήμενον οὕτως, | οὐχ ὥσπερ ἐγὼ ῥαψάμενός σοι τουτὶ φέρω.—διά τε μαθητὴς εἶναι Προδίκου] Socrates several times makes this assertion, but it was probably no more than a joke; comp. Crat. 384 B. νῦν δὲ οὐκ ἀκήκοα (τὴν πεντηκοντάδραχμον ἐπίδειξιν) ἀλλὰ τὴν δραχμιαίαν. Meno 96 D. Charm. 163 D. Hipp. Maj. 282 C.—μανθάνειν, "to understand." See on 319 A.—περὶ τοῦ δεινοῦ] "about the word δεινός." Comp. Alcib. II. 147 D. παράγων τὸ κακῶς ἀντὶ τοῦ κακοῦ, i.e. ἀντὶ τοῦ κακόν, (Buttm. ad loc.) Dem. Timocr. p. 726. § 94. γράψας ἀντὶ μὲν τοῦ τιμήματος τὸ ἀργύριον, ἀντὶ δὲ τοῦ τὸ γιγνόμενον, ὃ ὦφλεν, both cited by Dobree on Dem. Fals. Leg. p. 391. § 176.—σοφὸς καὶ δεινός] These words are often joined, e.g. Herod. v. 23. Ar. Ran. 968. Eccl. 245: by Plato especially with reference to the Sophists, as here and at Theaet. 154 D. 173 B. and then with some degree of irony. They are opposed however, Phaedr. 245 C. ἡ δὲ δὴ ἀπόδειξις ἔσται δεινοῖς μὲν ἄπιστος, σοφοῖς δὲ πιστή. Theaet. 164 C. Compare also Theaet. 177 A. δεινοὶ καὶ πανοῦργοι, with Menex 246 E. πᾶσά τε ἐπιστήμη χωριζομένη δικαιοσύνης καὶ τῆς ἄλλης ἀρετῆς πανουργία οὐ σοφία φαίνεται.

B. εἰ οὐκ αἰσχύνομαι] See above on 324 E. In reference to this passage Hermann remarks, on Eur. Med. 87. "Obiter abji-

cimus, etiam ubi *ei an* significat, recte sequi οὐ si nulla est negationis ad affirmationem oppositio: aliter enim μὴ dicendum." Comp. 351 E.—δεινοῦ πλούτου] Genitives of wonder or admiration (Jelf, § 495) almost always take the article if no interjection is expressed: e.g. Ar. Ach. 87. καὶ τίς εἶδε πώποτε | βοῦς κριβανίτας; τῶν ἀλαζονευμάτων. On the other hand, Theocr. xv. 75. χρηστῶ κὠκτίρμονος ἀνδρός.—ἴσως οὖν] "So perhaps." οὖν as a resumptive particle is sometimes introduced after a parenthesis without regard to the form of the sentence; thus here after ὥσπερ περὶ τοῦ δεινοῦ we should have expected οὕτως. See other instances in Sympos. 201 D. Lys. 223 B. Euthyd. 285 B.—τὴν Σιμωνίδου φωνὴν τοῦτον ἐρωτᾶν] "to ask him about the *dialect* of Simonides." Comp. below 346 D. Phaedo 62 A. καὶ ὁ Κέβης...Ἴττω Ζεύς, ἔφη, τῇ αὑτοῦ φωνῇ εἰπών.—τί ἔλεγεν, "what did he *mean* by," as at 319 A.

C. ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἤκουεν] i.e. ὥσπερ ἂν ἐμέμφετο, εἰ ἤκουεν. Compare the note on κἂν εἰ, 328 A.—ἅτε Λέσβιος ὢν καὶ ἐν φωνῇ βαρβάρῳ τεθραμμένος] This can only be intended to ridicule the conceit of Prodicus, in denouncing as barbarous a dialect not far removed from his own.

D. καὶ σοῦ δοκεῖν ἀποπειρᾶσθαι] οἶμαι having preceded, δοκεῖν is not necessary to the sense: but the pleonasm "I think he seems," and the like, is not unfrequent. Comp. Phaedo 60 C. ὥσπερ οὖν καὶ αὐτῷ μοι ἔοικεν, ἐπειδὴ ὑπὸ τοῦ δεσμοῦ ἦν ἐν τῷ σκέλει τὸ ἀλγεινόν, ἥκειν δὴ φαίνεται ἐπακολουθοῦν τὸ ἡδύ. Phileb. 32 C. ἐν γὰρ τούτοις οἶμαι, κατά γε τὴν ἐμὴν δόξαν, εἰλικρινέσι τε ἑκατέροις γιγνομένοις, ὡς δοκεῖ...Lach. 192 C. τοῦτον τοίνυν ἔμοιγε φαίνεται, ὅτι οὐ πᾶσά γε, ὡς ἐγῷμαι, καρτερία ἀνδρία σοι φαίνεται. So in Soph. 225 D. δοκῶ is followed by κατὰ γνώμην τὴν ἐμήν.

E. εὐθὺς τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο ῥῆμα] "his very next remark." So 343 C. εὐθὺς τὸ πρῶτον τοῦ ᾄσματος. Theaet. 171 D. τὰ δοκοῦντα ἀεὶ=τὰ ἀεὶ δοκοῦντα. Phaedo 88 B. ἀεὶ τὸν μέλλοντα ἀποθανεῖσθαι.—τοῦτο γέρας ἀπένειμε] "assigned this *as an* attribute." γέρας is the predicate, otherwise the article would be required. Comp. Apol. 18 A. δικαστοῦ μὲν γὰρ αὕτη ἀρετή. Phileb. 16 C. ταύτην φήμην παρέδοσαν. Jelf, § 453. Obs. On the other hand, below 344 C. ἀλλὰ θεὸς ἂν μόνος τοῦτο ἔχοι τὸ γέρας.—ἀκόλαστον...καὶ οὐδαμῶς Κεῖον] The inhabitants of Ceos bore an excellent character for strict public and private morality. Comp. Legg. I. 638 B. Ar. Ran. 970. πέπτωκεν ἔξω τῶν κακῶν, οὐ Χῖος, ἀλλὰ Κεῖος...the Chians being at the opposite extremity of the moral scale.

342 ὅπως ἔχω, ὃ σὺ λέγεις τοῦτο, περὶ ἐπῶν] "*quomodo me habeam* περὶ ἐπῶν, *ut tu istuc appellas.* Respicit ad verba Protagorae, p. 338 E, ἡγοῦμαι...ἐγὼ ἀνδρὶ παιδείας μέγιστον μέρος

εἶναι περὶ ἐπῶν δεινὸν εἶναι." Stallbaum. Compare above on 321 C.—πλείστη τῶν Ἑλλήνων...πλεῖστοι γῆς] "Most abundant in Greece."..."most numerous in the world." The expressions are parallel.

XXVIII. B. ὥσπερ οὓς Πρωταγόρας ἔλεγε τοὺς σοφιστάς] i. e. ὥσπερ οἱ σοφισταὶ (ἐξαρνοῦνται καὶ σχηματίζονται ἀμαθεῖς εἶναι), οὓς Πρωταγόρας ἔλεγε: by a frequent attraction. Comp. Crito 48 C. ἃς δὲ σὺ λέγεις τὰς σκέψεις περί τε χρημάτων ἀναλώσεως κ.τ.λ. Crat. 417 C. ὠφέλιμον δέ, ξενικὸν τοὔνομα, ᾧ καὶ Ὅμηρος πολλαχοῦ κέχρηται, τῷ ὀφέλλειν. Rep. IX. 579 C. ὃς ἂν κακῶς ἐν ἑαυτῷ πολιτευόμενος, ὃν νῦν δὴ σὺ ἀθλιώτατον ἔκρινας, τὸν τυραννικόν, ὡς μὴ ἰδιώτης καταβιῷ.—εἰ γνωσθεῖεν ᾧ περίεισι] This conjecture of Van Heusde's, for ὅπερ εἰσί, is universally adopted.—τοὺς ἐν ταῖς πόλεσι λακωνίζοντας] Comp. Ar. Av. 1281. ἐλακωνομάνουν ἅπαντες ἄνθρωποι τότε, | ἐκόμων, ἐπείνων, ἐρρύπων, ἐσωκράτων. Dem. in Conon. p. 1267. § 47. οἱ ἐσκυθρωπάκασι καὶ λακωνίζειν φασὶ καὶ τρίβωνας ἔχουσι καὶ ἁπλᾶς ὑποδέδενται.—ὦτά τε κατάγνυνται] "get their ears battered" in boxing. Comp. Gorg. 515 E. τῶν τὰ ὦτα κατεαγότων ἀκούεις ταῦτα, i. e. τῶν λακωνιζόντων. Theocr. XXII. 45. σκληραῖσι τεθλαγμένος οὔατα πυγμαῖς. Ar. Fr. 72. Ὠτοκάταξιν· τὸν συντετριμμένον τὸ οὖς.

C. ἱμάντας περιειλίττονται] "*twist the straps* of the cestus *round* their arms.—βραχείας ἀναβολάς] Comp. Arist. Eth. Nic. IV. 7. 15. καὶ ἐνίοτε ἀλαζονεία φαίνεται, οἷον ἡ τῶν Λακώνων ἐσθής· καὶ γὰρ ἡ ὑπερβολὴ καὶ ἡ λίαν ἔλλειψις ἀλαζονικόν. Xen. Lacon. II. 4. ἑνὶ ἱματίῳ δι' ἔτους προσεθίζεσθαι.—ὡς δὴ τούτοις κρατοῦντας...τοὺς Λακεδαιμονίους] Here the use of κρατοῦντας resembles the accusative absolute: ὡς supplying the notion of ἡγούμενοι, νομίζοντες, &c. Comp. Phaedo 109 D. καὶ τὸν ἀέρα οὐρανὸν καλεῖν, ὡς διὰ τούτου οὐρανοῦ ὄντος τὰ ἄστρα χωροῦντα. Rep. IV. 426 C. προαγορεύουσι τοῖς πολίταις τὴν μὲν κατάστασιν τῆς πόλεως ὅλην μὴ κινεῖν, ὡς ἀποθανουμένους ὃς ἂν τοῦτο δρᾷ. Xen. Memor. I. 3. 2. εὔχετο δὲ πρὸς τοὺς θεοὺς ἁπλῶς τἀγαθὰ διδόναι, ὡς τοὺς θεοὺς κάλλιστα εἰδότας; and see Jelf, § 703. c. δή is ironical, "as if forsooth."—ἀνέδην] "without restraint." Elsewhere, Gorg. 494 E. Hipp. Min. 368 A. Legg. XI. 919 D. it rather means "outright," "without qualification."—ξενηλασίας ποιούμενοι] Comp. Legg. XII. 950 A. τὸ δ' αὖ μήτε ἄλλους δέχεσθαι μήτε αὐτοὺς ἄλλοσε ἀποδημεῖν ἅμα μὲν οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ τό γε παράπαν, ἔτι δὲ ἄγριον καὶ ἀπηνὲς φαίνοιτ' ἂν τοῖς ἄλλοις ἀνθρώποις, ὀνόμασί τε χαλεποῖς ταῖσι λεγομέναις ξενηλασίαις χρωμένους καὶ τρόποις αὐθαδέσι καὶ χαλεποῖς, ὡς δοκοῖεν ἄν. For the nature of these ξενηλασίαι see Arnold on Thuc. I. 144. II. 39. Xen. Lacon. XIV. 4. Arist. Pol. II. 9. Plutarch Lycurg. p. 56 C.—οὐδένα ἐῶσι...ἐξιέναι] Thuc.

I. 70. καὶ μὴν καὶ ἄοκνοι πρὸς ὑμᾶς καὶ ἀποδημητοὶ πρὸς ἐνδημοτάτους, οἴονται γὰρ οἱ μὲν τῇ ἀπουσίᾳ ἄν τι κτᾶσθαι, ὑμεῖς δὲ τῷ ἐπελθεῖν καὶ τὰ ἑτοῖμα ἂν βλάψαι.

D. ἀλλὰ καὶ γυναῖκες] There is a collection of Λακαινῶν ἀποφθέγματα bearing the name of Plutarch. See a specimen in Cic. Tusc. I. 42 (102).—εἰ γὰρ ἐθέλει τις, κ.τ.λ.] "For if any one chooses to converse with the most ordinary Lacedaemonian, during the greater part of the conversation he will find him quite an ordinary person to all appearance; but afterwards, at whatever point in the argument he gets the opportunity, he suddenly interposes a striking remark, short and epigrammatic, so that his opponent will seem no better than a child."

E. ἐνέβαλε...συνεστραμμένον] Comp. Theaet. 180 A. ἀλλ' ἂν τινά τι ἔρῃ, ὥσπερ ἐκ φαρέτρας ῥηματίσκια αἰνιγματώδη ἀνασπῶντες ἀποτοξεύουσι. Sympos. 219 B. ἐγὼ μὲν δὴ ταῦτα ἀκούσας καὶ εἰπών, καὶ ἀφεὶς ὥσπερ βέλη, τετρῶσθαι αὐτὸν ᾤμην. The use of the aorist as an *instantaneous* future has been already noticed on 310 A.—παιδὸς μηδὲν βελτίω] Comp. Theaet. 177 B. καὶ ἡ ῥητορικὴ ἐκείνη πως ἀπομαραίνεται, ὥστε παίδων μηδὲν δοκεῖν διαφέρειν. Phaedr. 279 A.

343 τούτων ἦν καὶ Θαλῆς κ.τ.λ.] τούτων, i. e. τῶν πάλαι. The list of the seven sages here given is remarkable for the substitution of Myson ὁ Χηνεὺς for Periander. Very little is known either of this person or of his birth-place. Diog. Laert. I. 106. Μύσων Στρύμονος, ὥς φησι Σωσικράτης Ἑρμίππου παρατιθέμενος, τὸ γένος Χηνεύς, ἀπὸ κώμης τινὸς Οἰταϊκῆς ἢ Λακωνικῆς, σὺν τοῖς ἑπτὰ καταριθμεῖται. Ibid. 108. μέμνηται αὐτοῦ καὶ Πλάτων ἐν τῷ Πρωταγόρᾳ, ἀντὶ Περιάνδρου θεὶς αὐτόν. Of the two localities named, the present passage clearly favours the first, Mount Oeta: otherwise Myson would have been joined with Chilo, as a Spartan.

B. οὗτοι καὶ κοινῇ ξυνελθόντες] There is a good deal of uncertainty among the ancient authorities as to the ownership of the various sayings. The fact as here stated is recorded by Pausanias, x. 26, and with some variation by Plutarch, de Garrul. p. 511 A. Καὶ τῷ ἱερῷ τοῦ Πυθίου Ἀπόλλωνος οὐ τὴν Ἰλιάδα καὶ τὴν Ὀδύσσειαν οὐδὲ τοὺς Πινδάρου παιᾶνας ἐπέγραψαν οἱ Ἀμφικτύονες, ἀλλὰ τὸ Γνῶθι σαυτὸν καὶ τὸ Μηδὲν ἄγαν καὶ τὸ Ἐγγύα, πάρα δ' ἄτα. Cf. Plat. Charm. 164 D. sqq. Cicero Legg. I. 22 (58). Tusc. I. 22 (52). De Fin. III. 22 (73).—ἃ δὴ πάντες ὑμνοῦσι] "which you know (δὴ) are in every one's mouth." Comp. 317 A. ταῦτα ὑμνοῦσι.—Τοῦ δὴ ἕνεκα ταῦτα λέγω;] This expression is abundantly illustrated by Heindorf and Stallbaum on Gorg. 453 C.—τῶν παλαιῶν τῆς φιλο-

σοφίας] For τῆς τῶν παλ. φιλοσ., τῶν παλαιῶν being emphatic. ἰδίᾳ περιεφέρετο, "was privately circulated." With this sense of the word comp. that of περιφορητός, "notorious," in Anacr. Fragm. 19, Bergk.

C. εἰ καθέλοι τοῦτο τὸ ῥῆμα] "if he were to destroy the authority of this saying:" as in the fragment of Simonides below, ὃν ἂν ἀμήχανος συμφορὰ καθέλῃ.—εἰς τοῦτο οὖν τὸ ῥῆμα...πεποίηκεν] "It was against this dictum, then, and with this view (his own ambition, ὅπως αὐτὸς εὐδοκιμήσει) in plotting against it to rob it of its currency, that he composed the whole poem." Comp. Sympos. 203 B. ἡ οὖν Πενία ἐπιβουλεύουσα διὰ τὴν αὑτῆς ἀπορίαν παιδίον ποιήσασθαι ἐκ τοῦ Πόρου. Xen. Anab. v. 6. 29. ὅτι αὐτὸς ἐπεβούλευε διαβάλλειν με πρὸς ὑμᾶς. In the text we have τούτῳ (which Ast would omit) as well as the infinitive, both dependent on ἐπιβουλεύων.

XXIX. D. ἔπειτα ἐνέβαλε τὸ μέν] The poem begins "Ἄνδρ' ἀγαθὸν μὲν ἀλαθέως γενέσθαι χαλεπόν.—οὐδὲ πρὸς ἕνα λόγον] "nothing at all to the point:" stronger than πρὸς οὐδένα λόγον. Comp. 344 A. 351 E. πρὸς λόγον. Phileb. 42 E. οὐδὲν πρὸς λόγον. Ibid. 18 D. τί πρὸς ἔπος αὖ ταῦτ' ἔστι;—Οὔκ, ἀλλὰ γενέσθαι μὲν κ.τ.λ.] "No, not to *be* good, but to *become* a good man is hard, Pittacus, in very truth: he does not say *truly good*, it is not to this that he applies the word *truly*, as if in fact there were certain things some of which were truly good, and others good no doubt, but not truly good."

E. ἀλλ' ὑπερβατὸν...τὸ τοῦ Πιττακοῦ] "one must imagine the word ἀλαθέως transposed in the poem, and understand the saying of Pittacus in some such sense as the following." Hence the grammatical figure ὑπέρβατον, Quintilian's *verbi transgressio*, VIII. 6. 62.—"Verbum ὑπειπεῖν significat *ita interpretari ut de tuo aliquid subjicias, sive loquendo sive cogitando.* V. Reisk. Ind. Demosth." Heindorf.—ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ θείημεν] i. e. ὥσπερ ἂν ὑπείποιμεν, εἰ θείημεν. See on 328 A....εἰπόντα...τὸν δὲ ἀποκρινόμενον] i. e. τὸν μὲν εἰπόντα, τὸν δὲ ἀποκρ.

344 φαίνεται πρὸς λόγον] The MSS. read τὸ πρὸς λόγον, corrected by Heindorf.—καὶ τὰ ἐπιόντα πάντα] See below 345 C. καὶ τὰ ἐπιόντα γε τοῦ ᾄσματος ἔτι μᾶλλον δηλοῖ.

B. τὸν τύπον...καὶ τὴν βούλησιν] "Let us describe its general outline and intention." τύπος is used like the Lat. *adumbratio:* comp. Rep. III. 414 A. ὡς ἐν τύπῳ, μὴ δι' ἀκριβείας, εἰρῆσθαι. Arist. Eth. Nic. I. 11, 2. καθ' ὅλου δὲ καὶ τύπῳ λεχθὲν τάχ' ἂν ἴσως ἔχοι.—παντὸς μᾶλλον, *prorsus*, "most assuredly:" a frequent phrase in Plato. παντὸς μᾶλλον οὐ..."certainly not." Phaedr.

228 D.—ὡς ἂν εἰ λέγοι λόγον] "as if he were maintaining an argument."

XXX. C. ἄνδρα δὲ οὐκ ἔστι, κ.τ.λ.] "But for man, he cannot possibly be other than evil, whom helpless misfortune prostrates." μὴ οὐ is used wherever in Latin we might translate by *non potest quin*. Comp. Jelf, § 750. Below on 352 D.—οὐ τὸν κείμενόν τις ἂν καταβάλοι, ἀλλὰ τὸν μὲν ἑστῶτα...] The language of the wrestling-schools. "One cannot be said to 'throw' a man when he is down, but when he is on his legs one may." Comp. Hipp. Min. 374 A. αἴσχιον ἐν πάλῃ τὸ πίπτειν ἢ τὸ καταβάλλειν, Rep. v. 451 A. κείσομαι περὶ ἃ ἥκιστα δεῖ σφάλλεσθαι. Aesch. Eum. 590. οὐ κειμένῳ πω τόνδε κομπάζεις λόγον.

D. ἀμήχανον ἂν θείη] Stallbaum cites Athen. XI. 501 C. τὸ ποιῆσαι θεῖναι πρὸς τῶν ἀρχαίων ἐλέγετο.—ταὐτὰ ταῦτα. See on 318 A.—παρ' ἄλλου ποιητοῦ] Xen. Memor. I. 2. 20. μαρτυρεῖ δὲ καὶ τῶν ποιητῶν ὅ τε λέγων, Ἐσθλῶν μὲν γὰρ ἄπ' ἐσθλὰ διδάξεαι· ἢν δὲ κακοῖσι | συμμίσγῃς, ἀπολεῖς καὶ τὸν ἐόντα νόον· καὶ ὁ λέγων, Αὐτὰρ ἀνὴρ ἀγαθὸς κ.τ.λ. The first quotation is taken from Theognis: it is clear therefore that the second is not, but from an uncertain "poeta Gnomicus."—οὐκ ἐγχωρεῖ γενέσθαι] sc. κακῷ, as at Meno 89 A. εἰ φύσει οἱ ἀγαθοὶ γίγνονται, sc. ἀγαθοί.

E. τὸ δ' ἐστὶ γενέσθαι μέν...ἀδύνατον] "whereas in fact to *become* good is hard no doubt, yet possible; but to *be* so is impossible." τὸ δὲ=*quum revera*, as often in Plato, Apol. 23 A. οἴονται γάρ με ἑκάστοτε οἱ παρόντες ταῦτα αὐτὸν εἶναι σοφόν, ἃ ἂν ἄλλον ἐξελέγξω· τὸ δὲ κινδυνεύει, ὦ ἄνδρες, τῷ ὄντι ὁ θεὸς σοφὸς εἶναι. Theaet. 157 B. 183 A. 207 B. Soph. 244 A. Rep. I. 340 C. Legg. VII. 803 C. Sympos. 198 D. Hermann and Sauppe have enclosed ἐσθλὸν in brackets: rightly, I think; for besides the harshness involved in its present collocation, it weakens the force of the opposition between γενέσθαι and ἔμμεναι.—κακὸς δ' εἰ κακῶς] sc. ἔπραξε, as if εἰ μὲν γὰρ ἔπραξε had preceded: μὲν does not belong to the poem, as the antistrophe shews. Comp. Rep. II. 370 B. πότερον κάλλιον πράττοι ἄν τις πολλὰς τέχνας ἐργαζόμενος, ἢ ὅταν μίαν εἷς, sc. ἐργάζηται.

345 οὗτος γὰρ...κακὸς γένοιτο] sc. κακῶς πράξας, or εἰ κακῶς ἔπραξε. A good physician can become a bad one by faring ill: but no amount of ill luck can make us unprofessional people physicians at all—therefore it cannot make us bad physicians.

B. κακὴ πρᾶξις, ἐπιστήμης στερηθῆναι] See below on the words οὐδένα ἀνθρώπων ἑκόντα ἐξαμαρτάνειν, 345 D.—τοῦτο τοῦ φάματ

πρὸς τοῦτο τείνει, ὅτι κ.τ.λ.] "this part of the poem tends to prove that" &c.

C. ἐπὶ πλεῖστον δὲ καὶ ἄριστοι, κ.τ.λ.] In the restored poem this line stands thus: τούπιπλεῖστον ἄριστοι, τούς κε θεοὶ φιλῶσιν.—Τοὔνεκεν οὔ ποτ' ἐγὼ...ἀπαγγελέω] "Wherefore I will never throw away in vain a part of life upon bootless hope, seeking that which cannot be, an all blameless man among us who enjoy the fruits of the spacious earth. When I have found one, I will let you know." κενεὰν is to be joined with μοῖραν αἰῶνος, as Stallbaum explains it: ὥστε κενεὰν εἶναι, i.e. *frustra*, by a prolepsis similar to that at 327 C.—ὅσοι καρπὸν αἰνύμεθα χθονός] Comp. Hom. Il. vi. 142. βροτῶν οἳ ἀρούρης καρπὸν ἔδουσιν. Hor. Od. ii. 14. 10. "Quicunque terrae munere vescimur."

XXXI. D. ἐπεξέρχεται] "follows up his attack against it." Legg. ix. 866 B. ὁ βουλομένος ἐπεξελθὼν τούτῳ δίκην.—ἑκὼν ὅστις ἔρδῃ] The author's meaning was undoubtedly that which Socrates rejects immediately afterwards, ὃς ἂν ἑκὼν μηδὲν κακὸν ποιῇ. ἂν is omitted, as often in poetry: cf. Soph. Oed. Col. 395. γέροντα δ' ὀρθοῦν φλαῦρον, ὃς νέος πέσῃ. Rarely in prose: Thuc. iv. 18. οἵτινες νομίσωσι. Phaedo 62 C. Jelf, § 830. 1. For the construction πάντας...ὅστις, comp. Heindorf's note: Monk on Eur. Hipp. 78.—ἀνάγκῃ δ' οὐδὲ θεοὶ μάχονται] Comp. Legg. v. 741 A. ἀνάγκην δὲ οὐδὲ θεὸς εἶναι λέγεται δυνατὸς βιάζεσθαι, vii. 818 A. τὸ δὲ ἀναγκαῖον αὐτῶν οὐχ οἷόν τε ἀποβάλλειν, ἀλλ' ἔοικεν ὁ τὸν θεὸν πρῶτον παροιμιασάμενος εἰς ταῦτα ἀποβλέψας εἰπεῖν ὡς οὐδὲ θεὸς ἀνάγκῃ μή ποτε φανῇ μαχόμενος. Ibid. E. οὕτω γὰρ ἀνάγκη φύσει κατείληφεν, ἥ φαμεν οὐδένα θεῶν οὔτε μάχεσθαι τὰ νῦν οὔτε μαχεῖσθαί ποτε. Philemon in Θηβαίοις (fragm. 31, Meineke), δοῦλοι βασιλέων εἰσίν, ὁ βασιλεὺς θεῶν, | ὁ θεὸς ἀνάγκης.—οὐδένα ἀνθρώπων ἑκόντα ἐξαμαρτάνειν] The following are some of the chief passages in which this doctrine of Plato is unfolded. Legg. v. 731 C. τὰ δ' αὖ τῶν ὅσοι ἀδικοῦσι μέν, ἰατὰ δέ, γιγνώσκειν χρὴ ὅτι πᾶς ὁ ἄδικος οὐχ ἑκὼν ἄδικος. τῶν γὰρ μεγίστων κακῶν οὐδεὶς οὐδαμοῦ οὐδὲν ἑκὼν κεκτῇτο ἄν ποτε, πολὺ δ' ἥκιστα ἐν τοῖς ἑαυτοῦ τιμιωτάτοις· ψυχὴ δ', ὡς εἴπομεν, ἀληθείᾳ γ' ἐστι πᾶσι τιμιώτατον· ἐν οὖν τῷ τιμιωτάτῳ τὸ μέγιστον κακὸν οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν μήποτε λάβῃ, καὶ ζῇ διὰ βίου κεκτημένος αὐτό. ἀλλὰ ἐλεεινὸς μὲν πάντως ὅ γε ἄδικος καὶ ὁ τὰ κακὰ ἔχων. Ibid. 734 B. καὶ τόν γε βουλόμενον ἡδέως ζῆν οὐκέτι παρείκει ἑκόντα γε ἀκολάστως ζῆν, ἀλλ' ἤδη δῆλον ὡς εἰ τὸ νῦν λεγόμενον ὀρθόν, πᾶς ἐξ ἀνάγκης ἄκων ἐστιν ἀκόλαστος· ἢ γὰρ δι' ἀμαθίαν ἢ δι' ἀκράτειαν ἢ δι' ἀμφότερα τοῦ σωφρονεῖν ἐνδεὴς ὢν ζῇ ὁ πᾶς ἀνθρώπινος ὄχλος. Add Rep. ix. 589 C. Tim. 86 D. Hipp. Maj. 296 C.

E. ὃς ἂν...τούτων] An instance of the change of construction with the relative just noticed. The reading τούτων for τούτου is that of all the best MSS.

346 καὶ ἐπαινέτην] I have now cancelled the words φιλεῖν καὶ ἐπαινεῖν, which in the first ed. I had bracketed. Hirschig, usually so bold in excision, retains them within brackets: but they are evidently intrusive.—μητέρα ἢ πατέρα] "Sic matris vocabulum saepe praeponitur. Criton. 51 A. λέληθέ σε ὅτι μητρός τε καὶ πατρὸς...τιμιώτερόν ἐστιν ἡ πατρίς. Ibid. C. βιάζεσθαι δὲ οὐχ ὅσιον οὔτε μητέρα οὔτε πατέρα. Hom. Od. IX. 367. Οὖτιν δέ με κικλήσκουσι | μήτηρ ἠδὲ πατήρ." Heindorf.—ἀλλόκοτον] "unnatural." This is one of the passages which might seem to favour the derivation from κότος, though, on the whole, that is probably to be rejected.—ὥσπερ ἀσμένους...ἐπιδεικνύναι] "observe it with a kind of satisfaction, and draw attention to it by finding fault:" the sentence of course still depends upon ἡγεῖτο.—ὥστε ἔτι μᾶλλον ψέγειν...] "so that they (these sons of unnatural parents) blame them still more (than they deserve), and add wilful dislike to what is unavoidable." μᾶλλον is for μᾶλλον τοῦ δέοντος, as in Phaedo 63 D. φησὶ γὰρ θερμαίνεσθαι μᾶλλον τοὺς διαλεγομένους, δεῖν δὲ οὐδὲν τοιοῦτον προσφέρειν τῷ φαρμάκῳ· a passage otherwise remarkable for the extremely rare use of οὐδὲν after φημὶ δεῖν.

B. ἐπικρύπτεσθαί τε καὶ ἐπαινεῖν ἀναγκάζεσθαι] "dissemble and force themselves even to praise."—ἑαυτοὺς παραμυθεῖσθαι] "*persuade* themselves," "control their feelings." So Phaedo 70 B. παραμυθία is *persuasion*: ἀλλὰ τοῦτο δὴ ἴσως οὐκ ὀλίγης δεῖται παραμυθίας καὶ πίστεως, ὡς ἔστι τε ἡ ψυχὴ ἀποθανόντος τοῦ ἀνθρώπου καί τινα δύναμιν ἔχει καὶ φρόνησιν.—ἡγήσατο...ἐπαινέσαι] "thought it *right* to praise;" a *sensus praegnans*. Comp. Thuc. II. 42. τὸ ἀμύνεσθαι καὶ παθεῖν μᾶλλον ἡγησάμενοι ἢ τὸ ἐνδόντες σώζεσθαι... where see Arnold. Lysias in Erastoth. p. 122. § 27. ὅτι δὲ συλλαβὼν ἀπέκτεινας, οὐκ οἴει ἐμοὶ καὶ τούτοισι δοῦναι δίκην; Herm. on Viger. p. 743, note 158, and a good note in Riddell's Dig. § 83.

C. ἀπάλαμνος] ἀμήχανος· Hesych. Here in a bad sense, nearly = κακός, as in Pind. Ol. II. 105. θανόντων...ἀπάλαμνοι φρένες | ποινὰς ἔτισαν..."the souls of the wicked," where Donaldson cites Solon. Fragm. 25. (Bergk). οὐδ' ἔρδειν ἔθ' ὅμως ἔργ' ἀπάλαμνα θέλει. Theogn. 481. μυθεῖται δ' ἀπάλαμνα, τὰ νήφοσι γίγνεται αἰσχρά.—εἰδώς τ' ὀνησίπολιν] This is Hermann's admirable emendation for εἰδώς γε ὀνήσει πόλιν. μιν for μήν, Schleierm. Both these corrections have been adopted by all the recent editors.—τῶν γὰρ ἠλιθίων ἀπείρων γενέθλα] "the breed of fools is endless:" γενέθλα

(not *γένεθλα*) is the nom. fem. for *γενέθλη*, and *ἀπείρων* is made to agree with *ἠλιθίων* by enallage.—*πάντα τοι καλά*] "Propriam quasi sedem in *γνώμαις* habet vocula *τοι*. Hom. Od. VIII. 329. *οὐκ ἀρετᾷ κακὰ ἔργα· κιχάνει τοι βραδὺς ὠκύν*. 351. *δειλοί τοι δειλῶν γε καὶ ἐγγύαι ἐγγυάασθαι*." Heindorf. Hence it recurs constantly in Theognis.—*ὥσπερ ἂν εἰ ἔλεγε*] See on 341 C. 343 E.

D. *τὰ μέσα ἀποδέχεται ὥστε μὴ ψέγειν*] "he approves of a mean so far as not to condemn it."—*καὶ οὐ ζητῶ...*] As these words obviously refer to the lines *τοὔνεκεν οὔποτ' ἐγὼ...διζήμενος*, they furnish a key to the correct restoration of the fragment: it being clear that those lines followed immediately upon *πάντα τοι καλά, κ.τ.λ.*, though Socrates had quoted them first, p. 345 C. See the restored poem at the end of the Dialogue.

E. *ἐνταῦθα δεῖ...λέγοντα*] "here, at the word *ἑκών*, we must make a pause in reciting." Comp. 341 A. *περὶ τοῦ δεινοῦ*, and the note.—*ἔστιν οὓς*, i. e. *ἐνίους*, cf. Jelf, § 817. 8.

347 *νῦν δέ...διὰ ταῦτά σε ἐγὼ ψέγω*] I cannot admit the aposiopesis which Heindorf and Stallbaum find here: the words *σφόδρα γάρ...λέγειν* are simply parenthetical.—*ἔστι μέντοι, ἔφη, καὶ ἐμοὶ λόγος...*] Comp. Hipp. Maj. 286 A. (Hippias is speaking) *ἔστι γάρ μοι περὶ αὐτῶν πάγκαλος λόγος συγκείμενος, καὶ ἄλλως εὖ διακείμενος καὶ τοῖς ὀνόμασι*. His conceit of his own accomplishments is ridiculed also Hipp. Min. 368 B. *πάντως δὲ πλείστας τέχνας πάντων σοφώτατος εἶ ἀνθρώπων, ὡς ἐγώ ποτέ σου ἤκουον μεγαλαυχουμένου, πολλὴν σοφίαν καὶ ζηλωτὴν σαυτοῦ διεξιόντος ἐν ἀγορᾷ ἐπὶ ταῖς τραπέζαις. ἔφησθα δὲ ἀφικέσθαι ποτὲ εἰς Ὀλυμπίαν ἃ εἶχες περὶ τὸ σῶμα ἅπαντα σαυτοῦ ἔργα ἔχων*...*πρὸς δὲ τούτοις ποιήματα ἔχων ἐλθεῖν, καὶ ἔπη καὶ τραγῳδίας καὶ διθυράμβους, καὶ καταλογάδην πολλοὺς λόγους καὶ παντοδαποὺς συγκειμένους.*

XXXII. C. *περὶ μὲν ᾀσμάτων...ἐάσωμεν*] Alcib. I. 113 D. *τὰ μὲν γὰρ τοιαῦτα ἡγοῦνται δῆλα εἶναι· ἐάσαντες οὖν περὶ αὐτῶν, σκοποῦσιν ὁπότερα συνοίσει πράξασι.*—*τῶν φαύλων καὶ ἀγοραίων ἀνθρώπων*] "ordinary and vulgar people."—*καὶ γὰρ οὗτοι...τιμίας ποιοῦσι τὰς αὐλητρίδας*] "For these people, because they cannot of themselves converse together over their cups, nor by means of their own voice and their own words, through want of education, keep up the price of female flute-players." They compare Xen. de Vectig. IV. 10. *τὸ δ' ἀργύριον τιμιώτερον ποιεῖ*. Plat. Euthyd. 304 B. *τὸ γὰρ σπάνιον τίμιον*.

D. *οὐκ ἂν ἴδοις οὔτ' αὐλητρίδας κ.τ.λ.*] Compare Sympos. 176 E. *τοῦτο μὲν δέδοκται, πίνειν ὅσον ἂν ἕκαστος βούληται, ἐπάναγκες δὲ μηδὲν εἶναι, τὸ μετὰ τοῦτο εἰσηγοῦμαι τὴν μὲν ἄρτι εἰσελθοῦσαν αὐλη-*

τρίδα χαίρειν ἐᾶν, αὐλοῦσαν, ἑαυτῇ ἢ ἂν βούληται ταῖς γυναιξὶ ταῖς ἔνδον, ἡμᾶς δὲ διὰ λόγων ἀλλήλοις συνεῖναι τὸ τήμερον. But in Xenophon's Symposium (II. 1) we have αὐλητρίδα ἀγαθὴν καὶ ὀρχηστρίδα τῶν τὰ θαύματα δυναμένων ποιεῖν, καὶ παῖδα πάνυ γε ὡραῖον καὶ πάνυ καλῶς κιθαρίζοντα καὶ ὀρχούμενον. It is not probable, however, as some have supposed, that in these passages Plato intended directly to ridicule Xenophon.

E. ἐὰν μὲν λάβωνται ἀνδρῶν] λαμβάνεσθαί τινος, like ἔχεσθαί τινος, is properly to "lay hold of:" but here simply "to catch."—ἐπαγόμενοί τε αὐτοὺς] "*bringing them forward* as authorities," i. e. quoting them. Comp. Hipp. Maj. 289 B. ἢ οὐ καὶ Ἡράκλειτος ταὐτὸν τοῦτο λέγει, ὃν σὺ ἐπάγει. Rep. II. 364 C. τούτοις πᾶσι τοῖς λόγοις μάρτυρας ποιητὰς ἐπάγονται.—ὃ ἀδυνατοῦσιν ἐξελέγξαι] "which they can neither prove nor disprove." See Arnold on Thuc. I. 21. ὄντα ἀνεξέλεγκτα καὶ τὰ πολλὰ...ἐπὶ τὸ μυθῶδες ἐκνενικηκότα.

348 καταθεμένους τοὺς ποιητὰς] In explanation of τοὺς τοιούτους μιμεῖσθαι, and therefore without the copula. Comp. above on 330 A.—παρέχειν] sc. ἐμαυτόν. "to put myself at your disposal." Comp. Gorg. 475 D. γενναίως τῷ λόγῳ ὥσπερ ἰατρῷ παρέχων ἀποκρίνου. 456 B. 480 C. Theaet. 191 A. But πάρασχες with the infinitive is "permit," a not unfrequent signification.

B. ἵνα τούτῳ μὲν ταῦτα συνειδῶμεν] "that we may be certain of this about him," i. e. of his unwillingness. Comp. Phaedr. 235 C. συνειδὼς ἐμαυτῷ ἀμαθίαν. Legg. IX. 170 B. ἃ μηδένα βούλονται σφίσι ξυνειδέναι γιγνόμενα ἢ γεγονότα. Sympos. 193 E. εἰ μὴ ξυνῄδειν Σωκράτει τε καὶ Ἀγάθωνι δεινοῖς οὖσι περὶ τὰ ἐρωτικά.

C. τῶν ἄλλων σχεδόν τι] These words are to be taken together, but there is no occasion to suppose, with Heindorf, an ellipse of πάντων· σχεδόν τι is often a mere polite phrase, where no real qualification is intended. Comp. 345 D. σχεδόν τι οἶμαι τοῦτο.—ἐρωτᾶν αὐτὸν ὡς ἀποκρ.] Stallbaum and Hermann are undoubtedly right in reading αὐτόν.

XXXIII. D. πάνυ λέγειν τι τὸν Ὅμηρον] "that there is a good deal in what he says," as at 320 B. Il. x. 224—226. σύν τε δύ' ἐρχομένω, καί τε πρὸ ὃ τοῦ ἐνόησεν, | ὅπως κέρδος ἔῃ· μοῦνος δ' εἴπερ τε νοήσῃ, | ἀλλά τε οἱ βράσσων τε νόος, λεπτὴ δέ τε μῆτις. Cf. Sympos. 174. D. σύν τε δύ', ἔφη, ἐρχομένω πρὸ ὁ τοῦ βουλευσόμεθα ὅ τι ἐροῦμεν. Alcib. II. 140 A. σύν τε δύο σκεπτομένω σχεδὸν εὑρήσομεν.—πρὸ ὃ τοῦ, i. e., ἕτερος πρὸ ἑτέρου.—μεθ' ὅτου βεβαιώσηται] "with whose authority to confirm it," the conj. deliberativus.—ἕνεκα τούτου σοι ἡδέως διαλέγομαι...ἡγούμενος] Comp. Herod. I. 86. τοῦδε εἵνεκεν ἀνεβίβασε ἐπὶ τὴν πύρην, βουλόμενος εἰδέναι εἴ τίς μιν

δαιμόνων ῥύσεται. Phaedo 102 D. λέγω δὲ τοῦδ' ἕνεκα, βουλόμενος δόξαι σοι ὅπερ ἐμοί. Theaet. 151 B. ταῦτα...ἕνεκα τοῦδε ἐμήκυνα, ὑποπτεύων σέ.

E. ἄλλους δὲ οὐ δύνανται ποιεῖν] See on 312 E.—ἀναφανδὸν σεαυτὸν ὑποκηρυξάμενος] "having yourself publicly cried:" teipsum *praeconio quodam venditans*, Heindorf. Comp. Aeschin. de Cor. p. 59, § 41. ἄλλοι δέ τινες ὑποκηρυξάμενοι τοὺς αὐτῶν οἰκέτας ἀφίεσαν ἀπελευθέρους· and see on 312 A.

349 σοφιστὴν ἐπονομάσας] Protagoras had said ὁμολογῶ τε σοφιστὴς εἶναι καὶ παιδεύειν ἀνθρώπους, 317 B.—πρῶτος...ἄρνυσθαι] Diog. Laert. IX. 52. οὗτος πρῶτος μισθὸν εἰσεπράξατο μνᾶς ἑκατόν. It is singular that Mr Grote should have set aside the explicit testimony of these two passages in favour of the pseudo-Plato, Alcib. I. 119 A. Besides, that passage is susceptible of a different explanation: see Mr Cope's Essay already referred to, p. 151.—ἐρωτᾶν καὶ ἀνακοινοῦσθαι] "to enquire into your opinions, and communicate his own."—καὶ νῦν δὴ ἐγὼ...πάλιν ἐπιθυμῶ] See above on 329 C.

B. ἦν δέ...τὸ ἐρώτημα τόδε] Comp. 329 D. "Wisdom, self-control, courage, justice, and holiness, are these all but five names for one thing? or does there lie under each of these names a distinct idea and a distinct thing having each a function of its own, so that no one of them is the same as any other? You said then that they were not names for one thing, but that each of these names was applied to a distinct thing," &c.

C. οὐδέν σοι ὑπόλογον τίθεμαι] "I put nothing down to your account," i. e. "I hold you accountable for nothing:" for which the usual word is ποιεῖσθαι. Comp. Lach. 189 B. λέγ' οὖν ὅ τι σοι φίλον, μηδὲν τὴν ἡμετέραν ἡλικίαν ὑπόλογον ποιούμενος. We must be careful to distinguish these cases in which ὑπόλογος is an adjective (ὑπ. ποιεῖσθαί τι), from those where it is a substantive (ὑπ. ποιεῖσθαί τινος). Riddell, § 131, has a good note on the verb ὑπολογίζεσθαι.—οὐ γὰρ ἂν θαυμάζοιμι...εἰ ἔλεγες] For the optative followed by indicative cf. Riddell, § 71.

XXXIV. D. ἐπιεικῶς παραπλήσια, "*tolerably* like." See on ἐπιεικής, above 336 D.—Ἔχε δή] "*Subsiste*. Formula est revocandi retinendique, si quis alio pergere aut aliud acturus videatur." Heindorf: comparing Gorg. 460 A. 490 B. ἔχε ἠρέμα Crat. 399 E. ἔχε simply, Ar. Vesp. 1149. Pac. 1193.

E. ἴτας] Schol. θαρραλέους, ἐπὶ πάντα ὁρμῶντας. The true derivation from εἶμι is here indicated: an American would translate "go-ahead fellows." Comp Sympos. 203 D. ἐπίβουλός ἐστι τοῖς

ἀγαθοῖς καὶ τοῖς καλοῖς, ἀνδρεῖος ὢν καὶ ἴτης καὶ σύντονος. Ar. Nub. 445. θρασύς, εὔγλωσσος, τολμηρός, ἴτης.—Κάλλιστον μὲν οὖν] Compare 309 A. σοφωτάτῳ μὲν οὖν δήπου, where σοφῷ in like manner has gone before.—εἰ μὴ μαίνομαί γε] "*alioqui*, ni dicerem, *insanus forem*:" "as I am a sane man." Comp. Ar. Thesm. 470. Μισῶ τὸν ἄνδρ' ἐκεῖνον, εἰ μὴ μαίνομαι. Charm. 156 A. εἰ μὴ ἀδικῶ γε· where see Heindorf.—τὸ μέν τι...τὸ δέ τι καλόν] Comp. Phileb. 13 C. τὰς μὲν εἶναί τινας ἡδονὰς ἀγαθάς, τὰς δέ τινας...κακάς. Euthyphr. 12 A. ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν αὐτοῦ ὅσιον, τὸ δέ τι ἄλλο. Gorg. 499 C. Rep. I. 339 C. Legg. II. 658 B.

350 Πότερον διότι ἐπιστάνται] Socrates is now to prove that courage, like the other virtues, comes under the general head of virtue, i. e. knowledge: since without knowledge it degenerates into rashness.—αὐτοὶ ἑαυτῶν...ἢ πρὶν μαθεῖν] Comp. Legg. I. 649 A. αὐτὸν αὑτοῦ ποιεῖ πρῶτον ἵλεων εὐθὺς μᾶλλον ἢ πρότερον.

B. οἱ θαῤῥαλέοι οὗτοι] "*hi, quos dicimus, fidentes*." Heindorf. Comp. Meno 88 B. Σκόπει δὴ τοίνυν ἅττα σοι δοκεῖ μὴ ἐπιστήμη εἶναι ἀλλ' ἄλλο ἐπιστήμης, εἰ οὐχὶ ποτὲ μὲν βλάπτει, ποτὲ δὲ ὠφελεῖ· οἷον ἀνδρία, εἰ μὴ ἔστι φρόνησις ἡ ἀνδρία ἀλλ' οἷον θάῤῥος τι· οὐχὶ ὅταν μὲν ἄνευ νοῦ θαῤῥῇ ἄνθρωπος, βλάπτεται, ὅταν δὲ σὺν νῷ, ὠφελεῖται;—Καὶ νῦν γ', ἔφη] "Yes, and I say so now."

C. οἱ οὕτω θαρραλέοι] i. e. ἀνεπιστήμονες ὄντες.—καὶ ἐκεῖ αὖ ...θαρραλεώτατοί εἰσι] "and from what we said before, those who are wisest will themselves also be most daring;" οὗτοι being joined with what follows, not with σοφώτατοι. With the use of ἐκεῖ comp. 323 B. ὃ ἐκεῖ σωφροσύνην ἡγοῦντο εἶναι, and below 351 A.

D. τοὺς δὲ ἀνδρείους...ὡμολόγησα] "But that the courageous are not daring (whereas I admitted they were), you have nowhere shown, or that I was wrong in making the admission I did." The sense is plain, but there is a confusion between two modes of expression, τοὺς ἀνδρείους ὡς οὐ θαρραλέοι εἰσὶν οὐδαμοῦ ἐπέδειξας, and τὸ ἐμὸν ὁμολόγημα οὐδαμοῦ ἐπέδειξας ὡς οὐκ ὀρθῶς ὡμολόγησα. —ἔπειτα] "*Porro*, sic positum h. l. quasi praecessisset πρῶτον μέν." Heindorf.

351 ἀλλὰ τὸ μὲν...τὴν δύναμιν] See on 313 A. 323 B. Other instances of this epexegesis are Gorg. 520 B. σὺ δὲ δι' ἄγνοιαν τὸ μὲν πάγκαλόν τι οἴει εἶναι, τὴν ῥητορικήν, τοῦ δὲ καταφρονεῖς. Theaet. 167 B. ἃ δή τινες τὰ φαντάσματα ὑπὸ ἀπειρίας ἀληθῆ καλοῦσιν. Euthyd. 271 C. ὃ δὲ σὺ ἐρωτᾷς τὴν σοφίαν αὐτοῖν, θαυμασία, ὦ Κρίτων. Legg. I. 631 C. ἄνπερ ἅμ' ἕπηται φρονήσει. ὃ δὴ πρῶτον αὖ τῶν θείων ἡγεμονοῦν ἐστὶν ἀγαθῶν, ἡ φρόνησις. II. 666 B. τελετὴν ἅμα καὶ παιδιάν, ἣν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις ἐπίκουρον τῆς

τοῦ γήρως αὐστηρότητος ἐδωρήσατο τὸν οἶνον φάρμακον.—κἀκεῖ "in the former case."

XXXV. B. ἀνιώμενός τε καὶ ὀδυνώμενος] "in pain of mind and body." ἡδέως βιούς, "having lived in pleasure."

C. καὶ ἀνιαρὰ ἀγαθά] i. e. καὶ ἀναιρὰ ἄττα ἀγαθά;—ἐγὼ γὰρ λέγω...κακά] Translate: "For what I mean is, as far as things are pleasant, are they not so far good unless something else (besides pleasure) result from them? And on the other hand, are not painful things just in the same way evil, so far as they are painful?" ὡσαύτως οὕτως are joined as in Xen. Cyrop. I. 1. 4. VIII. 5. 5. Cf. Phaedo 98 A. καὶ δὴ καὶ περὶ ἡλίου οὕτω παρεσκευάσμην ὡσαύτως πευσόμενος. μὴ εἰ is the reading of nearly all the MSS., including the best: but the sense clearly requires εἰ μή. I am favoured with a note by the Master of Trinity that "there may be a vestige of a reading εἰ μὴ εἴ τι = the Latin *nisi si*." In Gorg. 480 B. εἰ μὴ εἴ τις ὑπολάβοι is read in all editions: and in Phaedr. 279 B. Dr Thompson has restored εἴ τε εἰ αὐτῷ for ἔτι τε. See his notes on both passages.

D. πρὸς πάντα τὸν ἄλλον βίον τὸν ἐμόν] Mr Grote well remarks, "There is something peculiarly striking in this appeal of Protagoras to his whole past life, as rendering it impossible for him to admit what he evidently looked upon as a *base theory*... I deny the theory to be base, though I think it an imperfect theory of ethics." Vol. VIII. p. 518, note. ἔστι δ' ἃ ἔστι] i. e. ἔστι δὲ ἡδέα, ἃ ἐστιν ἀγαθά, καὶ ἀνιαρά, ἃ ἐστι κακά. Comp. above, 334 A. τὰ δὲ ἀνθρώποις μὲν οὐδέτερα, ἵπποις δέ· with the note.

E. τοῦτο τοίνυν λέγω, κ.τ.λ.] "I put the question, then, in this form—whether, in so far as they are pleasant, they be not good: meaning thereby to ask whether pleasure itself be not a good thing."—σκοπώμεθα αὐτό, κ.τ.λ.] Protagoras is here getting completely bewildered by his opponent's dialectics. He *means* to say (as Heindorf ingeniously remarks) "let us inquire into it, if the inquiry seem to be relevant:" (πρὸς λόγον, cf. on 343 D.) he actually says, "let us inquire, *and* if the inquiry seems relevant, and pleasure and good the same thing, we will—agree! but if not, why then we will—differ!" The confusion of thought and the truism are both characteristic of his perplexity.—Δικαιος, ἔφη, σὺ ἡγεῖσθαι] Many MSS., but not the best, read δίκαιος εἶ, ἔφη, but the ellipse is justified by Legg. VIII. 833 E, τίς νικᾷν ἄρα δίκαιος περὶ ταύτας αὖ τὰς μάχας. Tim. 62 D. ὁ μὲν γὰρ μέσος ἐν αὐτῷ τόπος οὔτε κάτω πεφυκὼς οὔτε ἄνω λέγεσθαι δίκαιος, ἀλλ' αὐτὸ ἐν μέσῳ.

352 ὅτι οὕτως ἔχεις πρὸς τὸ ἀγαθὸν] "that you think thus of, that such is your state of mind in relation to, Good and Pleasure." With ἔχεις we may supply γνώμης, as the second of the following instances shows. Parmen. 131 E. πρὸς τόδε πῶς ἔχεις; Τὸ ποῖον; Οἶμαί σε ἐκ τοῦ τοιοῦδε ἓν ἕκαστον εἶδος οἴεσθαι εἶναι...Xen. Memor. IV. 8. 7. καὶ οἱ ἐμοὶ φίλοι οὕτως ἔχοντες γνώμης περὶ ἐμοῦ διατελοῦσιν, οὐ διὰ τὸ φιλεῖν ἐμέ· καὶ γὰρ οἱ τοὺς ἄλλους φιλοῦντες οὕτως ἂν εἶχον πρὸς τοὺς ἑαυτῶν φίλους.

B. πότερον καὶ τοῦτό σοι δοκεῖ] "i.e. πότερον καὶ περὶ τούτου (περὶ ἐπιστήμης) σοι δοκεῖ. Respicit ad p. 351 C. μὴ καὶ σύ, ὥσπερ οἱ πολλοί, ἡδέα ἄττα καλεῖς κ.τ.λ. Constructio eadem est Phaedr. 234 C. τί σοι φαίνεται...ὁ λόγος...i. e. περὶ τοῦ λόγου. Menon. 82 E. Phileb. 22 A." Stallbaum.—ὡς περὶ τοιούτου αὐτοῦ ὄντος διανοοῦνται] The construction is περὶ αὐτοῦ ὡς ὄντος τοιούτου. Comp. Soph. 226 C. ὡς περὶ ταῦτα μίαν οὖσαν ἐν ἅπασι τέχνην ἑνὸς ὀνόματος ἀξιώσομεν αὐτήν, i. e. ὡς μίαν οὖσαν περὶ ταῦτα ἐν ἅπασι τέχνην. Legg. III. 692 C. καταφρονήσας ὡς ὄντων ἡμῶν βραχέος ἀξίων, i. e. καταφρονήσας ἡμῶν ὡς ὄντων.—ἀτεχνῶς...ἀπάντων] "thinking of knowledge precisely as (ἀτεχνῶς ὥσπερ, cf. Phaedo 90 C.) of a slave, dragged about at will by all the rest."

C. οἷον ἄρχειν] Comp. on 330 C. τοιοῦτον...οἷον δίκαιον εἶναι.

D. αἰσχρόν ἐστι...μὴ οὐχὶ] μὴ οὐ is used after δεινὸν εἶναι, αἰσχρόν, αἰσχύνην εἶναι, αἰσχύνεσθαι, which imply a negative notion. Jelf, § 750. b. Heindorf compares Theaet. 151 D. αἰσχρὸν μὴ ου παντὶ τρόπῳ προθυμεῖσθαι ὅ τί τις ἔχει λέγειν. Amat. 139 A. Xen. Lacon. VI. 2. So in Xen. Anab. II. 3. 11. ὥστε πᾶσιν αἰσχύνην εἶναι μὴ οὐ συσπουδάζειν. Cf. Cyrop. VIII. 4. 5. Plat. Theaet. 181 B. οὐδὲν μὲν οὖν ἀνεκτὸν...μὴ οὐ διασκέψασθαι. Plato could not have been without respect for the man into whose mouth he puts this sentiment, however he may amuse himself at the expense of Protagoras' weakness in dialectics.—Καλῶς γε...σὺ λέγων] Comp. Charm. 162 E. Καλῶς γε σὺ τοίνυν, ἦν δ' ἐγώ, ποιῶν. Gorg. 451 D. Ὀρθῶς γε λέγων σύ. Meno 73 E; and for καλῶς...καὶ ἀληθῆ, Phaedo 79 D. Ion 538 E. ὡς ῥᾳδίως τε καὶ ἀληθῆ ἐγώ σοι ἀποκρινοῦμαι. Terent. Adelph. IV. 3. 18. Et *recte* et *verum* dicis.

E. τὸ πάθος, ὅ φασιν...ἡττᾶσθαι] "This state which they call being overpowered by pleasure." Riddell, § 15.

353 ἐπεὶ γιγνώσκειν γε αὐτά] "although they know them." The infinitive after ἐπεὶ of course depends on φασί. Compare a similar use of ἐπεὶ in the *orat. obliqua*, Phaedo 109 E. ἐπεὶ εἴ τις αὐτοῦ ἐπ' ἄκρα ἔλθοι ἢ πτηνὸς γενόμενος ἀνάπτοιτο, κατιδεῖν ἂν ἀνακύψαντα.—εἰ μὴ ἔστι τοῦτο...ἀλλὰ τί ποτ' ἐστί] Comp. Gorg. 470

D. Εἰ δὲ μή, ἀλλ' ἀκούω γε. Xen. Cyrop. I. 3. 6. VIII. 7. 22. In these cases ἀλλὰ is "why then."—ὅ τι ἂν τύχωσι] sc. λέγοντες, "whatever comes into their head." Crito 45 D. ὅ τι ἂν τύχωσι, τοῦτο πράξουσι· Comp. ibid. 44 E. Sympos. 181 B.

B. εἶναι τι ἡμῖν τοῦτο πρὸς τὸ ἐξευρεῖν] Comp. Xen. Lac. VI. 13. Ἔστι γάρ τι τοῦτο πρὸς παιδείαν. The order of the next clause is: πῶς ποτ' ἔχει πρὸς τἆλλα μόρια τὰ τῆς ἀρετῆς.—ἐμμένειν οἷς ἄρτι ἔδοξεν ἡμῖν] Comp. Crito 50 A. καὶ ἐμμένομεν οἷς ὡμολογήσαμεν δικαίοις οὖσιν; Rep. I. 345 B. ἃ ἂν εἴπῃς, ἔμμενε τούτοις.

XXXVI. C. ἄλλο τι...ἐν τοῖσδε;] "Do you not allow that this happens to you in the following cases?" τοῦτο i.e. τὸ ἥττω τῶν ἡδονῶν γίγνεσθαι. The use of ἄλλο τι, *nonne?* for ἄλλο τι ἤ (Jelf, § 875, e.) is colloquial, and mostly confined to Plato: I have noticed it, however, in Ar. Nub. 423. ἄλλο τι δῆτ' οὖν νομιεῖς ἤδη θεὸν οὐδένα πλὴν ἅπερ ἡμεῖς;

D. καὶ ἡδύ ἐστιν ἕκαστον αὐτῶν] "Etiam ad haec ἐν τῷ παραχρῆμα intelligendum." Stallbaum.—ἢ κἂν εἴ τι τούτων...καὶ ὁπηοῦν] "Or even if they produce none of these after effects, but only give pleasure, would they still be evil, just because they give pleasure in any way whatever." The words ὅ τι (or ὅτι) μαθόντα have perplexed the editors, and have given rise to a multitude of conjectures. I have followed Dobree (Adv. I. 541) in applying to this passage the principle of ὅ τι μαθών, *propterea quod*, as explained by Herm. on Vig. p. 749. n. 194. Other instances are Apol. 36 B. τί ἄξιός εἰμι παθεῖν ἢ ἀποτῖσαι, ὅ τι μαθὼν ἐν τῷ βίῳ οὐχ ἡσυχίαν ἦγον; Euthyd. 283 E. εἶπον ἄν σοι εἰς κεφαλήν, ὅ τι μαθὼν ἐμοῦ καὶ τῶν ἄλλων καταψεύδει τοιοῦτο πρᾶγμα. Ibid. 299 A. πολὺ μέντοι, ἔφη, δικαιότερον τὸν πατέρα ὑμῶν τύπτοιμι, ὅ τι μαθὼν σοφοὺς υἱεῖς οὕτως ἔφυσεν. Eupolis (Incert. fr. 302, Meineke) εὐθὺ γὰρ πρὸς ὑμᾶς πρῶτον ἀπολογήσομαι | ὅ τι παθοντες τοὺς ξένους μὲν λέγετε ποιητὰς σοφούς...where the old reading is ὅ τι μαθόντες, the construction in either case remaining the same. Of the emendations which have been proposed, the best is C. F. Hermann's ὅτι παροντα: I think it is clear that μαθόντα, or whatever other word is read, must be the nom. plural; since the acc. masc. without the article would involve great harshness. On this ground I object to Stallbaum's ὅτι παθόντα, *quia sentientem*, and still more to Ast's ὅτι μαθόντα, *quia cognoscentem*. [I do not find much light in the recent edd. of Kroschel and Sauppe; and the ever critical Hirschig here holds his hand. I am now more certain than ever that the text and interpretation above are right.] There is room for a difference of opinion as to the meaning of καὶ

ὁπῃοῦν. I prefer taking it as (not only injuriously, but) "even in any way at all:" though it may also be translated "in every way," i.e. "indiscriminately." Compare Phileb. 40 D. τῷ τὸ παράπαν ὁπωσοῦν καὶ εἰκῇ χαίροντι.—κατὰ τὴν...ἐργασίαν] "on account of their producing immediate pleasure."

354 τὰς ὑπὸ τῶν ἰατρῶν θεραπείας] ὑπὸ is sometimes added where the simple genitive would be expected. Polit. 291 D. τὴν ὑπὸ τῶν ὀλίγων δυναστείαν. Xen. Cyrop. III. 3. 2. ἥδεσθαι τῇ ὑπὸ πάντων τιμῇ. cf. id. Hier. x. 3. ὁ ἀπὸ τῶν δορυφόρων φόβος.—λιμοκτονιῶν] Not of course "killing by hunger," but abstinence or starvation in a medical sense. The word is thus used by Hippocrates.

C. ἀλλ' ἢ ἡδονάς τε καὶ λύπας] For the phrase ἀλλ' ἤ, *except*, see Jelf, § 773. 5. The ἤ, which is not found in the MSS., was first inserted by Stephens on conjecture: but Hermann is perhaps right in rejecting it, as a few instances are found to support the omission. Comp. Soph. Oed. Tyr. 1331. Eur. Hipp. 638. Xen. Vectig. III. 6. Anab. VI. 4. 2. Plat. Sympos. 192 E, all cited in Jelf, § 773. 4.—τὴν μὲν ἡδονὴν ὡς ἀγαθὸν ὂν] A frequent attraction of the participle, instead of the more regular οὖσαν. See 329 D. ἑνὸς ὄντος τῆς ἀρετῆς· below 359 D. ἐπειδὴ τὸ ἥττω εἶναι ἑαυτοῦ εὑρέθη ἀμαθία οὖσα. 361 B. Rep. I. 336 A. ἐπειδὴ δὲ οὐδὲ τοῦτο ἐφάνη ἡ δικαιοσύνη ὄν. Ibid. 354 C. τὸ δίκαιον μὴ οἶδα...εἴτε ἀρετή τις οὖσα τυγχάνει. Gorg. 463 E. Meno 79 E. Hipp. Maj. 299 A.

D. ἐπεὶ εἰ...ἀλλ' οὐχ ἕξετε] "For if you really do call pleasure itself an evil for any other reason or with any other end in view, you may tell ns too (if yon can); bnt you cannot." The optat. ἔχοιτε ἂν expresses the speaker's incredulity in a less decided manner than the indic. ἔχετε ἡμῖν εἰπεῖν below: we may translate the latter "of course you can tell ns." Cf. Jelf, § 853. b.—ἄλλο τι οὖν, "nonne igitur?" see on 353 C. 358 C.

E. ἐν τούτῳ...ἀποδείξεις] "all my arguments turn on this;" on the meaning of τῶν ἡδονῶν ἥττω εἶναι.—ἀναθέσθαι] "to retract," as often in Plato: comp. Phaedo 87 A. οὐκ ἀνατίθεμαι μὴ οὐχὶ πάνυ χαριέντως...ἀποδεδεῖχθαι. Gorg. 461 D. ἀναθέσθαι ὅ τι ἂν σὺ βούλῃ, and Riddell Dig. § 111.

355 φημὶ γάρ...γίγνεσθαι] ὑμῖν is to be taken with τὸν λόγον: "for I say that, if this be the case, your argument becomes ridiculous."—ἄνθρωπος] There is no occasion to read with Bekker ὁ ἄνθρωπος· generic nonns may be nsed with or withont the article. To go no farther than the present dialogue, we have had at p. 321 D. σοφίαν ἄνθρωπος ταύτῃ ἔσχε. Ibid. E. τὴν τῆς 'Αθηνᾶς δίδωσιν

ἀνθρώπῳ· on the other hand, 322 A. ἐπειδὴ δὲ ὁ ἄνθρωπος θείας μέτεσχε μοίρας. 322 C. δοίη δίκην καὶ αἰδῶ ἀνθρώποις, and immediately afterwards δίκην δὴ καὶ αἰδῶ οὕτω θῶ ἐν τοῖς ἀνθρώποις. Below 355 E. λέγωμεν ὅτι ἄνθρωπος πράττει.—ἐξὸν μὴ πράττειν] "though he is *at liberty not* to practise them." The student must be careful not to confound this with οὐκ ἐξὸν πράττειν, "though he is *not at liberty*," &c. Comp. Dem. Mid. p. 538. § 95. καὶ ταῦτ' εἰς οἰκίαν ἐλθὼν ἐπὶ δεῖπνον, οἷ μὴ βαδίζειν ἐξῆν αὐτῷ.—ἀγόμενος καὶ ἐκπληττόμενος] "hurried along and driven out of his senses."

B. αὖθις αὖ λέγετε] The indicative may be defended as an anacoluthon: Ast and Bekker read, after Heindorf, λέγητε.—ἐὰν μὴ...χρώμεθα ἄρα] For the position of ἄρα comp. Gorg. 519 B. πολλὰ καὶ ἀγαθὰ τὴν πόλιν πεποιηκότες ἄρα ἀδίκως ὑπ' αὐτῆς ἀπόλλυνται. Legg. x. 906 B. δῆλον ὅτι θηριώδεις πρὸς τὰς τῶν φυλάκων ψυχὰς ἄρα κυνῶν ἢ τὰς τῶν νομέων...Sympos. 177 E. ταῦτα δὴ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι πάντες ἄρα ξυνέφασάν τε καὶ ἐκέλευον. Thuc. iv. 86. καὶ εἴ τις ἰδίᾳ τινὰ δεδιὼς ἄρα ἀπρόθυμός ἐστι. After εἰ, ἐὰν etc. ἄρα means *perhaps*, Buttm. Mid. p. 516. § 9.

XXXVII. C. ἡττώμενος φήσομεν] i. e. ὅτι ἡττᾶται.—λέγωμεν, ὅτι ἡττώμενος—] Again only the same answer can be given, because the terms of the definition exclude the answer ἡττώμενος ὑπὸ ἡδονῆς.—τοῦ ἀγαθοῦ, φήσομεν] The preposition of the question is generally not repeated in the answer. Comp. Polit. 283 C. Περὶ δὴ τούτων αὐτῶν ὁ λόγος ἡμῖν...ὀρθῶς ἂν γίγνοιτο. Τίνων; Μήκους τε πέρι, κ.τ.λ. Rep. iii. 410 C. Τίνος δέ, ἦ δ' ὅς, πέρι λέγεις; Ἀγριότητός τε καὶ σκληρότητος...v. 456 D. Πῶς οὖν ἔχεις δόξης τοῦ τοιοῦδε πέρι; Τίνος δή; Τοῦ ὑπολαμβάνειν, κ.τ.λ.—ὑβριστής] "sarcastic," as in Sympos. 175 E. 215 B.

D. ἀνάξιά ἐστι τἀγαθὰ τῶν κακῶν] "In what respect are good things unworthy of being preferred to evil?" like οὐκ ἀξίων ὄντων νικᾶν τὰ κακὰ above.—πλείω, τὰ δὲ ἐλάττω] See on 330 A. The second ἢ is bracketed by Hirschig: rightly, I think.

E. Ταῦτα μὲν οὖν οὕτω] "So far then on this track:" i. e. using the words "good" and "evil" instead of their equivalents "pleasurable" and "painful." This will serve to explain the phrase μεταλάβωμεν τὰ ὀνόματα ἐπὶ τοῖς αὐτοῖς τούτοις, a rare construction with μεταλαμβάνειν, though frequent with εἰπεῖν, καλεῖν, ὀνομάζειν. Comp. Soph. 240 A. ἐπὶ τίνι τὸ τοιοῦτον εἴπες; Crat. 433 E. ἐπὶ μὲν ᾧ νῦν σμικρόν, μέγα καλεῖν, ἐπὶ δὲ ᾧ μέγα, σμικρόν. Rep. v. 470 B. ἐπὶ μὲν οὖν τῇ τοῦ οἰκείου ἔχθρᾳ στάσις κέκληται, ἐπὶ δὲ τῇ του ἀλλοτρίου πόλεμος. vi. 493 C. ὀνομάζει πάντα ταῦτα ἐπὶ ταῖς τοῦ μεγάλου ζώου δόξαις, οἷς μὲν χαίροι ἐκεῖνο, ἀγαθὰ

καλῶν, οἷς δὲ ἄχθοιτο, κακά. Alcib. I. 108 A. Τί οὖν; ἐπειδὴ βέλτιον μὲν ὠνόμαζες ἐπ' ἀμφοτέροις...τί καλεῖς τὸ ἐν τῷ κιθαρίζειν βέλτιον;

356 καὶ τίς ἄλλη ἀξία ἡδονῇ...ἔλλειψις] "And what other measure of value has pleasure in comparison with pain, but the excess or defect of one or the other?" ἀξία ἡδονῇ is Schleiermacher's correction: the MSS. read ἀναξία ἡδονή, which is meaningless.—ταῦτα δ' ἐστὶ...γιγνόμενα] i. e. τοῦτο δ' ἐστὶ...τὸ γίγνεσθαι.—μᾶλλον καὶ ἧττον, "in greater or less degree." Comp. Phaedo 93 B. ἂν μὲν μᾶλλον ἁρμοσθῇ καὶ ἐπὶ πλέον...μᾶλλόν τε ἂν ἁρμονία εἴη καὶ πλείων, εἰ δ' ἧττόν τε καὶ ἐπ' ἔλαττον, ἧττόν τε καὶ ἐλάττων, and a passage much resembling the present in Hipp. Maj. 299 D.—πολὺ διαφέρει...τὸν ὕστερον χρόνον] A passage in the Republic, IX. 583 B—586 C, is well worth comparing. For the pleonasm of ὅτι cf. Riddell, § 279.

B. ἀγαθὸς ἱστάναι] "expert at weighing." So just below, τὸ ἐγγὺς...ἐν τῷ ζυγῷ is "having weighed both their nearness and remoteness in the scales." The rule of conduct here laid down bears a curious affinity to the "greatest happiness principle" of the modern Utilitarian school: one is surprised, however, to meet with it in the mouth of Socrates.—ταύτην τὴν πρᾶξιν...ἐνῇ] "that line of conduct is to be pursued, in which this excess is contained."

C. Ὅτε δὴ τοῦτο οὕτως ἔχει] Ὅτε is here causal, "since:" as in Phaedo 84 E. Soph. 254 B. Rep. IX. 581 E. Legg. X. 886 E.—μεγέθη "magnitudes" whether greater or less: in a merely relative sense. Comp. Phileb. 41 E. ἐν μὲν ὄψει τὸ πόρρωθεν καὶ ἐγγύθεν ὁρᾶν τὰ μεγέθη τὴν ἀλήθειαν ἀφανίζει.—τὰ παχέα καὶ τὰ πολλὰ ὡσαύτως;] "Is it not the same with the thickness and number of objects?"—αἱ φωναὶ αἱ ἴσαι] The second αἱ was added by Heindorf, and has been retained by all the editors except Ast and C. F. Hermann: they defend the reading of the MSS. αἱ φωναὶ ἴσαι by making ἴσαι the predicate, "etsi pares sint."

D. "If then our well-being depended upon this, upon our practising and choosing great lengths, and our avoiding and not practising small ones, what safeguard of our life should we seemingly have had? Would it be the art of mensuration, or the force of appearances? or would not this latter have led us astray, and made us constantly waver in our choice of the same things, and change our minds both in practice and in the choosing of lengths both great and small? and would not mensuration have brought to nought this unreality, and by showing us the truth have caused

our soul to have rest in abiding by the truth, and have become the safeguard of our life?"—*ἐν τούτῳ...ἐν τῷ*] Compare, for the preposition thus repeated, 358 B. *αἱ ἐπὶ τούτου πράξεις ἅπασαι, ἐπὶ τοῦ ἀλύπως ζῆν*. Lach. 183 C. *ἐκ τούτων οἱ ὀνομαστοὶ γίγνονται ἐκ τῶν ἐπιτηδευσάντων ἑκάστων*. Ibid. 191 B. Rep. I. 341 D. Legg. II. 670 D.—*ἡ τοῦ φαινομένου δύναμις;*] *δύναμις* is here the "force" or "meaning," like Lat. *vis:* as at Gorg. 447 C. Rep. v. 477 B. Phaedr. 237 C.—*ἐπλάνα καὶ ἐποίει*] *ἂν* is to be supplied from the context: see Herm. on Vig. App. p. 944 sqq.—*μεταλαμβάνειν ταὐτὰ καὶ μεταμέλειν*] See above 355 E. In these instances *μετὰ* expresses "change:" so in Rep. IV. 434 B. *ὅταν...τὰ ἀλλήλων οὗτοι ὄργανα μεταλαμβάνωσι καὶ τὰς τιμάς*. Theaet. 173 B. *μετάληψις τῶν λόγων* is "alternation of arguments." The more usual sense of *μεταλαμβάνω*, "to participate," occurs above, 329 E.

E. *ἢ αὐτὸ πρὸς...τὸ ἕτερον*] "either by comparison between themselves (i.e. odd with odd, and even with even) or with one another."

357 *'Εδόκουν ἂν...ὁμολογεῖν*] *ἂν* of course belongs to *ὁμολογεῖν*.—*ἐν ὀρθῇ τῇ αἱρέσει*] The position of the article requires us to translate "in the correctness of our choice" or "in our choice being correct:" *ὀρθῇ* is the predicate.—*τοῦ τε πλέονος καὶ ἐλάττονος, κ.τ.λ.*] The article is correctly used with the first word only of an enumeration: comp. Crito 47 C. *περὶ τῶν δικαίων καὶ ἀδίκων καὶ αἰσχρῶν καὶ καλῶν καὶ ἀγαθῶν καὶ κακῶν*. Euthyphr. 7 C. Alcib. I. 117 A. Above, 329 C.

B. *πρὸς ἀλλήλας*] i. e. *ἡδονῆς πρὸς λύπην* and *λύπης πρὸς ἡδονήν*.

C. *ἤρεσθε δέ, εἰ μέμνησθε, κ.τ.λ.*] "Now you asked, if you remember, when we (Protagoras and I) had agreed that nothing was more powerful than scientific knowledge, but that knowledge (*τοῦτο*, i. e. *τὴν ἐπιστήμην*· cf. 352 B) was ever dominant, wherever it existed, over pleasure and everything else—whereas you, on the contrary, said that pleasure was often dominant even over the man possessed of knowledge—so when we did not agree with you, you asked in the next place," &c.—*εἰ μὴ ἔστι...ἡττᾶσθαι*] "if experiencing this be not what is meant by being overpowered by pleasure."

D. *εἰ...εἴπομεν...κατεγελᾶτε ἄν*] The imperfect thus interchanged with the aorist expresses the continuance of the action: "you would have laughed at us and would be laughing still." The construction may be compared with that at 311 B, where the imperfect precedes: and see Jelf, § 401. 4.—*καὶ οὐ μόνον ἐπιστή-*

μης] sc. ἐνδείᾳ. With εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν ἔτι ὡμολογήκατε comp. Soph. 258 C. Πλεῖον ἢ 'κεῖνος ἀπεῖπε σκοπεῖν, ἡμεῖς εἰς τὸ πρόσθεν ἔτι ζητήσαντες ἀπεδείξαμεν αὐτῷ.

E. ὥστε τοῦτ' ἐστὶ...μεγίστη] "This therefore is what being overpowered by pleasure means, ignorance, and that the greatest." —οὔτε αὐτοὶ] sc. προσέρχεσθε, to be supplied from πέμπετε: the latter word is introduced as an afterthought, instead of οὔτε αὐτοὶ οὔτε οἱ ὑμέτεροι παῖδες προσέρχονται. τούτων is neuter.

XXXVIII. 358 ὦ Ἱππία] ὦ has dropped out after ἐρωτῶ, and is added in all recent editions. The same corrections have been made below, p. 358 E. ἐγώ, ὦ Πρόδικε, and 359 A.—τὴν δὲ Προδίκου τοῦδε διαίρεσιν] See on 337 A.—εἴτε ὁπόθεν...ὀνομάζων] "whatever be the name, and whencesoever derived, by which you choose to call it." Comp. Crat. 400 E. ὥσπερ ἐν ταῖς εὐχαῖς νόμος ἐστὶν ἡμῖν εὔχεσθαι, οἵτινές τε καὶ ὁπόθεν χαίρουσιν ὀνομαζόμενοι. Phaedr. 273 C. ὅστις δή ποτ' ὢν τυγχάνει καὶ ὁπόθεν χαίρει ὀνομαζόμενος. Crito 50 A. Euthyd. 288 A. Hipp. Min. 369 A. Legg. I. 633 A. Parmen. 133 D. Sympos. 212 C. Wyttenb. on Phaedo 100 D.

B. τοῦτό μοι πρὸς ὃ βούλομαι ἀπόκριναι] "*Hoc vocabulo utere in responsione tua*, ut dicas vel τὸ ἡδὺ ἀγαθὸν εἶναι, vel τὸ τερπνὸν εἶν. ἀγ. etc." Heindorf.—αἱ ἐπὶ τούτου πράξεις] "actions *tending* to this." Instead of the more usual *dative of purpose*, we have here the *genitive of motion:* as in the phrases πλεῖν ἐπὶ Σάμου, Thuc. I. 116. Xen. Cyrop. VII. 2. 1. ἐπὶ Σάρδεων ἔφευγε. Cf. Jelf, § 633. 1.—καὶ ὠφέλιμοι] These words are undoubtedly spurious: compare the recapitulation, p. 359 E.—ἃ ποιεῖ καὶ δυνατά] This is Schleiermacher's conjecture, followed by most of the recent editors for the reading of the MSS. ἃ ἐποίει καὶ δύναται. The latter can only mean "better than what he did before and is able to do again:" the grammar and sense of which are both unsatisfactory. Translate: "no man who either knows or believes that other things are better than what he is doing, *and at the same time practicable*, nevertheless does the less good, when he might do the better." Sauppe gives ἃ ποιεῖ καὶ ἃ δύναται. It is easy to say, with Ast and Kroschel, that the words καὶ δυνατά were better away: not so easy to account for their insertion.

C. Ἄλλο τι οὖν...κακὰ εἶναι] See on 354 D. and comp. Meno 78 A. Οὐκ ἄρα βούλεται, ὦ Μένων, τὰ κακὰ οὐδείς, εἴπερ μὴ βούλεται τοιοῦτος εἶναι (ἄθλιος καὶ κακοδαίμων).

D. ἀντὶ τῶν ἀγαθῶν] i.e. ἀντὶ τοῦ ἰέναι ἐπὶ τὰ ἀγαθά. This species of condensed expression is well illustrated by Stallbaum. Gorg. 455 E. ἡ τῶν λιμένων κατασκευὴ ἐκ τῆς Θεμιστοκλέους συμβου-

λῆς γέγονε...ἀλλ' οὐκ ἐκ τῶν δημιουργῶν, i.e. ἐκ τῆς τῶν δημιουργῶν. Phileb. 34 C. τὴν ψυχῆς ἡδονὴν χωρὶς σώματος, i.e. χωρὶς τῆς τοῦ σώματος. Ibid. 41 C. οὐκοῦν τὸ μὲν ἐπιθυμοῦν ἦν ἡ ψυχὴ τῶν τοῦ σώματος ἐναντίων ἕξεων, i.e. τῶν ἐναντίων τῶν τοῦ σώματος. Rep. VIII. 554 D. εὑρήσεις...τὰς τοῦ κηφῆνος ξυγγενεῖς ἐνούσας ἐπιθυμίας, i.e. τῶν τοῦ κηφῆνος ἐπιθυμιῶν. Sympos. 218 E. ἀντὶ δόξης ἀλήθειαν καλῶν κτᾶσθαι ἐπιχειρεῖς, i.e. ἀντὶ δόξης καλῶν.—καλεῖτέ τι δέος] Comp. on 332 A. ἀφροσύνην τι καλεῖς; In this place τι is added on Heindorf's conjecture.—εἴτε φόβον εἴτε δέος] Ammonius, s. v. δέος. δέος καὶ φόβος διαφέρει. δέος μὲν γάρ ἐστι πολυχρόνιος κακοῦ ὑπόνοια· φόβος δὲ ἡ παραυτίκα πτόησις. διόπερ Ἡρόδοτος ἐν τῇ τετάρτῃ (IV. 115.) Ἡμέας ἔχει φόβος τε καὶ δέος. The distinction is neglected in practice, but is characteristically insisted on by Prodicus: comp. on 337 A.

E. ἀλλὰ τόδε] sc. διαφέρει τι· "but this *does* matter."—ἆρά τις ἀνθρώπων, κ.τ.λ.] "will any man deliberately encounter what he fears, when he might encounter what he does not fear? or is it impossible by our previous admissions? for we have admitted that what he fears he believes to be evil, and that what he thinks evil, no one either encounters or chooses willingly."

359 ἀπολογείσθω...παντάπασι] "Let our friend Protagoras here defend the correctness of what he said at first—nay, not quite at first." Compare 329 D sqq. with 349 D.—ἰδίαν...δύναμιν] "that each had a distinct function of its own."

B. ἠρόμην δ' οὖν τοῦτον] See p. 349 E.

C. τὰ θαῤῥαλέα] "safe things:" a rare signification, equivalent to ἐπὶ ἃ θαῤῥοῦσι below.

D. Ἀλλὰ τοῦτό γ', ἔφη] τοῦτο, "the former:" ἐπὶ τὰ δεινά, ἡγουμένους δεινὰ εἶναι.—ἐν οἷς...τοῖς λόγοις] At 358 C. ἐπί γε τὰ κακὰ οὐδεὶς ἑκὼν ἔρχεται, οὐδὲ ἐπὶ ἃ οἴεται κακὰ εἶναι. Cf. D. E. For the construction comp. Phaedo 61 B. διὰ ταῦτα δὴ οὓς προχείρους εἶχον καὶ ἠπιστάμην μύθους τοὺς Αἰσώπου, τούτους ἐποίησα, οἷς πρώτοις ἐνέτυχον. Soph. 246 C. λάβωμεν λόγον ὑπὲρ ἧς τίθενται τῆς οὐσίας, and the note on 342 B. ὥσπερ οὓς Πρωταγόρας ἔλεγε τοὺς σοφιστάς.—ἐπειδὴ τὸ...οὖσα] See on 354 C. τὴν μὲν ἡδονὴν...ὄν. Add Rep. III. 392 D. ἆρ' οὐ πάντα, ὅσα ὑπὸ μυθολόγων ἢ ποιητῶν λέγεται, διήγησις οὖσα τυγχάνει. IV. 420 C. οἱ γὰρ ὀφθαλμοί, κάλλιστον ὄν, οὐκ ὀστρείῳ ἐναληλιμμένοι εἶεν. The argument is, that the passions which lead men into what they know to be dangerous are, as such, a sort of ἀμαθία. The connexion is, however, obscure; and Ast wishes to strike out the clause.

E. πᾶν γε τοὐναντίον...οἱ ἀνδρεῖοι] "The things which cowards

and brave men encounter are the exact opposite (of one another)." —*αὐτίκα* "for instance," as in Theaet. 166 B. *αὐτίκα γάρ δοκεῖς τινα σοι ξυγχωρήσεσθαι*... Gorg. 472 C. *αὐτίκα πρῶτον, περὶ οὗ νῦν ὁ λόγος ἐστί, σὺ ἡγεῖ οἷόν τε εἶναι.* Phaedr. 235 E. *αὐτίκα περὶ οὗ ὁ λόγος, τίνα οἴει λέγοντα, κ.τ.λ.* and not unfrequently in Attic Greek.—*καὶ ἀγαθὸν ὡμολογήσαμεν*] At 358 B.

360 *ἰέναι ἐπὶ τὸ κάλλιόν τε*] The MSS. read *καλὸν* for *κάλλιον*· Stephens' correction is however rendered certain by the words recurring below without variation, and by Plato's usage elsewhere. Comp. Crito 54 B. Phaedo 98 E.

B. *Οὐκοῦν ὅλως...θαῤῥοῦσιν*] "In a word then, courageous men fear no base fears when they do fear, nor are they inspired with base confidences." Comp. Phileb. 43 D. *Οὐκοῦν οὐκ ἂν εἴη τὸ μὴ λυπεῖσθαί ποτε ταὐτὸν τῷ χαίρειν; Πῶς γὰρ ἄν;*

E. *Φιλονεικεῖν μοι...τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον*] "You seem to stickle, Socrates, for the answer coming from me." Comp. Thuc. v. 111. *δοθείσης αἱρέσεως πολέμου πέρι καὶ ἀσφαλείας μὴ τὰ χείρω φιλονεικῆσαι* (*obstinately to choose the worst*). Elsewhere, the construction is *φιλονεικεῖν πρός τι.* Rep. I. 338 A. *προσεποιεῖτο δὲ φιλονεικεῖν πρὸς τὸ ἐμὲ εἶναι τὸν ἀποκρινόμενον.*—*αὐτό, ἡ ἀρετή*] "the abstract idea of virtue." Comp. Theaet. 146 E. *γνῶναι ἐπιστήμην αὐτὸ ὅτι ποτ' ἐστίν.* Rep. II. 362 E. *οὐκ αὐτὸ δικαιοσύνην ἐπαινοῦντες, ἀλλὰ τὰς ἀπ' αὐτῆς εὐδοκιμήσεις.* VI. 493 E. *αὐτὸ τὸ καλόν, ἀλλὰ μὴ τὰ πολλὰ καλά.* Parmen. 130 B. *τί σοι δοκεῖ εἶναι αὐτὸ ὁμοιότης χωρὶς ἧς ἡμεῖς ὁμοιότητος ἔχομεν.* To write in one word *αὐτοδικαιοσύνη, αὐτόδοξα*, &c. is later, and first in Aristotle. Cf. Jelf, § 626. 2. Riddell, Dig. §§ 47. 215.

361 *μακρὸν λόγον...ἀπετείναμεν*] Comp. 329 A. note. 335 C. 336 C.—*νῦν σεαυτῷ τἀναντία σπεύδεις*] Crito 45 C. *καὶ τοιαῦτα σπεύδεις περὶ σεαυτὸν γενέσθαι, ἅπερ ἂν καὶ οἱ ἐχθροί σου σπεύσαιέν τε καὶ ἔσπευσαν.* Gorg. 455 C. *καὶ τὸ σὸν σπεύδειν.*

B. *ἐπιστήμη ὅλον*] "nothing but knowledge." Comp. 349 E. *ὅλον καλόν.* Meno 79 B. *ἐμοῦ δεηθέντος ὅλον εἰπεῖν τὴν ἀρετήν*—81 D. *τὸ γὰρ ζητεῖν ἄρα καὶ τὸ μανθάνειν ἀνάμνησις ὅλον ἐστίν*—*νῦν τοὐναντίον...ἢ ἐπιστήμην*] "now seems urging the contrary, that it appears to be almost anything rather than knowledge." Comp. Apol. 27 A. *ἔοικε γὰρ ὥσπερ αἴνιγμα ξυντιθέντι.* Phaedo 87 E. *ἔοικεν ἁπτομένῳ.* Rep. III. 414 C. *ὡς ἔοικας, ἔφη, ὀκνοῦντι λέγειν.* Meno 80 D. *νῦν μέντοι ὅμοιος εἶ οὐκ εἰδότι.*

C. *βουλοίμην ἂν...εἴτε μὴ διδακτόν*] Comp. Meno 100 B. *τὸ δὲ σαφὲς περὶ αὐτοῦ εἰσόμεθα τότε, ὅταν πρὶν ᾧτινι τρόπῳ τοῖς ἀνθρώποις παραγίγνεται ἀρετή, πρότερον ἐπιχειρήσωμεν αὐτὸ καθ' αὑτὸ

ζητεῖν τί ποτ' ἔστιν ἀρετή.—μὴ πολλάκις] lest "*perhaps*," a sense which *πολλάκις* bears not unfrequently after *εἰ, ἐάν, μή, ἵνα μή*. Phaedo 60 E. *εἰ ἄρα πολλάκις ταύτην τὴν μουσικήν μοι ἐπιτάττοι ποιεῖν.* Lach. 179 B. *εἰ δ' ἄρα πολλάκις μὴ προσεσχήκατε τὸν νοῦν τούτῳ.* Rep. IV. 424 C. *μὴ πολλάκις τὸν ποιητήν τις οἴηται.* Phaedr. 238 D. *ἐὰν ἄρα πολλάκις νυμφόληπτος προϊόντος τοῦ λόγου γένωμαι.* Thucyd. II. 13. *μὴ πολλάκις...τοὺς ἀγροὺς αὐτοῦ παραλίπῃ καὶ μὴ δῃώσῃ,* Ar. Eccl. 791. *σεισμὸς εἰ γένοιτο πολλάκις | ἢ πῦρ ἀπότροπον.*—Virg. Aen. I. 148. Ac veluti magno in populo quum *saepe* coorta est | Seditio.—*καὶ ἐν τῇ σκέψει...ὥσπερ καὶ ἐν τῇ διανομῇ*] See 321 C. D. and for the repetition of *καί*, Phaedo 76 E. *ὥσπερ καὶ ταῦτα ἔστιν, οὕτω καὶ τὴν ἡμετέραν ψυχὴν εἶναι.* Gorg. 457 E. *εἰ μὲν καὶ σὺ εἶ τῶν ἀνθρώπων ὧνπερ καὶ ἐγώ, ἡδέως ἄν σε διερωτῴην.*

D. *ᾧ χρώμενος ἐγὼ καὶ προμηθούμενος*] i. e. "making him my model and taking *forethought* for my whole life:" with a play on the name of Prometheus, *ᾧ χρώμενος* being equivalent to *προμηθείᾳ χρώμενος.—ὅπερ καὶ κατ' ἀρχὰς ἔλεγον*] 348 C. D.

E. *ὧν ἐντυγχάνω*] i. e. *τούτων οἷς ἐντυγχανω*, a rare instance of the dative suffering attraction. Comp. Theaet. 144 A. *ὧν δὴ πώποτε ἐνέτυχον.* Gorg. 509 A. *ὧν ἐγὼ ἐντετύχηκα.* Aeschin. Fals. Leg. p. 43. § 123. *παρ' ὧν μὲν βοηθεῖς οὐκ ἀπολήψῃ χάριν*, i. e. *παρὰ τούτων οἷς βοηθεῖς·* and see Jelf, § 822. Obs. 4. There is no undoubted instance of *ἐντυγχάνω* followed by a genitive: in Herod. IV. 140. *λελυμένης τῆς γεφύρης* is probably a genitive absolute, as Bähr explains it.—*τῶν μὲν τηλικούτων καὶ πάνυ*] "among those of your own age, indeed, *by far* the most." This is said, of course, with a tacit reservation in favour of himself as an older man. Socrates had said, above 314 B. *ταῦτα οὖν σκοπώμεθα καὶ μετὰ τῶν πρεσβυτέρων ἡμῶν· ἡμεῖς γὰρ ἔτι νέοι ὥστε τοσοῦτο πρᾶγμα διελέσθαι.*

362 *οἷπερ ἔφην ἰέναι*] Above 335 C. *ἐλθεῖν γάρ ποί με δεῖ.—Καλλίᾳ τῷ καλῷ*] Hipp. Maj. init. *Ἱππίας ὁ καλός τε καὶ σοφός* Cf. Phileb. 11 C. Phaedr. 278 E. Xen. Memor. IV. 2. 1. Ar. Vesp. 97. *ἢν ἴδῃ γέ που γεγραμμένον | υἱὸν Πυριλάμπους ἐν θύρᾳ Δῆμον καλόν*, where the Scholiast: *ἐπέγραφον δὲ οἱ Ἀθηναῖοι τὰ τῶν καλῶν ὀνόματα οὕτως· ὁ δεῖνα καλός.*

INDEX TO THE NOTES.

CAMBRIDGE: PRINTED BY C. J. CLAY, M.A. AT THE UNIVERSITY PRESS.

March, 1879.

A CLASSIFIED LIST
OF
EDUCATIONAL WORKS
PUBLISHED BY
GEORGE BELL & SONS.

Full Catalogues will be sent post free on application.

BIBLIOTHECA CLASSICA.

A Series of Greek and Latin Authors, with English Notes, edited by eminent Scholars. 8vo.

Æschylus. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 18*s*.
Cicero's Orations. By G. Long, M.A. 4 vols. 16*s*., 14*s*., 16*s*., 18*s*.
Demosthenes. By R. Whiston, M.A. 2 vols. 16*s*. each.
Euripides. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 3 vols. 16*s*. each.
Homer. By F. A. Paley, M.A. Vol. I. 12*s*.; Vol. II. 14*s*.
Herodotus. By Rev. J. W. Blakesley, B.D. 2 vols. 32*s*.
Hesiod. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 10*s*. 6*d*.
Horace. By Rev. A. J. Macleane, M.A. 18*s*.
Juvenal and Persius. By Rev. A. J. Macleane, M.A. 12*s*.
Plato. By W. H. Thompson, D.D. 2 vols. 7*s*. 6*d*. each.
Sophocles. By Rev. F. H. Blaydes, M.A. Vol. I. 18*s*.
——— Philoctetes. By F. A. Paley, M.A. [*In the Press.*
Tacitus: The Annals. By the Rev. P. Frost. 15*s*.
Terence. By E. St. J. Parry, M.A. 18*s*.
Virgil. By J. Conington, M.A. 3 vols. 12*s*., 14*s*., 14*s*.
An Atlas of Classical Geography; Twenty-four Maps. By W. Hughes and George Long, M.A. New edition, with coloured outlines. Imperial 8vo. 12*s*. 6*d*.

Uniform with above.

A Complete Latin Grammar. By J. W. Donaldson, D.D. 3rd Edition. 14*s*.
A Complete Greek Grammar. By J. W. Donaldson, D.D. 3rd Edition. 16*s*.

GRAMMAR-SCHOOL CLASSICS.

A Series of Greek and Latin Authors, with English Notes. Fcap. 8vo.

Cæsar: De Bello Gallico. By George Long, M.A. 5*s*. 6*d*.
——— Books I.–III. For Junior Classes. By G. Long, M.A. 2*s*. 6*d*.
Catullus, Tibullus, and Propertius. Selected Poems. With Life. By Rev. A. H. Wratislaw. 3*s*. 6*d*

Cicero: De Senectute, De Amicitia, and Select Epistles. By George Long, M.A. 4*s*. 6*d*.

Cornelius Nepos. By Rev. J. F. Macmichael. 2*s*. 6*d*.

Homer: Iliad. Books I.–XII. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 6*s*. 6*d*.

Horace. With Life. By A. J. Macleane, M.A. 6*s*. 6*d*. [In 2 parts. 3*s*. 6*d*. each.]

Juvenal: Sixteen Satires. By H. Prior, M.A. 4*s*. 6*d*.

Martial: Select Epigrams. With Life. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 6*s*. 6*d*.

Ovid: the Fasti. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 5*s*.

Sallust: Catilina and Jugurtha. With Life. By G. Long, M.A. 5*s*.

Tacitus: Germania and Agricola. By Rev. P. Frost. 3*s*. 6*d*.

Virgil: Bucolics, Georgics, and Æneid, Books I.–IV. Abridged from Professor Conington's Edition. 5*s*. 6*d*.
(The Bucolics and Georgics in one volume. 3*s*.)

——— Æneid, Books V.–XII. Abridged from Professor Conington's Edition. 5*s*. 6*d*.

Xenophon: The Anabasis. With Life. By Rev. J. F. Macmichael. 5*s*.

——— The Cyropædia. By G. M. Gorham, M.A. 6*s*.

——— Memorabilia. By Percival Frost, M.A. 4*s*. 6*d*.

A Grammar-School Atlas of Classical Geography, containing Ten selected Maps. Imperial 8vo. 5*s*.

Uniform with the Series.

The New Testament, in Greek. With English Notes, &c. By Rev. J. F. Macmichael. 7*s*. 6*d*.

CAMBRIDGE GREEK AND LATIN TEXTS.

Æschylus. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 3*s*.

Cæsar: De Bello Gallico. By G. Long, M.A. 2*s*.

Cicero: De Senectute et de Amicitia, et Epistolæ Selectæ. By G. Long, M.A. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Ciceronis Orationes. Vol. I. (in Verrem.) By G. Long, M.A. 3*s*. 6*d*.

Euripides. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 3 vols. 3*s*. 6*d*. each.

Herodotus. By J. G. Blakesley, B.D. 2 vols. 7*s*.

Homeri Ilias. I.–XII. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 2*s*. 6*d*.

Horatius. By A. J. Macleane, M.A. 2*s*. 6*d*.

Juvenal et Persius. By A. J. Macleane, M.A. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Lucretius. By H. A. J. Munro, M.A. 2*s*. 6*d*.

Sallusti Crispi Catilina et Jugurtha. By G. Long, M.A. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Terenti Comœdiæ. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 3*s*.

Thucydides. By J. G. Donaldson, D.D. 2 vols. 7*s*.

Virgilius. By J. Conington, M.A. 3*s*. 6*d*.

Xenophontis Expeditio Cyri. By J. F. Macmichael, B.A. 2*s*. 6*d*.

ovum Testamentum Græcum. By F. H. Scrivener, M.A. 6*l* An edition with wide margin for notes, half bound, 12*s*.

CAMBRIDGE TEXTS WITH NOTES.

A Selection of the most usually read of the Greek and Latin Authors, Annotated for Schools. Fcap. 8vo. 1s. 6d. each.

Euripides. Alcestis. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Medea. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Hippolytus. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Hecuba. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Bacchæ. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Ion. By F. A. Paley, M.A. [Price 2s.]
Æschylus. Prometheus Vinctus. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
——— Septem contra Thebas. By F. A. Paley, M.A.
Ovid. Selections. By A. J. Macleane, M.A.

PUBLIC SCHOOL SERIES.

A Series of Classical Texts, annotated by well-known Scholars. Crown 8vo.

Aristophanes. The Peace. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 4s. 6d.
——— The Acharnians. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 4s. 6d.
——— The Frogs. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 4s. 6d.
Cicero. The Letters to Atticus. Bk. I. By A. Pretor. M.A. 4s. 6d.
Demosthenes de Falsa Legatione. By R. Shilleto, M.A. 6s.
——— The Law of Leptines. By B. W. Beatson, M.A.
Plato. The Apology of Socrates and Crito. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 4th Edition. 4s. 6d.
——— The Phædo. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 5s. 6d.
——— The Protagoras. By W. Wayte, M.A. 4s. 6d.
Plautus. The Aulularia. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 2nd edition. 4s. 6d.
——— Trinummus. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 2nd edition. 4s. 6d.
——— The Menaechmei. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 4s. 6d.
Sophoclis Trachiniæ. By A. Pretor, M.A. 4s. 6d.
Terence. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 10s. 6d.
Theocritus. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 4s. 6d.

Others in preparation.

CRITICAL AND ANNOTATED EDITIONS.

Ætna. By H. A. J. Munro, M.A. 3s. 6d.
Aristophanis Comœdiæ. By H. A. Holden, LL.D. 8vo. 2 vols. 23s. 6d. Plays sold separately.
——— Pax. By F. A. Paley, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 4s. 6d.
Catullus. By H. A. J. Munro, M.A. 7s. 6d.
Horace. Quinti Horatii Flacci Opera. By H. A. J. Munro, M.A. Large 8vo. 1l. 1s.
Livy. The first five Books. By J. Prendeville. 12mo. roan, 5s. Or Books I.-III. 3s. 6d. IV. and V. 3s. 6d.

Lucretius. Titi Lucretii Cari de Rerum Natura Libri Sex. With a Translation and Notes. By H. A. J. Munro, M.A. 2 vols. 8vo. Vol. I. Text, 16s. Vol. II. Translation, 6s. (Sold separately.)

Ovid. P. Ovidii Nasonis Heroides XIV. By A. Palmer, M.A. 8vo. 6s.

Propertius. Sex Aurelii Propertii Carmina. By F. A. Paley, M.A. 8vo. Cloth, 9s.

Sophocles. The Ajax. By C. E. Palmer, M.A. 4s. 6d.

Thucydides. The History of the Peloponnesian War. By Richard Shilleto, M.A. Book I. 8vo. 6s. 6d. (Book II. *in the press.*)

Greek Testament. By Henry Alford, D.D. 4 vols. 8vo. (Sold separately.) Vol. I. 1l. 8s. Vol. II. 1l. 4s. Vol. III. 18s. Vol. IV. Part I. 18s.; Part II. 14s.; or in one Vol. 32s.

LATIN AND GREEK CLASS-BOOKS.

Auxilia Latina. A Series of Progressive Latin Exercises. By Rev. J. B. Baddeley, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 2s.

An Introductory Part to the above on Accidence. [*In the Press.*

Latin Prose Lessons. By A. J. Church, M.A. 2nd Edit. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Latin Exercises and Grammar Papers. By T. Collins, M.A. 2nd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Analytical Latin Exercises. By C. P. Mason, B.A. 2nd Edit. 3s. 6d.

Scala Græca: a Series of Elementary Greek Exercises. By Rev. J. W. Davis, M.A., and R. W. Baddeley, M.A. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Greek Verse Composition. By G. Preston, M.A. Crown 8vo. 4s. 6d.

By the Rev. P. Frost, M.A., St. John's College, Cambridge.

Eclogæ Latinæ; or, First Latin Reading-Book, with English Notes and a Dictionary. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Materials for Latin Prose Composition. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d. Key, 4s.

A Latin Verse-Book. An Introductory Work on Hexameters and Pentameters. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. Key, 5s.

Analecta Græca Minora, with Introductory Sentences, English Notes, and a Dictionary. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Materials for Greek Prose Composition. New Edit. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. 6d. Key, 5s.

Florilegium Poeticum. Elegiac Extracts from Ovid and Tibullus. New Edition. With Notes. Fcap. 8vo. 3s.

By the Rev. F. E. Gretton.

A First Cheque-book for Latin Verse-makers. 1s. 6d.

A Latin Version for Masters. 2s. 6d.

Reddenda; or Passages with Parallel Hints for Translation into Latin Prose and Verse. Crown 8vo. 4s. 6d.

Reddenda Reddita (*see next page*).

By H. A. Holden, LL.D.

Foliorum Silvula. Part I. Passages for Translation into Latin Elegiac and Heroic Verse. 8th Edition. Post 8vo. 7s. 6d.

——— Part II. Select Passages for Translation into Latin Lyric and Comic Iambic Verse. 3rd Edition. Post 8vo. 5s.

——— Part III. Select Passages for Translation into Greek Verse. 3rd Edition. Post 8vo. 8s.

Folia Silvulæ, sive Eclogæ Poetarum Anglicorum in Latinum et Græcum conversæ. 8vo. Vol. I. 10s. 6d. Vol. II. 12s.

Foliorum Centuriæ. Select Passages for Translation into Latin and Greek Prose. 6th Edition. Post 8vo. 8s.

TRANSLATIONS, SELECTIONS, &c.

*** Many of the following books are well adapted for School Prizes.

Æschylus. Translated into English Prose by F. A. Paley, M.A. 2nd Edition. 8vo. 7s. 6d.

——— Translated into English Verse by Anna Swanwick. Crown 8vo. 2 vols. 12s.

——— Folio Edition, with 33 Illustrations after Flaxman. 2l. 2s.

Anthologia Græca. A Selection of Choice Greek Poetry, with Notes. By F. St. John Thackeray. *4th and Cheaper Edition.* 16mo. 4s. 6d.

Anthologia Latina. A Selection of Choice Latin Poetry, from Nævius to Boëthius, with Notes. By Rev. F. St. John Thackeray. Fcap. 8vo. 6s. 6d.

Aristophanes: The Peace. Text and Metrical Translation. By B. B. Rogers, M.A. Fcap. 4to. 7s. 6d.

——— The Wasps. Text and Metrical Translation. By B. B. Rogers, M.A. Fcap. 4to. 7s. 6d.

Corpus Poetarum Latinorum. Edited by Walker. 1 vol. 8vo. 18s.

Horace. The Odes and Carmen Sæculare. In English Verse by J. Conington, M.A. 7th edition. Fcap. 8vo. 5s. 6d.

——— The Satires and Epistles. In English Verse by J. Conington, M.A. 4th edition. 6s. 6d.

——— Illustrated from Antique Gems by C. W. King, M.A. The text revised with Introduction by H. A. J. Munro, M.A. Large 8vo. 1l. 1s.

Mvsæ Etonenses, sive Carminvm Etonæ Conditorvm Delectvs. By Richard Okes. 2 vols. 8vo. 15s.

Propertius. Verse translations from Book V., with revised Latin Text. By F. A. Paley, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 3s.

Plato. Gorgias. Translated by E. M. Cope, M.A. 8vo. 7s.

——— Philebus. Translated by F. A. Paley, M.A. Small 8vo. 4s.

——— Theætetus. Translated by F. A. Paley, M.A. Small 8vo, 4s.

——— Analysis and Index of the Dialogues. By Dr. Day. Post 8vo. 5s.

Reddenda Reddita: Passages from English Poetry, with a Latin Verse Translation. By F. E. Gretton. Crown 8vo. 6s.

Sabrinæ Corolla in hortulis Regiæ Scholæ Salopiensis contexuerunt tres viri floribus legendis. Editio tertia. 8vo. 8s. 6d.

Sertum Carthusianum Floribus trium Seculorum Contextum. By W. H. Brown. 8vo. 14s.

Theocritus. In English Verse, by C. S. Calverley, M.A. Crown 8vo. 7s. 6d.

Translations into English and Latin. By C. S. Calverley, M.A. Post 8vo. 7s. 6d.

——— By R. C. Jebb, M.A.; H. Jackson, M.A., and W. E. Currey, M.A. Crown 8vo. 8s.

——— into Greek and Latin Verse. By R. C. Jebb. 4to. cloth gilt. 10s. 6d.

REFERENCE VOLUMES.

A Latin Grammar. By T. H. Key, M.A. 6th Thousand. Post 8vo. 8s.

A Short Latin Grammar for Schools. By T. H. Key, M.A., F.R.S. 11th Edition. Post 8vo. 3s. 6d.

A Guide to the Choice of Classical Books. By J. B. Mayor, M.A. Crown 8vo. 2s.

The Theatre of the Greeks. By J. W. Donaldson, D.D. 8th Edition. Post 8vo. 5s.

A Dictionary of Latin and Greek Quotations. By H. T. Riley. Post 8vo. 5s. With Index Verborum, 6s.

A History of Roman Literature. By W. S. Teuffel, Professor at the University of Tübingen. By W. Wagner, Ph.D. 2 vols. Demy 8vo. 21s.

Student's Guide to the University of Cambridge. Revised and corrected. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 6s. 6d.

CLASSICAL TABLES.

Greek Verbs. A Catalogue of Verbs, Irregular and Defective; their leading formations, tenses, and inflexions, with Paradigms for conjugation, Rules for formation of tenses, &c. &c. By J. S. Baird, T.C.D. 2s. 6d.

Greek Accents (Notes on). By A. Barry, D.D. New Edition. 1s.

Homeric Dialect. Its Leading Forms and Peculiarities. By J. S. Baird, T.C.D. New edition, revised by W. Gunion Rutherford. 1s.

Greek Accidence. By the Rev. P. Frost, M.A. New Edition. 1s.

Latin Accidence. By the Rev. P. Frost, M.A. 1s.

Latin Versification. 1s.

Notabilia Quædam; or the Principal Tenses of most of the Irregular Greek Verbs and Elementary Greek, Latin, and French Construction. New edition. 1s.

Richmond Rules for the Ovidian Distich, &c. By J. Tate, M.A. 1s.

The Principles of Latin Syntax. 1s.

CAMBRIDGE SCHOOL AND COLLEGE TEXT-BOOKS.

A Series of Elementary Treatises for the use of Students in the Universities, Schools, and Candidates for the Public Examinations. Fcap. 8vo.

Arithmetic. By Rev. C. Elsee, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 7th Edit. 3s. 6d.

Algebra. By the Rev. C. Elsee, M.A. 4th Edit. 4s.

Arithmetic. By A. Wrigley, M.A. 3s. 6d.

——— A Progressive Course of Examples. With Answers. By J. Watson, M.A. 3rd Edition. 2s. 6d.

Algebra. Progressive Course of Examples. By Rev. W. F. M'Michael, M.A., and R. Prowde Smith, M.A. 3s. 6d.

Plane Astronomy, An Introduction to. By P. T. Main, M.A. 3rd Edition. [*In the Press.*

Conic Sections treated Geometrically. By W. H. Besant, M.A. 2nd Edition. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Elementary Conic Sections treated Geometrically. By W. H. Besant, M.A. [*In the Press.*

Statics, Elementary. By Rev. H. Goodwin, D.D. 2nd Edit. 3*s.*

Hydrostatics, Elementary. By W. H. Besant, M.A. 7th Edit. 4*s.*

Mensuration, An Elementary Treatise on. By B. T. Moore, M.A. 5*s.*

Newton's Principia, The First Three Sections of, with an Appendix; and the Ninth and Eleventh Sections. By J. H. Evans, M.A. 5th Edition, by P. T. Main, M.A. 4*s.*

Trigonometry, Elementary. By T. P. Hudson, M.A. 3*s.* 6*d.*

Optics, Geometrical. With Answers. By W. S. Aldis, M.A. 3*s.* 6*d.*

Analytical Geometry for Schools. By T. G. Vyvyan. 3rd Edit. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Greek Testament, Companion to the. By A. C. Barrett, A.M. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 5*s.*

Book of Common Prayer, An Historical and Explanatory Treatise on the. By W. G. Humphry, B.D. 5th Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Music, Text-book of. By H. C. Banister 7th Edit. revised. 5*s.*

——— Concise History of. By H. G. Bonavia Hunt, B. Mus. Oxon. 3rd Edition revised. 3*s.* 6*d.*

ARITHMETIC AND ALGEBRA.

Principles and Practice of Arithmetic. By J. Hind, M.A. 9th Edit. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Elements of Algebra. By J. Hind, M.A. 6th Edit. 8vo. 10*s.* 6*d.*

Choice and Chance. A Treatise on Permutations and Combinations. By W. A Whitworth. 2nd Edition. Crown 8vo. 6*s.*

See also foregoing Series.

GEOMETRY AND EUCLID.

Text-Book of Geometry. By T. S. Aldis, M.A. Small 8vo. 4*s.* 6*d.* Part I. 2*s.* 6*d.* Part II. 2*s.*

The Elements of Euclid. By H. J. Hose. Fcap. 8vo. 4*s.* 6*d.* Exercises separately, 1*s.*

——— The First Six Books, with Commentary by Dr. Lardner. 10th Edition. 8vo. 6*s.*

——— **The First Two Books explained to Beginners.** By C. P. Mason, B.A. 2nd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2*s.* 6*d.*

The Enunciations and Figures to Euclid's Elements. By Rev. J. Brasse, D.D. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 1*s.* On Cards, in case, 5*s.* 6*d.* Without the Figures, 6*d.*

Exercises on Euclid and in Modern Geometry. By J. McDowell, B.A. Crown 8vo. 2nd Edition revised. 6*s.*

Geometrical Conic Sections. By W. H. Besant, M.A. 3rd Edit. 4s. 6d.

Elementary Geometrical Conic Sections. By W. H. Besant, M.A. [*In the Press.*

The Geometry of Conics. By C. Taylor, M.A. 2nd Edit. 8vo. 4s. 6d.

Solutions of Geometrical Problems, proposed at St. John's College from 1830 to 1846. By T. Gaskin, M.A. 8vo. 12s.

TRIGONOMETRY.

The Shrewsbury Trigonometry. By J. C. P. Aldous. Crown 8vo. 2s.

Elementary Trigonometry. By T. P. Hudson, M.A. 3s. 6d.

Elements of Plane and Spherical Trigonometry. By J. Hind, M.A. 5th Edition. 12mo. 6s.

An Elementary Treatise on Mensuration. By B. T. Moore, M.A. 5s.

ANALYTICAL GEOMETRY AND DIFFERENTIAL CALCULUS.

An Introduction to Analytical Plane Geometry. By W. P. Turnbull, M.A. 8vo. 12s.

Treatise on Plane Co-ordinate Geometry. By M. O'Brien, M.A. 8vo. 9s.

Problems on the Principles of Plane Co-ordinate Geometry. By W. Walton, M.A. 8vo. 16s.

Trilinear Co-ordinates, and Modern Analytical Geometry of Two Dimensions. By W. A. Whitworth, M.A. 8vo. 16s.

An Elementary Treatise on Solid Geometry. By W. S. Aldis, M.A. 2nd Edition revised. 8vo. 8s.

Geometrical Illustrations of the Differential Calculus. By M. B. Pell. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Elementary Treatise on the Differential Calculus. By M. O'Brien, M.A. 8vo. 10s. 6d.

Notes on Roulettes and Glissettes. By W. H. Besant, M.A. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Elliptic Functions, Elementary Treatise on. By A. Cayley, M.A. Demy 8vo. 15s.

MECHANICS & NATURAL PHILOSOPHY.

Statics, Elementary. By H. Goodwin, D.D. Fcap. 8vo. 2nd Edition. 3s.

Statics, Treatise on. By S. Earnshaw, M.A. 4th Edition. 8vo. 10s. 6d.

Dynamics, A Treatise on Elementary. By W. Garnett, B.A. 2nd Edition. Crown 8vo. 6s.

Statics and Dynamics, Problems in. By W. Walton, M.A. 8vo. 10s. 6d.

Theoretical Mechanics, Problems in. By W. Walton. 2nd Edit. revised and enlarged. Demy 8vo. 16s.

Mechanics, An Elementary Treatise on. By Prof. Potter. 4th Edition revised. 8s. 6d.

Hydrostatics, Elementary. By Prof. Potter. 7s. 6d.

Hydrostatics By W. H. Besant, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 7th Edition. 4s.

Hydromechanics, A Treatise on. By W. H. Besant, M.A. 8vo. New Edition revised. 10s. 6d.

Dynamics of a Particle, A Treatise on the. By W. H. Besant, M.A. [*Preparing.*

Dynamics of a Rigid Body, Solutions of Examples on the. By W. N. Griffin, M.A. 8vo. 6s. 6d.

Motion, An Elementary Treatise on. By J. R. Lunn, M.A. 7s. 6d.

Optics, Geometrical. By W. S. Aldis, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Double Refraction, A Chapter on Fresnel's Theory of. By W. S. Aldis, M.A. 8vo. 2s.

Optics, An Elementary Treatise on. By Prof. Potter. Part I. 3rd Edition. 9s. 6d. Part II. 12s. 6d.

Optics, Physical; or the Nature and Properties of Light. By Prof. Potter, A.M. 6s. 6d. Part II. 7s. 6d.

Heat, An Elementary Treatise on. By W. Garnett, B.A. Crown 8vo. 2nd Edition revised. 3s. 6d.

Geometrical Optics, Figures Illustrative of. From Schelbach. By W. B. Hopkins. Folio. Plates. 10s. 6d.

Newton's Principia, The First Three Sections of, with an Appendix; and the Ninth and Eleventh Sections. By J. H. Evans, M.A. 5th Edition. Edited by P. T. Main, M.A. 4s.

Astronomy, An Introduction to Plane. By P. T. Main, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. cloth. 4s.

Astronomy, Practical and Spherical. By R. Main, M.A. 8vo. 14s.

Astronomy, Elementary Chapters on, from the 'Astronomie Physique' of Biot. By H. Goodwin, D.D. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Pure Mathematics and Natural Philosophy, A Compendium of Facts and Formulæ in. By G. R. Smalley. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Elementary Course of Mathematics. By H. Goodwin, D.D. 6th Edition. 8vo. 16s.

Problems and Examples, adapted to the 'Elementary Course of Mathematics.' 3rd Edition. 8vo. 5s.

Solutions of Goodwin's Collection of Problems and Examples. By W. W. Hutt, M.A. 3rd Edition, revised and enlarged. 8vo. 9s.

Pure Mathematics, Elementary Examples in. By J. Taylor. 8vo. 7s. 6d.

Euclid, Mechanical. By the late W. Whewell, D.D. 5th Edition. 5s.

Mechanics of Construction. With numerous Examples. By S. Fenwick, F.R.A.S. 8vo. 12s.

Anti-Logarithms, Table of. By H. E. Filipowski. 3rd Edition. 8vo. 15s.

Mathematical and other Writings of R. L. Ellis, M.A. 8vo. 16s.

Pure and Applied Calculation, Notes on the Principles of. By Rev. J. Challis, M.A. Demy 8vo. 15s.

Physics, The Mathematical Principle of. By Rev. J. Challis, M.A. Demy 8vo. 5s.

HISTORY, TOPOGRAPHY, &c.

Rome and the Campagna. By R. Burn, M.A. With 85 Engravings and 26 Maps and Plans. With Appendix. 4to. 3*l.* 3*s.*

Modern Europe. By Dr. T. H. Dyer. 2nd Edition revised and continued. 5 vols. Demy 8vo. 2*l.* 12*s.* 6*d.*

The History of the Kings of Rome. By Dr. T. H. Dyer. 8vo. 16*s.*

A Plea for Livy. By Dr. T. H. Dyer. 8vo. 1*s.*

Roma Regalis. By Dr. T. H. Dyer. 8vo. 2*s.* 6*d.*

The History of Pompeii: its Buildings and Antiquities. By T. H. Dyer. 3rd Edition, brought down to 1874. Post 8vo. 7*s.* 6*d.*

Ancient Athens: its History, Topography, and Remains. By T. H. Dyer. Super-royal 8vo. Cloth. 1*l.* 5*s.*

The Decline of the Roman Republic. By G. Long. 5 vols. 8vo. 14*s.* each.

A History of England during the Early and Middle Ages. By C. H. Pearson, M.A. 2nd Edition revised and enlarged. 8vo. Vol. I. 16*s.* Vol. II. 14*s.*

Historical Maps of England. By C. H. Pearson. Folio. 2nd Edition revised. 31*s.* 6*d.*

History of England, 1800–15. By Harriet Martineau, with new and copious Index. 1 vol. 3*s.* 6*d.*

History of the Thirty Years' Peace, 1815–46. By Harriet Martineau. 4 vols. 3*s.* 6*d.* each.

A Practical Synopsis of English History. By A. Bowes. 4th Edition. 8vo. 2*s.*

Student's Text-Book of English and General History. By D. Beale. Crown 8vo. 2*s.* 6*d.*

Lives of the Queens of England. By A. Strickland. Library Edition, 8 vols. 7*s.* 6*d.* each. Cheaper Edition, 6 vols. 5*s.* each. Abridged Edition, 1 vol. 6*s.* 6*d.*

Eginhard's Life of Karl the Great (Charlemagne). Translated with Notes, by W. Glaister, M.A., B.C.L. Crown 8vo. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Outlines of Indian History. By A. W. Hughes. Small post 8vo. 3*s.* 6*d.*

The Elements of General History. By Prof. Tytler. New Edition, brought down to 1874. Small post 8vo. *s.* 6*d.*

ATLASES.

An Atlas of Classical Geography. 24 Maps. By W. Hughes and G. Long, M.A. New Edition. Imperial 8vo. 12*s.* 6*d.*

A Grammar-School Atlas of Classical Geography. Ten Maps selected from the above. New Edition. Imperial 8vo. 5*s.*

First Classical Maps. By the Rev. J. Tate, M.A. 3rd Edition. Imperial 8vo. 7*s.* 6*d.*

Standard Library Atlas of Classical Geography. Imp. 8vo. 7*s.* 6*d.*

PHILOLOGY.

WEBSTER'S DICTIONARY OF THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE. Re-edited by N. Porter and C. A. Goodrich. With Dr. Mahn's Etymology. 1 vol. 21s. With Appendices and 70 additional pages of Illustrations, 31s. 6d.

'THE BEST PRACTICAL ENGLISH DICTIONARY EXTANT.'—*Quarterly Review.*

Prospectuses, with specimen pages, post free on application.

New Dictionary of the English Language. Combining Explanation with Etymology, and copiously illustrated by Quotations from the best Authorities. By Dr. Richardson. New Edition, with a Supplement. 2 vols. 4to. 4l. 14s. 6d.; half russia, 5l. 15s. 6d.; russia, 6l. 12s. Supplement separately. 4to. 12s.

An 8vo. Edit. without the Quotations, 15s.; half russia, 20s.; russia, 24s.

The Elements of the English Language. By E. Adams, Ph.D. 15th Edition. Post 8vo. 4s. 6d.

Philological Essays. By T. H. Key, M.A., F.R.S. 8vo. 10s. 6d.

Language, its Origin and Development. By T. H. Key, M.A., F.R.S. 8vo. 14s.

Synonyms and Antonyms of the English Language. By Archdeacon Smith. 2nd Edition. Post 8vo. 5s.

Synonyms Discriminated. By Archdeacon Smith. Demy 8vo. 16s.

Etymological Glossary of nearly 2500 English Words in Common Use derived from the Greek. By the Rev. E. J. Boyce. Fcap. 8vo. 3s. 6d.

A Syriac Grammar. By G. Phillips, D.D. 3rd Edition, enlarged. 8vo. 7s. 6d.

A Grammar of the Arabic Language. By Rev. W. J. Beaumont, M.A. 12mo. 7s.

Who Wrote It? A Dictionary of Common Poetical Quotations. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

DIVINITY, MORAL PHILOSOPHY, &c.

Novum Testamentum Græcum, Textus Stephanici, 1550. By F. H. Scrivener, A.M., LL.D. New Edition. 16mo. 4s. 6d. Also on Writing Paper, with Wide Margin. Half-bound. 12s.

By the same Author.

Codex Bezæ Cantabrigiensis. 4to. 26s.

A Full Collation of the Codex Sinaiticus with the Received Text of the New Testament, with Critical Introduction. 2nd Edition, revised. Fcap. 8vo. 5s.

A Plain Introduction to the Criticism of the New Testament. With Forty Facsimiles from Ancient Manuscripts. 2nd Edition. 8vo. 16s.

Six Lectures on the Text of the New Testament. For English Readers. Crown 8vo. 6s.

The New Testament for English Readers. By the late H. Alford, D.D. Vol. I. Part I. 3rd Edit. 12s. Vol. I. Part II. 2nd Edit. 10s. 6d. Vol. II. Part I. 2nd Edit. 16s. Vol. II. Part II. 2nd Edit. 16s.

The Greek Testament. By the late H. Alford, D.D. Vol. I. 6th Edit. 1l. 8s. Vol. II. 6th Edit. 1l. 4s. Vol. III. 5th Edit. 18s. Vol. IV. Part I. 4th Edit. 18s. Vol. IV. Part II. 4th Edit. 14s. Vol. IV. 1l. 12s.

Companion to the Greek Testament. By A. C. Barrett, M.A. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 5s.

Liber Apologeticus. The Apology of Tertullian, with English Notes, by H. A. Woodham, LL.D. 2nd Edition. 8vo. 8s. 6d.

The Book of Psalms. A New Translation, with Introductions, &c. By Very Rev. J. J. Stewart Perowne, D.D. 8vo. Vol. I. 4th Edition, 18s. Vol. II. 4th Edit. 16s.

——— Abridged for Schools. 2nd Edition. Crown 8vo. 10s. 6d.

History of the Articles of Religion. By C. H. Hardwick. 3rd Edition. Post 8vo. 5s.

Pearson on the Creed. Carefully printed from an early edition. With Analysis and Index by E. Walford, M.A. Post 8vo. 5s.

Doctrinal System of St. John as Evidence of the Date of his Gospel. By Rev. J. J. Lias, M.A. Crown 8vo. 6s.

An Historical and Explanatory Treatise on the Book of Common Prayer. By Rev. W. G. Humphry, B.D. 5th Edition, enlarged. Small post 8vo. 4s. 6d.

The New Table of Lessons Explained. By Rev. W. G. Humphry, B.D. Fcap. 1s. 6d.

A Commentary on the Gospels for the Sundays and other Holy Days of the Christian Year. By Rev. W. Denton, A.M. New Edition. 3 vols. 8vo. 54s. Sold separately.

Commentary on the Epistles for the Sundays and other Holy Days of the Christian Year. By Rev. W. Denton, A.M. 2 vols. 36s. Sold separately.

Commentary on the Acts. By Rev. W. Denton, A.M. Vol. I. 8vo. 18s. Vol. II. 14s.

Notes on the Catechism. By Rev. A. Barry, D.D. 5th Edit. Fcap. 2s.

Catechetical Hints and Helps. By Rev. E. J. Boyce, M.A. 3rd Edition, revised. Fcap. 2s. 6d.

Examination Papers on Religious Instruction. By Rev. E. J. Boyce. Sewed. 1s. 6d.

Church Teaching for the Church's Children. An Exposition of the Catechism. By the Rev. F. W. Harper. Sq. fcap. 2s.

The Winton Church Catechist. Questions and Answers on the Teaching of the Church Catechism. By the late Rev. J. S. B. Monsell, LL.D. 3rd Edition. Cloth, 3s.; or in Four Parts, sewed.

The Church Teacher's Manual of Christian Instruction. By Rev. M. F. Sadler. 16th Thousand. 2s. 6d.

Short Explanation of the Epistles and Gospels of the Chris-tian Year, with Questions. Royal 32mo. 2s. 6d.; calf, 4s. 6d.

Butler's Analogy of Religion; with Introduction and Index by Rev. Dr. Steere. New Edition. Fcap. 3s. 6d.

——— **Three Sermons** on Human Nature, and Dissertation on Virtue. By W. Whewell, D.D. 4th Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

Lectures on the History of Moral Philosophy in England. By W. Whewell, D.D. Crown 8vo. 8s.

Elements of Morality, including Polity. By W. Whewell, D.D. New Edition, in 8vo. 15s.

Astronomy and General Physics (Bridgewater Treatise). New Edition. 5s.

Kent's Commentary on International Law. By J. T. Abdy, LL.D. New and Cheap Edition. Crown 8vo. 10*s.* 6*d.*

A Manual of the Roman Civil Law. By G. Leapingwell, LL.D. 8vo. 12*s.*

FOREIGN CLASSICS.

A series for use in Schools, with English Notes, grammatical and explanatory, and renderings of difficult idiomatic expressions. Fcap. 8vo.

Schiller's Wallenstein. By Dr. A. Buchheim. New Edit. 6*s.* 6*d.* Or the Lager and Piccolomini, 3*s.* 6*d.* Wallenstein's Tod, 3*s.* 6*d.*

——— **Maid of Orleans.** By Dr. W. Wagner. 3*s.* 6*d.*

——— **Maria Stuart.** By V. Kastner. 3*s.*

Goethe's Hermann and Dorothea. By E. Bell, M.A., and E. Wölfel. 2*s.* 6*d.*

German Ballads, from Uhland, Goethe, and Schiller. By C. L. Bielefeld. 3*s.* 6*d.*

Charles XII., par Voltaire. By L. Direy. 3rd Edition. 3*s.* 6*d.*

Aventures de Télémaque, par Fénélon. By C. J. Delille. 2nd Edition. 4*s.* 6*d.*

Select Fables of La Fontaine. By F. E. A. Gasc. New Edition. 3*s.*

Picciola, by X. B. Saintine. By Dr. Dubuc. 4th Edition. 3*s.* 6*d.*

FRENCH CLASS-BOOKS.

Twenty Lessons in French. With Vocabulary, giving the Pronunciation. By W. Brebner. Post 8vo. 4*s.*

French Grammar for Public Schools. By Rev. A. C. Clapin, M.A. Fcap. 8vo. 6th Edit. 2*s.* 6*d.* Separately, Part I. 2*s.*; Part II. 1*s.* 6*d.*

French Primer. By Rev. A. C. Clapin, M.A. 3rd Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 1*s.*

Primer of French Philology. By Rev. A. C. Clapin. Fcap. 8vo. 1*s.*

Le Nouveau Tresor; or, French Student's Companion. By M. E. S. 16th Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 3*s.* 6*d.*

F. E. A. GASC'S FRENCH COURSE.

First French Book. Fcap 8vo. New Edition. 1*s.* 6*d.*

Second French Book. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2*s.* 6*d.*

Key to First and Second French Books. Fcap. 8vo. 3*s.* 6*d.*

French Fables for Beginners, in Prose, with Index. New Edition. 12mo. 2*s.*

Select Fables of La Fontaine. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 3*s.*

Histoires Amusantes et Instructives. With Notes. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2*s.* 6*d.*

Practical Guide to Modern French Conversation. Fcap. 8vo. 2s. 6d.

French Poetry for the Young. With Notes. Fcap. 8vo. 2s.

Materials for French Prose Composition; or, Selections from the best English Prose Writers. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 4s. 6d. Key, 6s.

Prosateurs Contemporains. With Notes. 8vo. New Edition, revised. 5s.

Le Petit Compagnon; a French Talk-Book for Little Children. 16mo. 2s. 6d.

An Improved Modern Pocket Dictionary of the French and English Languages. 25th Thousand, with additions. 16mo. Cloth. 4s. Also in 2 vols., in neat leatherette, 5s.

Modern French-English and English-French Dictionary. 2nd Edition, revised. In 1 vol. 12s. 6d. (formerly 2 vols. 25s.)

GOMBERT'S FRENCH DRAMA.

Being a Selection of the best Tragedies and Comedies of Molière, Racine, Corneille, and Voltaire. With Arguments and Notes by A. Gombert. New Edition, revised by F. E. A. Gasc. Fcap. 8vo. 1s. each; sewed, 6d.

CONTENTS.

MOLIERE:—Le Misanthrope. L'Avare. Le Bourgeois Gentilhomme. Le Tartuffe. Le Malade Imaginaire. Les Femmes Savantes. Les Fourberies de Scapin. Les Précieuses Ridicules. L'Ecole des Femmes. L'Ecole des Maris. Le Médecin malgré Lui.

RACINE:—Phédre. Esther. Athalie. Iphigénie. Les Plaideurs. Thébaïde; or, Les Frères Ennemis. Andromaque. Britannicus.

P. CORNEILLE:—Le Cid. Horace. Cinna. Polyeucte.

VOLTAIRE:—Zaïre.

GERMAN CLASS-BOOKS.

Materials for German Prose Composition. By Dr Buchheim. 5th Edition, revised, with an Index. Fcap. 4s. 6d.

A German Grammar for Public Schools. By the Rev. A. C. Clapin and F. Holl Müller. Fcap. 2s. 6d.

Kotzebue's Der Gefangene. With Notes by Dr. W. Stromberg. 1s.

ENGLISH CLASS-BOOKS.

The Elements of the English Language. By E. Adams, Ph.D. 15th Edition. Post 8vo. 4s. 6d.

The Rudiments of English Grammar and Analysis. By E. Adams, Ph.D. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 2s.

BY C. P. MASON, B.A. LONDON UNIVERSITY.

First Notions of Grammar for Young Learners. Fcap. 8vo. Cloth. 8d.

First Steps in English Grammar for Junior Classes. Demy 18mo. New Edition. 1s.

Outlines of English Grammar for the use of Junior Classes. Cloth. 5th Edition. 1s. 6d.

English Grammar, including the Principles of Grammatical Analysis. 22nd Edition. Post 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Shorter English Grammar, with copious carefully graduated Exercises. Crown 8vo. 3s. 6d. [*Just published.*

English Grammar Practice, being the Exercises from the above, in a separate volume. 1s. [*Just published.*

The Analysis of Sentences applied to Latin. Post 8vo. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Analytical Latin Exercises: Accidence and Simple Sentences, &c. Post 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Edited for Middle-Class Examinations.

With Notes on the Analysis and Parsing, and Explanatory Remarks.

Milton's Paradise Lost, Book I. With Life. 3rd Edit. Post 8vo. 2s.

——— Book II. With Life. 2nd Edit. Post 8vo. 2*s*.

——— Book III. With Life. Post 8vo. 2*s*.

Goldsmith's Deserted Village. With Life. Post 8vo. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Cowper's Task, Book II. With Life. Post 8vo. 2*s*.

Thomson's Spring. With Life. Post 8vo. 2*s*.

——— **Winter.** With Life. Post 8vo. 2*s*.

Practical Hints on Teaching. By Rev. J. Menet, M.A. 4th Edit. Crown 8vo. cloth, 2s. 6d.; paper, 2s.

Test Lessons in Dictation. Paper cover, 1*s*. 6*d*.

Questions for Examinations in English Literature. By Rev. W. W. Skeat. 2s. 6d.

Drawing Copies. By P. H. Delamotte. Oblong 8vo. 12*s*. Sold also in parts at 1s. each.

Poetry for the School-room. New Edition. Fcap. 8vo. 1*s*. 6*d*.

Select Parables from Nature, for Use in Schools. By Mrs. A. Gatty. Fcap. 8vo. Cloth. 1s.

School Record for Young Ladies' Schools. 6*d*.

Geographical Text-Book; a Practical Geography. By M. E. S. 12mo. 2s.

The Blank Maps done up separately, 4to. 2s. coloured.

A First Book of Geography. By Rev. C. A. Johns, B.A., F.L.S. &c. Illustrated. 12mo. 2s. 6d.

Loudon's (Mrs.) Entertaining Naturalist. New Edition. Revised by W. S. Dallas, F.L.S. 5s.

——— **Handbook of Botany.** New Edition, greatly enlarged by D. Wooster. Fcap. 2s. 6d.

The Botanist's Pocket-Book. With a copious Index. By W. R. Hayward. 2nd Edit. revised. Crown 8vo. Cloth limp. 4s. 6d.

Experimental Chemistry, founded on the Work of Dr. Stöckhardt. By C. W. Heaton. Post 8vo. 5s.

Double Entry Elucidated. By B. W. Foster. 7th Edit. 4to. 8s 6d.

A New Manual of Book-keeping. By P. Crellin, Accountant. Crown 8vo. 3s. 6d.

Picture School-Books. In Simple Language, with numerous Illustrations. Royal 16mo.

School Primer. 6d.—School Reader. By J. Tilleard. 1s.—Poetry Book for Schools. 1s.—The Life of Joseph. 1s.—The Scripture Parables. By the Rev. J. E. Clarke. 1s.—The Scripture Miracles. By the Rev. J. E. Clarke. 1s.—The New Testament History. By the Rev. J. G. Wood, M.A. 1s.—The Old Testament History. By the Rev. J. G. Wood, M.A. 1s.—The Story of Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress. 1s.—The Life of Christopher Columbus. By Sarah Crompton. 1s.—The Life of Martin Luther. By Sarah Crompton. 1s.

BOOKS FOR YOUNG READERS.

In 8 vols. Limp cloth, 6*d.* each.

The New-born Lamb; Rosewood Box; Poor Fan; Wise Dog——The Cat and the Hen; Sam and his Dog Red-leg; Bob and Tom Lee; A Wreck——The Three Monkeys——Story of a Cat, told by Herself——The Blind Boy; The Mute Girl; A New Tale of Babes in a Wood——The Dey and the Knight; The New Bank-note; The Royal Visit; A King's Walk on a Winter's Day——Queen Bee and Busy Bee——Gull's Crag, a Story of the Sea.

BELL'S READING-BOOKS.

FOR SCHOOLS AND PAROCHIAL LIBRARIES.

The popularity which the 'Books for Young Readers' have attained is a sufficient proof that teachers and pupils alike approve of the use of interesting stories, with a simple plot in place of the dry combination of letters and syllables, making no impression on the mind, of which elementary reading-books generally consist.

The Publishers have therefore thought it advisable to extend the application of this principle to books adapted for more advanced readers.

Now Ready. Post 8vo. Strongly bound.

Masterman Ready. By Captain Marryat, R.N. 1*s.* 6*d.*
The Settlers in Canada. By Captain Marryat, R.N. 1*s.* 6*d.*
Parables from Nature. (Selected.) By Mrs. Gatty. 1*s.*
Friends in Fur and Feathers. By Gwynfryn. 1*s.*
Robinson Crusoe. 1*s.* 6*d.*
Andersen's Danish Tales. (Selected.) By E. Bell, M.A. 1*s.*
Southey's Life of Nelson. (Abridged.) 1*s.*
Grimm's German Tales. (Selected.) By E. Bell, M.A. 1*s.*
Life of the Duke of Wellington, with Maps and Plans. 1*s.*

Others in Preparation.

London: Printed by John Strangeways, Castle St. Leicester Sq.